Accreditation Council of the Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Healthcare 04/20/2023

### REPORT OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM <u>7M10124 "GLOBAL HEALTH"</u> OF NJSC "ASTANA MEDICAL UNIVERSITY" FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS OF MASTER'S SPECIALTIES IN HEALTH CARE

period of external expert evaluation: from March 27 to March 29, 2024.

Astana, 2024

| CONTENT |
|---------|
|---------|

|     | List of symbols and abbreviations  | 3  |
|-----|--|----|
| 1.  | Composition of the external expert commission  | 4  |
| 2.  | General part of the final report   | 5  |
| 2.1 | Presentation of the Master's educational program "7M10124 Global Health"             | 5  |
| 2.2 | Information about previous accreditation   | 8  |
| 2.3 | Brief description of the results of the analysis of the report on self-assessment of |    |
|     | the master's educational program "7M10124 Global Health" for compliance with         | 8  |
|     | the Accreditation Standards for educational programs of master's specialties in      |    |
|     | health care and conclusions on completion  |    |
| 3.  | Description of external expert evaluation and conclusion                             | 10 |
| 4.  | Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of          | 12 |
|     | an external evaluation of the master's educational program "7M10124                  |    |
|     | Global Health"   |    |
| 5.  | Recommendations for improving the master's educational program "7M1024               | 35 |
|     | Global Health"   |    |
| 6.  | Recommendation to the Accreditation Council on Accreditation                         | 35 |
|     | Annex 1. Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation and educational        | 36 |
|     | program of the master's program "7M10124 Global Health"                              |    |
|     | Annex 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation         | 37 |

### LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

| Description   Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in   Education and Healthcare |
|---|
| Education and Healthcare  |
|   |
| World Federation of Medical Education   |
| Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of   |
| Kazakhstan  |
| Non-profit joint-stock company "Astana Medical University"  |
| Automated information system  |
| Administrative and management personnel   |
| Basic disciplines   |
| Inside the department control   |
| Higher education institution  |
| State Attestation Commission  |
| State compulsory education standard of the Republic of  |
| Kazakhstan  |
| State Examination Commission  |
| Job description   |
| Unified national testing  |
| Final state certification   |
| End-of-course assessment  |
|   |
| Individual teacher work plan  |
| Integrated management system  |
| International Organization for Standardization  |
| Individual Educational Plan   |
| Component of choice   |
| Corporate Information System  |
| Committee for Control in the Sphere of Education and Science of                                     |
| the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of  |
| Kazakhstan  |
| Team-based learning   |
| Quality Assurance Committee   |
| Comprehensive testing of applicants   |
| Catalog of elective disciplines   |
| Treatment and prevention organization;  |
| Treatment and prevention institutions   |
| International academic cooperation  |
| Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan  |
| Inter-department meeting  |
| International scientific and technical cooperation  |
| International educational activities  |
| European Foundation for Quality Management Excellence Model   |
| Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan                                     |
| International educational cooperation   |
| ISO international standard  |
|   |

### 1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 7 dated 03/05/2024, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the master's degree educational program in the specialty "7M10124 Global Health" in the period from 03/27 to 03/29/2024 in the following composition:

| Nº | Status as part of the EEC                              | Full name                            | Academic degree/title, position, place of<br>work/place of study, course, specialty  |
|----|--|--------------------------------------|--|
| 1  | Chairman   | Kuzgibekova Alma<br>Bolatovna        | Candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor of<br>the Department of Childhood Diseases of the<br>NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda".  |
| 2  | International<br>expert                                | Kulikov Oleg<br>Vilievich            | Candidate of Medical Sciences, senior<br>lecturer, expert auditor of the voluntary<br>certification system of the Federal State<br>Budgetary Institution "National Institute of<br>Quality" of Federal Service for Surveillance<br>in Healthcare.  |
| 3  | Academic expert  | Boshkaeva Asyl<br>Kenesovna          | Doctor of Medical Sciences, Acting Professor<br>of the Department of Pharmaceutical and<br>Toxicological Chemistry, Pharmacognosy and<br>Botany of the NJSC "Kazakh National<br>Medical University named after S.D.<br>Asfendiyarov"   |
| 4  | Academic expert  | Yermukhanova<br>Lyudmila Sergeevna   | Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate<br>Professor, Head of the Department of Public<br>Health and Healthcare, NJSC "West<br>Kazakhstan Medical University named after.<br>M. Ospanova"   |
| 5  | Academic expert  | Khismetova Zaytuna<br>Abdulkasimovna | Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate<br>Professor, Head of the Department of Public<br>Health of NJSC "Semey Medical University".  |
| 6  | Academic expert  | Brimzhanova<br>Marzhan<br>Dikhanovna | Doctor PhD, Advisor to the Rector of<br>Kazakhstan Medical University "HSPH"<br>LLP.   |
| 7  | Expert<br>representative of<br>practical<br>healthcare | Zhanturiev Bolat<br>Meirbekovich     | Candidate of Medical Sciences, DBA, Head<br>of the Biological Testing Laboratory of the<br>Testing Centre with Laboratories, Almaty<br>Regional Branch of the National Centre for<br>Expertise of Medicines, Medical Products and<br>Medical Equipment of the Ministry of Health<br>of the Republic of Kazakhstan. |
| 8  | Expert<br>representative of<br>master's students       | Astrakhanov<br>Magzhan Rustemuly     | 1st year master's student in the specialty<br>"Biology" of the Eurasian University. L.N.<br>Gumilyov   |
| 9  | Expert student representative                          | Aitpay Aruay<br>Kanatkyzy            | 2 courses in the specialty "Paediatrics", NJSC<br>"Medical University of Karaganda"  |

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC. The EEC report includes a description of the results and conclusion of an external evaluation of the master's educational program "7M10124 Global Health" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards for educational programs of master's specialties in healthcare and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC for further improving the approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above-mentioned educational program and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council on Accreditation.

### 2. General part of the final report

# **2.1** Presentation of the master's educational program in the specialty "7M10124 Global Health"

| пеани   |   |
|---|---|
| Name of organization, legal form of                                       | Non-profit joint-stock company "Astana Medical University"                                |
| ownership, BIN  |   |
| Government  | Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan  |
| Full name of the first manager  | Nadyrov Kamalzhan Talgatovich   |
| University foundation date  | 1964  |
| Location and contact details  | Republic of Kazakhstan, 01000, Astana, st. Beibitshilik, 49A<br>Phone: +7(7172)539424     |
| State license for educational activities in the magistracy (date, number) | From 03/19/2019, No. KZ93LAA00014823, code 7M101 in the field of preparation "Healthcare" |
| Inclusion in the Register of  | Date of inclusion in the register - 05/31/2022  |
| educational programs of higher and  | EP update date $-03/11/2024$  |
| postgraduate education of the   |   |
| National Center for the Development                                       |   |
| of Higher Education of the Ministry                                       |   |
| of Education and Science of the   |   |
| Republic of Kazakhstan  |   |
| Information about branches,   | -   |
| subsidiaries (if any)   |   |
| Year of commencement of the   | 2023  |
| accredited educational program (EP)                                       |   |
| Duration of training  | 1 year  |
| Total number of graduates since the                                       | -   |
| beginning of the EP implementation  |   |
| Number of master's students in the  | 1   |
| EP since the beginning of the current                                     |   |
| academic year   |   |
| Full-time teachers/   | The total number of teachers is 14, including full-time                                   |
| part-time workers involved in the   | teachers - 12, part-time teachers - 2.  |
| implementation of the educational   |   |
| program, incl. % sedate   | Sedateness,% - 100%   |
| Website   | https://amu.edu.kz/ru/about-university/   |
| Instagram   |   |
| Facebook with active pages  |   |
|   |   |

From February 22, 2019, on the basis of the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On the issues of creating a non-profit joint-stock company "Astana Medical University" No. 648 dated October 16, 2018, the joint-stock company "Astana Medical University" was reorganized into a non-profit joint-stock company "Astana Medical University".

According to the organizational structure of NJSC "AMU" <u>https://amu.edu.kz/upload/images/struktura-012024.jpg</u>, the main structural divisions of the University are institutes, schools, departments, administrations, departments, centres, which include staff in the

ECAQA\_ Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Healthcare 4

following categories: Academic staff, administrative and managerial personnel, educational and support personnel, maintenance personnel.

NJSC "AMU" was the first among the medical universities of Kazakhstan to begin multi-level training of medical and scientific-pedagogical personnel (a system of continuous higher education) in the following areas: undergraduate - internship - residency; Bachelor's - Master's - Ph.D. doctorate.

The research school coordinating and implementing the Master's educational program "Global Health" is headed by PhD Raisova K.A.

NJSC "AMU", within the framework of the provided academic freedom, has developed the University Standard SU-AMU-15-22 "Educational programs: development and updating" <u>https://amu.edu.kz/upload/iblock/865/8653b0b7a81d2cf480aac38f1d57f716.pdf</u>, which regulates the procedure development of educational programs. Schools, QAC of EP, heads of departments and Academic staff at the design stage carry out:

- to study of the graduate's professional activity;

- to determine competencies (general (GC) and professional (PC));
- to form learning outcomes (LO) of the EP;
- to determine the list of disciplines depending on the LO;

- to determine the need for resources.

At the design stage of the program, as well as during the period of implementation of the EP, the following resources are analysed: material and technical base, information about the availability of food and medical services, computer software, investments in the EP, information and library support, the presence of a classroom fund, practical training resources, research and scientific achievements, academic staff and its potential.

In accordance with SU-AMU-15-22, the department initiates the development of the EP and sends a list of the composition of the working group to the research school. Based on this request, the IS issues an order on the composition of the working group. Next, the working group forms a draft EP, which is discussed at the department, QAC, agreed upon at a meeting of the Academic Council and approved by the Scientific Council.

Checking for compliance with the State Compulsory Educational Standards EP is carried out by the IS.

All interested parties are involved in the process of developing the EP. The working group for the development of the EP consists of both representatives of Academic staff and representatives from potential employers. At the stage of discussion and approval, representatives from among the students participate at the departmental meeting and at the meeting of the University's QAC.

The EP review procedure is carried out throughout the entire process of program development and approval. For the purpose of reviewing, the EP is sent to representatives of potential employers and educational institutions, including foreign ones. In the process of writing a review, reviewers indicate their suggestions and comments, which are necessarily taken into account.

The advisory bodies include representatives of students at all levels of education, including undergraduates, as members. Everyone has the right to make their own adjustments and suggestions if they are reasonably reasoned.

The developer of EP 7M10124 – "Global Health" is the Department of Public Health and Management, whose Academic staff are involved in its implementation.

At the development stage, more than 7 publications were published on this EP in both domestic and foreign journals, as well as participation in international practical conferences on global health. For example, two doctoral students were ambassadors in this area and were appointed to a conference in Sri Lanka -2021/2022.

External financing of projects is organized both by foreign organizations and at the expense of authorized bodies.

After going through all stages of discussion, consideration, recommendations, the educational program "Global Health" was approved at a meeting of the Scientific Council on June 30, 2023. Extract from the minutes No. 7 of the Regular meeting of the Scientific Council of the NJSC "AMU"

<u>https://drive.google.com/file/d/1S0WAqo6fs-I5K9clYpvP-HJG5bxZtQX1/view</u>. The final learning outcomes are determined in accordance with the learning outcomes reflected in the State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan (SCES RK).

The mission of the master's degree educational program 7M10124 – "Global Health" corresponds to the available resources, opportunities and market requirements. The departments participating in the implementation of the master's degree program 7M10124 – "Global Health" have sufficient scientific and pedagogical potential, consisting of highly qualified specialists. Thus, 14 full-time employees are involved in the implementation of the accredited program: 5 Doctors of Science, 4 Candidates of Science, 5 PhD, and the degree level are 100%.

NJSC "AMU" has a sufficient material and technical base to ensure the high-quality implementation of educational programs. Evidence of the constant improvement and renewal of the material and technical base of NJSC "AMU" is the use of updated resources of educational, scientific and research laboratories in educational and scientific processes; annual replenishment of the library's book collection in Kazakh, Russian and English languages; introduction of innovative, information and communication technologies.

Today the university actively participates in the National Ranking of Leading Universities in Kazakhstan 2022, which was conducted by the Independent Agency for Quality Assurance in Education (IQAA-Ranking) and took 2nd place.

In the ranking of medical universities by scientific publications in 2022, the university also took 2nd place. According to the results of the annual rating "Atameken" in 2022, the specialties "Public Health", "Dentistry", "General Medicine" took 1st place.

Based on the results of a comprehensive assessment of the British company QS, NJSC "Astana Medical University" received high scores and was awarded a "3 stars" rating, highlighting 2 categories in which NJSC "AMU" received 4 stars: training, employment opportunities.

### 2.2 Information about previous accreditation

To date, accreditation of the educational program "7M10124 Global Health" has not been carried out.

# 2.3 Brief description of the results of the analysis of the report on self-assessment of the master's educational program "7M10124 Global Health" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards of educational programs of master's specialties in health care and conclusions about completion

The report on self-assessment of the master's educational program "7M10124 Global Health" is presented on 112 pages of main text, 25 tables of annexes according to relevant standards, copies or electronic versions of 30 documents located at <u>https://amu.edu.kz/ru/about-university/</u>, <u>https://amu.edu.kz/upload/images/struktura-012024.jpg</u>

The report is characterized by completeness of answers to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for self-assessment of the educational program provided to the educational organization by the accreditation centre - ECAQA, as well as internal consistency of information. The report is accompanied by a covering letter signed by the rector Nadyrov Kamalzhan Talgatovich, who confirms the accuracy of the quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 16 members of the internal self-assessment committee indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting a self-assessment of the educational program is Turgambaeva A.K., head of the department of public health and management, candidate of medical sciences, associate professor, Sarymsakova B.E. - Professor of the Department of Public Health and Management, Raisova K.A. – Dean of the Institute of School, Suleimenova A.Yu. - senior methodologist of the research school, Dosanova A.K. – Head of the Centre for Planning and Development of Academic Affairs, Duisekova S.B. - associate professor-researcher of the department of Public health and Management, PhD,

Tleshova N.S. – head of the office registrar, Umbetzhanova A.T. - Associate Professor of the Department of General Medical Practice with a course of evidence-based medicine, PhD, Zikenov I.I. - Deputy Head of the HR Department, Khudaybergenov F.E. - Head of the Operations Department of Material and Technical Support, Esirkepova G.Zh. - Director of the Library, Akhmetova K. M. - Master, senior lecturer of the Department of Public Health and Management, Omirbek Zh. - software engineer, Karsakbaeva L.Zh., Ph.D., head of the educational process quality audit group; head of the working group, Karsakbaeva L.Zh., Ph.D., head of the educational process quality audit group; head of the working group.

Self-assessment of the educational program "7M10124 Global Health" was carried out on the basis of the order of the rector of the university No. 739-n/k dated December 16, 2023 "On self-assessment of the master's educational program 7M10124 "Global Health"".

All standards contain the actual practice of the university in preparing master's students in the specialty 7M10124 "Global Health", taking into account the start of admission of students in 2023, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the objectives of the educational program, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is quite complete and updated regarding the number of undergraduates, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, learning outcomes, results of evaluation of knowledge and skills, educational resources and practical learning environment, practice bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations ), financial information, plans for the development and improvement of undergraduate training and timely completion of dissertation research.

The report is presented to ECAQA in a complete form, written in literate language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criteria of the standards, the tables contain references in the text and are continuously numbered.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure is an external evaluation. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be received during the visit to the educational organization, i.e. carrying out verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

### **3. Description of external expert evaluation**

External expert work as part of the evaluation of the educational program "7M10124 Global Health" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the External Evaluation of Educational Organizations and Educational Programs of the ECAQA and in accordance with the program approved on 03/05/2024.

External evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Program (hereinafter referred to as the program), which is located in the documentation of the accreditation centre. The program is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of external expert evaluation.

To obtain objective information, members of the EEC used the following methods and their results:

- interviews with management and administrative employees 45 people;
- interviews with master's students 65 people;
- study of the university website <u>https://amu.edu.kz/ru/about-university/</u>
- interviewing 18 employees, 216 teachers, 5 scientific supervisors;
- survey of teachers and master's students 539 and 65, respectively;
- observation of the training of master's students: attendance at 3 practical classes:
  - 1. At the Department of Public Health and Management the topic of the lesson: "Modern approaches to management", teacher is associate professor Uazhanov Margulan

Ualkhanovich, PhD, students of 401 gr., specialty 6B10109 "Public Health", venue – st. Beibitshilik, 49, building 53, room. 507;

- 2. At the Department of Public Health and Epidemiology the topic of the lesson: "Basics of Epidemiology", teacher is Aidarkhanova A.I., students of 301 gr., specialty 6B10109 "Public Health", venue st. Beibitshilik, 49, building 53, room. 506;
- 3. At the Department of Public Health and Hygiene the topic of the lesson is: "Environmental Hygiene", teacher is senior teacher Zeinolldina A.S., students 303 gr., specialty 6B10109 "Public Health", venue st. Beibitshilik, 49, building 53, room. 303.
- review of resources in the context of implementing accreditation standards: visited 2 bases of practical training and scientific research, including "Alanda Clinic", Astana, Tauelsizdik Avenue 33, and the Institute of Radiobiology and Radiation Protection, and also visited the university library and museum.
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 39 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (the list of documents studied is in **Annex 2**).

The team of the accredited organization ensured the presence of all persons indicated in the visit program and according to the lists of interview sites (Table 1).

| Table 1 - Information on the number and | category of | participants | in meetings, | , interviews, talks |
|---|-------------|--------------|--------------|---------------------|
| with members of the EEC                 |             |              |              |                     |

| N⁰ | Position               | Quantity |
|----|------------------------|----------|
| 1  | Vice-Rector            | 4        |
| 2  | Directors              | 3        |
| 3  | Managers, specialists  | 18       |
| 4  | Chairmen               | 12       |
| 5  | Deans                  | 8        |
| 6  | Employers              | 22       |
| 7  | Teachers               | 216      |
| 8  | Scientific supervisors | 5        |
| 9  | Master's students      | 65       |
| 10 | Master's graduates     | 19       |

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held based on the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion was held on the results of the external evaluation of the educational program, study of documents, results of interviews, talks, and questionnaires. Members of the EEC began drafting the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the results of the external evaluation are made. The experts individually completed the "Quality Profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational program "7M10124 Global Health" for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards." No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the educational program were discussed by the chairman Kuzgibekova A.B. held a final open vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for the accreditation period.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC, and access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the university, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to members, but despite this there is insufficient continuity between structural divisions and poor awareness of the Academic staff on internal document flow.

While conducting a survey of undergraduates, 7.01% rated the work of the External Expert Commission on Accreditation as positive - 59.7%, 16.58% as satisfactory. The majority of respondents (74.21%) believe that it is necessary to accredit educational organizations or educational programs.

According to 63.08% of teachers, the survey conducted by the ECAQA is useful for developing recommendations for improving key areas of activity of an accredited educational organization.

 $\mathsf{ECAQA}_{\mathsf{Eurasian}}$  Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Healthcare 8

At the end of the visit, the chairman of the EEC announced recommendations based on the results of the external evaluation as part of specialized accreditation to the management and employees of the educational organization.

## 3. Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the master's educational program "7M10124 Global Health"

### **Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES**

### 1.1 Mission Statement, Goals and Learning Outcomes

The mission of the educational program (EP) 7M10124 "Global Health" is training highly qualified masters in global health. The mission reflects the specifics of personnel training under this program and is formulated in accordance with the strategic directions of the university" <u>https://amu.edu.kz/upload/iblock/0eb/0eb223bbc75239937df778921cbf0304.pdf.</u>

The mission of the EP was developed on the basis of the mission of the organization and the main regulatory documents - this is Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated November 24, 2022 No. 945 "On approval of the Concept for the development of healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan until 2026." <u>https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/P2200000945</u> and Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 12, 2021 No. 725 On approval of the national project "Quality and affordable healthcare for every citizen "Healthy Nation". <u>https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/P2100000725.</u>

The final learning outcomes are determined in accordance with the learning outcomes reflected in the State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan (SCES RK) and are prescribed in the modular educational program.

During interviews with students, the latter noted that the final results of training are discussed at QAC meetings, where student representatives are present.

The university has formulated the mission and goal of the educational program, which includes the preparation of highly qualified masters in global health, capable of mastering methods and methodology for evaluating the health status of the population, taking into account the application of international knowledge and practical skills." This formulation is presented in an accessible form for undergraduates and employers and ensures the attractiveness of the educational program.

While implementing program activities, namely, based on the results of an interview with the first head of the organization, members of the research school, QAC in interviews with and teachers, compliance with the criteria of **standard 1.1** was established, since the final learning outcomes contain both theoretical knowledge and the formation of analytical thinking through the discipline "Critical thinking and scientific writing", communication skills through the discipline "Management Psychology and Bioethics". The educational program formulates the goals of developing practical skills through the development of such disciplines as "Measuring the health of the population: methods and results", Social and economic determinants of health."

The university applies ethical approaches to teaching master's students. The experts familiarized themselves with the Code of Ethics for Students and Teachers (Protocol No. 28, approved on December 28, 2019). During a conversation with 65 master's students, experts were convinced that they knew about this document and used it in their studies and communication with teachers and colleagues.

### **1.2** Participation in the formulation of the mission and final learning outcomes

All participants in the educational process know the mission of the educational program, took part in the formation of proposals for formulating the mission (clause 1.2), for example, the Head of City Polyclinic No. 6 - Ph.D. Beyserkina D.S., Head of the RSE at the REM "Research and Production Centre for Transfusiology" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Astana - Ph.D. Abdrakhmanova S.A., Head of the "Alanda clinic" - Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor Ibraev S.Ye., Deputy Head of the State Institution "Central Hospital with a Polyclinic of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Republic of Kazakhstan" PhD, Tursynbet \_ Ye.A.

<u>https://docs.google.com/document/d/15BcSwkjW3Nldeuf8ethZOuzc1HZaKQav/edit.</u> Minutes of the 03/14/2023 meeting No. 3 were presented during the EEC's visit to the organization. On the recommendation of employers, the list of final results was supplemented with the following skills - demonstrating knowledge on the structure of organizations, mechanisms of their interaction with interested parties (stakeholders), principles of working in an external context in the long term, practical skill to be able to develop a strategic plan for the development of the organization.

The mission of the EP "Global Health" has not been updated, since the program has been implemented for the first year.

Experts found that the mission of the educational program was brought to the attention of master's degree applicants, undergraduates, and employers through the website, social networks, and information letters to medical organizations.

From interviews with master's students, it was established that before the start of classes, teachers inform about the mission and work plans of the university, and tell where to get the necessary information about the educational program, teachers, and training bases.

In the process of visiting university departments, experts noted the strengths of the accredited educational program; while attending classes at the Department of Public Health and Management, students during their answers used practical skills in solving situational problems, and the lesson was held in the form of a game, which significantly increases the assimilation of the topic.

The university has departments that are directly related to the master's educational program "710124 Global Health", which can be noted as the best practice in education, namely the Project Management Centre. In this centre, students gain project management skills and become familiar with tools for achieving strategic goals.

During conversations with master's students and employers, experts, answers were received to the following questions: "Do you participate in formulating the mission and goals of the organization, educational program?", "What is the personal contribution of master's students to improving the educational program?" To these questions, the master's students answered that they were members of advisory bodies at the university and proposed to strengthen the practical part of training within the framework of elective disciplines, and employers responded as follows: on their recommendation, the list of final results was revised and additions were made on issues of knowledge of the structure of organizations and mechanisms their interaction with interested parties (stakeholders), and students at the university stage mastering the skill of developing a strategic plan for the organization.

### 1.3 Institutional autonomy and academic freedom

To verify **standard 1.3**, a meeting was held with vice-rectors on issues of university autonomy in formulating the mission of the organization, drawing up educational programs, and a studentcentred approach. During the conversation, the experts asked the following questions: What is the autonomy of the university, how is the catalogue of elective disciplines formed, is the opinion of students taken into account, how is the issue of organizing mobility among students posed, do students have the right to choose a mentor or scientific consultant? During the answers, the projector confirmed that all interested parties participate in the development of the mission and final results of the EP; the discussion begins at the level of department meetings. The university developed its own form of the Syllabus. In addition to the EP itself, Syllabus, WC, there is a catalogue of elective disciplines (CED), which contains a description of the elective disciplines available for selection by master's students.

The university also has autonomy in the development of educational programs, including a master's program in the specialty "7M10124 Global Health". The program was developed by employees of the Department of Public Health and Management, reviewed and approved at a meeting of the department (Minutes No. 3 of March 14, 2022). Student-centred learning is reflected in the organization of the entire educational process, for example, on the recommendation of a master's student, the elective discipline "Environmental pollution as a determinant of health" was included in the EP.

The development of EP is carried out in accordance with the University Standard "Educationalprograms:developmentandupdating"SU-MUA-15-22https://amu.edu.kz/upload/iblock/865/8653b0b7a81d2cf480aac38f1d57f716.pdf.

The elective components were developed taking into account the opinions of master's students and representatives of practical healthcare. For example, an elective on the topic "Environmental pollution as a determinant of health" was developed in connection with global environmental challenges, such as floods.

When choosing a base for practical training, the choice was made in favour of the "Alanda Clinic", this is a 7-story elite private clinic with a state order, has its own laboratory, operating room, which is equipped with video cameras to monitor the progress of operations, both for students and teachers, and has a conference -hall, training rooms for students. There are highly qualified, established international-level personnel working there, such as Ospanov Oral, Tokpanov Serik and others. 35% of doctors speak English, with extensive experience working in international clinics; they are leading experts, each in their own field. Master's students are provided with all the necessary resources for preparing a dissertation research (library, access to international databases - see more in section 6.) There are the necessary Academic staffs of 14 people to maintain a teacher: master's student ratio of 1:3.

### **1.4 Name and description of the program**

The results of studying the documentation demonstrate that the mission of the organization and the mission of the educational program "7M10124 Global Health" are fully consistent with the objectives of preparing master's students in obtaining skills in using scientific research methodology in practical healthcare, with the ability to also be able to train their colleagues, and the educational process is structured in accordance with State Compulsory Educational Standards and Laws and Statutory Instruments (LSI) in postgraduate education and healthcare. At the same time, during meetings with internal and external stakeholders, experts identified a number of problems, including the fact that in the 1st year of development and implementation of this program there were no students admitted in an accredited program. Currently there is only 1 student.

Experts examined 39 pieces of documentation, including those directly related to the accredited master's program (see Annex 3 to this report).

To implement the educational program in the specialty "7M10124 Global Health", the organization's documents contain EMCD, which defines the goal, takes into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, and independent work. Compliance with State Standards and standard requirements has been established.

Information is provided on teaching methods in master's programs, including the possibility of creating an individual training program if necessary. This is regulated by the university document: PL-AMU-121-23 Regulations on master's studies (approved on June 29, 2023). In the document "PL-AMU-13-21 Regulations "On conducting intermediate and end-of-course assessment of students at NJSC "Astana Medical University"" dated January 20, 2021, P-AMU-17-23 "Academic policy of NJSC "AMU", dated 12/08/2023" describes the assessment policy, conditions for extending master's studies (for example, in case of long absences for a valid reason for the student), requirements for the preparation of a dissertation (RI-AMU-18-20 "Requirements for the content, design and defence of a master's thesis", dated 01/31/2020 G.

The support system for master's students is described in PL-AMU-146-22 "Regulations on the appointment, payment and amount of state scholarships for students" (approved on November 16, 2022).

The policy for identifying plagiarism is included in the document RI-AMU-18-20 "Requirements for the content, format and defence of a master's thesis" (approved on January 31, 2020). The principles of academic integrity are described in document K-AMU-01-20 "Regulations on Academic Integrity", dated 10/08/2020.

The conditions for the selection and admission of a master's student are contained in the document PR-AMU-04-23 "Rules for admission to the master's program" (approved 07/05/2023).

The procedure for filing complaints and applications from master's students is included in the document PL-AMU-121-23 Regulations on master's studies (approved on June 29, 2023).

The experts are familiar with the approved Policy on ensuring the quality of education (protocol No. 6 of 05/31/2023).

The procedure for informing master's students about their rights and responsibilities is reflected in the document PL-AMU-121-23 "Regulations on master's studies" (approved on June 29, 2023).

During a visit to the university and during an interview with employees - Baimagambetova A.A., dean of the school of health care and management, Abdrakhmanova A.K., senior methodologist of the centre for planning and development of academic affairs, the commission was convinced that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to everyone teachers and staff, and includes documents such as annual operating plans, annual reports - implementation of KPIs, regulations of departments, agreements with teachers and master's students, and educational and methodological documentation (work program, work curricula, syllabuses, journals), assessment tools (checklists, statements), evidence, certificates and verifications.. A review of the website showed that its pages contain the documents necessary for master's students - Regulations on master's studies, Requirements for the content, design and defence of a master's thesis, Code of Academic Integrity and information on updating educational programs, Regulations on the competency model of a graduate, which is updated regularly.

Experts reviewed the strategic development plan of the university for 2022-2026, including 5 directions, including the direction for the development of postgraduate education: "Training competitive and professionally competent healthcare specialists in popular specialities and specializations." According to experts, this confirms the fulfilment of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the university.

While conducting a survey of 65 master's students on the resource (<u>https://webanketa.com/</u>), out of 22 questions, a number were devoted to the quality of the educational process and educational program. It was found that 58.07% of undergraduates would recommend studying at the university to their acquaintances, friends, and relatives. And 55.8% of respondents believe that educational program leaders and teachers are aware of students' problems related to learning. To the question "Do you think the university allows you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in your chosen specialty?", 66.96% of undergraduates answered positively, 33.04% were not sure about this.

The 553 teacher's surveyed (question 23 of the survey) also answered that 70.87% were satisfied with the organization of work and workplace at the university, and 24.30% partially agreed with this statement. Experts determined that the university has a healthy microclimate, since the director is quite accessible to both undergraduates and employees, and responds promptly to applications and requests. In the questionnaire, 83.86% of teachers are satisfied with the microclimate at the university, and 13.91% are partially satisfied. According to 74.95% of respondents, they have the opportunity to realize themselves as professionals in their specialty. Teaching experience is up to 5 years - 24.49%, up to 10 years - 17.7%, over 10 years - 58.44%.

*EEC conclusions based on the criteria.* Compliant out of 5 basic standards: fully – 5. *Recommendations for improvement- none* 

### **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME**

### 2.1 Learning and teaching methods

For the effective implementation of the master's program in the specialty "7M10124 Global Health," the department uses such teaching methods as Project-based learning, Research-based learning, analysis of specific situations (ASS or case studies); team-based learning (TBL), incl. work in small groups; role-playing, business games; creative tasks (videos, crosswords, quizzes, etc.); use of problematic and situational tasks in practical classes; - e-learning, analysis from the perspective of evidence-based medicine.

The choice of these teaching methods is due to the fact that it allows master's students to develop the ability to work with primary sources, master the skills of independent presentation with oral reports, substantiate and defend their own point of view. Master's students are taught the skills of conducting a discussion and the ability to listen to a partner.

The university organizes training for master's students at practical bases and laboratories, where they form and develop practical skills such as sensibly evaluating an unusual situation that has arisen, making independent management decisions, and practicing the algorithm of their actions in emergency situations.

By attending practical classes on the topics "Modern approaches to management", 90 hours (3 credits), "Basics of Epidemiology", 90 hours (3 credits), "Environmental Hygiene", 300 hours (10 credits), the experts received convincing data that the training is carried out according to plan; before the start of the lesson, master's students answer tests, receive feedback from the teacher, and have the opportunity to improve their skills in assessing the environment, the epidemiological situation and making management decisions. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational program, since experts studied the code of ethics (December 28, 2019) and during the interview, master's students responded that they were informed about the contents of this document.

In a conversation with master's students, experts saw that the university promotes the development of practical competencies of master's students, including research ones. At the same time, master's students deepen their theoretical knowledge and develop communication skills.

The training of master's students in the specialty "7M10124 Global Health" is aimed at meeting the needs of practical healthcare, since when analysing the shortage of specialists for 2022, it was found that practical healthcare, namely the Sanitary and Epidemiological Committee, does not have enough specialists in the relevant profile. Therefore, the university provides a lot of opportunities and conditions for qualified training of specialists in this field. So, during a conversation with the dean of the Research School - Raisova K.A. experts received the following information: EP "7M10124 Global Health" was developed within the framework of the international project Erasmus+, in which 5 countries (Germany, Norway, Ukraine, Georgia and Kazakhstan) participated, and teachers confirmed that before the launch of this program they underwent repeated training in global health, participated in international practical conferences, 7 articles have been published on this topic and that currently the training of master's students is carried out under a joint educational program with Al-Farabi Kazakh National University.

Of the 65 master's students surveyed, 56.55%% answered that teachers in the classroom use active and interactive teaching methods quite often, 36.51%% believed that they rarely or sometimes. When visiting the university, experts did not identify any problems with the introduction of new teaching methods.

### 2.2 Development of academic skills

Experts received evidence that the educational program develops academic skills in master's students, including independent thinking, analytical skills, critical thinking, and decision-making skills. During a conversation with master's students, experts came to the conclusion that master's students can reason, are capable of critical perception of information and have the communication skills necessary for a scientist-teacher-health specialist. For example, experts asked the following questions: When writing scientific articles, what university resources can you use? The master's students answered: The University fully provides all resources, we can use laboratories, and we have access to all international databases for writing articles. The master's students also noted that during practical classes they are also taught how to critically evaluate articles using international checklists.

The experts got acquainted with the individual work plan of the master's student (IWPMS) for the accredited program, which contains information about the individual curriculum, the number of basic, major disciplines in credits, types of internships, their number, and a plan for completing the master's thesis. The IWPMS is formed for each student and stored in the student's personal AIS account and serves as the basis for monitoring the implementation and mastery of the curriculum. The structure of the IWPMS was developed on the basis of the State Compulsory Educational Standard for 2022 and does not require additional internal approval.

Teachers provide undergraduates with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, with which 60.67% are completely satisfied, 24.59% are partially satisfied, 14.7% are not satisfied.

### 2.3 Contents of the program, scope of application

There are documents containing requirements for the content of educational programs SU-AMU-15-22 "Educational programs: development and updating" dated 08/31/2023, including the responsibility for the selection and implementation of innovations in the educational process lies with the head of the EP.

Each topic of the master's program includes basic and advanced theories and models, such as the competency-oriented approach, which is a unified system for defining goals, selecting content, organizing the specialist training process based on identifying special, general and key competencies, guaranteeing a high level of professional performance of specialists.

The content of work programs and the catalogue of elective disciplines reflect the needs of the health care system, such as the knowledge and ability to think critically in the face of any modern challenges, as well as the specifics of research and scientific achievements of teachers.

When developing the master's program, the developers relied on professional medical literature, including the scientific supervisors' own experience.

The surveyed teachers responded that 85.4% were completely satisfied with the level of previous training of master's students, and 14.7% were partially satisfied.

Experts have established a clear continuity between the final outcomes of the previous training of master's students (prerequisites) and training in the master's program, as well as subsequent programs of continuous professional development. The university has developed 94 additional education programs (60 hours - 46 EP, 90 hours - 3 EP, 120 hours - 35 EP, 150 hours - 4 EP, 240 hours - 6 EP), including for the specialty " 7M10124 Global Health" - 20. Master's students are informed about this. The total number of non-formal education programs is 27.

82.3% of teacher respondents believe that university students have a high level of knowledge and practical skills after completing the training program, and 13.7% partially agree with this. **2.4 Research and grants** 

An analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in the advising disciplines were taken into account, additions were made to the EMCD bibliography and syllabuses, and teachers use them in the classroom.

The educational program includes the scientific foundations and methodology of medical research (discipline: "Epidemiology and biostatistics", for example, topic: "Quantitative and qualitative research methods"). While talking with master's students, experts learned that they use scientific data in their training and know the basics of evidence-based medicine. The teachers said that they teach master's students methods of critical evaluation of literature, articles and scientific data, and the application of scientific developments.

The university carries out 34 scientific and technical programs (STP), the results of which can become the basis for the research practice of master degree students. For example, "Building Academic Capacity in Global Health in the Eastern Europe/Central Asia Region" is carried out by the Department of Public Health and Management.

While surveying master's students, it was found that the university has access to student participation in research work and 80.1% of people were completely satisfied with this, 18.7% were partially satisfied, and 5.4% were dissatisfied. Master's students should engage in research and in response to the questionnaire, 40.1% wrote that they are already engaged in research, 38.7% are planning to start, 16.8% are looking for a research topic, 15.38% are not engaged.

### 2.5 Program structure and duration

The duration of the Global Health program, major area, is 1800 hours. The academic year begins in September and ends in May. Of the 60 credits presented in the EP, 16.6% are basic disciplines,

according to the State Compulsory Educational Standard 83.4% are major disciplines including industrial practice. In addition to the cycles of the university component prescribed in the structure of the EP, there are elective components that are developed by departments, based on the demand of the labour market, the needs of students and modern scientific achievements.

Required components of the master's program are 180 hours (10%). The elective component lasts 1500 hours and includes such disciplines as Globalization and health, critical thinking and scientific writing, epidemiology and biostatistics, non-communicable diseases, environmental pollution, etc. The allotted time for independent study is 720 hours and is intended for mastering the independent work of master's students, according to the approved thematic plan.

The program describes approaches to formative (current) and summative (final) assessment of a master's student. Feedback from master's students is carried out regularly and includes the following questions: effectiveness of teaching, use of innovative teaching methods, and satisfaction with the educational process, how relevant the topics taught are. Thus, the results of a survey of master's students conducted by the Department of Public Health and Management demonstrate: satisfaction with the educational process - 87.5%, teaching methods - 89.1%, application of innovative teaching methods - 83.8%.

Providing feedback;

Upon completion of training, the master's student is issued a diploma and is awarded the qualification Master of Health in the educational program "7M10124 Global Health", which corresponds to level 7 of the European Qualifications Framework, the requirements for completing the program.

The procedure for extensions and breaks of studies is described in the Regulations "On Master's Degree Studies" dated June 29, 2023. During the reporting period, 1 master's student in the specialty "7M10124 Global Health" took advantage of this.

For the successful implementation of the educational program in the specialty "7M10124 Global Health", the organization has resources for organizing the evaluation of practical skills of master's student (All information about the assessment policy, assessment methods, including evaluation criteria, examination criteria, weight and criteria for students' progress, appeal procedure, the number of permitted retakes and the conditions for retaking the exam are contained in the "Academic Policy of NJSC "AMU" P-AMU-17-23

https://amu.edu.kz/upload/iblock/b69/b69b044bb38b1675685e53048d4f2a33.pdf).

Practical training of master's students is carried out in the conditions of such medical organizations as the "Alanda clinic", the MSE on the REM "City Polyclinic No. 10", the Republican State Enterprise "Hospital of the Medical Centre for Administration of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan", which guarantees the acquisition of skills by master's students in various aspects (research, supervision, examination, management, teaching, decision making) of the chosen area of health care.

### 2.6 Educational program development process

Management of the educational process, reflected in the self-assessment report (**Standard 2**) and general approaches to management were confirmed during visits to three departments (public health and management, public health and hygiene, public health and epidemiology) and conversations with the head and staff. At the same time, verification of **standard 2** showed that the accredited educational program is being implemented according to the approved plan.

Experts got acquainted with the work of departments and councils involved in the development of the master's educational program "7M10124 Global Health", including the program implementers. A total of 5 meetings were held and during cross-interviews with Academic staff of three departments (12 people), it was established that all interested parties took part in the development of this educational program, whose opinions were fully taken into account (both employers and students).

The process of developing an educational program includes an evaluation of the needs for specialists (for example, there is a need for graduates of the "7M10124 Global Health" program, according to the Head of the SEC in Astana), and the cost of training is 1,020,000 tenge.

The master's program was developed at the Department of Public Health and Management and approved at a meeting of the Scientific Council on June 30, 2023. Extract from the minutes No. 7 of the Regular meeting of the Scientific Council of the NJSC "AMU" https://drive.google.com/file/d/1S0WAqo6fs-I5K9clYpvP-HJG5bxZtQX1/view. The master's program was reviewed by an external reviewer Sarsenbaeva G.Zh., Ph.D., associate professor, head Department of Social Health Insurance and Public Health of South Kazakhstan Medical Academy JSC and the reviewer noted that the EP fully complies with international training standards and is written at a high level. Thus, the experts analysed the hierarchy and sequence of development and implementation of the master's program.

The following recommendations were made during the development of the master's program: employers made recommendations in terms of strengthening the practical skills of future master's students, and in particular the ability to draw up a strategic plan for the organization, which the department took into account when finalizing the master's program.

However, there are difficulties in planning, developing and approving educational programs, including in recruiting students for this program, since the awareness of applicants is insufficient.

At the same time, to the question "Do representatives of master's students participate in the development of educational programs?, the experts received the following answer that students are members of advisory bodies.

69.66% of the surveyed master's students are fully satisfied with the schedule of classes. , completely, partially disagree or doubt – every 3rd (30.34%).

*EEC conclusions based on the criteria.* Compliant out of 21 standards (including 19 basic, 2 improvement standards): fully - 20, partially - 1, do not comply - 0.

### **Recommendations for improvement:**

1) To provide for the development of joint educational programs (JEP) or double-degree educational programs with non-medical universities.

### **Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS**

### **3.1** Assessment methods

The Regulations "On conducting intermediate and end-of-course assessment of students at NJSC "AMU" dated January 20, 2021 define the principles and methods used to evaluate master's students including criteria for admission to exams, the number of exams, the number of permitted retakes ("Academic Policy of NJSC "AMU" dated 12/08/2023). The choice of certain methods for evaluating master's students is based on the specifics of the disciplines.

To ensure that the results of the assessment of master's students are available to external experts, they are placed in the automated Platonus system, to which teachers, students, staff of the Research School, the Registrar's Office, etc. have access.

The results of the assessment of master's students are documented in the AIS "Platonus" in the form of a statement, which is generated in the Registrar's Office and transmitted to the Research School. Paper copies of the statements, signed by the head of the Registrar's Office, are stored in the Research School; electronic statements are available in the Platonus AIS, access to which is available to the Registrar's Office specialists.

Objectivity and transparency of assessments and the grading process is ensured through the Platonus AIS.

The study of control and measurement tools (500 tests, 45 situational tasks, 2 checklists) showed that the university has implemented an appropriate assessment policy that allows for a comprehensive assessment of the educational achievements of master's students. During the interview, the master's students talked about the forms of assessment, for example, what the daily assessment in a practical lesson consists of, and that they were satisfied with everything. They also receive regular feedback from teachers.

In order to implement the principles of academic integrity and transparency in the organization and control of the educational process, the University has an appeal system in accordance with the "Academic "AMU" Policv of NJSC P-AMU-17-23. https://amu.edu.kz/upload/iblock/b69/b69b044bb38b1675685e53048d4f2a33.pdf. To verify the data of standard 3, the experts asked the head of the postgraduate education department: How is master's students' progress monitored, are current grades issued daily? The experts were given access to the Platonus AIS. The learning results of master's students are evaluated during practical classes by grading in the AIS "Platonus", once a week. CISs are available for all disciplines provided; in the nomenclature of cases they are stored in the EMCD folder. Test tools are reviewed by internal experts. The heads of the departments visited by the experts responded that additions and updates to the CIS are planned to be made annually when updating the syllabuses.

### **3.2 Evaluation system**

The assessment of academic skills is at the graduate level as it applies teaching methods such as utility, which includes validity, reliability, acceptability and effectiveness. The developed assessment criteria are valid (objects of assessment correspond to the set goals of the academic discipline); developing (allows you to record what students can do and how they can improve their results); fair (all students have equal opportunities to succeed); reliable (uniform agreed upon criteria or standards are used); effective (feasible, but does not take up much time from teachers and students); timely (feedback is constantly provided).

Assessment methods and results avoid conflicts of interest, as they are based on the following important principles: - planned: analysis and assessment are carried out not spontaneously, but in compliance with a certain plan (according to the calendar-thematic plan of disciplines; systematicity: analysis and assessment must correspond to structural components of the content of the material being studied and are constant (rating system); objectivity, which is ensured by a 100-point assessment (there are criteria for each assessment); students know their grades, which stimulates them to increase their activity: they will be checked; knowledge, abilities, skills of everyone; unity of requirements: taking into account national standards of educational content in accordance with the qualification characteristics of the educational program.

The evaluation system for master's students includes the principles of anti-plagiarism (the Regulations on the use of an automated system for detecting plagiarism and checking texts for borrowings have been introduced, Protocol No. 23, dated 08.22.2023) and academic integrity (Code of Academic Integrity, Protocol No. 29, dated 10.08.2020. ), which includes the Rights and responsibilities of participants in the educational process within the framework of academic integrity, as well as the responsibilities of participants in the educational process.

The experts examined the resources for organizing the assessment of knowledge and practical skills, namely, the AIS "Platonus".

The interviewed representatives of employers also pointed out that the training of graduates corresponds to the modern development of medical practice and science, since, in their words, the university is 70% a "training ground" for practical healthcare. Employers said that they themselves participate in the evaluation of master's students, since they are included in the commission for the final state certification and defense of master's theses. But the educational organization did not provide systematic feedback to them. Employers believe that they wanted to see the strongest skills in master's graduates, such as drawing up a strategic plan for an organization and knowledge of an algorithm for making management decisions in emergency situations.

### 3.3 Feedback from undergraduates

The experts received information that each master's student provides feedback through individual and detailed written feedback (or oral feedback with a written report) after formative and summative assessments. Feedback questionnaires for master's students have been developed, and surveys are conducted regularly after completing each discipline. For example, when surveying master's students, university teachers received information that the teacher should announce their grades at the end of each lesson, since grades are posted in the journal only 2 times a week. This recommendation was discussed at the department meeting and brought to the attention of each teacher. **3.4 Quality assurance of the assessment system** 

The organization evaluates the reliability and validity of evaluation methods through developed and approved assessment criteria.

During a visit to the university, management was asked the question: "Are external examiners involved in order to improve the fairness, quality and transparency of the assessment process?" And the answer was received that during the final state certification, external examiners are involved.

While conducting interviews with 216 teachers regarding evaluation methods, experts received convincing information that teachers at the master's student level do not assign current grades to students in the Platonus AIS, while master's students are given current grades 2 times a week. Master's students also shared their opinions about the timeliness of providing tests, counselling before exams, the clarity of the entire assessment procedure and its fairness. For example, master's students said that teachers are always available for consultations, even outside the approved schedule.

*EEC conclusions based on the criteria* correspond to 10 basic standards: completely – 10. *Recommendations for improvement: none* 

### **Standard 4: STUDENTS**

### 4.1 Admission and selection policy

The organization has a policy for the admission of master's students, which has been approved and implemented by NJSC "AMU" "Rules for admission to master's programs" PR-AMU-04-23, which spells out the requirements, the procedure that ensures the process of transparent selection of master's students, which are posted on the university website in the section "Master's program for applicants"<u>https://amu.edu.kz/upload/iblock/cc6/cc6b818f460b686171afa18888430eb2.pdf.</u>

Admission of students under the 7M10124 "Global Health" program is planned taking into account the total area of educational premises, the availability of teaching staff, the provision of educational, educational, methodological and scientific literature, the carrying capacity of the university's practical bases, and the availability of social and living conditions for training students. For the period of the interview, an examination committee is created at the University from among the Academic staff, the composition of the examination committee, indicating their chairmen, is approved by order of the Rector of the University. According to the mission of the EP, the policies and admission criteria for the Global Health program are drawn up taking into account the production of specialists who are capable of assisting in the improvement of comprehensively solving problems of economic management, finance and mastery of new management tools.

The dean of the research school, Raisova K.A., spoke about the policy for admitting master's students. Approaches to the admission of master's students are based on the requirements of the country and internal regulations, namely, the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 600 "On approval of the Standard Rules for admission to training in educational organizations implementing educational programs of higher and postgraduate education." The EP "Global Health" was included in the register in 2022, and admission was only in the 2023-2024 academic year; only 1 master's student entered this program.

Thus, experts validated the data according to **standard 4.** In general, all criteria are met, at the same time, some shortcomings were identified in terms of career guidance work on admitting students for this program, and this EP is not reflected on the university website. The experts reviewed the documentation for the admission of master's students, including the University Standard "Model for Evaluation of the Educational Program" dated January 12, 2024. The presented documents were compiled at the proper level.

Regarding the practice of academic counselling, personal support for master's students and the development of not only professional skills, experts interviewed the dean of the research school Raisova K.A., the head of the department of public health and management - Turgambaeva A.K., who

answered that students can answer all questions of interest contact the dean of the School, the supervising vice-rector, or write to the rector's blog. Each student within the EP, together with a supervisor, draws up an individual work plan, determined by a list of elective disciplines. The choice of topic takes into account the relevance of the issue within the research areas of the department.

Each student within the EP, together with a supervisor, draws up an individual work plan, determined by a list of elective disciplines. The choice of topic takes into account the relevance of the issue within the research areas of the department.

The organization does not have a separate development program for master's students. Master's students are included in such advisory bodies as the Committee for Quality Assurance of EP Master's and Doctoral Studies. Based on the results of an interview with the chairman of the QAC for master's and doctoral studies Latypova N.A., as well as interviews with master's students, the experts were convinced that the QAC included a representative of master's students.

### 4.2 Admission of master's students

The university has implemented a policy and process for admitting master's students based on their previous achievements, the principles of equality and objectivity. Admission of master's students is based on Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 600 "On approval of the Standard Rules for admission to study in educational organizations implementing educational programs of higher and postgraduate education." NJSC "AMU" has approved and implemented the "Rules for Admission to Master's Degree" PR-AMU-04-23, which sets out the requirements and procedure for ensuring the process of transparent selection of master's students, which are posted on the university website in the section "Master's Degree for Applicants" https://amu.edu.kz/upload/iblock/cc6/cc6b818f460b686171afa18888430eb2.pdf.

The number of master's students for the current academic year is 163 people, in the current academic year and in general there is 1 master's student studying in the specialty "7M10124 Global Health".

The procedure for admitting master's students with disabilities to the master's program 7M10105 "Management in Healthcare" is carried out in accordance with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 27, 2007 No. 319-III "On Education", observing the principle of accessibility of education at all levels for the population, taking into account intellectual development, psychophysiological and individual characteristics each person describes the practice of admitting master's students with disabilities in accordance with the current laws and regulatory documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan. During the reporting period, no undergraduates with special needs were admitted.

### 4.3 Support and counselling for master's students

The university provides master's students with a scholarship in the amount of 102,000 tenge (in accordance with the "Regulations on the appointment, payment and amount of state scholarships for students" dated November 16, 2022). Other types of support for master's students include the following: payment of tuition in instalments, discounts on tuition for excellent students, discounts on dormitory accommodation, payment for participation in conferences, payment for publishing articles in international databases.

The University underwent a preliminary familiarization with the activities of the "e-University" Service Centre, created to serve all categories of students, teachers and staff of the University in order to optimize and automate processes in the provision of services on the "one office" principle, minimize corruption risks, transfer paper services in electronic format.

The University has help boxes and a helpline, which operate continuously and are one of the important types of socially significant services.

The participation of master's students in the development of the master's program is also carried out through the choice of elective disciplines; master's students have the right to make a proposal to include in the catalogue new elective disciplines, in their opinion, necessary for study and contributing to the improvement of the educational program as a whole. While talking with master's students, experts received evidence that they were provided with academic, financial (including assistance in publications and participation in conferences) and psychological support through the research school.

### 4.4 Representation of master's students

Master's students are included in the work of advisory bodies to participate in the development, management and evaluation of educational programs, as well as other issues relevant to master's students. Thus, master's student Rakhmanberdi Nazerke Musakhankyzy was included in the QAC by order No. 1 of 10/04/2023.

### 4.5 Requirements for master's students

Requirements for master's students regarding the implementation of the program (projects, dissertation, practice, portfolio, transcripts, etc.) are described in the document "Requirements for the content, design and defence of a master's thesis" dated January 31, 2020. The preparation of an individual work plan for a master's student is carried out by according to SCES-2-22

The experts were shown evidence of the development of research and critical analysis skills among master's students during a visit to the radiobiological laboratory of the university.

### 4.6 Indicators of progress and reasons for lag

Requirements for a master's student's progress are described in the individual work plan of each master's student and approved by the dean of the research school.

If there is academic debt and/or failure to complete the dissertation work within a certain time frame, the university has developed the document "Academic Policy of NJSC "AMU"" dated 12/08/2023 to predict such situations and help the master's student overcome them. Accounting for the progress of master's students is carried out by a unit - the Department of Public Health and Management.

The department cannot present the performance indicators of master's students in the "7M10124 Global Health" program over the years, since the master's student entered this year.

*EEC conclusions based on the criteria.* Comply with 12 basic standards: fully - 11, partially - 1, do not comply - 0

### **Recommendations for improvement:**

1) To expand career guidance work to attract students to the educational program "7M10124 Global Health".

### **Standard 5: ACADEMIC STAFF**

### **5.1 Selection policy**

There are a total of 14 employees, of which 12 are full-time part-time teachers 2. The experts are familiar with the personnel policy P-AMU-03-23 "Personnel Policy" dated 08.08.2023. The Regulations on Scientific Management "Rules for the Competitive Replacement of Faculty Positions and scientific workers of NJSC "AMU" dated May 14, 2018."

External experts received the opinion of teachers on personnel policy, which includes procedures for admission, registration, and dismissal of Academic staff and employees. Recruitment of teachers is carried out through a competition for filling vacant positions of Academic staff, the procedure for which is regulated by the Rules for competitive filling of positions of Academic staff and scientific workers of NJSC "Astana Medical University" (PR-AMU-20-18) <a href="https://amu.edu.kz/upload/iblock/4a1/4a13cf6dbf41694cf7b013b174991838.pdf">https://amu.edu.kz/upload/iblock/4a1/4a13cf6dbf41694cf7b013b174991838.pdf</a> and job descriptions.

Conversation with the head of the department of public health and hygiene Suleimenova R.K. included questions such as how the department recruits new employees, what is the emphasis placed on when recruiting? and it allowed experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees from practical healthcare to theoretical departments for teaching (there are 2 such teachers in total), about the strategy and tactics of admitting master's students, the information security of the educational program, and also to identify problems in the management and development of human resources, so as

most part-time workers do not have teaching skills, but have mentoring skills. While surveying teachers, it was found that the majority of 74.77% are completely satisfied with the organization of work and workplace at the university, but 19.85% are partially satisfied. At the university, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research work - 70.13% completely agree, 23.01%% partially agree. When asked about the implementation of a social support program for teachers, more than half of the teaching staff noted that such programs exist - 55.84%, 43.04% do not know about this program. Satisfied with wages - 40.07% completely agree, 13.73% partially agree.

### **5.2 Commitment and staff development**

At a meeting with the head of the HR department and during interviews with teachers, experts received information about approaches to developing the pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation to work with master's students, and the implementation of scientific supervision, which includes additional payment for supervising master's students.

The experts received answers about the teacher training program, which is conducted annually, and 6 teachers participating in the implementation of the educational program were trained for the 2023-2024 academic year. These events are funded by the university. The expert verified teachers' certificates on such topics as "Fundamentals of pedagogical measurement methods", 72 hours, "In the context of the Erasmus co-funded BASE ProJect", 60 hours, Global Health Emerging Leaders program Kazakhstan 2023, 30 hours.

Experts have found that teachers initiate research topics for undergraduates, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature, medical records and reporting documentation, the strategic plan of a medical organization, and acts of research into an epidemiological outbreak.

The Quality Assurance Committee ensures proper monitoring of teachers' activities through questionnaires. Feedback on satisfaction with the educational process, professional and personal development is carried out twice a year. Responsible department is HR department, QAC.

Teacher satisfaction indicators are improving over time.

At the university there is an opportunity for career growth and development of teacher competencies - 74.95% of surveyed teachers responded, and 21.15% partially agreed with this. They studied in professional development programs - 54.17% during this year, 41% more than 3 years ago, 4.83% more than 5 years ago and 4.83% answered "I don't remember when it was."

The university implements social support programs for teachers - 55.84% responded that "yes, such programs exist," 1.11% "I have already taken advantage of it," and 43.01% of respondents do not know about it.

### 5.3 Number and qualifications of teaching and management personnel

Master's students in the specialty "7M10124 Global Health" are trained by Doctors of Science (5), Candidates of Science (4), and Doctors of Science (5). The ratio "master's student to teacher" is 1:3.

Master's students have supervisors (mentors) who help with the completion of their dissertation work. There is 1 scientific supervisor in total, who are represented in an accredited educational program.

### **5.4 Administrative support**

Activities are described and published that provide administrative support for master's students and teachers, which include trips to conferences, financial assistance for publishing articles in international databases, instalment payment for tuition for master's students, discounts on training for excellent students, discounts on dormitory accommodation, financial assistance.

*EEC conclusions based on the criteria.* Complies with 7 basic standards: fully – 7. *Recommendations for improvement: none* 

### Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES AND LEARNING ENVIRONMENT 6.1 Learning environment

A review of the resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, for example, the practical bases of the private clinic "Alanda" were visited, which has its own laboratory, conference room, training rooms for students, and employees of the educational organization ensure collegial and ethical relations with medical staff, management of the practical basis for achieving the final results of master's students. Modern equipment in the laboratory is provided and demonstrates accessibility to students, and employees who simultaneously perform the roles of teachers and curators (mentors) provide high-quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the corresponding discipline of the educational program, the master's student receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during his studies. All conditions for acquiring skills have been created on a practical basis, and there is access to the organization's accounting and reporting documentation.

During a visit to the practical base, where experts examined the resources, their compliance with training programs, and accessibility for teachers and master's students, how modern this equipment is and meets the needs of students and practical healthcare. The experts obtained evidence of compliance with standard 6, as well as validation of the self-assessment report information.

The volume of the book fund for the EP "7M10124 Global Health" is 4313, of which textbooks and educational literature – 3329 copies, scientific literature – 984 copies, including in the Kazakh language - 1618 copies, in Russian 1810 copies. and in English - 885 copies.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report data and obtain evidence about the quality of the programs, an interview was conducted with master's students in the specialty "7M10124 Global Health". The experts asked questions about satisfaction with training, sufficient time to supervise patients, working with medical documentation in DAMUMED, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for master's students in need, and availability of resources from international databases of professional literature. In general, master's students are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered the university, because they believe that the university has good resources, image and international connections, at the same time, master's students would like the classes to take place more on practical bases with demonstration and honing of skills on workplace.

Master's students showed their commitment to the university, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgment in organizing training, evaluating their skills, advisory support, conducting research, and financing.

Experts studied the documents of master's students (IWMT, results of assessment of master's students, results of survey of master's students).

Students have free access to patients at clinical sites and all conditions for improving their practical skills - 60.30% of teachers completely agree with this, 24.68% partially agree, 15.03% found it difficult to answer.

An interview with 216 teachers, including 200 full-time teachers, showed that there are both successes and problems in education management, depending on the specific base (admission of undergraduates to equipment, sufficient amount of equipment, time for maintaining medical records, independent work of students, forms their implementation).

### 6.2 Information technology

To support the mission of the educational program, the library provides users with access to their own (electronic library, repository) and subscription databases (hereinafter referred to as DB), under a national license to international full-text resources.

A policy has been introduced that is aimed at the effective use and assessment of information, communication and distance technologies in the preparation of master's students. It is regulated by the University Standard document "Implementation of new educational technologies" dated January 24, 2023.

There is an IT department, the structure of which includes the Information and Analytical Centre and the IT Infrastructure and Information Systems Administration Department.

The territory of the university is provided with the Internet and WI-FI.

Library technical park: computers - 82 pcs, Elarscan - 1 pcs, interactive whiteboard with stand - 1 pcs, copier - 1 pcs, MFP - 1 pcs, printer - 4 pcs.

For distance learning there is a developed distance learning system (DLS). To conduct research, write a dissertation, self-study and access to the necessary information, master's students have access to international databases, including ScienceDirect (Elsevier)- <u>https://www.sciencedirect.com/</u>, Scopus (Elsevier)- <u>https://www.scopus.com</u>- <u>https://www.elsevier.com</u>, Springer - <u>https://www.springer.com</u>, EBSCOhostCinal- <u>https://www.ebsco.com/products/ebscohost-research-platform</u>, Cochrane Library - <u>https://www.cochranelibrary.com/.</u> and other bases.

*EEC conclusions based on the criteria.* Complies with 4 basic standards: fully – 4. *Recommendations for improvement: none* 

### Standard 7: MONITORING AND EVALUATING THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM 7.1 Program monitoring and evaluation mechanisms

There is a program for monitoring educational activities, which includes evaluating the effectiveness of each educational program. For example, the EP "Global Health" is aimed at interdisciplinary connections and a competency-based approach using modular learning technologies, taking into account the final learning outcomes.

The adequacy of the existing educational environment is evaluated through a survey among participants in the educational program by the Educational Process Quality Audit Group. The main objective of conducting a survey is to obtain objective information about the effectiveness of teaching at a university and evaluate the satisfaction of participants in the educational process, in order to improve the quality of education. To systematize this process, the working group developed a catalogue of questionnaires in three languages, approved at a meeting of the academic council (https://drive.google.com/file/d/1r51AL2huLm5ZNLrLMIxMIbqHGEMi8Ome/view?usp=drive\_link.

The results of the evaluation of the master's program are discussed at the QAC (Minutes No. 6 of the meeting of the Committee for Quality Assurance of Master's and Doctoral Educational Programs dated May 31, 2023) and are available to all interested parties.

As a result of monitoring and evaluation of the master's program, areas requiring improvement were identified: when discussing an accredited EP, it is also necessary to involve non-medical specialists (for example, specialists from an agricultural university).

### 7.2 Feedback from teachers and master's students

The university collects, analyses and provides teachers and master's students with feedback on the quality of implementation of the educational program. This process is carried out by various structural divisions; schools and departments also conduct monitoring by conducting surveys in order to identify the level of satisfaction with the educational program of university community participants. The method of conducting surveys using QR codes was discussed at the hardware meeting ((https://drive.google.com/file/d/10bU7Hpz6dFecSYLA0LyhClGsE65vrsvc/view?usp=drive\_link).

Feedback is collected regularly after completing each discipline.

### 7.2 Activities of master's students and graduates

There is only 1 master's student studying in this program; there has been no graduation yet.

During interviews with master's degree graduates, experts learned that, in general, master's programs are implemented at the university at the proper level, which allowed master's graduates to safely continue their studies in doctoral studies.

The results of the analysis of the activities of master's students (academic performance, defence of dissertations) are provided by the Department of Public Health and Management to the research school and the QAC for master's and doctoral studies, which are responsible for admitting master's students, developing an educational program, and advising master's students.

As a result of this process, the following changes occurred in the master's educational program: the master's student offered the elective discipline "Environmental pollution as a determinant of health."

The interview with employers was conducted online and included questions such as: knowledge of the university's mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of undergraduates, participation in the training of undergraduates through mentoring, provision of the department and master's students with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, there have not yet been graduates from the accredited program.

*EEC conclusions based on the criteria.* Complies with 8 basic standards: fully 8. *Recommendations for improvement: none* 

### Standard 8: MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION

### 8.1 Management

According NJSC Organizational structure of "AMU" to the https://amu.edu.kz/upload/images/struktura-012024.jpg general management, monitoring and control of the implementation of master's programs is carried out by the Research School, which is supervised by the Member of the Board, Vice-Rector for Research and Strategic Development. He is accountable to the Chairman of the Board - Rector. During our visit to the university, we had an interview with the vice-rector for scientific activities and strategic development - V.V. Koikov, and the dean of the research school - K.A. Raisova, and the head of the department of public health and management -Turgambaeva A.K., the head of the department of public health and epidemiology - Musina A.A., the head of the department of public health and hygiene - Suleimenova R.K. The Department of Public Health and Management is responsible for the accredited educational program. All processes of education management in the specialized master's program "7M10124 Global Health" are regulated and described in the "Regulations on training in the master's program" https://amu.edu.kz/upload/iblock/e35/e35cbf90ba682b2ef2e7e16b121b430f.pdf, as well as in the University Standard "Model evaluation of the educational program" dated January 12, 2024. 8.2 Program manager (dean's office/department)

# The Research School is a division within the organizational structure of the university. The dean of the research school reports to the vice-rector for science and strategic development and works closely with all structural divisions. The functions of the dean's office in relation to the master's program are: planning admission in the master's program for the new academic year; admission of master's students to study; consulting master's students on issues of the educational process (meetings, individual consultations, providing a master's student's guidebook, etc.); organization of self-government at the master's level; sending a master's student to study on academic mobility; providing the Education Department with information about the contingent of master's students; drafting Orders on the process of teaching master's students; organizing internships for master's students; organization of intermediate and end-of-course assessment of master's students; Conducting audits and inspections of master's departments regarding attendance of master's classes. The effectiveness of the dean's office is evaluated by indicators of scientific activity of Academic staff and students.

To the survey question "Do the heads of the organization listen to your opinion regarding issues related to the educational process, research work, clinical work," 56.02% of teachers answered that systematically, 43.96% answered "sometimes", "quite rarely".

### 8.3 Academic leadership (department)

The master's program in the specialty "7M10124 Global Health" is implemented at the departments of public health and management, public health and epidemiology, headed by the department of public health and hygiene. The graduating department is the Department of Public

Health and Management with a staff of 14 people and a degree rate of 100%. Based on the results of KPI 2023, this department took 1st place among other departments and received an award. This EP was developed within the framework of the Erasmus+ International Project, which included 5 countries. 70% of teachers have received training in global health from foreign colleagues. Reviews about the department are positive, both from students and from employers and graduates of other educational programs.

### **8.4 Program management**

Academic supervisors (program leaders) are employees of the graduating department of public health and management. The employees have the appropriate qualifications: Doctor of Medical Sciences. – 5 people, Ph.D. – 4 people, PhD doctors – 5 people. In their work they are guided by the Regulations "On conducting intermediate and final certification of students at NJSC "AMU" dated January 20, 2021, "Academic Policy of NJSC "AMU"" dated December 8, 2023, Regulations "On the organization of teaching, research and production practices master's students/PhD doctoral students" 06/8/2021 and job descriptions approved by the Academic staff. The main function of this unit is the development of an educational program and its implementation, evaluation of the compliance of instruments for evaluating the achievements of master's students in a specialized field with the established learning objectives and analysis of the degree to which students achieve the final learning outcomes.

### 8.5 Training budget and resource allocation

The main sources of formation of financial resources for the educational process at the university are:

- funds from the republican budget;
- funds from the provision of educational and other paid services;
- other income.

Every year, a commission under the leadership of the Chairman of the Board - Rector visits departments to determine the provision of material and technical equipment, training rooms, and working conditions. Management and use of resources is administered by the Chairman of the Board - Rector of the University.

The distribution of financial resources is carried out in accordance with approved plans, developed on the basis of a thorough analysis of areas of activity and structural divisions, as well as on the basis of limits, norms and standards, based on the need and availability of material resources in these areas.

In order to ensure transparency in the budget formation process, the university operates the principle of centralized distribution of financial resources and the formation of material assets.

In this regard, every year the departments draw up requests for the purchase of equipment and consumables, taking into account the need to update the material and technical base for inclusion in the development plan for the coming financial year.

Over the past 5 years, the University has continuously allocated funds to replenish the fund of educational literature, and also annually purchases computer equipment and medical equipment.

The cost of training for one master's student on a contractual basis is approved by the university annually in the context of EP in agreement with the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan within the limits of average training costs, for groups of specialties determined by the relevant Government resolution for the academic year.

For the 2023-2024 academic year, the cost of training in a specialized master's program amounted to 1,020,000 million tenge. Payment terms and amount are specified in a bilateral agreement.

### 8.6 Administration

The head of the EP 7M10124 "Global Health" is the head of the Department of Public Health and Management, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Assoc. Professor Turgambaeva Asiya Kairbaevna.

Data on the professional training and professional experience of administrative personnel are posted in the relevant sections of the university website, reflecting the organizational structure of NJSC "AMU".

The rights, responsibilities and functional list of the highest bodies of the University are regulated by the Charter of NJSC "AMU". The boundaries of responsibility and management in relation to the design of the educational program and its various components are determined within the framework of the following documents: Regulations on master's programs, regulations on structural divisions.

Monitoring of the accredited program is carried out on the basis of the Document "Feedback Monitoring" dated September 29, 2021, by surveying students after each completed discipline, then those responsible for the Academic staff program analyse the results of the questionnaires. The experts were provided with the results of 2 questionnaires.

While visiting the practical base of the "Alanda clinic", the mentor of the practical base is Professor Ibraev S.I. All information about conducting classes at this base was presented. The experts got acquainted with the classrooms, conference room, visited the statistical office of the clinic, and laboratory. When visiting the department of public health and management, associate professor -Duisekova S.B. presented the experts with the Nomenclature of the Department's Cases, and we also studied the syllabus in the discipline "Social and Economic Determinants of Health." The experts received evidence that the department has a clearly established system for documenting the educational process.

### 8.7 Requirements and legal documentation

NJSC "AMU" pays great attention to guaranteeing the transparency of all educational processes in master's programs, including 7M10124 - Global Health. All information that relates to master's degree processes is compiled in the "Regulations on Master's Studies" and in the "Academic Policy" <u>https://amu.edu.kz/upload/iblock/b69/b69b044bb38b1675685e53048d4f2a33.pdf</u>. All information is presented on the university website <u>https://amu.edu.kz/ru/poslevuzovskoe-obrazovanie/magistratura/magistratura-dlya-obuchayushchikhsya/.</u>

### 8.8 Review and approval process

A documented process of planning, discussing and updating the educational program in the specialty "7M10124 Global Health" has been introduced (approved on June 30, 2023, protocol No. 7), the responsibility for which lies with the head of the educational program - the head of the department of public health and management, everything is recorded in the protocols (Protocol No. 3 of the meeting of the Committee for Quality Assurance of Master's and Doctoral Educational Programs dated 03/14/2023, Minutes No. 6 of the meeting of the Committee for Quality Assurance of Master's and Doctoral Educational Programs dated 05/31/2023)

The educational program is updated as regulatory documents (SCES) change, as well as proposals are received, both from students and from employers. If the EP changes by up to 50%, peer review by experts in the EP register is not required, and if the EP changes by more than 50%, the educational program must be reviewed by two experts.

Documentation of joint events with other educational organizations is carried out through the conclusion of memorandums and cooperation agreements. In total, 25 agreements were concluded with republican institutions and 74 agreements with foreign organizations and associations. In particular, the master's program in the specialty "7M10124 Global Health" is implemented in collaboration with organizations in foreign countries such as Germany, Norway, Ukraine, and Georgia, where master's students undergo internships. The EP "Global Health" is a joint educational program with Al-Farabi Kazakh National University.

Admission of master's students is carried out on the basis of the Order of the rector of the university and is reflected in the document "Rules for admission to master's programs" dated

07/05/2023." Responsibility rests with the chair of the admissions committee and the dean of the research school.

### 8.9 Funding

The university has financial stability, tuition is on a paid basis (tuition cost is 1,020,000 tenge per year). The Company, in terms of planning and spending allocated funds, is guided by normative and regulatory acts, which delineate the standards for planning expenses per student and their financial support:

- Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated June 14, 2004 No. 474 "On approval of standards for calculating the cost of training for one student, residency student, master's student, doctoral student (PhD) in educational organizations and scientific organizations in the field of healthcare within the country under the state educational order" (with amendments and additions in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated August 8, 2011 No. 510, as of August 8, 2011);

- Order No. 221 06/30/2005 "On approval of the Rules for planning expenses for training personnel with higher and postgraduate medical and pharmaceutical education" (with amendments and additions in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 08/08/2011 No. 510, as of 08/08/2011 G.).

- Acting order Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated August 7, 2009 No. 374 "On approval of financial standards for higher and postgraduate education."

The cost of training is determined on the basis of the above regulations and is described in the internal regulations "Rules for the admission of applicants to study at NJSC "Astana Medical University", decision of the Board dated 07/05/2023, Minutes No. 17.

Currently, 1 master's student is studying on a paid basis in an accredited program. Sources of financing are medical and scientific activities: paid medical and educational services, implementation of scientific and technical programs of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Education and Science.

The general publication of the implementation of the development plan of NJSC "Astana Medical University" for the fiscal year is also important for demonstrating financial stability. This document displays the volume of revenues and expenses for specific budgetary and extra-budgetary programs, as well as the final profit of the University.

The University's income in 2020 is 6,659,617 thousand tenge, in 2021 - 7,750,457 thousand tenge, in 2022 - 9,498,317 thousand tenge.

The cash balances in the current account amounted to 236,355,586.83 tenge as of December 31, 2022.

The costs of purchasing equipment and replenishing the library fund in 2022 amounted to 35 million tenge, in 2023 - 47 million tenge, and in 2024, the Development Plan of NJSC "AMU" included the purchase of literature in the amount of 11,606 copies are expected to amount to 375 million tenge, which is 10 times more compared to 2022.

### 8.10 Financial management and integrity

Directly subordinate and accountable to the Board of Directors is the Chairman of the Board and Internal Rector the Audit Service (https://amu.edu.kz/upload/iblock/340/34009a77205917d989fa0a2fad853515.pdf), which monitors and evaluates the financial and economic performance of the university, audit risk management of the internal control system, execution of documents in the field of corporate governance and consulting in order to improve organization's activities the (https://amu.edu.kz/upload/iblock/1cd/1cd8aa5af6680772dc0b8e578ff42c4d.pdf). Report on the financial, economic and economic activities of the University for the year and long-term work plans for the next vear are heard at the Academic Council of the university. https://amu.edu.kz/upload/iblock/ecf/ecf46daf954139123f2d49314b21cc9e.pdf.

### Allocation of funds for basic educational resources

| Name                   | 2018<br>(actual)<br>thousand<br>tenge | 2019<br>(actual)<br>thousand<br>tenge | 2020<br>(actual)<br>thousa<br>nd<br>tenge | 2021<br>(actual)<br>thousand<br>tenge | 2022<br>(actual)<br>thousand<br>tenge | 2023<br>(actual)<br>thousand<br>tenge |
|------------------------|---------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|---|---------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|
| Library fund           | 110 798,7                             | 24 747,6                              | 0   | 69 693                                | 35 183                                | 329                                   |
| Computer<br>technology | 55 643,7                              | 47 456,8                              | 81 359                                    | 118 199                               | 80 212                                | 38 884                                |
| Medical<br>equipment   | 12 953,0                              | 14 371,7                              | 65 089                                    | 17 445                                | 5 798                                 | 106 251                               |
| academic<br>mobility   | 10 564,5                              | 30 878,7                              | 0   | 2 270                                 | 14 845                                | 7 456                                 |

### **8.11 Program information**

Full information about the educational program is available from the Department of Public Health and Management and is posted on the university website to be accessible to interested parties. There are various communication channels, including a website, social networks (Facebook, Instagram), leaflets and brochures containing reference information have been developed.

On the website in three languages, in the "Admissions Committee" section, information for admission to the master's program is posted.

*EEC conclusions based on the criteria*. Compliant out of 19 basic standards: fully - 18, partially - 1, do not comply - 0

### **Recommendations for improvement:**

1) To expand the base of non-medical practices in an accredited program.

### **Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

The University initiates regular review procedures in the form of internal audits and external examination (accreditation, audits). Internal evaluation is carried out as part of self-assessment, the quality assurance policy is regulated by the University Standard SU-AMU-81-21 System of Internal Quality Assurance of NJSC "Astana Medical University". The responsible department is the Quality Assurance Committees (QAC).

Based on the results of a self-assessment of the master's educational program "7M10124 Global Health", weaknesses were identified, such as an insufficient number of research bases for conducting research in the field of healthcare management, including through internal and external funding.

The following opportunities for improving the training program have been identified: development of joint educational programs with non-medical universities in the field of global health, expansion of international relations.

Other internal assessments of the educational program include regular surveys of students after completing each discipline.

The organizational structure of the university was updated in 2023 and includes such changes as the inclusion of the Vice-Rector for Educational Work, D.D. Saidangazin, in the organizational structure.

Based on the results of external and internal evaluation, a program of corrective measures is developed. Responsibility for execution lies with the department head of the department of public health and management.

The university conducts research in postgraduate education, such as "Building academic capacity in the field of global health in the Eastern Europe/Central Asia (EECA) region." The result of this research was the development of the EP "7M10124 Global Health".

Risk assessment in the educational process is carried out by the Quality Assurance Committee (QAC), in accordance with the Regulations "Risk Management Policy of the University, dated March 17, 2020, Protocol No. 1", who's tasks include minimizing risks in the educational process.

The following risks have been identified in relation to the master's program: lack of students in the program.

The university conducts benchmarking and includes such advanced (top) universities as Ariel University, which is included in THE Young University Rankings 2021, occupying 401+ places, the Agreement was signed on 02/27/2020. As a result of benchmarking, innovative methods of managing the educational process have been introduced into the educational process (for example, the information technology department has developed a unified information educational environment - smart.amu.kz, which regulates the entire educational process, starting with operational procedures), manages the master's degree educational program. Innovative teaching methods have been introduced, such as dual training, methods of assessing undergraduates with the involvement of experts from practice, and the inclusion of experts from practice in research work.

Since Ariel University is a strategic partner of the university, master's teachers can exchange experiences by performing indicators of incoming and outgoing mobility.

The University is committing resources to continuous improvement, as documented in the University's 2022-2026 Strategic Plan and 2024 Financial Plan (Budget).

*EEC conclusions based on the criteria.* Complies with 4 basic standards: fully – 4. *Recommendations for improvement: none* 

### **CONCLUSION:**

When conducting an external evaluation of the educational program, it was found that out of **90** standards (including 88 basic standards and 2 improvement standards), 87 accreditation standards demonstrate full compliance, including 85 basic standards and 2 improvement standards. 3 basic standards are partially met. No non-compliance with standards has been identified.

# 5. Recommendations for improving the educational program "7M10124 Global Health", NJSC "Astana Medical University":

1. To expand career guidance work to attract students to the educational program "7M10124 Global Health" (4.2).

2. To develop a joint educational program or double-degree educational program with nonmedical universities (2.1.4).

3. To expand the base of non-medical practices in an accredited program (8.8.1).

### 6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

Members of the EEC came to a unanimous decision to recommend that the Accreditation Council accredit the educational program **7M10124** "Global Health" of the NJSC "Astana Medical University", which complies with the Accreditation Standards of the educational programs of master's specialties in medicine and healthcare of medical educational organizations for a period of 5 years.

| Full name   | Signature |
|---|-----------|
| Chairperson<br>KUZGIBEKOVA ALMA BOLATOVNA                                   | D. der 25 |
| International Expert<br>KULIKOV OLEG VILIEVICH                              | Dunel     |
| Academic Expert<br>BOSHKAEVA ASYL KENESOVNA                                 | TF        |
| Academic Expert<br>YERMUKHANOVA LYUDMILA SERGEEVNA                          | 1.        |
| Academic Expert   | <u> </u>  |
| KHISMETOVA ZAITUNA ABDULKAMYMOVNA   |           |
| Academic Expert<br>BRIMZHANOVA MARZHAN DIKHANOVNA                           | NA        |
| Expert employer   |           |
| ZHANTURIEV BOLAT MEIRBEKOVICH   | Tarry     |
| Expert representative of master's students<br>ASTRAKHANOV MAGZHAN RUSTEMULY |           |
| Expert student representative   | _delley   |
| AITPAY ARUAY KANATKYZY  | durt      |
|   |           |

|          |  |        |                  |                            | Оценка                    |                  |
|----------|--|--------|------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|------------------|
| стандарт | Критерии оценки  | БС/СУ* | Всего стандартов | Полностью<br>соответствует | Частично<br>соответствует | Не соответствует |
| 1        | МИССИЯ И КОНЕЧНЫЕ  | 5/0    | 5                | 5/0                        | -                         | -                |
|          | РЕЗУЛЬТАТЫ   |        |                  |                            |                           |                  |
| 2        | ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНЫЕ ПРОГРАММЫ                                  | 19/2   | 21               | 18/2                       | 1                         | -                |
| 3        | ОЦЕНКА МАГИСТРАНТОВ  | 10/0   | 10               | 10/0                       | -                         | -                |
| 4        | МАГИСТРАНТЫ  | 12/0   | 12               | 11/0                       | 1                         | -                |
| 5        | АКАДЕМИЧЕСКИЙ ШТАТ   | 7/0    | 7                | 7/0                        | -                         | -                |
| 6        | ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНЫЕ РЕСУРСЫ,<br>СРЕДА ОБУЧЕНИЯ, ДОСТИЖЕНИЯ     | 4/0    | 4                | 4/0                        | -                         | -                |
| 7        | МОНИТОРИНГ И ОЦЕНКА<br>ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНОЙ ПРОГРАММЫ           | 8/0    | 8                | 8/0                        | -                         | -                |
| 8        | УПРАВЛЕНИЕ И<br>АДМИНИСТРИРОВАНИЕ                          | 19/0   | 19               | 18/0                       | 1                         | -                |
| 9        | НЕПРЕРЫВНОЕ УЛУЧШЕНИЕ                                      | 4/0    | 4                | 4/0                        | -                         | -                |
|          | *БС – базовые стандарты, СУ – стандарты<br>улучшения Итого | 88/2   | 90               | 85/2                       | 3                         | -                |

# Профиль качества и критерии внешней оценки по стандартам аккредитации образовательной программы магистратуры по специальности «Глобальное здоровье»

# Список документов, изученных членами ВЭК в рамках проведения внешней оценки образовательной программы магистратуры

| N⁰  | Наименования документов   | Количество |
|-----|---|------------|
| 1.  | ПЛ-МУА-146-22 «Положение о назначении, выплате и размерах государственных стипендий обучающимся» от 16.11.2022 г.                           | 1          |
| 2.  | Выписка из протокола №7 очередного заседания ученого совета НАО «МУА» от 30.06.2023 г.  | 1          |
| 3.  | Протокол № 3 заседания Комитета по обеспечению качества образовательных программ магистратуры и докторантуры от 14.03.2023                  | 1          |
| 4.  | Протокол № 6 заседания Комитета по обеспечению качества образовательных программ магистратуры и докторантуры от 31.05.2023                  | 1          |
| 5.  | Состав КОК образовательных программ   | 1          |
| 6.  | РИ-МУА-18-20 «Требования к содержанию, оформлению и защите магистерской диссертации» от 31.01.2020 г.                                       | 1          |
| 7.  | ПР-МУА-04-23 «Правила приема в магистратуру» 05.07.2023   | 1          |
| 8.  | ПЛ-МУА-121-23 Положение «Об обучении в магистратуре» от 29.06.2023 г.   | 1          |
| 9.  | ПР-МУА-13-21 Положение «О проведении промежуточной и итоговой аттестации обучающихся в НАО «МУА» от 20.01.2021 г.                           | 1          |
| 10. | ПР-МУА-51-21 Положение «Об организации педагогической, исследовательской и производственной практик магистрантов/докторантов PhD» 8.06.2021 | 1          |
| 11. | Образовательная программа 7М10124 «Глобальное здоровье» от 30.06.2023 г.  | 1          |
| 12. | П-МУА-17-23 «Академическая политика НАО «МУА»» от 08.12.2023  | 1          |
| 13. | СУ-МУА-15-22 «Образовательные программы: разработка и обновление» от 31.08.2023 г.  | 1          |
| 14. | СУ-МУА-14-22 Standard Университета «Внедрение новых образовательных технологий» от 24.01.2023 г.  | 1          |
| 15. | Рецензия на образовательную программу магистратуры 7М10124<br>«Глобальное здоровье», профильное направление                                 | 2          |
| 16. | Договор о совместной деятельности с клиническими базами   | 2          |
| 17. | СУ-МУА-04-21 «Мониторинг обратной связи» от 29.09.2021 г.   | 1          |
| 18. | Каталог утвержденных анкет от 28.03.2023 г.   | 1          |
| 19. | Анализ результатов анкет  | 2          |
| 20. | СУ-МУА-25-21 Standard Университета «Планирование учебного процесса в НАО «МУА»» от 04.03.2021, внесены изменения и                          | 1          |
|     | дополнения решением Правления от 31.08.2023 г.  |            |
| 21. | П-МУА-03-23 «Кадровая политика» от 08.08.2023 г.  | 1          |
| 22. | ПР-МУА-20-18 «Правила конкурсного замещения должностей профессорско-преподавательского состава и научных работников                         | 1          |
| 23. | НАО «МУА» от 14.05.2018 г.»<br>План повышения квалификации ППС (на 2022-2023 и 2023-2024<br>учебные годы)                                   | 2          |

| 24. | ПЛ-МУА-123-23 «Положение о компетентностной модели  | 1 |
|-----|---|---|
|     | выпускника магистратуры НАО «МУА»» от 30.10.2023 г.   |   |
| 25. | К-МУА-01-20 «Кодекс об академической честности» от 08.10.2020 г.  | 1 |
| 26. | План работы Ученого Совета на 2023 г.   | 1 |
| 27. | СУ-МУА-81-21 Standard Университета «Система внутреннего обеспечения качества НАО «МУА»» от 28.01.2022 г.  | 1 |
| 28. | СУ-МУА-82-23 Standard Университета «Модель оценки образовательной программы» от 12.01.2024 г.   | 1 |
| 29. | «Стратегия развития НАО «Медицинский университет Астана» на 2022-2026 годы», протокол №17 от 30.05.2022 г.  |   |
| 30. | Организационная структура вуза, Протокол № 12, от 22.12.2023 г.   | 1 |
| 31. | План развития ОП 7М10124 «Глобальное здоровье» 2023-2028 г.г.   | 1 |
| 32. | Меморандум об Академическом сотрудничестве между НАО «МУА» и КазНУ им. Аль-Фараби (на казахском и русском языках)   | 2 |
| 33. | ПЛ-МУА-130-23 «Положение об использовании автоматизированной системы для обнаружения плагиата и проверки текстов на заимствования», Протокол № 23 от 22.08.2023г. | 1 |
| 34. | К-МУА-02-19 Этический кодекс обучающихся НАО «Медицинский университет Астана», Протокол № 26, от 26.12.2019 г.  | 1 |
| 35. | Нормы времени для расчета объема учебной работы, выполняемой профессорско-преподавательским составом, на 2023-2024 г.г., 21.09.2023 г.                            | 1 |
| 36. | Положение о каталоге элективных дисциплин, Протокол № 35 от 08.12.2023 г.   | 1 |
| 37. | Кодекс корпоративной культуры и этики, Протокол № 8, от 28.09.2012 г.   | 1 |
| 38. | РИ-МУА-59-22 Инструкция по ведению электронного журнала успеваемости, от 31.03.2022 г.  | 1 |
| 39. | Журнал успеваемости, АИС «Платонус», Протокол № 17 от 05.07.2023 г.   | 1 |
|     |   |   |