

To Accreditation Council
of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation
and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care
June 20, 2022

**REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE
EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME 7R01104 –
"GASTROENTEROLOGY (ADULT, CHILDREN 'S)'"
FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR
POSTGRADUATE PROGRAMMES (SPECIALTY OF RESIDENCY)
IN MEDICAL ORGANIZATIONS OF EDUCATION**

NEI "KAZAKHSTAN-RUSSIAN MEDICAL UNIVERSITY"

external expert evaluation period: May 30-31 - June 1, 2022

Almaty, 2022

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	4
2.1.	Presentation of the educational programme in the specialty - 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)"	5
2.2.	Information on previous accreditation	5
2.3.	Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the self-assessment report of the educational programme 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions	5
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	6
4.	Results of the survey of teachers and residents	9
5.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)"	11
6.	Recommendations for the improvement of the educational programme 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)"	25
7.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	27
	Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria of the external evaluation and educational programme of the residency in the specialty of the educational programme 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)"	28
	Attachment 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	29

List of symbols and abbreviations

Abbreviation	Designation
EP	Educational programme
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
CEP	Educational Programmes Committee
EMCD	Educational and methodological complex of the discipline

ECAQA

1. Composition of the external expert commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 19 dated May 20, 2022, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as EEC) was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the educational programme of the residence in the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" in the period May 30-June 1, 2022, as follows:

order №	Status as part of EEC	Full name	Academic degree, academic title, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty
1	chairperson	Kurmanova Almagul Medeubaevna	clinical specialties department of the Higher School of Medicine of the Kazakh National University named after Al-Farabi, leading researcher of JSC "Scientific Center of Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology"
2	Foreign Expert	Zakirova Gyuzel Zakirovna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Ophthalmology of Kazan State Medical University, Ophthalmologist of the Children's Republican Clinical Hospital of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Tatarstan
3	Academic Expert	Urazova Saltanat Nurgozhayevna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Family Medicine No.3 of "Medical University of Astana" NJSC
4	Academic Expert	Kauysheva Almagul Amangeldinovna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Family Medicine No.3 - "Medical University of Astana" NJSC;
5	Academic Expert	Sarsenbayeva Gulzhan Iskendirovna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Doctor of the Department of Cardiac Surgery and Interventional Cardiology of the Scientific Center of Pediatrics and Pediatric Surgery JSC
6	Academic Expert	Bacheva Irina Viktorovna	PhD in Medicine, Associate Professor of the Department of Internal Diseases Head of the educational programme of the residency in Nephrology, including adult, NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda",
7	Academic Expert	Laryushina Elena Mikhailovna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor, head of the Department of Internal Diseases, NJSC Medical University of Karaganda
8	Academic Expert	Sultanova Gulnar Dosnovna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Dean of the Faculties of Dentistry, Pharmacy, Public Health Care and Nursing of NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov"
9	Employers' representative	Nurgaliyev Yerlan Yermekbayevich	Director general of GammaLab Diagnostic Laboratory LLP
10	Resident Representative	Maykenova Arailim Muratkyzy	Resident of the first year of study in the specialty "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" NJSC "Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University "

The observer for ECAQA is Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna, Head of Accreditation and

Monitoring Department.

The work of the ECAQA was carried out in accordance with the Regulation of EEC (Order of the Director General of ECAQA No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational programme 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC on further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above-mentioned educational programme and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

2. General part of the final report

2.1 Presentation of the educational programme of the residency in the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)"

Organization name, legal form of ownership, BIN	Non-state educational institution "Kazakh-Russian Medical University", BIN 970240002300
Management body	Attendees
Full name of the chief executive officer	Dzhainakbayev Nurlan Temirbekovich
Created in	1992
Location and contact details	Almaty, str. Abylai Khan 51/53 Tel: +7(771)495-60-51, +7(778) 188-54-48E-mail: info@medkrmu.kz
State license for educational activities in the residency (date, number)	No.0137388 dated July 8, 2021
Information on branches, subsidiaries (if any)	no.
Year of implementation of the accredited educational programme (EP)	2021
Duration of training	2 years
Total number of graduates since the beginning of EP implementation	0
Number of residents on EP since the beginning of the current year	3 (1 year of study)
Full-time trainers/ Combiners involved in the implementation of EP, incl. % of degree	6/1 (83.3%)

The NEI "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" (hereinafter referred to as the University, KRMU) represents the organization of medical education with a private form of ownership, having the necessary material, technical and scientific and educational base, highly qualified pedagogical and scientific personnel.

Over years of activity, the University has trained more than 6,000 specialists successfully working in the practical health care of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The main applied scientific direction of the university is the development of innovations for the introduction of practical health care, primarily mobile medicine for the rural population, the development of mobile medical complexes for rapid response in the event of emergencies and disasters. Thus, for his achievements in the development of mobile medical complexes, Rector, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor N.T. Dzhainakbayev was awarded the quality certificate of the Swiss Institute of Quality Standard

"International Quality Certificate" (SIQS) in 2015. The university lecturers publish the results of scientific activity in peer-reviewed publications, as well as in the journal "Actual problems of theoretical and clinical medicine", which has been published at the university quarterly since 2011. Cooperation with 30 Kazakh and foreign higher educational institutions, on the basis of concluded contracts, memoranda, agreements, contributes to the development of internationalization of the university, increases its competitiveness in the training of specialists.

The University conducts gradual training of specialists at all levels of higher (bachelor's, internship) and postgraduate (residency, master's, doctoral), as well as additional education. From the 2021-2022 academic year, the university began training specialists in residency in the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)". A specialty curriculum has been developed, which is included in the register of the Unified State Register, EMCD. In 2021, 3 residents were recruited for this specialty, which is carried out in 2021-2022 at the Department of Internal Diseases. To implement the educational programme, an educational learning environment was created, management and monitoring mechanisms aimed at improving the effectiveness of training specialists are functioning.

2.2. Information on previous accreditation

To date, the accreditation of the educational programme 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" has not been carried out.

2.3. Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the self-assessment report of the educational programme 7R01104 – " Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions

The report on the self-assessment of the educational programme of the residency in the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 93 pages of the main text, appendices on 26 pages, copies or electronic versions documents located at the link <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/14HwOLGx9TRQtLU52VaCBZtcVaOj15FO>

The report is characterized by the completeness of responses to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for the self-assessment of the educational programme provided to the organization of education by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by Rector N.T. Dzhainakbayeva, which confirms the reliability of quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 20 members of the internal self-assessment commission with an indication of the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme – Bekmagambetov Zh.M., Head of the Department of Strategic Development and Accreditation

The self-assessment of the educational programme 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" was carried out on the basis of the order of the rector of the NGO "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" No. 26-02-50/1-n/k dated 01.07.2021 "On preparation for accreditation and organization of the self-assessment of educational programmes".

The report was reviewed by the accreditation expert: Laryushina Elena Mikhailovna, and the reviews noted strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes, which were taken into account in the feedback process with the representative of the university and the corresponding changes and additions were made to the self-assessment report.

All the standards provide real practice of the university for the training of residents in the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)", taking into account the beginning of admission of students in 2021, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment

report is sufficiently complete and updated in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, learning outcomes, results of knowledge and skills assessment, material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, plans for development and improvement.

The report is submitted to ECAQA in a completed form, with correction of the data on the above recommendations, written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criterion of standards, tables and contain references in the text and have end-to-end numbering.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure, the external assessment. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be obtained during the visit to the educational institution, i.e. verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

3. External expert evaluation assessment

External expert work within the framework of the evaluation of the educational programme 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by the order of the Director General of the "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care" No.5 dated February 17, 2017) and in accordance with the programme approved on May 20, 2022 by the Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the Rector Dzhainakbayev Nurlan Temirbekovich of the NEI "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" (hereinafter – the University). Dates of the visit to the organization: 30-31 May-1 June 2022.

The external evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying the indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the Programme), which is contained in the documentation of the accreditation center. The programme is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of an external expert evaluation.

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- interview with management and administrative staff – 20 people in total;
- interviews with residents – 14 people;
- studying the website_www.medkrmu.kz;
- interviewing 17 employees, 8 teachers;
- questionnaires of teachers and residents - 14 and 12, respectively;
- observation of residents' education: attendance at a practical lesson (the topic of the practical lesson: "Non-specific ulcerative colitis". Full name of the teacher: Yesnazarova Gulnara Serikovna, 2 residents of group 21-01, venue: study room of the Department of Internal Diseases, State Clinical Hospital No.1, microdistrict Kalkaman, str. Ashimova, 2,
- review of resources in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards: 1 practice/clinical training base was visited - City Clinical Hospital No.1, microdistrict Kalkaman, str. Ashimova, 2, where training is carried out on 5 educational programmes, including the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" with the participation of 4 full-time teachers, 1 part-time clinical mentor;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 65 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the units (the list of studied documents is in Attachment 2).

The staff of the accredited organization ensures the presence of all persons indicated in the visiting programme and according to the lists of interviews and interviews (Table 1).

Table 1 -Information about the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with members of the EEC

№	Full name	Job Title
Residency Teachers		
1	Zordinova Karamyat Akhmetovna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Internal Medicine
2	Gulnara Serikovna Esnazarova	candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Internal Medicine
3	Ligai Zoya Nikolaevna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of General Medical Practice
4	Karabaeva Aigul Zhumartovna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Senior Lecturer of the Department of General Medical Practice
Student residencies		
5	Kemelova Indira Kanatkyzy	resident of the 1st year of study in the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)"
6	Zhanar Mirzaevna Kozieva	resident of the 1st year of study in the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)"
7	Khairova Zhuldyz Yerzhankyzy	resident of the 1st year of study in the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)"
Healthcare Practitioners		
8	Baizhigitova Nazipa Begalievna	Deputy Chief Physician for Medical Work of the State Clinical Hospital No.1
9	Alimbetova Mayra Serikovna	Deputy Chief Physician for Medical Work of the State Clinical Hospital on the Right of Economic Management "Almaty Multidisciplinary Clinical Hospital"
10	Zhumataeva Zarina Akhmetovna	Director of MC "Rakhat"
11	Kunaeva Gulbanu Janabaevna	Deputy Director for Strategic Development of the CCCH
12	Bukumbayeva Damira Dzhurumbayevna	IE "Bukumbayeva"

During the visit to the units of the University of Accreditation Experts, the strengths of the organization of education in relation to the accredited educational programme were noted: 1) The presence of a mobile medical complex for diagnostic and therapeutic measures for adults and children in emergency situations. 2) Functioning of the department of distance learning technologies. 3) High commitment and continuity of residents to this university. 4) High level of degree, categorization and long pedagogical experience of the teaching staff. 5) Availability of modern clinical facilities to achieve the goals of training contributes to adequate training of residents. 6) The stable financial situation of the university.

The University has units that are directly related to the educational programme 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)", which can be noted as the best practice in education, namely, the Department of Distance Education Technologies and the Career and Employment Center. This conclusion is drawn, since these units provide the formation of the skill of continuous self-improvement and contribute to the choice of an individual educational trajectory.

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. The final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, the study of documents, the results of the interview, questionnaires was held. EEC members started designing the final EEC report. The results of the external evaluation are summarized. Experts individually completed the "Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" for compliance with the

ECAQA Accreditation Standards". EEC members made a comment on the lack of access of residents to clinical bases to ensure the implementation of the pediatric component. Recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed and the Chairperson Kurmanova A.M. held a final open vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for the accreditation period of 5 years.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all the necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the university, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to the members of the EEC.

At the end of the programme of the visit, the chairperson of the EEC for the management and employees of the organization of education announced recommendations on the results of an external assessment within the framework of specialized accreditation.

4. Results of the survey

An observer from the ECAQA conducted an online survey on the resource in the period 30.05.2022 <https://webanketa.com/>.

The resident survey includes 22 questions.

Total number of respondents –12.

This university will be recommended as an organization of education –75 % fully agree, partially -25 %. Fully agree 83.3% of respondents, 8.33% partially agree and 8.33% doubt that programme managers and faculty are aware of their learning challenges. Completely (83.3%), partially (8.3%) and doubt the answer (8.3%) with the conditions and equipment of the study rooms, university classrooms. According to 100% (full) office equipment is available for use on the basis of practice. Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes - fully agree 100%. Fully (100%) satisfied with the library collection and resources. All 100% of respondents have access to electronic educational resources.

The organization of clinical training, according to 75% of respondents, fully satisfies them, but 25% - partially. Satisfied completely (91.67%) and partially (8.33%) with the methods of teaching. There is sufficient time for practical training (patient supervision, etc.) – 100% fully agree. Satisfied with the methods of assessing my knowledge and skills – completely agree 91.67%, partially 8.33%. According to 91.67% of residents, teachers regularly use active and interactive teaching methods in classes, and according to 8.33% - sometimes.

According to 100% of respondents, teachers constantly provide feedback after completing classes. Fully satisfied that study in higher education 83.33%, partly 16.67% of respondents. The university allows you to improve or acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the chosen specialty, 91.67% are confident, 8.33% cannot give an answer, 0% would like to believe it, 0% began to doubt it. 100% are fully satisfied with the organization of teaching in the NEI KRMU.

According to 75% of respondents, accreditation is a necessary mechanism for improving educational programmes, but 16.67% believe that it is not necessary to conduct and 8.33% doubt the answer. The work of the EEC was assessed as positive – 91.67% of residents, satisfactory – 8.33%.

The results of the survey generally demonstrate satisfaction with the educational process, the availability of office equipment on clinical bases, the provision of methodological material, the library fund and electronic resources for preparation for classes, the methodology of training and evaluation, which testify to the good organization and implementation of the educational programme. However, it is noted that 25% of residents are partially satisfied with the organization of clinical training.

The teacher survey included 21 questionnaire questions.

The total number of teachers on the list is 14. The total number of respondents was 14, including 7.14 per cent with experience of up to 5 years, 28.57 per cent with experience of up to 10 years and 64.29 per cent with experience of more than 10 years. 100% satisfied with the organization of the educational process. The university observes ethics and subordination completely agree 100%.

Completely satisfied with the organization of work and workplace 92.86% of respondents, partially - 7.14%. There is an opportunity for career growth and competence development for teachers in the organization - 100% fully agree.

In this educational institution, teachers have the opportunity to do scientific work and publish the results of research – 100% completely agree. 92.86% of respondents are completely satisfied with work of personnel service, doubt with the answer – 7.14%. The majority of those surveyed have undergone refresher training over the past 5 years. 100% fully agree that they can be implemented as professionals. Unfortunately, 42.86% did not answer the question of whether the university supports the teacher in participating in international and republican events, they applied for payment of travel, business trips, registration fee – 7.14%, for payment of registration fee – 7.14%, and 35.71% did not apply with this to the management or relevant administrative employees of the university. 100% of respondents fully agree that students have free access to patients on the clinical bases of the university and to the resources of the practice bases. 42.86% know about the implementation of social programmes to support teachers, 7.14% used them, 28.57% do not know and 21.43% of respondents are doubtful about their availability. The management and administration systematically listen to the opinion of teachers -92.86%, sometimes -7.14% of the respondents. Students are taught using a variety of teaching methods, but more often work is done by analyzing situational tasks (88.06%), working in small groups (92.86%), lectures (50%), interactive learning (64.29%), performing abstracts (50%), performing projects, coursework (50%), practical classes in clinical skills at the training and clinical center (50%), oral analysis of the topic of classes (78.57%) oral surveys and analysis of the topic (64.29%), working in small groups (50%)also problem-oriented learning (57.14%), solving tests (71.43%), solving cases (42.86%), less often written completion of tasks (28.57%). Completely according to 92.86% that this questionnaire will be useful for the development of recommendations for improving the university and educational programmes of the residency, 7.14% partially agree with this.

The results of the survey generally demonstrate satisfaction with the educational process, the resources of the clinical base, the organization of work, career opportunities, research work, the development of pedagogical competencies, which indicates the availability of mechanisms for managing the educational programme, the development of material and technical resources and personnel potential. Attention is drawn to the lack of awareness of teachers about social programmes to support teachers.

5. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme in the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)"

Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES

Evidence of compliance:

1.1 Mission statement and deliverables

Thus, when implementing the activities of the programme, namely, based on the results of the interview with the first head of the organization, members of the Academic Council, in interviews with residents/students and teachers, compliance with the criteria of **Standard 1** was established. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the organization, took part in the formation of proposals for the formulation of the mission, while the mission was brought to the attention of potential residents through the website, social networks, information letters to medical organizations. The "Strategy of the NEI" Kazakh-Russian Medical University" for 2019-2025" was reviewed, which was discussed at the Academic Council on December 26, 2019, Protocol No.5, including such strategic goals as improving the quality of services through the development of the university's educational programmes; internationalization and development of the university's scientific potential at the international and national levels; ensuring the growth of the university's management efficiency through digitalization of activities and compliance with the requirements of national and international

standards; improving the efficiency of human capital management through improving the processes of relationship management, developing competencies, team spirit and proactivity; forming the university's image in the education market through the use of marketing tools; modernizing the material and technical base of the university through the updating of computer equipment and increasing the classroom fund, which confirms the fulfillment of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization. From the interviews with residents, it was established that before the beginning of classes, teachers inform about the mission, competencies and final learning outcomes necessary for mastering in the learning process, determine, together with a supervisor and a clinical mentor, an individual curriculum, are aware of where they can get the necessary information about the educational programme, teachers, clinical training bases.

1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy

The University is autonomous in the formulation of the mission of the EP, in the development of the EP on the basis of the State Mandatory Residency Standard for Medical Specialties and the standard professional curriculum for medical specialties of the residency, the order of the Ministry of Health and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 647 dated July 31, 2015, as amended by the order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 21, 2020 No. KR DSM-12/2020, which is located in the register of the ESUVO. The autonomy of the EP is confirmed by the university's independent determination of the Work Curricula, the availability of developed syllabuses for the disciplines (Syllabuses for the disciplines "Gastroenterology", "Nutritional Science", "Fundamentals of Oncology", approved by the CEP, protocol No.1 dated August 31, 2021), the choice of forms of final control. CED (CED for 2022-2023 academic year in the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)", approved at the meeting of the Academic Council on 24.02.22, protocol No.4) allows residents to form an individual educational trajectory in achieving the final results of training.

In the process of external evaluation, it was established that the determined competencies, learning outcomes, EP, syllabuses, CED undergo the necessary review and discussion procedures: they are developed and considered at a meeting of the Department of Internal Diseases, discussed at a meeting of the CEP, agreed at a meeting of the Academic Council of the University and approved by the Academic Council. The EP was agreed with I.K. Kemelova, a 1-year resident, and an external national expert (a review of Gastroenterology for Adults and Children by G.A. Abildayeva, MD, Associate Professor of the Department of Internal Diseases with the course of propaedeutics of internal diseases of Asfendiyarov KazNMU).

The University organizes round tables with employers on the role of employers in the formation of the EP (April 23, 21), meetings with employers in coordination with the CED. Representatives of practical health care are members of the Clinical Council of the University, the CEP of postgraduate education.

1.3 Learning outcomes

The final results of training are presented in the EP for specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)", approved on 18.08.2021. In the course of interviews with residents, it was established that residents are informed about the results of training, which they get acquainted with on the first day of training, including training in disciplines. All interested parties can also get acquainted with the mission of the EP on the website <https://krmu.edu.kz/> (Training programmes – Residence).

1.4 Participation in the formulation of the mission and final results

During the visit to the University, it was established that the university operates procedures for the formulation of the mission and final learning outcomes. Residents, teachers, administrative staff, employers are involved in the formulation of the mission and learning outcomes. Thus, the mission of the EP, the final results of training in the accredited specialty were developed and discussed at the meeting of the Department of Internal Diseases, agreed with the resident of the 1st year of study Kemelova I.K., discussed at the meeting of the EP committee, agreed at the Academic Council (June 24, 21, Minutes No.6) and approved by the decision of the Academic Council (August 18, 21, Minutes No.011). The committee of postgraduate education includes representatives of practical health care (CED for 2021-2022 academic year, dated 06.09.21), teachers, heads of structural units and residents.

Nevertheless, the EP in the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" is not agreed with the employer of the relevant profile. The inclusion of representatives of practical healthcare in the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" in the list of approving parties of the EP will allow to fully ensure the participation of all stakeholders in the formulation of the mission and final results of training in this EP.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 17 standards: fully – 16, partially – 1, non-compliant – 0

Standard 1: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) The final results of training should be determined taking into account proposals from interested parties (the employer).

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME

Evidence of compliance:

2.1 Postgraduate programme framework

In the development and implementation of EP for the training of students of the residency, a competence-oriented approach, credit technology of training and practice-oriented training are used, which is carried out on clinical bases with personal participation in the therapeutic and diagnostic process. The organization's documents contain syllabuses for disciplines (syllabuses for the disciplines "Gastroenterology", "Nutrition", "Fundamentals of Oncology", approved by the CEP, protocol No.1 of 31.08.2021), EMCD, where the goal is defined, the integration of practical and theoretical components, the independent work of residents, including independent work under the guidance of a clinical mentor, is taken into account. Compliance of the State Standard State Educational Standard with the standard curriculum for the specialty has been established. The content of the Working Curriculum in the specialty (18.08.21, approved by the Vice-Rector for Academic Work) corresponds to the standard curricula and CED. When developing a catalogue of elective disciplines, the expectations of employers and the needs of the labor market are taken into account. The number of hours of the elective component (elective disciplines), their correlation with the mandatory disciplines are regulated by the SCES RoK. Attending the practical lesson on the topic "Non-specific ulcerative colitis" in the amount of 3 hours, the experts received convincing data that the training is carried out according to the plan, before the beginning of the lesson, the residents answer the control tests, receive feedback from the teacher, have the opportunity to improve the skills of differential diagnosis in the case of diarrhea syndrome, establish and substantiate the patient's clinical diagnosis, determine management tactics, nutritional support, develop a plan for preparation for genetically engineered therapy of patients with ulcerative colitis in adults. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational programme, since the experts studied the code of ethics (26.11.2021) and during the interview, the residents replied that they were informed about the content of this document.

The analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in advisory disciplines are taken into account, additions are made to the bibliography of the EMCD and syllabuses, and teachers apply them in classes.

This indicates compliance with Standard 2 in terms of adapting training to the needs of residents.

2.2 Scientific method

The content of the EP is aimed, inter alia, at mastering the scientific and research competence of the resident – "research: able to formulate adequate research questions, critically assess professional literature, effectively use international databases in its daily activities, participate in the work of the research team". When analyzing syllabuses by discipline, it was found that when organizing training within the framework of independent work, students identified various types of work aimed at developing research competencies, such as reviews for a scientific article, presentations on studied topics, work with scientific literature, participation in the research department, in departmental events,

webinars, master classes, congresses and seminars, etc. Thus, residents of the 1st year of study participated in the scientific and practical Online Conference "COVID-19 pandemic: challenges, lessons, solutions". The CED presents the discipline of the component of the choice "Management of scientific research". Conducting magazine clubs, where publications with a high level of evidence are analyzed to develop the skills of residents in critical analysis, judgment, language practice. However, when interviewing residents, analyzing the syllabuses, individual curriculum, the resident's diary-report, it is not clear how many tasks must be completed by the resident to master this research competence, how its mastery is assessed; no evidence of planning the research work of residents is presented.

2.3 Content of the residency programme

In the EP developed by the University (EP 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" approved by the decision of the Academic Council on 18.08.2021, Protocol No.011), the purpose and results of training are presented. The achievement of the goals and results of training in EP is based on the acquisition by residents of the necessary knowledge and key competencies, the core disciplines of the mandatory component and the component of choice. The curriculum of the 1st year of study reflects the consistent mastering of the profile disciplines of the mandatory component (Gastroenterology, Nutrition, Fundamentals of Oncology) in the amount of 70 credits, which is reflected in the content of the syllabuses developed by the University. In the 2nd year of study, according to the Work Curriculum submitted (18.08.21, approved by the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs), it is planned to master such profiling disciplines of the mandatory component as Hepatology, Endoscopy, Ultrasonic Diagnostics, as well as the disciplines of the component of choice.

Analysis of the submitted documents, as well as in the process of interviewing the faculty, it was found that the content and scope of the disciplines of the EP of the residence in the specialty, correspond to the State Standard Curriculum and the Standard Curriculum, as well as internal regulatory documents (Academic Policy, 27.08.2021).

2.4 Programme structure, content and duration

The structure of the programme (see clause 2.3), its content and duration of study are presented in the curriculum of the EP, on the basis of which the University developed a Work Curriculum for the 1st year of study (18.08.21, approved by the Vice-Rector for Academic Work). There is an updated KED for 2022-2023 academic year in the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" (approved at the meeting of the Academic Council on 24.02.22, protocol No.4), containing 4 disciplines of the component of choice: "Differential diagnosis of diseases accompanied by abdominal pain", "Differential diagnosis of diseases of the digestive organs accompanied by anaemic syndrome", "Modern methods of diagnosis in hepatology", "Evidence-based medicine", "Management of scientific research" (4 credits).

2.5 Organization of training

When analyzing the questionnaire of residents, it was found that all (100%) students are satisfied with the organization of teaching at the University, agree with the statement that there is enough time for practical training. The organization of clinical training, according to 75% of respondents, fully satisfies them, but 25% - partially. Most of the residents (91.67%) answered that the university allows to improve or acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the chosen specialty. The analysis of teachers' questionnaires also reflects the high satisfaction (100%) of the teaching staff with the organization of the educational process.

2.6 Relationship between postgraduate medical education and health care

When conducting a visual inspection, interviewing students and clinical mentors during a visit to clinical bases, it was established that the mastery of clinical skills, competencies is carried out under the guidance of a clinical mentor. Mentoring is carried out on the basis of the Regulation on Mentoring, approved by the Protocol of the Scientific and Clinical Council No.18 of June 17, 2019. There is an order (dated 01.09.21, No.1-2) of the vice-rector for scientific and clinical work on the appointment of curators and a clinical mentor of residents of the relevant specialty, and the distribution of residents by clinical bases (clinical mentor Alimbetova M.S., ARCH, Almaty). In the process of

interviewing residents, as well as during the examination of clinical bases, insufficient provision of opportunities for training to provide advisory and diagnostic assistance at the outpatient stage, both for adults and children was revealed.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 30 standards: fully - 28, partially – 2.

Standard 2: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) To develop quantitative indicators of R&D, the scientific component shall be included in the thematic plan in the form of tasks based on the application of scientific analysis methods.

2) Expand the use of clinical bases for the possibility of mastering the outpatient stage of providing specialized gastroenterological care to adults and children.

Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS

Evidence of compliance:

3.1 Methods of evaluation

The study of control and measurement tools for tests (test task bank for the disciplines Gastroenterology, Nutritional Science with internal reviews, specification of test tasks), evaluation sheets for evaluating various tasks of residents (Evaluation Sheet – training conference "Journal Club" (review of a scientific article), evaluation of a resident doctor by patients and employees (360), evaluation sheet of a clinical task, evaluation sheet of a presentation, evaluation sheet of a duty, evaluation sheet of a practical skill (dops), evaluation sheet of filling out medical documentation, evaluation sheet of a clinical case discussion (CBD), evaluation sheet of a mini-clinical exam (MINI-CEX)), electronic journal of AIS "Platonus", showed that the organization has introduced an appropriate evaluation policy that allows to evaluate the educational achievements of residents in a multifaceted manner. During the interview, the residents told about the assessment forms, using assessment sheets and that they were satisfied with everything, as well as receiving regular feedback from teachers. The assessment system, appeals of the assessment results are reflected in the document Academic Policy of the University (Academic Policy, 27.08.2021), Regulations on the current monitoring of students' performance, interim and final certification in the NEI "KazRosmeduniversity" (Decision of the Academic Council, 29.08.2019; Regulations on the assessment of students' knowledge (Decision of the Academic Council, 29.08.2019), Regulations on the Test Committee (Decision of the Academic Council, 28.10.2021). There were no precedents for the appeal during the period of implementation of the EP. Thus, compliance with standard 3 has been established. However, it should be noted that there are no test tasks in the Gastroenterology test bank aimed at assessing the achievements of the training results in the paediatric component.

3.2 Relationship between evaluation and training

When analyzing the syllabuses, measuring instruments, interviewing residents and teachers, it was found that the methods of assessing the current and final control used to assess the results of training residents in the specialty are comparable to the methods of training. Also, the analysis of the results of the survey of residents indicates their high satisfaction (91.67%) with the methods of assessing knowledge and skills, the use of active and interactive teaching methods by teachers, constant feedback after completing the lesson (100%).

The conclusions of the EEC meet the criteria of 11 standards: fully - 10, partially – 1.

Standard 3: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Expand the bank of tests for assignments in disciplines with tests aimed at assessing the achievement of training results in the paediatric component.

Standard 4: STUDENTS

Evidence of compliance:

4.1 Admission and Selection Policy

Formation of the residency contingent in the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" is carried out by the University in accordance with the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On approval of the Standard Rules for admission to education, implementing educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education" dated October 31, 2018 No.600, State Standardized Educational Standards of the Republic of Kazakhstan – 2020 and the Rules for admission to the residency. The study of the Rules of admission to the residency during the visit (approved by the Vice-Rector for Clinical and Scientific Work, 24.07.2020), information on the university website (<http://krmu.edu.kz/rezidentura-3/>, "Admission Commission"- "Residence"), the admission examination programme for admission to the residency in the EP 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" (approved at the meeting of the CEP on 24.05.22) indicates that the educational organization has a policy of admission and selection of residents, which is periodically revised taking into account the needs and requirements of health care and society. Thus, for example, in 2020, in accordance with the circular letter of the Ministry of Health (Ref. No. 14-02-11/3875-I dated 16.07.2020) on the basis of the decision of the Republican Commission on Distribution (Protocol No.1 dated 30.06.2020), the conditions of admission were changed – conducting an interview online, calculating the final assessment, taking into account the scores of the applicant's individual achievements and the availability of a certificate of the applicant's place of work in medical institutions of the Republic of Kazakhstan associated with the fight against coronavirus infection. When analyzing the content of the programme of the entrance exam for admission to the residency in the EP 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)", it was revealed that the programme includes highly specialized questions.

4.2 Number of residents

According to the educational programme 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" in the 2021-2022 academic year, the first recruitment of 3 residents on a contractual basis was held.

4.3 Resident support and advice

To this end, the resident is assigned a curator who provides the functions of an academic mentor, participates in the formation and implementation of an individual curriculum, manages the educational and scientific activities of the student, assists in employment and a clinical mentor in the medical organization where the resident is trained. G.S. Esnazarova, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Internal Diseases is the curator of residents in the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)". The university has mechanisms for adapting to learning, primarily through mentoring. The syllabuses for the disciplines contain the contact details of the curator (corporate email address, phone number), and student support services. When interviewing residents, it was found that they immediately receive feedback on emerging issues, more often used for this purpose Vazap, at the beginning of the training in each discipline the teacher explains the organization of training, the schedule of tasks, the assessment methods used, methodological materials, library resources presented in the syllabus.

The University has mechanisms for social and financial support of students in accordance with the internal document "Regulations on social support of students" (June 21, 2019). In order to optimize employment and monitor the career of university graduates, a Career Center was established by the Rector's order, operating on the basis of the Regulation on the Career Center (22.10.2020). The University organizes support for students in the event of a professional crisis, which is carried out by the Residency Department together with curators and clinical mentors in case of problem situations.

4.4 Representation of residents

When analyzing the submitted documentation, it was established that the Academic Council, on the basis of the order of the rector dated August 26, 2021, includes a resident of the 2nd year of Shaikhin D., specializing in "Anesthesiology and resuscitation", the CEP of postgraduate education includes a resident of the 2nd year of K. Taylykov's training in the specialty of Infectious diseases of adults, children, 3 years of A. Tolegen in the specialty "Obstetrics and gynecology of adults, children". Every

year, questionnaires of residency graduates are carried out, which serves as a basis for improving the implementation of EP. Reports on the results of the survey of residency graduates for 2020, 2021, and the survey of residency students for 2020-2021 were presented. I.K. Kemelova, a resident of 1 year of study, participated in the coordination developed by the EP in the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)".

4.5 Working conditions

When enrolling in the residency, students, together with a supervisor and a clinical mentor, determine the individual work plan of the resident (Zh.E. Khairova, 1 year of study in the specialty "Gastroenterology adult, pediatric", approved by the head of the residency department on August 31, 21), the resident's diary-report (Zh.E. Khairova, 1 year of study in the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)", which indicates the bases for clinical training, a list of disciplines, skills for mastering, the period of training and holidays, the schedule of duty of the resident. In the resident's diary-report (Zh.E. Khairova, 1 year of study in the specialty "Gastroenterology, adult, pediatric"), there is a sheet on familiarization with the policy of the academic discipline at the Department of Internal Diseases, the instructions on safety and labor protection at the clinical base, the obligation to non-disclose confidential information dated 01.09.2021. When visiting the clinical base (State Clinical Hospital No.1), it was established that there is a study room, workplaces for work in the department, conditions for rest and meals.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 30 standards: fully - 29, partially – 1.

Standard 4: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) The programme of entrance examinations should include questions only in the disciplines of prerequisites and exclude highly specialized topics.

Standard 5: FACULTY

Evidence of compliance:

5.1 Recruitment and Selection Policy

In order to verify the data of Standard 5, external experts during the interview obtained the opinion of teachers on the personnel policy, which indicates that the University has and successfully operates the Personnel Policy, on the basis of which the selection and admission of teachers is carried out on a competitive basis, conditions for the development of teaching staff are created. Thus, competitive selection is carried out on the basis of the current Regulation on the competitive substitution of positions of faculty and researchers, approved by the order of the rector No. 26-02-44-n/k dated November 27, 2020. The University has approved the structure of departments. Order dated 26.08.2020 No. 26-02-14-n.k "On Amendments to the Organizational Structure of the Chairs of the University Regulations on departments (30.04.2021), Regulations on the pedagogical load of faculty (30.04.2021), job descriptions of employees (24.09.21) have been developed. Control over the performance of the duties of teaching staff is carried out by heads of departments, deans of faculties on the basis of the implementation of individual plans of the teacher, educational and methodological, scientific and public work. During the visit, the report on the scientific work of the department for the 2020-2021 academic year, approved by the vice-rector for scientific and clinical work dated June 21, 21, individual work plans of the head of the department of internal diseases, Professor K.A. Zordinova, Associate Professor G.S. Yesnazarova, approved by the vice-rector for academic activities dated August 27, 21, were also studied. The results of the survey of teaching staff demonstrate high satisfaction with the organization of work and opportunities for career growth, research and advanced training. When interviewing teachers and analyzing the documentation, no information was received about the availability of evaluation criteria for teachers and clinical mentors at the university.

5.2 Teachers' obligations and development

In order to verify the data of Standard 5, during a meeting with the head of the personnel department and during an interview with teachers, experts received an opinion on approaches to the development

of teachers' pedagogical competence, motivation to work with residents, the implementation of mentoring, which includes the functioning of the Teacher's School (Regulations on the Teacher's School of 12.12.2017, Programmes for teaching modules, Methods of teaching at a medical university. Methodological instructions for teachers (approved at the meeting of the Academic Council on 26.08.21) for the development of pedagogical competencies, annual planning of teacher development on the basis of the formation of plans (Plans for the advanced training of teaching staff for 2017-2021). Plans and reports for the last 5 years are analyzed. Thus, 145 teachers of the university underwent advanced training for the 2020-2021 academic year, including the head of the department of internal Zordinova K.A., who received training in the cycle of Gastroenterology in the amount of 216 hours on the basis of KazNMU. The expert checked the certificates of teachers: Associate Professor Esnazarova G.S., who was trained from 12 to 27 March 2018 at the Asfendiyarov Medical University in the amount of 54 hours on the cycle "Teacher of medical organizations of education and science", in 2019 in the amount of 216 hours on the cycle "Modern methods of diagnosis and treatment of diseases of internal organs" on the basis of the Medical Academy of Postgraduate Education; teacher Shalbayeva R.Sh., who was trained in 2020 in the amount of 54 hours on the cycle "Mechanisms for introducing and improving the system of compulsory social health insurance" at the Kazakhstan Medical University of the Higher Education Institution, in 2018 in the specialty of Oncology, in the cycle "Independent examination" on the basis of the Medical Education Center of Urken, in 2017 on the basis of Asfendiyarov Medical University in the amount of 54 hours on the cycle "Teacher of medical organizations of education and science"; in 2017 Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology of the Ministry of Health of Kazakhstan in the amount of 216 hours on the cycle "Oncogynecology". At the same time, it should be noted that Associate Professor G.S. Yesnazarova, who carries out educational activities in the disciplines of the mandatory component, has no advanced training in the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" for the last 5 years. The university teaching staff who implement EP does not participate in the work of the committee "Gastroenterology" of the EMD of the REMC.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 7 standards: fully – 6, partially – 1, non-compliant – 0

Standard 5: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Develop evaluation criteria for TS and clinical mentors.
- 2) To provide on a regular basis professional development of teaching staff within the framework of the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)";
- 3) To recommend a candidate from among the university's teaching staff to participate in the work of the Gastroenterology Committee of the Department of General Medicine of the Department of Healthcare.

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

Evidence of compliance:

6.1 Logistics and equipment

In the list of material and technical base of departments, implementing EP in the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" there is a sufficient number of office equipment necessary to ensure the educational process with the use of innovative teaching methods, methodological material. The study room, located on the clinical base is furnished, is equipped with office equipment (printer, projector in the presence of computers and laptops with access to the Internet space. Resident doctors can fully search for the necessary medical information and perform tasks of independent work, work in medical information systems), visual aids, educational material in electronic form. When visiting the State Clinical Hospital No.1, it was established that resident doctors have access to equipment on clinical bases, in particular for ultrasound diagnostics, as well as radiological, echographic, ECG, CT and MRI studies. In the training of residents, endoscopic diagnostic and treatment equipment is used.

The University has a test center equipped with 122 computers for the final control of the knowledge of residents. To form the clinical competencies of students, there is a Training and Clinical Center (TCC), where residents practice the skills of emergency care. Mobile medical complexes designed to provide qualified medical and specialized gastroenterological care to the population of remote areas are equipped with basic diagnostic equipment, including equipment for clinical and laboratory, ultrasound diagnostics.

The library fund is sufficiently provided with literature in the specialty, including author's guides on therapeutic nutrition (prof. Zhangabylov A.K.), electronic resources. The library provides access to international, national bibliographic and abstract databases of peer-reviewed scientific literature. The university has formed databases of educational information resources, to which there is access from the intranet of the university. The distance learning system is based on AIS Moodle, where online modules for this specialty are located.

When analyzing the survey of residents, 83.3% of respondents are completely satisfied with the conditions and equipment of the study rooms. According to 100% (full) office equipment is available for use on the basis of practice. Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes - fully agree 100%. Fully (100%) satisfied with the library fund and resources, 100% of respondents have access to electronic educational resources.

6.2 Clinical Bases

The University has 85 clinical bases located in Almaty, Almaty region and regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan. For the clinical training of residents in the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" signed contracts with 4 clinical bases:

- 1) RSE on REM "Almaty Multidisciplinary Clinical Hospital" (accredited), total bed capacity 360 beds, including gastroenterology department for 20 beds
- 2) SPE on the REM of the SCB No.1 (accredited for 2018 – 2022 by the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan), total bed capacity – 410 beds, including 10 gastroenterological beds in the therapeutic unit, consulting and diagnostic department;
- 3) SPE on the REM "Children's City Clinical Hospital No.2" (recognized as accredited for a period of 3 years with the assignment of category 1. Date of issue of the certificate 09.11.2018. Registration No. KZ69VEG00008623, Astana), total bed capacity – 312 beds.
- 4) City Polyclinic No.29 (recognized as accredited for a period of 3 years with the assignment of 1 category. Date of issue of the certificate 16.07.2020. Registration No. KZ66VEG00010247, Nur-Sultan) - 185 thousand visits per year, 5 pediatric areas, specialized office.

The review of resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, for example, the clinical base of the RSE on REM CCH No.1 of Almaty with a total bed capacity of 312 beds was visited, and employees of the organization of education provide collegial and ethical relations with medical personnel, the management of the clinical base to achieve the final results of residents. A sufficient number of thematic patients, modern equipment and demonstrates accessibility to students are provided, and employees who simultaneously perform the roles of teachers and mentors (mentors) provide high-quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the relevant discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during the training. The list, the required volume, as well as a mark on the performance of clinical skills are reflected in the diary-report. Members of the External Expert Commission (EEC) Experts studied the documents of residents (portfolio, results of assessment of residents - checklists, results of questionnaire of residents). When analyzing the questionnaire, it was found that 75% are completely satisfied with clinical training, and 25% - partially and 100% of residents answered that they have sufficient time for practical training (patient supervision, etc.) – fully agree.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report and to obtain evidence on the quality of the programmes, interviews were conducted with residents in the specialty. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with the training, enough time for patient supervision, work in DAMUMED with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of

teachers, social and moral support for residents in need, participation in "Journal Clubs", accessibility of international databases of professional literature, scientific works. In general, the residents are satisfied with the training, evaluation methods, and purposefully entered this organization, as they believe that the organization of education has good resources, image and international relations, at the same time, the residents noted the lack of access to clinical bases of the pediatric profile during the training.

6.3 Information technology

When examining the syllabuses, visiting the library, experts found that the library fund is provided with educational and scientific literature in the specialty, including the demonstrated author's guide to Practical Dietetics (prof. Zhangabylov A.K.), electronic resources. The library provides access to international, national bibliographic and abstract databases of peer-reviewed scientific literature. The university has formed databases of educational information resources, which are accessible to students and teachers.

When visiting the department of distance learning technologies, it is shown that the distance learning system is based on the Moodle platform, where online modules for this specialty are located. An online course on the discipline, where the syllabus, methodological materials necessary for the task of a resident gastroenterologist are placed, is demonstrated. It should be noted that the Department of Remote Technologies developed the synchronization of the Moodle platform and Platonus AIS, as well as work on creating an electronic portfolio of students. However, it is noteworthy that during the interview, residents note that they receive the necessary information on the organization of training using WhatsApp.

6.4 Clinical Teams

When interviewing residents, visiting the clinical base, it was established that residents, together with the staff of clinical bases, carry out work under the guidance of a clinical mentor within the framework of their specialty, participate in morning medical, scientific and practical conferences, multidisciplinary consultations, clinical debriefings. Work in multidisciplinary teams is also facilitated by the organization of a clinical base with multidisciplinary beds, as well as the training of residents in 5 different areas of the therapeutic profile. The result of the resident's activity is checked by the teacher using assessment sheets (assessment of the resident's doctor by patients and employees (360), clinical task assessment sheet, duty assessment sheet, practical skill assessment sheet (DOPS), medical documentation completion assessment sheet, clinical case discussion assessment sheet (CBD). Planning and evaluation of these activities of the resident is reflected in the syllabuses, diaries-reports, the portfolio of the resident.

6.5 Medical Research and Advances

The main areas of research of employees involved in the implementation of the EP are: New methods of treatment of liver diseases of a non-viral nature; Study of the therapeutic effectiveness of whole mare's milk and its freeze-dried (dry) form in chronic diseases of the digestive organs; New methods of prediction and methods of correction of necrotic enterocolitis in premature children; The influence of genetic factors on the risk of destruction in the pancreas; Combination of endoscopic ligation and actinotherapy in bleeding from varicose-expanded veins of the esophagus in patients with cirrhosis of the liver. Residents in the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" independently conduct patient supervision, have access to equipment and archived medical records at clinical bases. The department provides residents with appropriate time in the training programme for scientific work. Critical analysis of the literature is presented by residents for discussion and analysis within the framework of the "Journal Club" department, which includes residents of all areas of preparation of the therapeutic profile, which was demonstrated to experts during a visit to the clinical base of the State Clinical Hospital No.1. Resident gastroenterologist 1 year of training Zh. Khairov together with teachers and residents of other specialties is the author of a joint publication: Features of the course of severe community

pneumonia in the elderly (Clinical case). G.S. Esnazarova, K.A. Zordinova, G.M. Gulamova, I. Kemelova, J. Kazieva, J. Khairova, B. Askarova, S. Mishra, A. Askarbekova, People and Medicine of

Kazakhstan, No.2/4. - 2022. – P. 106-110). Nevertheless, there is no information in the individual plans of residents, diaries-reports about the planned topics of research work, publications, speeches at scientific and practical conferences. There is no evidence of resident participation in research within the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)".

6.6 Education expertise

When interviewing teachers, heads of departments, it is shown that at the University, expertise in the assessment of education and research in the field of medical education is provided through the joint work of departments, department of academic work, CEP, AC. Expertise in the evaluation of education, as well as research in the field of medical education, is entrusted to the department of academic work. When analyzing the report of the scientific work of the Department of Internal Diseases for 2020-2021, the participation of teachers of the Department in research in the field of medical education was not reflected.

6.7 Training in other institutions

The University has a department of academic mobility, which works to establish partnerships with Kazakh and foreign universities, plans and organizes the implementation of academic mobility of residents and teachers.

The University has agreements and memoranda of cooperation with 11 organizations of education in the near and far abroad.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 21 standards: fully - 17, partially – 4.

Standard 6: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Ensure implementation of the pediatric component at appropriate clinical sites (6.2.1)
- 2) Update information on the website for resident students (class schedule, EP, self-control questions, syllabuses, training tasks) (6.3.3)
- 3) Individual plans are recommended to reflect research activities (R&D topic, programme, publications, conferences, etc.)
- 4) To develop a system for motivating employees to conduct research in the field of medical education

Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION

Evidence of compliance:

7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms

Within the framework of the general system of monitoring the quality of education, which consists in assessing: the management of the educational programme (the level of teaching staff, the organization of the educational process, the regular assessment of the level of achievement of the goals of the programme, the demand for graduates); the implementation of the educational programme (curriculum, standard programmes of disciplines, methodological and information support, infrastructure, educational technologies, research); the results of the educational programme (interim certification, final certification). A multilevel approach is used for the monitoring and evaluation of EP, including the profiling/graduating and related departments, the residency department, the specialized CEP of postgraduate education, the department of academic work, the Academic Council, the Career Center (general monitoring of the quality of educational programmes through a survey of stakeholders (employers, professional associations and students). Independent monitoring of data on the achievement of the final learning outcomes of residents is carried out by the examination of graduates of EP through the National Center for Independent Examination (NCIE) and on the questionnaire of employers, the analysis of which is carried out annually and serves as a basis for improving training, primarily through the updating of CED and syllabuses. When interviewing, as well as analyzing the report of the Department of Internal Diseases for 2020-2021 academic year, individual plans of teachers, it is shown that for internal quality

assessment a system of intradepartmental control with an assessment of various activities of teachers is used. Internal audit is organized and conducted by the Quality Management System Department on the basis of the annual audit plan (Rector's Order on the Internal Audit Plan for the 2020-2021 academic year). Based on the results of the survey of students, an action plan is developed annually to improve the residency department, which is approved at the meeting of the CEP of postgraduate education, and aimed at improving the implementation of EP in the areas of training in the residency.

7.2 Feedback from teachers and residents

The University annually conducts questionnaires of residents, graduates of residency, employers, on the basis of which the Head of the quality monitoring area by the educational process draws up a report with recommendations for improving the EP. On the basis of the analysis, Action Plans of the Residency Department are developed annually to improve the satisfaction and expectations of university consumers on the basis of the analysis of the survey on the assessment of student satisfaction with the conditions of study at the university). For feedback with teachers and residents, the Rector's blog is used, on which students and university staff receive answers to questions they are interested in on the terms of implementation of the educational programme. Representatives of residents are members of the CEP, the Academic Council, where they participate in the discussion of the implementation of the educational programme.

7.3 Results of Residents and Graduates

This EP is implemented in the first year of training. Intermediate and final certification in the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" was not carried out. Viewing the electronic journal of AIS Platonus, demonstrates good assessments of the current performance of residents in the range of 80-85% in the disciplines "Gastroenterology", "Fundamentals of Oncology".

7.4 Stakeholder Engagement

The process of monitoring and evaluation of EP involves departments that implement EP, the department of residency, the postgraduate education CEP, the department of academic work, the Academic Council, the Scientific Council, the Career Center (general monitoring of the quality of educational programmes through a survey of stakeholders (employers, students, residency graduates). Interviews with 6 employers were conducted online and included such questions as: knowledge of the university's mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals to the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in the training of residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and formation clinical thinking, interaction with departments and the university as a whole, 100% employment of residency graduates, etc. There are no graduates of the residency in this specialty.

7.5 Procedure for Approval of Educational Programmes

Specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" was developed by associate professors of the Department of Internal Diseases Esnazarova G.S., Krasnova S.A., discussed at the meeting of the CEP of postgraduate education, agreed at the meeting of the Academic Council (Minutes No.6, dated June 24, 21), as well as with a student (resident doctor of 1 year of study in the specialty Kemelova I.K.), as well as an external reviewer (review of the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" G.A. Abildaeva, MD, associate professor of the Department of Internal Diseases with a course of propaedeutics of internal diseases of Asfendiyarov KazNMU) and the Decision of the Academic Council was approved on 18.08.2021.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 15 standards: fully – 15.

Standard 7: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none

Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION

Evidence of compliance:

8.1 Management

Management and administration of the learning process at the University, its activities in general, is carried out on the basis of the University Structure, the updating of which was carried out on 16.07.2020 (Rector's Order No. 26-02007 n/a), Coordination of the implementation, control and monitoring of the implementation of residency programmes in all specialties is carried out by the Residency Department under the supervision of the Vice-Rector for Scientific and Clinical Work. The Department of Internal Diseases (Head of the Department Professor K.A. Zordinova) is directly responsible for the development and implementation of the EP for the accredited specialty. During the visit, an interview was conducted with the Acting Vice-Rector for Scientific and Clinical Work Seidalin Arystan Oskarovich, with Orakbai Lyazzat Zhadigerovna, the Head of the Residency Department and his main specialists (Dossayeva Saltanat Tasbulatovna, Kasimova Arzygul Imarovna), the Chairperson of the CEP (postgraduate education of residency and doctoral studies) - Ligai Zoya Nikolaevna. The Residence Department carries out its activities on the basis of the Regulations on the Residence Department (21.10.2019), as well as the formation of the annual work plan of the Residence Department (plans of the Residence Department for 3 years: 2018-2019, 2020-2021, 2021-2022 academic year), Quality Goals for the 2021-2022 academic year (Approved at the meeting of the Academic Council on 27.08.21, Minutes No.1).

8.2 Academic Leadership

The Department of Internal Diseases (Head of the Department Professor K.A. Zordinova) is directly responsible for the development and implementation of the EP for the accredited specialty. When interviewing residents, employers, graduates, it was demonstrated that the department carries out training in postgraduate and postgraduate education, including areas of training in the residency of the therapeutic profile, positive feedback. Has a graduated and highly categorized faculty, including members of public academies of sciences and professional associations, scientific societies (1 and 3, respectively). Teachers of the department improve teaching and assessment methods in the residency, introducing innovative technologies (innovative methods of clinical training, standardized assessment sheets, critical analysis of literature in the work of the magazine club of residents).

8.3 Training budget and resource allocation

The budget of KazRosmeduniversity is formed from two sources: the republican budget (state order for training of personnel of higher and postgraduate education, advanced training of medical workers, development of scientific research, transfers) and provision of paid educational services. Management of financial and economic policy and activities of the University is the responsibility of the Rector. Financial issues are under the responsibility of the Director of the Department of Financial Work and the Chief Accountant of the University, whose duties and powers are established by the job description and the Regulations on the Department of Financial Work. During the meeting with the university management, the heads of structural units noted that in order to implement educational activities, there is an improvement in funding for the equipment of the Training and Clinical Center, the development of information technologies, the purchase of electronic resources and educational and methodological literature.

8.4 Administration and Management

Administration and management of educational activities is carried out on the basis of the updated structure of the university, the provisions of structural units, job descriptions of faculty and administrative staff. The University's activities are guided by the Strategic Development Plan, the University Mission, quality policy and objectives. The Department of Strategic Development and Quality Management System is responsible for ensuring the quality of management at the University, which organizes regular audits of the work of departments and structural units. Internal regulatory documents are open and available on the official website <https://medkrmu.kz/>

8.5 Requirements and regulations

The development and implementation of the residency of the EP in the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" is carried out in accordance with the SCES and the standard curriculum for medical specialties of the residency, the order of the Ministry of Health and Social

Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 647 dated July 31, 2015, as amended by the order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 21, 2020 No. KR DSM-12/2020; the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" (Art. 36 "Postgraduate education"); Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 7, 2020 No. 360-VI "On public health and the health care system"; Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 21, 2020 No. KR DSM-305/2020 "On approval of the nomenclature of specialties and specializations in the field of health care, nomenclature and qualification characteristics of health care workers"; Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 12, 2018 No.563 "On approval of the Rules for the organization of the educational process on credit technology of training"; Rules for the admission of medical personnel in the residency, approved by Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 15, 2020 No. KR DSM-270/2020; Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 21, 2020 No. KR DSM-304/2020 "On approval of the regulations on the clinical base, clinic for the organization of education in the field of health care, university hospital, residency base, integrated academic medical center and the requirements for them"; Rules for admission to the residency of the NEI "KazRosmeduniversity" for 2020-2021 academic year; "Academic policy of the NEI" KazRosmeduniversity "; "Regulations on the current control of success, intermediate and final certification of students "; academic programmes of the residency; individual listeners of the platoon. During the visit, the expert established compliance with the relevant regulatory requirements that ensure the implementation of the EP. However, it should be noted that the employer should be a representative of practical health care in the field of implemented EP.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant from 15 standards: fully -14, partially -1, non-compliant - 0

Standard 8: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:






1) Agree or get a review of the EP in the specialty "Gastroenterology adult, pediatric" with employers/representatives of practical health care.

6. Recommendations for the improvement of the educational programme 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)"

1. The final results of training should be determined taking into account proposals from interested parties (the employer).
2. To develop quantitative indicators of R&D, the scientific component shall be included in the thematic plan in the form of tasks based on the application of scientific analysis methods.
3. Expand the use of clinical bases for the possibility of mastering the outpatient stage of providing specialized gastroenterological care to adults and children.
4. Expand the bank of tests for assignments in disciplines with tests aimed at assessing the achievement of training results in the paediatric component.
5. The programme of entrance examinations should include questions only in the disciplines of prerequisites and exclude highly specialized topics.
6. Develop evaluation criteria for teaching staff and clinical mentors (5.2.4)
7. To provide on a regular basis professional development of teaching staff within the framework of the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)"; To recommend a candidate from among the university's teaching staff to participate in the work of the Gastroenterology Committee of the Department of General Medicine of the Department of Healthcare.
8. Ensure implementation of the pediatric component at appropriate clinical sites (6.2.1)
9. Update information on the website for resident students (class schedule, EP, self-control questions, syllabuses, training tasks) (6.3.3)
10. Individual plans are recommended to reflect research activities (R&D topic, programme, publications, conferences, etc.) (6.5.4)
11. Develop a system to motivate health education research staff (6.6.3)
12. Agree or receive review/feedback on the educational programme in the specialty 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" from employers/representatives of practical health care (8.5.2).

7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

Members of the EEC established the compliance of the educational programme 7R01104 – "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" with the Accreditation Standards and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend to the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit this programme for a period of 5 years.

Председатель Внешней экспертной комиссии	Курманова Алмагуль Медеубаевна	
Зарубежный эксперт	Закирова Гузель Закировна	
Национальный академический эксперт	Кауышева Алмагуль Амангельдиновна	
Национальный академический эксперт	Сарсенбаева Гульжан Искендировна	
Национальный академический эксперт	Бачева Ирина Викторовна	
Национальный академический эксперт	Уразова Салтанат Нургожаевна	
Национальный академический эксперт	Ларюшина Елена Михайловна	
Национальный академический эксперт	Султанова Гулнар Достановна	
Эксперт – представитель работодателей	Нурғалиев Нурлан Ермекбаевич	
Эксперт – представитель резидентов	Майкенова Арайлым Мураткызы	

**Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme
(generalization)**

Standard	Evaluation Criteria	Number of standards	Estimation		
			Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Not compliant
1	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES	17	16	1	
2	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	30	28	2	
3	ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS	11	10	1	
4	STUDENTS	30	29	1	
5	FACULTY	7	6	1	
6	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	21	17	4	
7	PROGRAMME EVALUATION	15	15		
8	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	15	14	1	
9	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	4	4		
	Subtotal:	150	139	11	
			150		