

**REPORT OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS  
OF EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME  
8D10101 "SCIENCE IN NURSING" AT KARAGANDA MEDICAL  
UNIVERSITY NJSC FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS OF  
ACCREDITATION OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES OF PHD  
DOCTORAL STUDIES IN HEALTHCARE**

**External expert evaluation period: 22-26 May 2023**

**Karaganda, 2023**

## CONTENT

	List of designations and abbreviations	2
1.	Members of the external expert committee	3
2.	General part of the final report	5
2.1	Presentation of the educational programme for 8D10101 Science In Nursing specialty	5
2.2	Data on previous accreditation	8
2.3	Conclusion on the results of reviewing the report on self-assessment of Science in Nursing educational programme for compliance with the Standards for Accreditation of Doctoral PhD educational programmes in Public Health and decisions	8
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	9
4.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of external evaluation of Science in Nursing PhD educational programme.	13
5.	Recommendations for the improvement of Science in Nursing Educational Programme of doctoral studies PhD	30
	Appendix 1. Quality profile and criteria of external evaluation and educational programme of PhD Doctorate programme "Science in Nursing"	32
	Appendix 2. List of documents studied by the EEC members in the framework of the external evaluation of the educational programme of PhD doctoral studies 8D10101 "Science in Nursing"	33

## LIST OF DESIGNATIONS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Designation
ECAQA	Eurasian Centre For Accreditation And Quality Assurance In Higher Education And Health Care
EEC	External Expert Committee
NJSC	Non-Profit Joint Stock Company
EP	Educational Program
SCES	State Comprehensive Education Standard
HETP	Higher-Education Teaching Personnel
MES RK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
ILS	Institute of Life Sciences
KMU	Karaganda Medical University
CED	Catalogue of elective disciplines
CD	Core disciplines
PS	Principal Subject
HEIC	HEI component
OC	Optional Component
SRW	Student Research Work
MH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
AMU	Astana Medical University
SKSMA	South Kazakhstan State Medical Academy
RITO	Research Institute of Traumatology and Orthopaedics
WKMU	West Kazakhstan Medical University

### 1. Members of the external expert committee

In accordance with the order of the Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Health Care (hereinafter referred to as ECA) No. 15 dated 05 May 2023, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as EEC) was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the educational programme 8M10101 "Science in Nursing" in the period of 24-26 May 2023 in the following membership:

No	Status as a member of the EEC	Full name	Academic degree/title, position, place of work/place of study, course, speciality
1	Chairman	KHATIMYA ILYASOVNA KUDABAEVA	Associate Professor, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Internal Diseases №1 Marat Ospanov Western Kazakhstan Medical University NJSC (non-public joint stock company)
2	Foreign expert	SERGEY ALEKSANDROVICH RYZHKIN	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Radiotherapy and Radiology named after Academician A.S. Pavlov, Head of the Department of Additional

			Professional Education of the Russian Medical Academy of Continuous Professional Development (Moscow), Scientific Secretary of the Department of Medical and Biological Sciences of the Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Tatarstan, accredited expert of the Federal Service for Supervision of Education and Science (Rosobrnadzor).
3	Academic expert	SHUSHANIK GEVORKOVNA AFRIKYAN	PhD in Pharmacy/Candidate of Pharmaceutical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Pharmacy, Head of the Computer Based Examinations Organisation Department, Yerevan State Medical University after M. Geratsi, Republic of Armenia.
4	Academic expert	SALTANAT NURGOZHAYEVNA URAZOVA	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Family Medicine No. 3. Astana Medical University NJSC
5	Academic expert	DARYA MURATOVNA SHABDARBAEVA	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, pathologist of the highest category, medical examiner of the highest category, head of the department of pathological anatomy and forensic medicine named after Professor Y.V. Pruglo, Semey Medical University NJSC
6	Academic expert	RAYGUL MUKHANBETOVNA RAMAZANOVA	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Internal Medicine Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov NJSC
7	Academic expert	AKMARAL KANASHEVNA ZHUMALINA	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the department of paediatric diseases with neonatology West Kazakhstan State Medical University named after Marat Ospanov NJSC
8	Academic expert	RAIHAN ESENZHANOVNA TULEUTAYEVA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Pharmacology and Evidence-based Medicine of Medical University NJSC
9	Academic expert	ZAURE ALPANOVNA BAIGOZHINA	PhD in Medical Sciences, Dean of the School of Nursing Astana Medical University NJSC, Member of the Association for Medical Education in Europe (AMEE).
10	Academic expert	SHOLPAN KHAMZAEVNA RAMAZANOVA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Acting Associate Professor at the Department of Clinical Disciplines, Al-Farabi Kazakh National University.
11	Academic expert	BIBIKHAN ABDALIYEVNA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Assistant of the Department of Clinical Pharmacology

		YERALIEVA	Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov NJSC
12	Academic expert	GULNARA AKHMETKAZYEVNA ISPOSUNOVA	doctor - urologist of the highest qualification category, assistant of the Urology Department Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D.Asfendiyarov NJSC
13	Academic expert	ASEM KALELOVNA DOSANOVA	PhD, Associate Professor, Department of Paediatric Surgery Astana Medical University NJSC
14	Academic expert	ASEL BAIDAULETOVNA DOSHAKANOVA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Postgraduate Education Department of the Kazakh Order "Badge of Honour" Research Institute of Eye Diseases LLP
15	Employers' Representative	BAYAN LASHINOVNA DANIYAROVA	Deputy Director for Strategic Development of the Regional Clinical Hospital, Karaganda Oblast Health Department
16	Expert - representative of doctoral students	AKNUR DAURENKYZY ORAZBAY	Doctoral student of the first year of study in the Biology speciality E.A. Buketov Karaganda University NJSC

The ECA observer - Makpal Aldibekovna Umarova, Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department.

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulation on the EEC (Order of the ECA Director General No. 4 of 13 February 2017).

The EEC report includes an assessment of the PhD educational programme "Science in Nursing" for compliance with the Standards for Accreditation of Educational Programmes of Doctoral PhD Specialties in Healthcare (hereinafter - Accreditation Standards) and conclusions, recommendations of the EEC on further improvement of approaches and conditions for implementation of the above educational programme and recommendations for the ECA Accreditation Council.

## 2. General part of the final report

### 2.1 Presentation of the educational programme for 8D10101 Science in Nursing specialty

Name of organisation, legal form of ownership, BIN	Karaganda Medical University Non-profit Joint Stock Company
Corporate body	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
Full name of the first manager	Anar Akyzbekovna Turmukhambetova
Creation date	1950 on the basis of the Decree of the Council of Ministers of the Kazakh SSR No. 65 of 20 January 1950 "On the organisation of the Karaganda State Medical Institute" in accordance with the Order of the Council of Ministers of the Union of Soviet Socialist Republics No. 19630-p of 5 December 1949
Location and contact details	Republic of Kazakhstan, Karaganda, Gogol str. 40,

	tel. 8-7212-50-06-31
State licence for educational activity in PhD doctoral studies (date, number)	No. KZ32LAA00016018 dated 06 May 2019
Information on branches, subsidiaries (if any)	-
The year of implementation of the accredited educational programme (EP) started	The first intake of doctoral students for the educational programme of doctoral studies of the specialty "Science in Nursing" (scientific and scientific-pedagogical direction) took place in 2020-2021 academic year
Duration of training	3 years
Total number of graduates since the beginning of the implementation of the EP	-
Number of residents at the EP from the beginning of the current academic year	3 students
Full-time teachers/joint teachers involved in the implementation of the programme, including % of academic degree holders rate	Total number of teachers - 11, including full-time employees - 11, part-time employees - 0. Academic degree holders rate, % 100 Categorisation, % _____
Link to the university website, where information about the educational programme is available	<a href="http://www.qmu.edu.kz">www.qmu.edu.kz</a> @officialkmu

### **Brief information about the accredited educational programme**

In Karaganda Medical University NJSC (hereinafter - the University) educational programme of doctoral studies PhD 8D10101 "Science in Nursing" (hereinafter - the EP) is implemented since 2020 under the license for educational activities №KZ32LAA00016018 dated 06 May 2019.

The University made the first intake of applicants in the number of 2 persons to the EP in 2020, the second intake in the number of 1 person was accepted for training in 2021. The first graduation is planned for the current year (2023). The EP was reviewed by the Academic Committee of the research school and approved at the meeting of the University Academic Council. The EP is entered in the Register of Educational Programmes on February 2, 2020.

The EP has been repeatedly revised in connection with changes in the requirements of the State Standards of Higher and Postgraduate Education. The total contingent of doctoral students is 3 students, trained under the state order with the Russian language of study.

The main objective of the EP is to achieve in the trained specialists such a level of knowledge and skills, which should be sufficient for them to take leading positions in the development and implementation of research and practical programmes in a particular area of medicine and practical work in health care and social welfare organisations.

Doctoral students participate in the Erasmus+ programme under the Project:

[ECAQA\\_ Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care](#)

"Accelerated development of nursing education at master's and doctoral level in the system of higher education in Kazakhstan", AccelEd (2020 - 2023). The infrastructure of research activities of the University regarding the accredited programme is represented by:

- Institute of Public Health and Professional Health, which includes the Clinic of Professional Health and Research Sanitary and Hygienic Laboratory;

- Institute of Life Sciences, which carries out planning, organisation, coordination and methodological support of scientific and innovative activities of the university, implementation of educational programmes of postgraduate education (doctoral studies);

- Local Bioethics Commission, which carries out ethical and moral-legal evaluation of the university's scientific projects and doctoral students' dissertation works, the objects of which are human beings and animals, Dissertation Council for the defence of doctoral dissertations for the award of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the specialty 8D10101 "Science in Nursing".

In accordance with the plans for master classes and training seminars, doctoral students take part in educational events to develop professional skills:

- Master class "Training of trainers in nursing clinical guidelines on the topic "Rehabilitation of cardiac patients" (F. H. Sadueva), Master class "Service-design approach in the development of nursing services" (F. H. Sadueva, O. S. Zorina, S. N. Serikova), educational course "Advanced Qualification Methods in Nursing Phase 1" 5 credits, (F. H. Sadueva), educational programme "Pre-PhD programme in Science in Nursing", 10 credits (F. H. Sadueva), Webinar "How to publish a scientific paper in highly cited journals for free", (O. S. Zorina.), participation in 10-hour workshops on quality assurance and dissemination of the project in the framework of the project kick-off meeting "Accelerating the development of nursing education at the Master's and PhD level in the system of higher education in Kazakhstan", (O. S. Zorina), participation in the International PhD Summer School, (O. S. Zorina), Online course "Essence and development of nursing theory/science of nursing" May-December 2021, 10 credits (O.S. Zorina), Online course "Nursing theories and research on patients with complex conditions and long-term health needs", 10 credits (O.S. Zorina, S.N. Serikova), Master class "Application of service-design in nursing development in Kazakhstan", 40 hours, (F.H. Sadueva, S.N. Serikova), Workshop "Service-design and its application for nursing development", 04.11.2022, 8 hours, (F.H. Sadueva, S.N. Serikova, S. N. Serikova), seminar "Service-design and its application for nursing development", 04.11.2022, 8 hours (S. N. Serikova, F. H. Sadueva), programme "Research in Nursing Management and Leadership", JMK University of Applied Sciences, Jyväskylä, Finland, 3 credits (F. H. Sadueva, O. S. Zorina, S. N. Serikova), etc.

During the reporting period 2 doctoral students of the University made 4 reports on the results of dissertation research at international scientific forums and conferences: International Congress "Innovations in Primary Health Care", dedicated to the 44th anniversary of the Alma-Ata Declaration and the 4th anniversary of the Astana

Declaration on PHC, 2022, Conference "Promoting Innovation and Research in Nursing" organised by ProInCa structure, founded by Erasmus+ project, 2020, International Conference "Nursing Education, Research and Practice in Kazakhstan: Investing in the Future of Nursing" organised, 2022, International Scientific and Practical Conference "Medical Rehabilitation: priority directions in diagnosis, therapy and prevention", 2022.

The University attracts Higher-Education Teaching Personnel (hereinafter - HETP) to teach the disciplines of the EP. The teaching personnel, carrying out the implementation of the EP - 11 people, including doctors of medical sciences (Doctor of medical sciences) - 4, candidates of medical sciences (Candidate of medical sciences) - 3, candidate of chemical sciences - 1, PhD - 1. The number and composition of HETP is sufficient for the quality implementation of the disciplines of the programme, the number of teaching staff is 100%.

In 2019 Karaganda Medical University Non-profit Joint Stock Company was granted the status of a research university, approved by the Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 27 June 2019 No. 453.

There is a positive experience of development and implementation of joint educational programme "Science in Nursing". In 2019-2020 academic years, Karaganda Medical University and Vilnius University developed an educational programme "Science in Nursing" (doctoral studies). The educational programme is included in the Register of EP of the MES RK <http://esuvo.platonus.kz>. The new educational programme was developed by the universities in accordance with the analysis of the labour market needs and the demand of Kazakhstan for specialists in the field of nursing science. The co-director of the educational programme from Vilnius University is Natalya Fatkulina, PhD, Director of the Institute of Health Sciences of Vilnius University.

A partnership agreement was concluded on the Erasmus+ Capacity Building in Higher Education Programme "Improvement of Nursing at Master's and PhD Doctorate Level in the Higher Education System of Kazakhstan" (AccelEd) NR. 618052-EPP-1-2020-1-LT-EPPKA2-CBHE-SP, in which LITHUANIAN UNIVERSITY OF HEALTH SCIENCES OF LITHUANIA participates as "Coordinator" and the following beneficiaries: Astana Medical University (Kazakhstan), Abo Academy University (Finland), University of Applied Sciences Jyväskylä (Finland), Kazakh National Medical University named after S. D. Asfendiyarov (Kazakhstan), Kazakh National Medical University (Kazakhstan), Karaganda Medical University (Kazakhstan), Nazarbayev University, Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, University Hospital Utrecht (Netherlands), South Kazakhstan Medical Academy (Kazakhstan).

## **2.2 Data on previous accreditation**

To date, no accreditation of the Science in Nursing educational programme has been carried out".



### **2.3 Conclusion on the results of reviewing the report on self-assessment of Science in Nursing educational programme for compliance with the Standards for Accreditation of Doctoral PhD educational programmes in Public Health and decisions**

The report on self-assessment of the educational programme "Science in Nursing" (hereinafter - the report) is presented on 62 pages of the main text and contains 14 annexes according to the relevant standards and 2 appendices (in word format): Organisational structure of Karaganda Medical University NJSC and a list of regulations and rules, as well as an electronic link to google drive [https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1pdCvvFIzipqSvbyN9b9UVEg5NIvvJdId?usp=s\\_haring](https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1pdCvvFIzipqSvbyN9b9UVEg5NIvvJdId?usp=s_haring).

The report is characterised by completeness of answers to all 8 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for the self-assessment of the educational programme provided to the educational organisation by the ECA accreditation centre, as well as internal unity of information.

The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by the Chairman of the Board-Rector Anar Akylbekovna Turmukhambetova, which confirms the reliability of quantitative information and data included in the self-assessment report.

The report has a list of members of the working group for self-assessment and preparation for specialised accreditation with the indication of responsibility of each member of the internal commission; information about the person responsible for self-assessment for compliance with the standards of accreditation of the educational programme - Madina Aynullaevna Ernazarova Ernazarova, chief specialist of the department of strategic development and quality management.

Self-assessment of the educational programme "Science in Nursing" was carried out under the order of the head from September 16, 2022 No. 274 "On approval of the composition of the working group for self-assessment and preparation for specialised accreditation".

The report was reviewed by accreditation expert Z.A. Baigozhina, and the reviews highlighted strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and amendments. In the process of feedback with the representative of the educational organisation, the experts received answers to the questions that arose and the relevant amendments and additions were made to the self-assessment report according to the recommendations of the reviewers.

In all standards the real practice of Karaganda Medical University NJSC on training of doctoral students PhD EP "Science in Nursing" taking into account the beginning of admission of students in 2020, reasoned data, examples of implementation of educational programme objectives, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards are given.

The description in the self-assessment report is sufficiently complete and updated on the number of doctoral students, teachers, administration, information on selection

and admission, learning outcomes, results of assessment of knowledge and skills, material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, plans for development and improvement, etc.

The report is submitted to ECA in a completed form, with the data corrected according to the above recommendations, written in competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criteria of the standards, tables and figures (schemes, photographs) are referenced in the text and are numbered consecutively.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as a basis for the transition to the next stage of the accreditation procedure - external assessment. The experts plan validation of the report data, comparison of information from the report with the information that will be obtained during the visit to the educational organisation, i.e. verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

### **3. Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion**

External expert work within the framework of the evaluation of the educational programme "Science in Nursing" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECA (approved by the order of the General Director of Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Health Care non-profit institution No. 5 of 17.02.2017) and according to the programme approved on 20.05.2022 by the Director General of ECA S. Sarsenbaeva and agreed with the Chairman of the Board - Rector of Karaganda Medical University NJSC. Visit date of the organisation 24-26 May 2023.

The external evaluation is aimed at validation of the self-assessment report data and verification of indicators showing the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the programme), which is available in the documentation of the accreditation centre and in the annex to this report. The programme is a proof of implementation of all planned activities within the framework of the external expert assessment.

The following methods and its results were used by the EEC members to obtain objective information:

- interview with management and administrative staff -35 people;
- interviews with master's and doctoral students - 10 people;
- study of the website <https://qmu.edu.kz>, SANAD Clinic Karaganda ([sanadmed.kz](http://sanadmed.kz));
- interviewing of 15 employees, 9 teachers, including co-director of the educational programme Fatkulina N., PhD, director of the Institute of Health Sciences of Vilnius University, 6 mentors;
- questionnaire survey of teachers (0) and doctoral students (5);

- review of resources in the context of meeting accreditation standards: 3 practice/clinical training bases were visited, including the Institute of Public Health and Professional Health of Karaganda Medical University NJSC/Professional Health Clinic of Karaganda Medical University NJSC, Clinical and Diagnostic Rehabilitation Centre "SANAD", Centre of Simulation and Educational Technologies of Karaganda Medical University NJSC, where training on 4 educational programmes is conducted with the participation of 11 full-time teachers;

- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 27 items both before the visit to the organisation and during the visit to the subdivisions (the list of studied documents is in Appendix 2).

The staff of the accredited organisation ensured the presence of all persons specified in the visit programme and according to the lists of interview and interview sites (Table 1).

**Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, questionnaires with EEC members**

No.	Position	Quantity
1	Chairman of the Board - Rector	1
2	Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs	1
3	Vice-rector for scientific and clinical work	1
4	Head of Career Development	1
5	Deans of Schools	6
6	Director of the Life Sciences Institute	1
7	Heads of Educational Programmes	5
8	Members of the Academic Senate Committee	22
9	Director of the Department of Human Resource Management	1
10	Chief Specialist of the Department of Human Resource Management	1
11	Chief Specialist of the Centre for Simulation and Educational Technologies	1
12	Director-Chief Accountant of the Department of Economics and Finance	1
13	Deputy Director of the Department of Economics and Finance	1
14	higher-education teaching personnel	9
15	Students (master students)	2
16	Students (doctoral students)	8
17	Graduates (master's students)	9
18	Graduates (doctoral students)	8

In the process of visiting the units of the University accreditation experts noted the strengths of the educational organisation in relation to the accredited educational programme, including: The University carries out scientific and technical programmes,

actively implements grant funding projects, international projects under the Erasmus programme. The Institute of Life Sciences functions, which carries out planning, organisation, coordination and methodological support of scientific and innovative activity of the University, implementation of educational programmes of postgraduate education (doctoral studies). A dissertation council for the defence of doctoral dissertations for the award of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the specialty 6D110101 "Science in Nursing" has been established.

The mechanisms for achieving internationalisation of the PhD educational programme "Science in Nursing" are described in sufficient detail. As evidence of the fact that it is possible for doctoral students to complete part of their PhD programme in other countries, the list of foreign organisations in Table 5 includes Vilnius University, Lithuania, with which an agreement on joint training of PhD doctoral students is concluded, as well as the list of doctoral students, supervisors, including foreign ones.

There is a description in the report that the University has been implementing a joint educational programme "Science in Nursing", developed in the 2019-2020 academic year together with the University of Vilnius. The University also works within the framework of the partnership agreement under the Erasmus+ Capacity Building in Higher Education Programme "Enhancement of Science in Nursing at Master's and PhD doctoral level in the higher education system of Kazakhstan" (AccelEd), where the Lithuanian University of Health Sciences participates in the role of coordinator.

The University has developed and operates a platform <https://session.kgmu.kz/> (own development of the KMU), which is used to conduct written examinations of students in online format (interim certification). The programme maintains a database of students and their results, and generates exam sheets. All written work is checked for originality using the Turnitin anti-plagiarism system. When a written work is handed in, it is encrypted and sent to the teacher in an anonymous form. The student does not know which lecturer is checking his/her work, and the lecturer does not know whose work he/she is checking.

The responsible structural unit is the Department of Academic Affairs. The platform has simplified the procedure for filing an appeal, applying for an appeal and seeing the decision of the Appeal Commission can be done directly on the exam platform.

The Institute of Public Health and Vocational Health of the KMU NJSC/Vocational Health Clinic is the clinical base of the University for the training of both PhD "Science in Nursing" doctoral students and Master's students in Nursing. Research work is also conducted there under the supervision of academic supervisors. At this clinical base, the School of Nursing Education is located, there are classrooms for students (doctoral students and master's students), all conditions are created for doctoral students to perform clinical section of research work, as well as teaching practice. Thus, the presence of its own clinical base of the University, where all conditions for students can be noted as the best practice in education and research activities of students.

On the last day of the visit to the organisation there was a meeting of the EEC members on the results of the external evaluation. Final discussion was held on the results regarding the external evaluation of the educational programme, study of documents, results of interviews, surveys, questionnaires. The members of the EEC started designing the final report of the EEC. The results of the external evaluation were summarised. The experts individually filled in the "Profile of quality and criteria of external evaluation of EP "Science in Nursing" for compliance with the ECA Accreditation Standards". No remarks were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for the improvement of the educational programme were discussed and the chairman H. Kudabaeva held the final open voting on the recommendations for the ECA Accreditation Council on the accreditation period - 5 years.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC, access to all necessary information and material resources was organised. The Commission notes a high level of corporate culture of the University, a high degree of openness of the staff in providing information to the members of the EEC.

At the end of the visit programme the Chairperson of the EEC announced recommendations for the management and staff of the educational institution on the results of the external evaluation within the framework of special accreditation.

### **3. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of external evaluation of Science in Nursing PhD educational programme**

#### **Standard 1: SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH ENVIRONMENT**

##### **Evidence of compliance:**

The University has created a research environment for doctoral students of PhD "Science in Nursing" to carry out research work. Doctoral students are involved in the implementation of International projects. The University works within the framework of the partnership agreement on Erasmus+ programme "Higher Education Capacity Building" "Improvement of Nursing at Master's and PhD doctoral level in the higher education system of Kazakhstan" (AccelEd), where the Lithuanian University of Health Sciences participates in the role of coordinator.

The Institute of Life Sciences functions, implementing educational programmes of postgraduate education (doctoral studies), including "Science in Nursing". A dissertation council for the defence of doctoral dissertations for the award of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the specialty 6D110101 "Science in Nursing" has been established. The University has sufficient resources that meet the qualification requirements for the implementation of the EP. There is sufficient evidence that PhD doctoral students' research is conducted in accordance with international ethical standards and with academic integrity and anti-plagiarism policies. The University implements a joint educational programme "Science in Nursing", developed in the 2019-2020 academic year in cooperation with the University of Vilnius. The University is fulfilling the task of internationalisation of the PhD educational programme "Science in Nursing". As evidence that it is possible for doctoral students to complete part of

their PhD programme in other countries, in Table 5 (Appendix to the self-assessment report) the list of foreign organisations includes Vilnius University, Lithuania, with which an agreement on joint training of PhD doctoral students is concluded, as well as the list of doctoral students, supervisors, including foreign ones. Doctoral student - Feruza Sadueva from 4 April to 20 May 2022 was trained in Jamk University of Applied Sciences, Jyväskylä, Finland within the framework of the project AcceleD.

In the implementation of the programme activities, namely, based on the results of interviews with the first head of the organisation, the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, for scientific and clinical work, members of the anaemic committee of the Senate, the quality assurance committee of the School on EP "Science in Nursing", in interviews with doctoral students and faculty, compliance with the criteria of standard 1 was established.

All participants of the educational process know the mission of the organisation and the main goals of the educational programme, participated in the formation of proposals for the formulation of the mission, and the content of strategic documents is communicated to doctoral candidates through the website, social networks, newsletters to medical and scientific organisations. Information on the material and technical basis of the implementation of the EP "Science in Nursing", information on the educational buildings of the University, characteristics of information resources, which are available to units and PhD doctoral students of the EP "Science in Nursing", information on the library of the University, the book collection related to the EP "Science in Nursing", also characteristics of clinical bases, organisations of training of doctoral students and the list of foreign organisations that have concluded an agreement on joint training of PhD doctoral students are reviewed. The information provided, as well as the results of visits to the library, student service centre, Department of Academic Work, and clinical sites, confirms that the accreditation standard has been met and demonstrates that there is an effective research environment for doctoral students of the University's Science in Nursing Programme to carry out their research work.

Visit to the School of Nursing Education, survey of resources, practice base: Institute of Public Health and Professional Health of Karaganda Medical University NJSC / Clinic of Professional Health of Karaganda Medical University NJSC, Clinical and Diagnostic Rehabilitation Centre "SANAD", where the research and teaching practice of doctoral students of EP " Science in Nursing" shows their compliance with the training programmes, accessibility for teachers and doctoral students. The experts obtained evidence of fulfilment of standard 1 "Research environment", as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report.

During the analysis of the self-evaluation report of the educational programme and during the visit to the educational organisation, there was insufficient information on how the process of analysis of the adequacy of resources for doctoral research, the need for relevant resources, as well as the process of their renewal is carried out.

***EEC conclusions on the criteria.*** Compliant out of 6 standards: fully compliant - 6, partially compliant - 0, not compliant - 0.

## *Standard 1: fulfilled*

### **Standard 2: OUTCOMES**

#### **Evidence of compliance:**

The final learning outcomes are defined and prescribed in the EP "Science in Nursing", which is approved by the Academic Committee of the research school (Minutes No. 8 of 08.04.2020) and approved at the meeting of the Academic Council of MKU NJSC (Minutes No. 11 of 09.04.2020). The EP is entered in the Register of Educational Programmes from 02.06.2020 [http://esuvo.platonus.kz/#/register/education\\_program/application/28822](http://esuvo.platonus.kz/#/register/education_program/application/28822).

The EP objective is defined as - training of leaders - research scientists, experts and educators in the field of nursing science, for practical work in organisations of education and science in the field of health care. Type of EP is innovative.

The University has defined the expected learning outcomes that doctoral students are expected to exhibit upon completion of the programme. These are 8 learning outcomes: ON 1 **demonstrates** a systematic understanding of the field of health care in the area of their qualification, possesses the skills and research methods used in the field, ON 2 **uses** specialist knowledge to critically analyse, evaluate and synthesise new complex ideas that are at the cutting edge of health care, ON 3 **is able to** conduct independent research and work towards a scientific outcome, has a sustained interest in developing new ideas and projects leading to new technologies in the field of health care, ON 4 **participates** orally or in writing in professional discussions, publishes research results in international academic journals, ON 5 **generates** ideas, predicts the results of innovative activities, promotes in academic and professional contexts the technological, social or cultural development of a knowledge-based society, ON 6 **demonstrates** leadership, innovation and autonomy in working and learning activities in new contexts that require solving problems related to multiple knowledge societies, ON 6 demonstrates leadership, innovation and autonomy in working and learning activities in new contexts that require solving problems related to multiple knowledge societies, ON 6 demonstrates leadership, innovation and autonomy in working and learning activities in new contexts that require solving problems related to multiple knowledge societies, ON 7 **is able to** communicate on topics in his/her area of expertise with peers, the wider scientific community and society, ON 8 **demonstrates** self-reflection skills, a commitment to lifelong learning and experience for teaching at undergraduate and postgraduate level.

When visiting clinical bases where research work is performed, it is also found that they are informed about the final learning outcomes from supervisors, through the educational programme, from the interviews with PhD doctoral students "Science in Nursing" F.H. Sadueva and S.N. Serikova. This indicates compliance with Standard 2 in terms of defining the expected learning outcomes that PhD doctoral students should exhibit after completion of the programme.

The organisation ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the EP PhD doctoral students, as the experts have studied the Regulations on the

Bioethics Committee, the Code of Business Ethics, ensuring compliance with the principles of ethical conduct in the relationship between the supervisor and doctoral student (Code of Business Ethics of KMU NJSC). During the interview, doctoral students responded that they are informed about the content of these documents.

In accordance with standard 2.4 "The medical education organisation promotes academic and scientific progress of doctoral students, starts it from the moment they enter doctoral studies and conducts it continuously" in the process of analysis of the report on self-assessment of the educational programme and during the visit to the educational organisation the following was revealed: at the stage of review in the self-assessment report in the annex to the report individual development plans of doctoral students were not presented and the expert during the review gave recommendations to provide as evidence individual plans of doctoral students of EP "Science in Nursing" and/or reference (access) to the Individual work plan (IWP) of doctoral students in "Platonus" AIS. The IWP of doctoral students were submitted only on the third day of the external visit of the EEC. According to the results of the cross-examination of doctoral students, head of the EP, scientific supervisors of doctoral students, it was not possible to get a complete answer to the question "What is the procedure for evaluating the implementation of dissertation research and how is the analysis and monitoring of doctoral students' progress in achieving the results of the educational and scientific components of the EP (history of educational achievements, publications, doctoral student mobility, completion of internships and traineeships, personal achievements)?"

***EEC conclusions on the criteria.*** Compliant out of 5 standards: fully - 4, partially - 1, not compliant - 0.

***Standard 2: fulfilled***

***Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:***

1. To analyse regularly and monitor the implementation of individual work plan of PhD doctoral students EP "Science in Nursing" by the responsible structural unit of Karaganda Medical University NJSC with assessment of progress (Sub-clause 2.4).

### **Standard 3: POLICY AND ACCEPTANCE CRITERIA**

#### **Evidence of compliance:**

The University admission of students to doctoral studies is carried out on the basis of the Policy of student admission, which is part of the Academic Policy of the University. The policy of admission to doctoral studies is revised annually taking into account social and professional data, as well as the requirements of the labour market and complies with the regulatory documents of the authorised body. Information about educational programmes, the State Educational Order, the work of the Admissions Committee, admission rules, entrance examinations for postgraduate education (Master's, residency, doctoral studies), price list for paid educational services are posted on information boards, on the official pages in social networks, where applicants can get



acquainted with information on the EP with a description of the duration of training, the degree awarded, the opportunity for further professional development.

The procedure for admission of applicants to the University is carried out in accordance with the standard rules of admission to study in educational organisations implementing educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education (Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 600 of 31.10.2018).

During the selection of applicants for the educational programme under the state educational order on a competitive basis, the accumulated points (not less than 75) are taken into account, and in the case of the same indicators of competitive points, the persons with the highest grade in the profile of the educational programme group, scientific achievements corresponding to the profile of the educational programme are given priority in enrolling in the doctoral programme: scientific publications, including those in the rating scientific editions included in the 1st, 2nd quartile according to Journal Citation Reports of the Web of science database of the Clarivate Analytic Company; certificates of scientific development; certificates of award of scientific scholarships.

All PhD doctoral students (3) have a level of education corresponding to the Master of Science degree "Nursing". The University determines the procedure of preliminary selection for training on educational programmes of doctoral studies. The results of the preliminary selection are admission or non-admission to the entrance examinations. During the selection of future doctoral students, the research potential of applicants is evaluated based on an interview and the abstract of the dissertation research submitted for pre-selection.

Admission of persons entering KMU NJSC on the EP of doctoral studies is carried out under their applications on a competitive basis based on the results of entrance examinations. The experts studied the documents on the Policy of admission of students to KMU NJSC, the membership of the admission committee.

The first intake of doctoral students for the EP "Science in Nursing" (scientific and scientific-pedagogical direction) took place in 2020-2021 academic years. Since the beginning of the implementation of the EP doctoral programme, 3 doctoral students have been enrolled for training. Release of doctoral students has not yet occurred, the first release will be in 2023.

Before enrolling a doctoral student, the University provides an assessment of the feasibility and quality of the scientific research project, the implementation of which is planned by the doctoral student, assesses the compliance with the qualifications of scientific supervisors in accordance with the documents "Regulations on doctoral studies in KMU NJSC.

The topics of dissertation works of doctoral students are approved after admission to the PhD programme, during the first semester and are approved by the decision of the University Senate after discussion at the meetings of departments/units.

The doctoral student reflects the implementation of the research in the individual work plan, which is prepared for a 3-year period of study and includes the section

"Research work". The expert studied the document "Regulations on doctoral studies in KMU NJSC, the qualifications of scientific supervisors meet the requirements". Scientific supervisor should: Have an academic degree of doctor or candidate of sciences, doctor of philosophy (PhD) and at least 5 publications on the profile of the direction of doctoral studies in rated international journals, including leading Russian journals, with a non-zero impact factor for the last 10 years".

For the period of preliminary selection the examination commission for the selection of incoming PhD doctoral students in the EP "Science in Nursing" is approved, the commission includes leading scientists of the university, representatives of the employer. In 2022 in the membership of the commission for the period of preliminary selection of entrants to PhD doctoral programme "Science in Nursing" included B.K. Omarkulov, N. Fatkulina (order No.33 of 27.01.2022).

At the oral interview during the meeting of the selection committee, the research potential of the applicants is assessed during the discussion of the thesis research abstract and the level of motivation based on the submitted essay. The evaluation criteria are:

- level of motivation, leadership qualities, degree of interest in studying in the chosen educational programme (from 1 to 30 points);
- level of professional competences/experience/knowledge in the field of research, readiness to conduct research (from 1 to 60 points);
- level of English language for communication in the professional community, participation in professional discussions, publication of research results (from 1 to 10 points).

The results of the preliminary selection are admission or non-admission to the entrance examinations.

All the obtained information is confirmed by the results of the survey of doctoral students, HETP and heads of EP.

In the process of analysis of the self-assessment report, survey of the HETP, study of documents, the experts paid attention to the way the University before starting the doctoral programme assesses the sufficiency and availability of resources for the implementation and completion of the educational programme in the declared field of research.

The analysis showed that the University submits an application on the basis of the expected resource potential: staffing, qualification level of teaching staff, research activities of HETP, material and technical support. When approving the topics of dissertation research, the University's material, technical and laboratory facilities are considered and, if necessary, the resources of national and foreign universities and scientific organisations are attracted based on existing memoranda of cooperation. For example, the resources of Vilnius University (Lithuania), JAMK University of Applied Sciences (Finland) are involved in the implementation of the thesis research under the accredited programme.

The membership of the HETP corresponds to the qualification requirements for teaching PhD students on the EP "Science in Nursing". At the same time, the teachers

are mainly doctors with scientific, academic degrees and titles in their speciality. For example, doctors teach such disciplines specific to nursing science as "Paradigms in Nursing", "Concept in Nursing".

**EEC conclusions on the criteria** compliant out of 6 standards: fully - 6, partially - 0, not compliant - 0.

**Standard 3: fulfilled**

#### **Standard 4: PhD DOCTORANTURE PROGRAMME**

##### **Evidence of compliance:**

The mission of EP "Science in Nursing" correspond to the mission of the University and the main programme documents in the field of education and health care: the programme of development of research university for 2019-2023, the State Programme of Education Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the State Programme of Health Care Development of RK 2020-2025 (SPHD), the State Comprehensive Education Standard- state the number. The University implements the procedure to review and update the structure of the doctoral programme. This procedure is carried out in accordance with the "Regulations on the management of the educational programme of KMU NJSC (Minutes No. 14 of 09.09.2020).

The decision to update the educational programme is taken when it is necessary to make at least 70% of changes in the EP. The following may serve as a basis for updating the educational programme: the results of quality assessment and objective changes in the conditions for the implementation of the educational programme.

The Quality Assurance Commission (QAC) ensures quality assessment at the level of the EP, while the Strategic Development and Quality Management Division ensure quality assessment at the institutional level. The following activities are carried out:

The aim of the educational programme is to provide trained specialists with the knowledge and skills to take leading positions in the development and implementation of research and practical programmes in a particular field of medicine and practical work in health care and social welfare organisations. The proof of the EP actualisation is the minutes: 14.04.2021 Minutes No. 8 of the Research School Council, where the changes of the EP disciplines were discussed and approved by the decision of the Board of Directors - Minutes No. 16 of 25.05.2021. At the meeting of the Board of the Research School the changes in the EP were made in connection with the change of the State Educational Standards - the disciplines of the basic and profile cycle were reduced and the disciplines were added: "Academic Writing", "Methods of Scientific Research" (Minutes No. 5 of 12 January 2022). Nevertheless, the updated EP was not submitted to the expert.

There is a catalogue of elective disciplines (CED) separately for the EP "Science in Nursing", with which the expert was familiarised. The CED has been reviewed and approved at the meeting of the Board of the School of Nursing Education (Minutes No. 4 of 17.11.2022). The CED contains topics related to management issues, ethics in nursing, biostatistics, licensing and accreditation, personnel policy, etc. In general, the

topics are relevant for the study of doctoral students of the EP "Science in Nursing".

The EP of doctoral studies is fulfilled under structured scientific supervision. According to the submitted documents (Appendix 15 - characteristic of scientific supervisors), in general, they meet the requirements that are imposed on them. Candidates for academic advisors are considered and discussed at the meeting of the Institute of Life Sciences and approved by the Senate of the University in accordance with the Regulations on Doctoral Studies and "Academic Policy of the University. Supporting documents are available.

The University ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational programme, as the expert has studied the Code of Business Ethics (approved by the decision of the Board of Directors Minutes No. 4 of 24.08.2019) and during the interview doctoral students responded that they are informed about the content of this document. In addition, training in the rules of ethics and responsible conduct of scientific research is provided by the inclusion in the EP "Science in Nursing" of the basic discipline Nursing Ethics and Bioethics HEI component, for credits.

Doctoral students in parallel with the dissertation work participate in activities not directly related to the research, for example, doctoral students of the EP "Science in Nursing" O.S. Zorina, S.N. Serikova, F.H. Sadueva participated in master classes and training seminars (2020-2023) related to professional skills, a total of 13 events. A detailed description and list of masterclasses, training seminars and internships is presented in the self-assessment report. The University, taking into account the cases of forced search for additional sources of income, does not prohibit the work of doctoral students, which is confirmed by the study of documents and interviews with doctoral students. Currently, doctoral students S.N. Serikova, F.H. Sadueva work in the School of Nursing Education at 0.5 rate, teach the disciplines of the academic bachelor's degree programme.

The approved EP dated 09.04.2020 professional competences and qualifications of PhD doctoral students are reflected in subsections 2.1 Graduate competences, 2.3 Competence map/learning outcomes 2.4 Competence matrix of the section "Content of the educational programme". The expert was familiarised with the general characteristic of the EP in the EP attached to the report (Appendix 10). In the submitted documents of the University there are working programmes, curricula, educational and methodical complex of disciplines, which define the goals and objectives to ensure the acquisition of knowledge and competences by doctoral students by studying basic and profile disciplines, the formation of skills and abilities in the course of professional (pedagogical, research) practice and in the performance of research work.

The EP provides theoretical training, which is 45 academic credits in the total volume of the EP and consists of cycles of basic (BD) and profiling (PD) disciplines, including disciplines of the university component (HEI Component) and elective component (EC), pedagogical and research practice. The ratio of the volume of BD and PD is determined by the HEI independently.

In the development of disciplines HEI content and EC the labour market needs, expectations of employers, needs and interests of doctoral students are taken into account, which is confirmed by the results of interviewing of students and employers. Doctoral student of the 2nd year of training EP "Science in Nursing" is a member of the Quality Assurance Committee of the Institute of Life Sciences; EP "Science in Nursing" is reviewed by the Deputy Director of Nursing, nurse of the highest qualification of the polyclinic No.3 of Karaganda city PSE, A.K. Kuzeeuova.

In general, the analysis of the EP showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in the advised disciplines are taken into account, addenda have been made to the reference list of the teaching materials and working programmes, and the teachers apply them in classes.

In order to validate the fulfilment of the self-assessment report data and to obtain evidence on the quality of the EP, interviews were conducted with PhD Nursing Science doctoral students. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with training, sufficient time for typing material for dissertation, working with documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualification of lecturers, social and moral support for doctoral students in need, participation in scientific work, accessibility of resources of international databases of professional literature. The skills of using these resources were assessed during the visits to the School of Nursing Education, practice/clinical training bases: Institute of Public Health and Professional Health of the KMU NJSC/Professional Health Clinic of the KMU NJSC, Clinical and Diagnostic Rehabilitation Centre "SANAD " Sanad", where the teaching and research practice of doctoral students is directly carried out.

The ECA observer conducted an online survey of students at <https://webanketa.com/>. The survey includes 39 questions, the number of respondents 63, including 5 doctoral students, that constituted 7.94%. The analysis of the answers of students in general showed their satisfaction with the conditions and equipment of study rooms and classrooms of this educational organisation (90%), access to the participation of students in research work (92.06%), the activity of scientific supervisors (95.24%), etc.

In general, doctoral students are satisfied with the training and academic supervision, assessment methods, and purposefully enrolled in this organisation because they believe that the educational organisation has good resources, image and international links, at the same time the expectations of doctoral students include support from the management in covering the costs of publication in peer-reviewed journals.

Doctoral students showed their adherence to the educational organisation, were active in answering the questions of external experts, demonstrated their judgement on the organisation of teaching and enabling the dissertation research, submission of the dissertation for defence, assessment of their skills, advisory support, opportunity to participate in the activities of the educational organisation, financing. The experts studied the doctoral students' documents (portfolios, assessment results, questionnaire results, abstracts, dissertations).

The interview with employers of graduates of the university was conducted in offline mode and included such questions as: knowledge of the EP, participation in the development, reviewing of the EP, participation in the work of the Quality Assurance Committee, working groups, Boards, research work (R&D) of the Dissertation Board, satisfaction with the competences of doctoral students, providing the supervising department located in the clinic and doctoral students with the necessary resources for scientific and practical training and formation of critical and research thinking, about the problems of interaction with the departments, indicators of employment of doctoral students. The representatives of the Clinic of the Medical University of the KMU NJCS, deputy director for educational work of Karaganda Regional Higher Nursing College PSE of the Health Department of Karaganda region were present at the meeting. Analysis of the results of the questionnaire showed satisfaction of employers with the quality of training of graduates.

***EEC conclusions on the criteria.*** Compliant out of 10 standards: fully compliant - 10, partially compliant - 0, not compliant - 0

***Standard 4: fulfilled***

#### **Standard 5: ACADEMIC ADVISING**

##### **Evidence of compliance:**

Approaches in scientific supervision of doctoral students demonstrate the following:

each doctoral student has a main scientific supervisor and scientific advisors, including foreign ones. The University has concluded an agreement on joint training of PhD doctoral students with a foreign organisation - Vilnius University, Lithuania. The scientific supervisor of all three doctoral students is B.K. Omarkulov, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor, Director of the Institute of Public Health and Professional Health of the KMU NJSC, scientific advisors: Natalia Istomina, Johanna Heikillia. Candidates for scientific advisors for the EP "Science in Nursing" was considered and discussed at the School Council and approved by the University Senate in accordance with the Regulations on Doctoral Studies and Academic Policy of the KMU NJSC. Scientific guidance is approved by the order of the Chairman of the Board - Rector of the KMU NJSC based on the decision of the Senate.

Higher-education teaching personnel who meet the requirements of paragraph 110 of the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan from 17 June 2015 № 391 "On approval of qualification requirements for educational activities, and the list of documents confirming compliance with them" (Table 16 in the appendix to the self-assessment report) are involved in teaching the disciplines of the EP "Science in Nursing". The number and composition of the HETP is sufficient for the quality implementation of the disciplines of the programme, the academic degree holders rate is 100%.

Proof of compliance of qualification of scientific supervisors with the requirements of paragraph 116 of the Order of the MES RK from 17 June 2015 No. 391

[ECAQA\\_ Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care](#)

"On approval of qualification requirements for educational activities and the list of documents confirming compliance with them" is the study of documents by experts, as well as the information provided in Annex 15 to the self-assessment report. Academic advisors are responsible for doctoral students' compliance with the academic discipline, fulfilment of the doctoral student's individual work plan and timely submission of the dissertation work. The duties of academic advisors are reflected in paragraph 48 of the Regulations on Doctoral Studies at the KMU NJSC.

Students plan their educational trajectory at the University with the help of academic advisors using the catalogue of elective disciplines and the working curriculum, as well as develop a plan of step-by-step work on the thesis and the publication of its results, deadlines for the submission of intermediate and final forms of control over the progress of its implementation, which determine the criteria for evaluating the research work and are reflected in the individual study plan of work. Reports on the implementation of research work are presented at the meeting of the department for each semester. Every year at the end of the academic year, the doctoral student undergoes academic attestation on the fulfilment of the individual work plan.

Planning and counselling support for doctoral students is provided on an individual basis depending on cognitive and operational abilities and the topic of the dissertation research.

Ensuring compliance with the principles of ethical behaviour in the relationship between supervisor and doctoral student is reflected and supported by: the KMU NJSC Code of Academic Integrity, confirmed by the University's participation in the Academic Integrity League, expert examination of materials for publications, dissertation papers.

Scientific supervisors, in order to assess the quality of research, compliance with their individual work plan, hold consultations with their doctoral students several times a month.

The organisation of the work of scientific advisors for the supervision of doctoral thesis and the duties of the scientific advisor are described in the Regulations on doctoral studies at the KMU NJSC (Board Decision of 18 November 2020, Minutes No. 24). The requirements of paragraph 48 of the Regulations (control over the fulfilment of the doctoral student's Individual work plan, discussion of the results of work performance, correction of prepared publications and assistance in their publication, methodological assistance in the preparation of the dissertation work with its subsequent verification) are fulfilled and confirmed by the results of the survey of doctoral students.

The University has not yet produced PhD doctoral students PhD "Science in Nursing". The system of appealing the results of the thesis defence is reflected in the Regulations on Doctoral Studies at the KMU NJS. During the visit to the organisation and during the interview with the staff member N. Fatkulina, PhD, Director of the Institute of Health Sciences, Vilnius University, Lithuania, B.K. Omarkulov, PhD, Professor, Director of the Institute of Public Health and Occupational Health of the KMU NJSC, the committee verified that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all faculty/academic supervisors and staff, and includes

documents such as annual operating plans, annual reports, unit regulations, contracts with faculty, supervisors and teaching and learning documentation (work programme, work curricula, syllabi, journals), assessment tools (checklists, sheets), certificates, certificates and credentials.

A review of the website showed that its pages contain documents necessary for doctoral students: educational programme, graduate competences, academic calendar, list of supervisors for the academic year, timetable, regulations of the Ethics Commission, composition of the Ethics Commission for the evaluation of scientific research and there is information in the "Science" section, which is regularly updated. This information was obtained through interviews with faculty and doctoral students: Feruza Sadueva, S.N. Serikova The conversation with the Dean of the School of Public Health, PhD, Associate Professor J.A Dauletkalieva; Director of the Institute of Life Sciences, Ph. A, included such questions as criteria for selecting a supervisor, information about the supervisors of PhD doctoral students "Science in Nursing", the University's policy to ensure that the profile of the faculty corresponds to the range and balance of teachers of disciplines included in the EP "Science in Nursing". The answers to the questions allowed the experts to learn about the approaches to attracting qualified staff as supervisors, about the strategy and tactics of admission of doctoral students to this EP, information provision of the EP.

Formation of the pool of scientific supervisors is carried out in accordance with the Regulation on doctoral studies in the KMU NJSC.

Interviews with 9 full-time teachers, showed that there are both successes and problems in the management of education, depending on the specific base for typing material for the thesis, time for medical documentation, independent work. The experts received answers about the programme of professional development of teachers and scientific supervisors, the availability of teacher's certification in teaching methods and research. Information about the teachers of the profile departments who have undergone professional skills training is presented in Appendix 18 to the self-assessment report.

The experts have studied the materials on admission of doctoral students and selection of teachers and established compliance with Standard 5.

In order to verify the data of Standard 5, external experts obtained an opinion on personnel policy and approaches to the development of teaching competence of teachers and supervisory skills of doctoral students' academic advisors, motivation to work with doctoral students, implementation of academic supervision system. The experts found that doctoral students enter the educational organisation with a previously defined topic for dissertation research, and scientific supervisors regularly provide consultations and stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature and documentation.

***EEC conclusions on the criteria.*** Compliant out of 11 standards: fully compliant - 11, partially compliant 0- , non-compliant - 0.

***Standard 5: fulfilled***



## **Standard 6: PhD DISSERTATION**

### **Evidence of compliance:**

Examination of documentation as well as interviews of doctoral students and HETP confirm that the doctoral students' dissertation topic has gone through the appropriate stages of planning, discussion, approval, and preliminary peer review before preparation for final defence.

The stages of planning, discussion, approval and preliminary review of dissertation works in the KMU NJSC is carried out in accordance with the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan from 20 July 2022 No. 2 "On approval of state compulsory standards of higher and postgraduate education", the Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. ҚР ДСМ-63 of 4 July 2022 "On approval of state compulsory standards for levels of education in the field of health care", Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 126 dated 31 March 2011 "On Approval of the Model Regulations on the Dissertation Council", Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No.127 dated 31 March 2011 "On Approval of the Rules for Awarding Degrees" and the Academic Policy and Regulations of the KMU NJSC developed in accordance with them in the field of research and educational activities.

The study of the regulations on doctoral studies in KMU NJSC, individual development plan of the scientific supervisor B.K. Omarkulov and doctoral students, materials for publications, dissertations of the practice of examination of completed works showed that the University has implemented a proper evaluation policy, which allows a comprehensive assessment of the educational achievements of doctoral students and submit a dissertation to the Dissertation Council (DC). The meeting and conversation with the Dean of the School of Public Health J.A. Dauletkalieva; Director of the Institute of Life Sciences D.A. Kluyev demonstrated the existence of a sustainable practice at the University to review, discuss and make a decision on the dissertation. During the interview doctoral students told about the forms of training, counselling and evaluation by supervisors and scientific advisors, for example, the choice of editions for publication of the results of dissertation research is made independently by the doctoral student in consultation with the supervisor, access through the national subscription of the University to the information databases of Clarivate Analytics, Scopus, SpringerLink, to the information platform of Elsevier publishing house and that they are satisfied with the counselling on working in the information databases of indexed scientific publications by library staff, specialists of the Institute of Life Sciences, receiving regular feedback from HETP and supervisors.

The review of resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, for example, a visit to the Institute of Public Health and Professional Health of the Karaganda Medical University NJSC/ Professional Health Clinic of the Karaganda Medical University NJSC, Clinical and Diagnostic Rehabilitation Centre "SANAD" showed that they correspond to the training programmes, accessibility for teachers and doctoral students.

University staff provide collegial and ethical relationships with nursing staff, clinical/production site management to ensure that doctoral students achieve their final results. Sufficient number of case patients for the recruitment of material for the thesis, modern equipment and demonstrates its availability to young researchers, and staff who fulfil both teaching and supervisory roles ensure quality training in an ethical and deontological manner. Before starting the relevant discipline of the educational programme, the PhD student receives from the lecturer the relevant methodological materials (syllabus, syllabus, teaching materials) and knows what skills he/she should acquire and develop during the study period.

The assessors have obtained evidence of fulfilment of Standard 6 PhD Dissertation as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report.

***EEC conclusions on the criteria.*** Compliant out of 9 standards: fully compliant - 9, partially compliant 0- , non-compliant - 0.

***Standard 6: fulfilled***

## **Standard 7: EVALUATION**

### **Evidence of compliance:**

EP "Science in Nursing" includes the final certification of doctoral students in the form of writing and defending a doctoral dissertation for which 12 credits or 360 academic hours are allocated, which meets the requirements of the Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. ҚР ДСМ-63 of 4 July 2022 "On Approval of state mandatory standards for levels of education in the field of health care".

The system of evaluation of doctoral students includes: preliminary discussion of the thesis at the meeting of the department/unit of the university, the procedure of discussion of the thesis of the doctoral student at the Scientific and Expert Council of the university and oral defence of the thesis in the Dissertation Council, which is confirmed by the requirements for the content and design of the doctoral dissertation reflected in the Regulations on Doctoral Studies in KMU NJSC.

The University has 3 Dissertation Councils for the defence of doctoral dissertations for awarding the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD). Dissertation Council for the defence of doctoral dissertations for the award of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the specialties 8D10100 "Medicine", 8D10101 "Science in Nursing" is organised by the order of the Committee for Control in the field of Education and Science of MES RK No. 316 dated 31 March 2016, in 2019 DC is included in the list of dissertation councils at higher educational institutions that do not have a special status and approved by the order of the Committee for Control in the field of Education and Science of MES RK No. 207 dated 04 March 2019.

The membership of DC on specialties 8D10100 "Medicine", 8D10101 " Science in Nursing" consists of 12 members, where 50% of members are representatives of other universities, scientific and other organisations (MH RK, KMU NJSC, UKMA JSC, Nazarbayev University, Research Institute of Traumatology and Orthopaedics (RITO), West Kazakhstan Medical University (WKMU).

Doctoral theses on the EP "Science in Nursing" have not yet been defended at the University. The first defence is planned in December 2024 according to the table 20 "Results of the dissertation research" of F.H. Sadueva "Evaluation of the role and potential of nurses in the process of implementation of rehabilitation programmes for stroke patients" presented in the annex to the self-assessment report, the doctoral student has one publication abroad, including in IF journals.

The survey of the HETP, head of the programme, doctoral students showed their awareness and knowledge of the basics of the Regulations on the Dissertation Council and, in particular, of the fact that during the defence of a dissertation it should be ensured to avoid conflict of interest if the scientific supervisor of a doctoral student is a member of the Dissertation Council. The Regulation on the Dissertation Council was approved by the Chairman of the Board of Rector of the KMU NJSC A. Turmukhambetova and is available on the website of the University <https://www.qmu.edu.kz/media/qmudoc/DisSovet.pdf>.

The experts studied the documents related to the process of public discussion and defence of theses and dissertations. The schedule of defences and reports on the work of the Dissertation Council are posted on the [web resource of the KMU NJSC](#). The procedure for submitting documents upon completion of the dissertation work is also described in the Regulations on the Dissertation Council of the University, the list of documents is available on the University website.

Despite the fact that there was no defence of doctoral dissertations on the accredited EP "Science in Nursing" and in the current year is not planned, doctoral students during the interview demonstrated awareness that in case of negative evaluation of the dissertation, the doctoral student will be given the opportunity to improve the dissertation taking into account the comments and recommendations of reviewers/opponents, that in order to comply with the principle of transparency, openness and accessibility of the results of the dissertation, the dissertation defence for stakeholders and the public, the dissertation defence will be conducted for the interested parties and the public. The Dissertation Council places on the Internet resource of the KMU NJSC materials on defences of doctoral students and activities of the Council.

The survey of doctoral students and analysis of documents related to the evaluation and monitoring of doctoral students' research performance showed that the organisation has implemented an appropriate evaluation policy that allows for a comprehensive assessment of doctoral students' academic and scientific achievements. During the interview, doctoral students said that they receive regular feedback from teachers and supervisors. Thus, compliance with the Standard 7 has been established.

***EEC conclusions on the criteria.*** Compliant out of 7 standards: fully compliant - 7, partially compliant 0- , non-compliant - 0.

***Standard 7: fulfilled***

## **Standard 8: ORGANISATION STRUCTURE**

### **Evidence of compliance:**

Organisational structure of the University management is approved by the decision of the Board of Directors of the KMU NJSC dated 03.10.2022 (Minutes No. 40) is available on the website and is presented in Appendix 1 to the self-assessment report.

The EP Science in Nursing is overseen by the Vice-Chancellor for Research and Clinical Affairs and in particular the Institute of Life Sciences. In 2022, the existing Research Centre of the University was transformed into the Institute of Life Sciences, which also included the units belonging to the Research School of the KMU NJSC. Because of the transformation, the Institute was transferred the management of the EP of Master's degree, doctoral studies, including the EP Science in Nursing. The Institute of Life Sciences (hereinafter - ILS) is a structural unit of the University and carries out planning, organisation, provision of educational and research activities of ILS, development and implementation of Master's and Doctoral studies. ILS is directly responsible for the implementation of scientific research, according to the plan of research work of doctoral students.

During the visit to the University the experts met with the Director of ILS D.A. Kluyev, as well as the HETP of the EP "Science in Nursing": B.K. Omarkulov, Natalia Fitkulina, J.A. Dauletkalieva. Based on the results of the interviews, information was obtained regarding the quality assurance of the EP. The University has sufficient resources necessary for the selection of doctoral students (Admissions Committee), implementation of the educational part of the programme (departments/units, laboratories, library, clinical facilities), evaluation and defence of the thesis, the procedure for awarding the PhD degree (Dissertation Council) for the quality implementation of the EP "Science in Nursing".

The University has a website page (<https://www.qmu.edu.kz/ru>), in the state and English languages, which contains accessible information about the work of the Admissions Committee, about the educational programmes with a description of study terms, the degree awarded, opportunities for further professional development, the Academic Policy of the University, about the collegial bodies of the KMU NJSC in the field of science: Local Commission on Bioethics, Dissertation Councils. Rules of the Admissions Committee include a clear description of the selection process of doctoral students. Acceptance of applications for admission to doctoral studies is conducted by the admission committee within the terms established by the "Standard rules of admission to study in educational organisations implementing educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education", approved by the Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 600 dated 31.10.2018.

The self-evaluation report describes in detail the procedure for regular revision and updating of the structure of the doctoral programme, assessment of the programme quality, but insufficiently presents information including feedback from supervisors and doctoral students. This is also confirmed by the information obtained during the survey of the HETP, the head of the EP and doctoral students about the analysis of monitoring of the Individual work plan of doctoral students, as well as about the updating and revision of the EP of doctoral studies PhD «Science in Nursing». According to the respondents, as well as according to the information in the self-assessment report EP is

updated in accordance with the Regulations on the management of the educational programme of the KMU NJSC (Minutes No. 14 of 09.09.2020), which defines the procedure for the development, approval, updating and management of educational programmes, but the updated EP is not demonstrated to the expert. The EP presented in the annex to the self-assessment report was approved in 2020.

At the University, the Quality Assurance Commission ensures quality assessment at the level of educational programmes, while the Department of Strategic Development and Quality Management ensures quality assessment at the institutional level. On a regular basis, doctoral students are surveyed to assess their satisfaction with the quality of education, administrative and economic conditions, teaching level, organisation of practical training and faculty and academic supervisors are surveyed to assess their satisfaction with working conditions.

The report on the satisfaction assessment results of the HETP and students is submitted to the Senate meeting. According to the data presented in the self-assessment report, 58 doctoral students (95% of the total number of doctoral students) participated in the questionnaire in the academic year 2021-2022 and accounted for 2.6% of the total number of respondents. According to the results of the questionnaire - 78.9% of the interviewed HETP are satisfied with the participation of the University in the issue of research work of the HETP (in the preparation of thesis, publication of textbooks, methodological developments), 44.6% responded well to the possibility of continuous capacity development, 68.8% of the interviewees consider it useful to involve HETP in the development of the EP.

The University has demonstrated the participation of doctoral students in the collegial bodies responsible for the development of the EP of doctoral studies - Senate, Institute of Life Sciences. For example, Serikova S. N., doctoral student of 2 years of EP "Nursing Science" is a member of the Academic Committee of the Senate and the Commission for Quality Assurance of the School of Nursing Education.

The University ensures that the rights and duties of doctoral students are respected in accordance with the existing values and traditions of the organisation.

The Labour (Internal) Regulations, Code of Academic Integrity, Code of Business Ethics are documents available at the University that ensure that the rights and responsibilities of staff and students are respected.

The University provides an appeal mechanism at all stages of admission and doctoral studies. The procedure of consideration of applications/appeals of doctoral students is carried out in accordance with the Academic Policy, Regulations on the rating system of evaluation of the student, which prescribe the official procedures for doctoral students' appeals. The appeal procedure is conducted commissionally by the faculty members of the department in the presence of a member of the dean's office. Following the results of the review, a decision is made, which is brought to the attention of the doctoral student.

PhD doctoral students have the possibility of oral/written address to the dean or supervising vice-rector, as well as to the blogs of the rector, dean on the university website.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria.** Compliant out of 9 standards: fully compliant - 8, partially compliant 1- , non-compliant - 0.

**Standard 8: fulfilled**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1. To revise and update the educational programme of PhD "Science in Nursing" (EP approved, entered in the register on April 9, 2020. According to paragraph 50 of the Regulations on the management of the educational programme in the KMU NJSC (date of approval 02.09.2020), the educational programme should undergo quality monitoring at least once every 3 years (Subparagraph 8.4).

#### **5. Recommendations for the improvement of Science in Nursing Educational Programme of doctoral studies PhD**

1. To regularly analyse and monitor the implementation of individual work plan of PhD doctoral students EP "Science in Nursing" by the responsible structural unit of Karaganda Medical University NJSC with assessment of progress (Standard 2, subparagraph 2.4).
2. To revise and update the educational programme of PhD Doctorate "Science in Nursing". EP approved, entered in the register on 9 April 2020. According to paragraph 50 of the Regulations on the management of the educational programme in the KMU NJSC (date of approval 02.09.2020), the educational programme should be monitored for quality at least once every 3 years (Standard 8, subparagraph 8.4).



## 6. Рекомендация Аккредитационному совету ЕЦА

Члены ВЭК пришли к единогласному мнению рекомендовать Аккредитационному совету аккредитовать образовательную программу **8D10101 «Сестринская наука» НАО «Медицинский университет Караганды»**, соответствующую Стандартам аккредитации образовательных программ PhD докторантуры медицинских организации образования на период 5 лет.

**Председатель Внешней экспертной комиссии**  
КУДАБАЕВА ХАТИМЯ ИЛЬЯСОВНА

**Зарубежный эксперт**  
РЫЖКИН СЕРГЕЙ АЛЕКСАНДРОВИЧ

**Зарубежный эксперт**  
АФРИКЯН ШУШАНИК ГЕВОРКОВНА

**Национальный академический эксперт**  
УРАЗОВА САЛТАНАТ НУРГОЖАЕВНА

**Национальный академический эксперт**  
ШАБДАРБАЕВА ДАРИЯ МУРАТОВНА

**Национальный академический эксперт**  
РАМАЗАНОВА РАЙГУЛЬ МУХАНБЕТОВНА

**Национальный академический эксперт**  
ЖУМАЛИНА АКМАРАЛ КАНАШЕВНА

**Национальный академический эксперт**  
ТУЛЕУТАЕВА РАЙХАН ЕСЕНЖАНОВНА

**Национальный академический эксперт**  
БАЙГОЖИНА ЗАУРЕ АЛПАНОВНА

**Национальный академический эксперт**  
РАМАЗАНОВА ШОЛПАН ХАМЗАЕВНА

**Национальный академический эксперт**  
ЕРАЛИЕВА БИБИХАН АБДАЛИЕВНА

**Национальный академический эксперт**  
ИСПОСУНОВА ГУЛЬНАРА АХМЕТКАЗЫЕВНА

**Национальный академический эксперт**  
ДОШАКАНОВА АСЕЛЬ БАЙДАУЛЕТОВНА

**Национальный академический эксперт**  
ДОСАНОВА АСЕМ КАЛЕЛОВНА

**Эксперт- представитель практического здравоохранения**  
ДАНИЯРОВА БАЯН ЛАШИНОВНА

**Эксперт – представитель докторантов**  
ОРАЗБАЙ АҚНҰР ДӘУРЕНҚЫЗЫ

**Эксперт – представитель резидентов**  
ҚҰРАҚ АЙДАНА ЖАНАЙДАРОВНА



**Quality profile and criteria of external evaluation and educational programme of  
PhD Doctorate programme "Science in Nursing"**

Standard	Evaluation criteria	Number of standards	Evaluation		
			Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Not compliant
<b>1.</b>	<b>RESEARCH ENVIRONMENT</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>		
<b>2.</b>	<b>FINAL RESULTS</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>1</b>	
<b>3.</b>	<b>ADMISSION POLICY AND CRITERIA</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>		
<b>4.</b>	<b>PHD DOCTORAL PROGRAMME</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>		
<b>5.</b>	<b>RESEARCH SUPERVISION</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>11</b>		
<b>6.</b>	<b>PHD DISSERTATION</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>9</b>		
<b>7.</b>	<b>EVALUATION</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>		
<b>8.</b>	<b>ORGANISATIONAL STRUCTURE</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>1</b>	
	<b>Total:</b>	<b>63</b>	<b>61</b>	<b>2</b>	
			<b>63</b>		

**List of documents studied by the EEC members in the framework of the external evaluation of the educational programme of PhD doctoral studies 8D10101 "Science in Nursing"**

No.	Document titles	Quantity
1	Report on the self-evaluation of the educational programme on the specialty 8D10101 - Science in Nursing	3
2	Minutes of the meeting of the Research School Council	2
3	Agreement on joint scientific counselling of doctoral students	
4	Individual work plan of the teaching staff	1
5	Educational programme 8D10101 - Science in Nursing	1
6	Regulations on doctoral studies	1
7	Regulations on the Management of the Educational Programme	1
8	Certificates of professional development of teaching staff	1
9	Certificates of advanced training of doctoral students	4
10	Report on the self-evaluation of the educational programme on the specialty 8D10101 - Science in Nursing	1
11	Memorandum of Understanding between Vilnius University (Lithuania) and Karaganda Medical University	1
12	Agreement on subsidies for multi-beneficiary work under the ERASMUS + Capacity Building in Higher Education Programme	1
13	Regulation on the Local Bioethics Commission	1
14	Article on the topic: Patient Adherence to Therapy After Myocardial Infarction: A Scoping Review	1
15	Material and technical basis for the implementation of the accredited educational programme	1
16	Brief characteristic of information resources, which are available to units and PhD doctoral students of the EP	1
17	Information about the HEI library. Book fund related to the speciality of the accredited educational programme. Library activities related to the speciality of the accredited programme.	1
18	List of foreign organisations that have concluded an agreement on joint training of PhD doctoral students.	1
19	Expected competences of PhD doctoral students	1
20	Contingent of PhD doctoral students in the speciality "Science in Nursing"	1
21	Characteristics of doctoral students	1
22	Indebtedness of doctoral students on payment of tuition fees, studying at the accredited educational programme (not available)	1

23	Quantitative characteristics of the EP	1
24	Information about EP disciplines	2
25	Information about participation of doctoral students in scientific events	2
26	Pedagogical and/or industrial practice	1
27	Performance of research (experimental) work	1
28	Characteristics of scientific supervisors	1
29	Staff composition of the teachers of the departments implementing the EP	1
30	Indicators of research activity	1
31	Information about teachers of profile departments who have undergone professional skills training	1
32	Information about the employment of PhD doctoral graduates	1
33	Results of fulfilment of the dissertation research	1
34	Results of PhD doctoral studies (no graduation yet)	1
35	List of external funding for research work	1
36	Main directions of scientific research in which the teaching staff involved in the implementation of the accredited educational programme participate	1
37	Expected competences of PhD doctoral students	1
38	Average teaching load of the teaching staff for the academic year 2022-2023	
39	Minutes of the meeting of the Commission for Quality Assurance of the School of Nursing Education №3 from 19.01.2023.	1
40	Catalogue of elective disciplines for the Science in Nursing EP	1