

To Accreditation Council
of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation
and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care
June 14, 2022

**REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE
EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME 7R01103 -
"ALLERGOLOGY AND IMMUNOLOGY (ADULT, CHILDREN'S)" FOR
COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR
POSTGRADUATE PROGRAMMES (SPECIALTY OF RESIDENCY)
IN MEDICAL ORGANIZATIONS OF EDUCATION**

NEI "KAZAKH-RUSSIAN MEDICAL UNIVERSITY"

external expert evaluation period: May 30-31 - June 1, 2022

Almaty, 2022

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	List of symbols and abbreviations	3
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	4
2.	General part of the final report	5
2.1.	Presentation of the educational programme in the specialty - 7R01103 – "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)"	5
2.2.	Information on previous accreditation	7
2.3.	Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the self-assessment report of the educational programme 7R01103 – "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions	7
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	8
4.	Results of the survey of teachers and residents	10
5.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01103 "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)"	12
6.	Recommendations for the improvement of the educational programme 7R01103 – "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)"	21
7.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	22
	Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria of the external evaluation and educational programme of the residency in the specialty of the educational programme "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)"	23
	Attachment 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	24

List of symbols and abbreviations

Abbreviation	Interpretation
PBL	Problem-based learning
TBL	Team -based learning
University	Higher education institution
EEC	External expert commission
SAC	State Attestation Commission
SCES	State compulsory standard of education
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care
CEP	Educational Programmes Committee
KRMU	Kazakh-Russian Medical University
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
MoH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES of RoK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
NJSC	Non-profit joint-stock company
IAAR	Independent agency for accreditation and rating
RI	Research Institute
RW	Research work
NLA	Normative legal acts
NEI	Non-State educational institution
EP	Educational programme
OSCE	Objective Structured Clinical Exam
PHC	Primary Medical health care
TS	Teaching staff
WC	Work Curriculum
IWS	Independent work of the student (resident)
IWRT	Resident independent work under the supervision of a teacher
TCC	Training and Clinical Center
EMCD	Educational and methodological complex of the discipline
SC	Scientific Council

1. Composition of the external expert commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 19 dated May 20, 2022, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as EEC) was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the educational programme of the residence in the specialty 7R01103 – "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" in the period May 30-June 1, 2022, as follows:

order №	Status as part of EEC	Full name	Academic degree, academic title, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty
1	chairperson	Kurmanova Almagul Medeubaevna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of clinical specialties department of the Higher School of Medicine of the Kazakh National University named after Al-Farabi, leading researcher of JSC "Scientific Center of Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology"
2	Foreign Expert	Zakirova Guzel Zakirovna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Ophthalmology of Kazan State Medical University, Ophthalmologist of the Children's Republican Clinical Hospital of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Tatarstan
3	Academic Expert	Urazova Saltanat Nurgozhayevna	doctor of Medical Sciences head of the Department of Family Medicine No.3 - "Medical University of Astana" NJSC;
4	Academic Expert	Kauysheva Almagul Amangeldinovna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Vice-Rector for Educational and Scientific Activities Kazakhstan Medical University "KSPH", Accredited independent expert on the assessment of the quality of medical services, Deputy Chairperson of the Board of the RPO "Kazakhstan Alliance of Medical Organizations"
5	Academic Expert	Sarsenbayeva Gulzhan Iskendirovna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Doctor of the Department of Cardiac Surgery and Interventional Cardiology of the Scientific Center of Pediatrics and Pediatric Surgery JSC
6	Academic Expert	Bacheva Irina Viktorovna	PhD in Medicine, associate Professor of the Department of Internal Diseases, Head of the Residency Educational Programme in Nephrology, including Pediatric, NJSC Medical University of Karaganda
7	Academic Expert	Laryushina Elena Mikhailovna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor, head of the Department of Internal Diseases NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda"
8	Academic Expert	Sultanova Gulnar Dosnovna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Dean of the Faculties of Dentistry, Pharmacy, Public Health Care and Nursing NJSC "Western Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov"
9	Employers' representative	Nurgaliyev Nurlan Yermekbayevich	Director general of GammaLab Diagnostic Laboratory LLP
10	Resident Representative	Maykenova Arailim Muratkyzy	Resident of the first year of study in the specialty "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" of NJSC

			"Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University"
--	--	--	---

The observer for ECAQA is Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna, Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department.

The work of the ECAQA was carried out in accordance with the Regulation of EEC (Order of the Director General of ECAQA No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational programme "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC on further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above-mentioned educational programme and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

2. General part of the final report

2.1 Presentation of the educational programme in the specialty - 7R01103 – "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)"

Organization name, legal form of ownership, BIN	Non-State educational institution "Kazakh-Russian Medical University", 970 240 002 300
Management body	The supreme body – the general meeting of participants
Full name of the chief executive officer	Dzhainakbayev Nurlan Temirbekovich
Created in	1992
Location and contact details	71, Torekulova str., Almaty
State license for educational activities in the residency (date, number)	license for educational activities AB No. 0137388, issued by the Committee for Control in the Field of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan on June 2, 2010
Information on branches, subsidiaries (if any)	no.
Year of implementation of the accredited educational programme (EP)	2021
Duration of training	2
Total number of graduates since the beginning of EP implementation	3
Number of residents on EP since the beginning of the current year	3 (transferred from KazMUNO in 2021)
Full-time trainers/ Combiners involved in the implementation of EP, incl. % of degree	10/0, 90%

The University currently represents the organization of medical education with a private form of ownership, having the necessary material, technical and scientific and educational base, highly qualified pedagogical and scientific personnel (license for educational activities AB No. 0137388, issued by the Committee for Control in the Field of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan on June 2, 2010). Over the years, the university has shaped its brand, traditions and values, continuing to follow the course to universities of the international level, indicated

by the country's leadership. The principles of the Bologna process, the credit system of training are implemented in all specialties of the bachelor's degree.

Since 2011, the University publishes a quarterly magazine "Actual problems of theoretical and clinical medicine".

In accordance with Article 23 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Science", the University was accredited by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan as a subject of scientific and scientific-technical activity, certificate number Series MK No. 005269 dated 08.10.2018.

The university's budget is formed from several sources: the republican budget (a state order for the training of specialists of higher, postgraduate and additional education), the provision of paid educational services.

The financing of the university is stable and contributes to improving the material and technical base and increasing the contingent.

The main applied scientific direction of the university is the development of innovations for implementation in practical health care, including the development of mobile medicine for the rural population. Thus, for his achievements in the development of mobile medical complexes, Rector, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor N.T. Dzhainakbayev was awarded the quality certificate of the Swiss Institute of Quality Standard "International Quality Certificate" (SIQS) on July 1, 2015.

In order to develop cooperation, 30 agreements, agreements and memoranda with Kazakhstan and foreign higher educational institutions have been concluded.

The NEI "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" implements 35 educational programmes of the residency, including the specialty EP 7R01103 – "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" (residents transferred from KazMUNO in 2021).

The total number of students in the residency in 2020-2021 is 146 residents, including 3 people in the specialty 7R01103 – "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)". In 2020 - 2021, 146 residents were released, respectively, in the specialty 7R01103 – "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" in KRMU, there was no issue, residents of the 2nd year were transferred from KazMUNO.

Requirements for the level of training of graduates of the residency in the specialty 7R01103 – "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" are formulated in the educational programme in accordance with: the State Mandatory Standard of the Residency in Medical Specialties and the standard professional curriculum for medical specialties of the residency, the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 647 dated July 31, 2015, as amended by the order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 21, 2020 No. KR DSM-12/2020; the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" (Art. 36 "Postgraduate education"); the Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 7, 2020 No. 360-VI "On public health and the health care system"; Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 21, 2020 No. KR DSM-305/2020 "On approval of the nomenclature of specialties and specializations in the field of health care, nomenclature and qualification characteristics of health care workers"; Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 12, 2018 No.563 "On approval of the Rules for the organization of the educational process on credit technology of training"; Rules for the admission of medical personnel to training in the residency, approved by Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 15, 2020 No. KR DSM-270/2020; Rules for admission to the residency of the NEI "KRMU" for 2020-2021 academic year; "Academic policy of the NEI" KRMU"; "Regulations on the current monitoring of academic performance, intermediate and final certification of students"; academic calendar of educational programmes of the residency; individual work plans of the student of the residency.

Studying in the residency in the specialty 7R01103 – "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" is carried out on a full-time basis, the term of study is 2 years. According to the SCES, the educational programme of training of residents is designed for 140 loans, including - the profile disciplines: a mandatory component – 132 loans, a component of choice – 4 loans, interim certification – 2 loans, final certification – 2 loans.

2.2. Information on previous accreditation

Residents under the educational programme 7R01103 – "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" were transferred in 2021 from KazMUNO. Accreditation of the educational programme 7R01103 – "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" in KazMUNO was carried out by the accreditation agency IAAR in 2016.

To date, the accreditation of the educational programme 7R01103 – "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" as a KRMU programme has not been carried out.

2.3 Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the self-assessment report of the educational programme 7R01103 "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions

The self-assessment report on the residency educational programme in the specialty 7R01103 – "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" is presented on 123 pages of the main text, annexes on 26 pages, copies or electronic versions of 46 documents located at <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1wSPCXeQYq11vNSnPn11M2N598fwxQ4ke>.

The report is characterized by the completeness of responses to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for the self-assessment of the educational programme provided to the organization of education by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by Rector N.T. Dzhainakbayev, which confirms the reliability of quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 9 members of the internal self-assessment commission with an indication of the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme – Bekmagambetov Zh.M., Head of the Department of Strategic Development and Accreditation

The self-assessment of the educational programme 7R01103 – "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" was carried out on the basis of the order of the Rector of the University No. 26-02-20-n/k dated February 25, 2022 "On the creation of a working group for conducting a specialized self-assessment and writing a report" (composition of the steering committee of the internal commission for self-assessment of educational programmes in the specialties of residency).

The report was reviewed by the accreditation expert Urazova S.N., the review noted the strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes, which were taken into account in the process of feedback from the university representative and the report on self-assessment was amended accordingly.

All the standards provide real practice of KRMU in the training of residents in the specialty 7R01103 – "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)", reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is sufficiently complete and updated in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, learning outcomes, results of knowledge and skills assessment, material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, plans for development and improvement.

The report is submitted to ECAQA in a completed form, with correction of the data on the above recommendations, written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criterion of standards, tables and contain references in the text and have end-to-end numbering.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure, the external assessment. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare

the information from the report with the information that will be obtained during the visit to the educational institution, i.e. verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

3. External expert evaluation assessment

External expert work in the framework of the evaluation of the educational programme 7R01103 – "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the External Evaluation of Educational Organizations and Educational Programmes of ECAQA (approved by the order of the Director General of the "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care" No.5 dated February 17, 2017) and in accordance with the programme approved on May 20, 2022 by the Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with Rector Dzhainakbayev N.T. Dates of the visit to the organization: May 30-June 1, 2022.

The external evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying the indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the Programme), which is contained in the documentation of the accreditation center. The programme is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of an external expert evaluation.

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- interview with management and administrative staff – 14 people in total;
- interviews with residents – 14 people, including foreign ones (resident – Mishra Santosh Kumar from India);
- studying the website <https://krmu.edu.kz/>;
- interviewing 8 employees, 8 teachers;
- questionnaires of teachers and residents - 14 and 12, respectively;
- observation of training of residents: observation of training of residents: attendance at a practical lesson ("Eosinophilic granulomatosis of Cherja-stross", teacher: Zordinova K.A., group: AII 20-01, SCS No. 1;
- visited the practice/clinical engagement database - State Clinical Hospital No. 1, where training on the residency programme 7R01103 – "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" is held with the participation of 2 full-time teachers and 2 part-time employees;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 36 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the units (the list of studied documents is in Attachment 2).

The staff of the accredited organization ensures the presence of all persons indicated in the visiting programme and according to the lists of interviews and interviews (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with EEC members

№	Full name	Job Title
Residency Teachers		
1	Zordinova Karamyat Akhmetovna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Internal Medicine
2	Gulnara Serikovna Esnazarova	candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Internal Medicine
3	Ligai Zoya Nikolaevna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of General Medical Practice
4	Karabaeva Aigul Zhumartovna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Senior Lecturer of the Department of General Medical Practice
Student residencies		

1	Bekbolatova Akerke Bekbolatkyzy	resident of the 2nd year of study in the educational programme 7R01103 – "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)"
2	Berikova Aidana Kanatkyzy	resident of the 2nd year of study in the educational programme 7R01103 – "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)"
3	Tastanbekova Muldir Nadyrkyzy	resident of the 2nd year of study in the educational programme 7R01103 – "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)"
Healthcare Practitioners		
1	Baizhigitova Nazipa Begaliyevna	Deputy Chief Physician for Medical Work of the State Clinical Hospital No.1
2	Alimbetova Mayra Serikovna	Deputy Chief Physician for Medical Work of the State Clinical Hospital on the Right of Economic Management "Almaty Multidisciplinary Clinical Hospital"
3	Zhumataeva Zarina Akhmetovna	Director of MC "Rakhat"
4	Isabekov Nurzhan Amangeldiyevich	Deputy Director of Surgery, CCCH
5	Kunaeva Gulbanu Janabaevna	Deputy Director for Strategic Development of the CCCH
6	Bukumbayeva Damira Dzhurumbayevna	IE "Bukumbayeva"

During the visit to the University, accreditation experts noted the strengths of the organization of education in relation to the accredited educational programme, including: a high level of degree, categorization and long pedagogical experience of the teaching staff, the availability of modern clinical bases for achieving the goals of education, contributing to adequate training of residents, a well-stocked library with wide access to various information resources, a strong structure and staff of the department of remote technologies, the availability of a mobile medical complex for diagnostic and therapeutic activities for adults and children in emergency situations.

At the University there are units that are directly related to the educational programme 7R01103 – "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)", which can be noted as the best practice in education, namely, the educational and clinical center, the library, the department of distance technologies. This conclusion is made because the residents of this specialty have the opportunity to hone their practical skills in the training and clinical center; the developed structure of remote technologies, a rich resource of information access to literature allows students to improve their professional level, and also helps in research work, advanced training. Teachers can also use these resources in both education and research.

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. The final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, the study of documents, the results of the interview, questionnaires was held. EEC members started designing the final EEC report. The results of the external evaluation are summarized. Experts individually completed the "Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01103 "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards". No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed and the Chairperson Kurmanova A.M. held a final open vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for the accreditation period.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all the necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the university, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to the members of the EEC.

At the end of the programme of the visit, the chairperson of the EEC for the management and employees of the organization of education announced recommendations on the results of an external assessment within the framework of specialized accreditation.

4. Results of the survey

An observer from the ECAQA conducted an online survey on the resource in the period 30.05.2022 <https://webanketa.com/>.

Resident survey results:

The resident survey includes 22 questions. Total number of respondents –12.

When studying the results of the survey, the overwhelming majority - 75% of respondents answered that they would recommend this university as an educational institution, partially agreed with this statement 25%.

83.3% of respondents believe that programme managers and teachers are aware of students' problems related to training, 8.33% partially support this statement and 8.33% found it difficult to answer.

The assessment of satisfaction with the conditions for training and the equipment of the training rooms and classrooms of the KRMU showed that 83.3% are completely satisfied with the conditions provided, 8.3% – partially and doubt the answer 8.3%.

According to 100% of respondents, office equipment is available on the basis of practice. Teachers fully, in 100% of cases provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes.

100% of the surveyed residents are completely satisfied with the library fund and resources. All 100% of respondents have access to electronic educational resources.

The organization of clinical training, according to 75% of respondents, fully satisfies them, but 25% - partially. The majority of students (91.67 per cent) are fully satisfied with the teaching methods and 8.33 per cent are partially satisfied.

All 100% noted that there is sufficient time for practical training (patient supervision, etc.). On the question "Satisfied with the methods of assessing my knowledge and skills", the majority of 91.67% fully agree, and 8.33% - partially.

According to 91.67% of residents, teachers regularly use active and interactive teaching methods in classes, and according to 8.33% - sometimes.

According to 100% of respondents, teachers constantly provide feedback after completing classes.

Fully satisfied that study in higher education 83,33%, and 16,67% of respondents - partially. According to 91.67% of respondents, the university allows to improve or acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the chosen specialty, but cannot give an answer - 8.33%. 100% are fully satisfied with the organization of teaching in the NEI KRMU.

According to 75% of respondents, accreditation is a necessary mechanism for improving educational programmes, but 16.67% believe that it is not necessary to conduct and 8.33% doubt the answer.

The work of the EEC was assessed as positive – 91.67% of residents, satisfactory – 8.33%.

Results of the survey of teachers:

The teacher survey included 21 questionnaire questions. In total, 14 teachers were surveyed, including those with up to 5 years of experience – 7.14%, up to 10 years – 28.57%, more than 10 years – 64.29%.

All respondents are completely satisfied with the organization of the educational process. Also all 100% answered that ethics and subordination are observed in higher education institution. Completely satisfied with the organization of work and workplace 92.86% of respondents, partially - 7.14%. 100% fully agree that there is an opportunity for career development in the organization and the development of the competence of teachers.

In this educational institution, teachers have the opportunity to do scientific work and publish the results of research – 100% completely agree.

92,86% of respondents are completely satisfied with work of personnel service, doubt with the answer – 7,14%. The majority of those surveyed have undergone refresher training over the past 5 years. 100% fully agree that they can be implemented as professionals. Unfortunately, 42.86% did not answer the question of whether the university supports the teacher in participating in international and republican events, they applied for payment of travel, business trips, registration fee – 7.14%, for payment of registration fee – 7.14%, and 35.71% did not apply with this to the management or relevant administrative employees of the university.

100% of respondents fully agree that students have free access to patients on the clinical bases of the university and to the resources of the practice bases. 42.86% know about the implementation of social programmes to support teachers, 7.14% used them, 28.57% do not know and 21.43% of respondents are doubtful about their availability. The management and administration systematically listen to the opinion of teachers -92,86%, sometimes -7.14% of the respondents.

Students are taught using a variety of teaching methods, but more often work is done by analyzing situational tasks (88.06%), working in small groups (92.86%), lectures (50%), interactive learning (64.29%), performing abstracts (50%), performing projects, coursework (50%), practical classes in clinical skills at the training and clinical center (50%), oral analysis of the topic of classes (78.57%) oral surveys and analysis of the topic (64.29%), working in small groups (50%) also problem-oriented learning (57.14%), solving tests (71.43%), solving cases (42.86%), less often written completion of tasks (28.57%).

Completely according to 92.86% that this questionnaire will be useful for the development of recommendations for improving the university and educational programmes of the residency, 7.14% partially agree with this.

The results of the survey in general demonstrate satisfaction with the educational process, the resources of the clinical base, the competencies of teachers, and also indicate the existence of centralized management of educational programmes.

5. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01103 "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)"

Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES

Evidence of compliance:

1.1 Mission statement and deliverables

The mission of the educational programme of the residency in the specialty 7R01103 – "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" is based on the mission of the NEI "KRMU" - "innovative, socially focused, practice-oriented, internationally recognized university" (<https://krmu.edu.kz> › missiya-universiteta). The mission of the educational programme in the specialty of the residency 7R01103 – "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" is "the formation of competencies and personal qualities of competitive, creative and innovative thinking, able to implement their knowledge and skills of new generation specialists." Interviews with management, employers and residents confirm that the mission has been communicated to students, employers and the public.

Residents claim that at meetings with the management of the university, as well as at the curatorial hours, they study the Mission of the programme, the goals and the tasks of training. The final learning outcomes common to all residency programmes are posted on the official website of the university <https://krmu.edu.kz/rezidentura/>.

1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy

Experts received convincing data that the university is autonomous in making decisions in the development of the educational programme in terms of the component of choice, the assessment policy

(current and final), including the choice of assessment methods (testing, oral survey, clinical examination), selection and admission of residents, personnel policy for teachers under the accredited educational programme, as well as the allocation of resources (classroom fund of clinical bases according to contracts).

Residents under the supervision of a clinical mentor receive special knowledge, develops practical skills at the patient's bedside, including work at the MMC. Under the guidance of supervisors, they master the professional ethical and communication skills necessary for the work of a doctor.

In the NEI "Kazakh-Russian University", the rights of residents to freedom of expression are ensured: at the end of the disciplines, a questionnaire is carried out, there is a blog of the rector, the possibility of personal appeal to any university officials is not excluded. Residents also know hotline phone number

1.3 Learning outcomes

The final learning outcomes affect both the knowledge, skills, and abilities in the professional pediatric field, as well as the ability to think critically, to have the desire for continuous learning, and the development of research skills. In the EP, the syllabuses define the final learning outcomes according to the qualification requirements for the specialty of residency, which include knowledge, skills, the need for analysis, communication skills and continuous training of the resident.

1.4 Participation in the formulation of the mission and final results

When studying the available materials, the EEC members found that during the formation of the mission and final results of the EP, discussions were held at the level of the student audience, graduates, employees of the department, at the meeting of the CEP (dated 14.05.2020 No.5), at the Academic Council (dated 28.08.2020 No.5) and the Academic Council of the University (dated 12.08.2020 No.5). In interview with residents, it was told that they are transferred from other higher education institution therefore can't answer concretely this question. From the interview with the administration of the university, faculty, residents and employers it was established that the formation of the mission and the final results of training is influenced by the opinions of various stakeholders - heads of departments and divisions of the university, faculty, students, graduates, employers, health and education authorities, representatives of the public.

When conducting the survey, the majority of residents (75%) answered that they would recommend this university as an education, which indicates the high prestige of the university.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 17 standards: full – 17.

Standard 1: Implemented

There *are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit*

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME

Evidence of compliance:

2.1 Postgraduate programme framework

Accredited programme 7R01103 "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's) was developed in accordance with the requirements of the State Committee on Environmental Protection, in compliance with the continuity of pre- and post-requisites. The university posits that the model used to implement the programme has a modular-competence approach. The organization's documents contain work programmes, EMCD, which define the goal, take into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, independent work. Compliance with the SCES and standard requirements has been established. Attending the practical lesson on the topic "Eosinophilic Cerdja-Strauss granulomatosis", the experts received convincing data that the training is carried out according to the plan, before the beginning of the lesson, the residents answer the tests, receive feedback from the teacher, have the opportunity to improve the skill. It should be noted that the lesson was held in the form of a meeting of a magazine club with the participation of residents of related specialties. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational programme, since the experts studied the code of ethics (26.11.2021) and during the interview, the residents replied that they were informed about the content of this document.

While attending a practical lesson on the topic and talking to residents, experts saw that the organization contributes to the development of practical competencies of residents. At the same time, residents deepen their theoretical knowledge, develop communication skills.

The analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in advisory disciplines are taken into account, additions are made to the bibliography of the EP EMCD and syllabuses, and teachers apply them in classes.

This indicates compliance with Standard 2 in terms of adapting training to the needs of residents.

2.2 Scientific method

In general, the university conducts generally accepted approaches to attracting residents to scientific research. Residents as it became clear from interviews have opportunity to study articles on interesting subjects and to make reports at meetings of magazine club, at conferences. The portfolio of resident pediatricians, where there are protocols for critical analysis of articles, has been studied. The library has access to databases, national clinical protocols are used in the daily practice of residents, which is confirmed when visiting the clinical base. In this specialty 3 residents of the 2nd year of study who have speeches at the conference are trained. But since these residents were transferred from KazMUNO, the experts did not find confirmation of their participation in the conferences, publication of articles. Moreover, residents have a vague idea of conducting research work, do not have a clearly defined plan, the implementation of research is not reflected in individual plans.

Thus, when conducting interviews with residents and studying the documentation, experts did not find confirmation of the use of scientific analysis methods when performing tasks, there are no specific indicators confirming the performance of research work by residents.

2.3 Content of the residency programme

In its content, "Neonatology" has components of profile disciplines that are mandatory for study, disciplines of choice, which are included in the Catalog of elective disciplines. The University follows a modular-competence approach to the construction of the programme. The management of the programme is based on the postulates of the SCES, as well as the rules of credit technology of training. Patient safety is one of the conceptual approaches in the clinical practice of future residents: basic practical skills from simple to complex sequentially from undergraduate to residency are practiced on mannequins and imitations, including in the conditions of the training and clinical center.

2.4 Programme structure, content and duration

The duration of mastering the educational programme of the residency in the specialty 7R01103 "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's) is 2 years.

The educational programme for training residents in the specialty 7R01103 "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's) is designed for 140 credits: core disciplines – 132 credits, a component of choice – 4 credits, interim certification – 2 credits, final certification – 2 credits. Profiling disciplines are represented by disciplines: "Clinical immunology and adult allergology" – 66 credits; "Clinical immunology and paediatric allergology" – 66 credits. The component of choice (4 credits) can be selected from the following disciplines: "Algorithm of actions of medical personnel in the conditions of inpatient care in case of detection of a patient with suspected in PDI, including CVI" - 4 credits, "Modern aspects of diagnosis and treatment of allergic diseases" – 4 credits, "Evidence-based medicine" – 4 credits.

2.5 Organization of training

According to the presented structure of the university, the vice-rector for scientific and clinical work, who reports to the rector, is responsible for the strategy for the development of postgraduate education. The vice-rector responsible for the educational activities of the residency is the vice-rector for academic activities. Clinical bases are selected for compliance with the residency programme by the clinical work department, which draws up contracts with clinical bases.

The staff of the department selects clinical bases, where the maximum resident will be able to access patients according to their profile of the residency educational programme. Currently, there are 3 of them in the department, which is quite sufficient for the effective distribution of residents. The development of clinical skills and professional attitude to work is facilitated by the participation of

residents in the real activities of the doctor: supervision of patients at the inpatient level, outpatient admission to primary health care, registration of medical documentation, work in medical information systems (KMIS), work with regulatory acts, duty, work in prevention departments, functional diagnostics, preparation of reports, presentations, portfolio formation.

2.6 Relationship between postgraduate medical education and health care

Training of resident doctors is carried out on clinical bases with personal participation in the therapeutic and diagnostic process, both in class time and during independent work, according to the WC, residents work with real patients to form professional competence.

Mentoring is carried out on the basis of the Regulation on Mentoring, approved by the Protocol of the Scientific and Clinical Council No.18 of June 17, 2019. Clinical mentors accompany the student on the clinical base of the department.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 30 standards: fully - 29, partially – 1.

Standard 2: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) The scientific component should be included in the thematic plan in the form of tasks based on the application of scientific analysis methods (2.2.4)
- 2) Develop quantitative indicators of R&D (2.2.4)

Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS

Evidence of compliance:

3.1 Methods of evaluation

The general policy, principles, methods of assessment of residents in the "Allergology and Immunology" are reflected in the internal documents: Academic Policy of the University, Regulations on the current monitoring of academic performance, interim and final certification of students. Checklists have been developed at the university to ensure objectivity and transparency of assessment. As methods of evaluation, taking into account the practical orientation of the programme, such methods as Mini-cEX, CbD, OSCE are used.

Members of the EEC visited the test center, reviewed the testing procedure, followed the work of the proctors. As it was noted by the head of the testing center, the control and measuring means undergo a review procedure before they are used in the examination.

The form of the midterm and final control is approved by the Academic Council. The university developed and approved, brought the criteria for the specific weight of the current, milestone, intermediate control in the final assessment. An interview with residents during a practical lesson, as well as in focus groups, showed that residents are aware of the assessment policy and clearly understand the scale of assessments, the rules for admission to exams, etc. Residents who have fully completed the educational process in accordance with the requirements of the individual curriculum are allowed to participate in the final certification. The examination itself is two-stage: the theory is evaluated in the form of tests and clinical skills, including communicative at the patient's bedside.

When analyzing the current documentation of residents, it was established that the portfolio consists of a resident's report; checklists with an assessment of practical activities, seminars, shifts, etc.; characteristics of the clinical mentor; information on achievements during the period of study in the residency, if any (awards, certificates, conference programmes, abstracts of publications, video materials, letters of thanks, patients' reviews, etc.).

The results of students' academic achievements are recorded in the electronic educational journal through the office-recorder system and the AIS Platonus programme, which automatically generates examination sheets, which is confirmed by experts when viewing 2 electronic journals.

3.2 Relationship between evaluation and training

The methods used to assess the competencies of students are described in syllabuses, residents are familiar with this document.

The university has developed standardized checklists, which is a good practice in terms of ensuring the transparency of assessment, although they are designed in the form of templates for all educational

programmes.

Differentiated assessment methods are used to assess different learning outcomes, so theoretical knowledge is mainly assessed by testing, and practical skills are assessed using assessment sheets for each section of the practical work. In addition, it is mandatory to give a description from the side of clinical mentors in all sections of training.

The vast majority (91.67%) responded positively to the survey conducted during the external expert assessment on satisfaction with the methods of assessing knowledge and skills.

The conclusions of the EEC meet the criteria of 11 standards: 11 in full.

Standard 3: Implemented

There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit

Standard 4: STUDENTS

Evidence of compliance:

4.1 Admission and Selection Policy

According to the submitted documentation, admission to the residency is carried out in accordance with the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On approval of the Standard Rules for admission to education in educational institutions that implement educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education", and the conditions for admission of students to the KRMU are prescribed in the "Rules for admission to the residency" (PR-03-11-05 of 24.07.2020). Criteria for applicants entering the residency correspond to the SCES of the Republic of Kazakhstan: basic medical education, higher medical education, internship. Questions about admission to residency educational programmes are posted on the website <https://krmu.edu.kz/rezidentura-3/>, which is a good practice on the part of the university.

At the same time experts of EEC noted when studying documentation of entrance examinations to residency that in the list of questions are narrowly specialized, without taking into account pre-requisites, i.e. it isn't taken into account that applicants entering residency can't know as entrants specific questions of this profile. According to experts, questions should include a baseline.

4.2 Number of residents

In the specialty 7R01103 "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's) in the current academic year 3 residents of the 2nd year of study transferred from KazMUNO are trained, while the number of teachers and the capacity of clinical bases is quite sufficient to ensure the educational process. That is, this year these are the first residents under this programme, which will be issued in July 2022.

4.3 Resident support and advice

During the analysis of the educational process in KRMU, it was established that, according to the Academic Policy, academic counseling of residents is carried out by a curator from among the faculty of the department, in addition, the resident is assigned a clinical mentor in the medical organization where the resident is trained. The main function of the mentor is to help in mastering practical skills and competencies. This is reflected in the Academic Policy of the University.

When conducting the survey, the vast majority, 83.3% of respondents, believe that programme managers and teachers are aware of students' problems related to learning and 100% said that teachers constantly provide feedback after completing classes.

During the interview with university staff and residents, it turned out that information about the university and service services is presented on the website of KRMU. The necessary information is also communicated to residents by corporate mail rezidentura@medkrmu.kz, by chat in the phone, by e-mail. Employees of the Career Center also advise on the employment of residents.

Thus, in accordance with the approved Regulation "On social support for students", approved in 2019, financial support is provided to orphaned students and students without parental care, whose parents have established disabilities of the first and second groups, from large and low-income families.

4.4 Representation of residents

The quality of the implementation of the educational programme is ensured by the participation of residents in the discussion of the mission of the university and the EP. Students have the opportunity to

participate in the assessment of EP during direct discussion and approval of work programmes, at the level of development of an individual work curriculum and a catalog of elective disciplines (order for the composition of the CEP No. 26-02-62-n/k dated 26.08.2021). The meeting of the EEC members with the resident asset confirmed that the students actively participate in the life of the university, many of them are members of the University's Student Self-Government. Also, according to the submitted documentation, the CEP (approved by the Rector's Order No. 26-02-15-n/k dated 28.08.2020), along with teachers and employers, includes residents. But under this programme, residents are not members of the above councils and associations, since they have switched to training from another university.

4.5 Working conditions

In accordance with the presented valid contracts with clinical bases, residents have access to patients and to all structural units, including clinical departments, operating unit, intensive care unit, intensive care unit in accordance with the needs of the educational process. Students in the specialty 7R01103 "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's) have the opportunity to participate in morning medical conferences, rounds, consultations both as listeners and as speakers. Participate in various activities at clinical sites. A training room has been allocated in State Security Committee No. 1. In the residency rooms, access to computer equipment is provided.

Satisfaction with the conditions for studying and the equipment of study rooms and classrooms showed that 83.3% of residents in general at the university are satisfied with the provided conditions for studying.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 30 standards: fully - 29, partially – 1.

Standard 4: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Include only the subjects of prerequisites in the programme of entrance examinations and exclude highly specialized topics (4.1.6)

Standard 5: FACULTY

Evidence of compliance:

5.1 Recruitment and Selection Policy

In order to verify the standard 5, external experts studied the Personnel Policy, which reflects: selection and admission of employees, development and activities of employees, promotion of employees, etc. The data were obtained during interviews with university staff, teachers and during the study of survey data conducted during the EEC.

Thus, competitive selection is carried out on the basis of the current Regulation on the competitive substitution of positions of faculty and researchers, approved by the order of the rector No. 26-02-44-n/k dated November 27, 2020.

The conversation with K.A. Zordinova, Acting Head of the Department of Internal Diseases, allowed the experts to learn about the approaches to attracting the staff of clinical bases for teaching (a total of 2 such teachers), about the strategy and tactics of recruitment of residents, information security of the educational programme.

According to the results of a survey of teachers of residency programmes during the survey, the vast majority -92, 86%- answered that they were satisfied with the work of the personnel service, everyone was satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace.

5.2 Teachers' obligations and development

In order to verify the data of Standard 5, during a meeting with the head of the HR department and during an interview with teachers, experts received an opinion on approaches to the development of teachers' pedagogical competence, motivation to work with residents, mentoring, which includes improving the qualifications of teachers according to the plan. There is a system of professional and pedagogical improvement of the teaching staff of the NEI "KRMU", which includes the following units: the School of the teacher, the Institute of postgraduate education, winter and summer schools, which contribute to the formation and development of the competence and potential of the teaching staff.

When conducting a survey of teachers, which was conducted by an observer from the accreditation center, everyone answered that there is an opportunity for career growth and competencies development at the university. Most of them have undergone advanced training in the past 5 years and fully agree that they can be implemented as professionals. However, unfortunately, 42.86% did not answer the question whether the university supports the teacher in participating in international and national events. 42.86% know about the implementation of social programmes to support teachers, 7.14% used them, 28.57% do not know and 21.43% of respondents are doubtful about their availability. The majority of 92.86 per cent of teachers responded that the management and administration listened to the teachers' opinions. At the Department of Internal Diseases, where the EP is implemented, during the interviews, the answers to the questions were positive, the teaching staff regularly undergo advanced training in winter and summer schools and mentors are attracted.

At the same time, the experts found no evidence on which criteria the assessment of teaching staff and clinical mentors is carried out. No response was received on the issues of differentiated payment, the development of indicators and the criteria for rating points.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 7 standards: fully – 6, partially – 1.

Standard 5: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Develop evaluation criteria for teaching staff and clinical mentors (5.2.4)

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

Evidence of compliance:

6.1 Logistics and equipment

In total, the department has 2 clinical bases. There are 2 study rooms, which are equipped with computers, an interactive board, visual aids, educational material in electronic form, methodological developments. In addition to training rooms and clinical bases, residents have the opportunity to improve their practical skills in the UCC, which has a sufficient number of dummies and equipment for practicing practical skills.

When studying the results of the survey, it turned out that 83.3% were completely satisfied with the provided conditions for training and equipping the study rooms and classrooms of KRMU, and in the conversation, the residents of the specialty "Allergology and Immunology" answered that they were fully satisfied with the training conditions. In addition, in the survey, according to 100% of respondents, office equipment is available on the basis of practice, and teachers fully, in 100% of cases, provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes. In oral conversation with residents of this programme, this fact is also confirmed.

6.2 Clinical Bases

The specialized disciplines of the resident in the specialty 7R01103 "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's) are held at the City Clinical Hospital No.1, Central Clinical Hospital.

During the visit to the clinical base – the city clinical hospital No.1, experts conducted a survey of resources, their compliance with the disciplines of the programme, accessibility for teachers and residents, as far as this equipment is modern and meets the needs of students and practical health care. It should be said that this base has the only specialized allergological department in the city and clinical mentors are doctors of this department, providing all resources, thematic patients, the possibility of conducting specialized examination and treatment.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report and to obtain evidence on the quality of the programmes, interviews were conducted with residents in the specialty. In general, residents are satisfied with the training, evaluation methods. It should be said that this fact is also confirmed by the results of the survey of residents in general at the university.

At the same time, the experts did not find confirmation of the passage of the pediatric component at the relevant clinical bases (children's departments of hospitals and polyclinics) during interviews with residents, although everything is described in the syllabuses and the programme. As it turned out during the discussion, the students passed the 1st year of training on the basis of KazMUNO and partially

completed these cycles. This year, residents attend outpatient practice at the reception of allergists. Thus, insufficient practical training on the children's component on the bases of children's hospitals was revealed.

6.3 Information technology

Independent training of students (IWS) is provided by access to educational resources of the library and the Internet. Access to modern and high-quality information resources to support the educational programme of students of the KRMU is provided by the library in the hall of electronic resources and in the electronic library. WIFI is available free of charge. 100% of the surveyed residents are completely satisfied with the library fund and resources. All 100% of respondents have access to electronic educational resources. Residents of this educational programme were not an exception, who are also satisfied with the resources provided.

When visiting the library, the experts made sure that residents were provided with all the main sources of literature on the catalogue, which are updated on an ongoing basis, and there is wide access to information databases. In addition, experts visited the department of remote technologies and during the interviews, the employees demonstrated all the possibilities and advantages of using remote learning technologies, the possibility of obtaining information. These data are common to all residency programmes. But when interviewing residents of the specialty "Allergology and Immunology", students answered that they use the library, but they did not have the need to use remote technologies, because they study daily in person and work all the time in the department with real patients.

However, when studying the university's website, experts found no confirmation of the availability of information for students- resident (class schedule, educational programme, self-control questions, syllabuses, training tasks). Residents also confirmed that the site does not contain such information for them.

6.4 Clinical Teams

The programme of training of residents in the specialty 7R01103 "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's) to work in a team and effective interaction with other health care specialists includes direct work of residents together with employees of clinical bases in all spheres of their activity, participation in selector republican and city meetings. Residents participate daily in the work of the department, where, under the guidance of clinical mentors, they supervise patients, participate in meetings, conferences, interact with employees of functional diagnostics departments and laboratories.

6.5 Medical Research and Advances

The scientific interests of the department's employees are due to the profile of the clinical base and the specialty. The research work of the department is regulated by the research plan. Priority areas of research of the course staff are theoretical and practical issues of diagnosis and treatment of lung diseases. In the specialty of Allergology and Immunology, residents study only critical literature, in most cases this applies to the search of literature on nosology relating to patients under supervision. There was no confirmation of the participation of residents in any research, conferences with reports and publications. When studying individual plans, experts also noted that they did not reflect research activities. Thus, there is no systematization in the conduct of research, some of its elements are occasional in the form of participation in meetings of magazine clubs.

6.6 Education expertise

When conducting interviews and studying the documentation, the experts noted that there are practically no articles and studies on medical education, which would contribute to improving the quality of the educational process. No research projects have been identified on the quality of education. Thus, employees do not have any incentives, motivation to conduct research in the field of medical education.

6.7 Training in other institutions

To organize and implement academic mobility, the University has organized a department of academic mobility, which is actively working to establish partnerships with Kazakh and foreign universities, but due to the current epidemiological situation, this programme was not implemented.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 21 standards: fully - 17, partially – 4.
Standard 6: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Ensure implementation of the pediatric component at appropriate clinical sites (6.2.1)
- 2) Update information on the website for resident students (class schedule, EP, self-control questions, syllabuses, training tasks) (6.3.3)
- 3) Individual plans are recommended to reflect research activities (R&D topic, programme, publications, conferences, etc.) (6.5.4)
- 4) Develop a system to motivate health education research staff (6.6.3)

Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION

Evidence of compliance:

7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms

Monitoring and evaluation of EP includes the following stages: discussion, review, revision taking into account proposals and comments made by employers and other stakeholders, recommendation for approval, approval procedure. Improvement of the procedure for evaluating the programme is carried out through discussion of it at the meetings of the CEP, followed by discussion of all members of the Academic Council of the University. The correction of EP is also carried out on the basis of feedback with the participation of stakeholders (teachers, residents, employers). Annually, at the meetings of the departments, the CEP, the Academic and Academic Councils, the results of the Final State Certification of Residents, interim certification, reports and assessment of resident diaries are heard, on the basis of which conclusions are drawn on the expected achievability of resident learning outcomes. This practice is given for all specialties of residency in KRMU.

7.2 Feedback from teachers and residents

During interviews and work with documentation, EEC members confirmed that teachers and residents participate in the assessment and subsequent improvement of the educational programme through different feedback channels. Confirmation of the effectiveness of the education received is also based on an annual survey of students to assess the level of satisfaction with educational programmes. As a result of the questionnaire analysis, changes and additions are made to the EP. This practice also exists for all residency programmes.

When surveyed during the EEC, residents answered that they have 100% feedback from teachers, which is confirmed when interviewing students.

7.3 Results of Residents and Graduates

The Residence Department collects feedback from students to determine the level of satisfaction with the content of the EP, the organization of the educational process in the form of a questionnaire, monitoring of appeals to the rector's blog, discussion of current issues in the social network. Residency graduates are also surveyed annually (questionnaires are developed and approved).

7.4 Stakeholder Engagement

According to the report, the stakeholders are the Ministry of Health, employers, professional associations, and non-governmental organizations. At each certain level, their work is carried out: coordination of competencies within the framework of the SCES, discussion of the results of the independent examination, examination of the test material and ways to improve it, a list of disciplines in the Catalogue of Elective Disciplines.

In 2021, the Career Center conducted a sociological survey "Satisfaction of employers with graduates of the NEI "KRMU ", a total of 30 employers participated (60% response rate) from 6 regions and the city of Almaty. The results of the survey on the quality of graduate training showed that no employer rated the quality of training as "low".

Annually, round tables are held with employers (programme and minutes of April 23, 2021). Based on the results of feedback, an analysis of nonconformities, the need for corrective measures is carried out, and then registration and analysis of the effectiveness and efficiency of the actions taken are carried out. The results of feedback and corrective actions are heard at meetings of the department, the CEP, the Academic Council.

An online interview with employers confirmed that the organizations are generally satisfied with the work of university graduates and have a relationship and cooperation with the faculty of the department.

7.5 Procedure for Approval of Educational Programmes

The EP is approved at the meeting of the Chair, the CEP and the Academic Council.

The CEP carries out a systematic study and comprehensive assessment of EP in order to improve and guarantee quality (determining the value of the programme, achieving the goal, achieving tasks, the degree of compliance with the needs of society, the requirements of employers, the effectiveness of the training methodology), as well as an assessment of the educational and methodological support and support of the educational process. On EP necessarily there are reviews, are discussed with residents and employers that is reflected in minutes of meeting of chair. While EPs were not updated, because there was no release yet.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 15 standards: fully – 15.

Standard 7: Implemented

There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit

Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION

Evidence of compliance:

8.1 Management

The NEI "KRMU" implements its management decisions in accordance with the normative and legal acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as the internal rules for the organization of the educational process in the residency. Requirements for admission, planning the number of students, the ratio of teaching staff to the number of residents, the evaluation scale, etc. are observed.

The management of the university is open to changes, ready to discuss initiatives in the field of academic management, which was confirmed by a meeting with the management at the level of the rector and vice-rectors.

The website of the university provides information on the educational programmes of the residency: information for admissions, schedule of classes, academic calendar, etc. <https://krmu.edu.kz/akademicheskij-kalendar-2/>

8.2 Academic Leadership

The academic policy, <https://krmu.edu.kz/akademicheskaya-chestnost/>, which regulates the rights, obligations and responsibilities of students and the administration of the university, the procedure for organizing the educational process, is annually reviewed and approved in the NEI "KRMU". These rules stipulate the officials responsible for the proper implementation of the Rules and the scope of their responsibility.

The direct implementation of this programme is carried out in the KRMU Department of Internal Diseases with the participation of clinical mentors, allergologists and immunologists of the highest qualification category. In conversation with teachers and mentors, it became clear that in SH No.1 there is the only allergy department which provides all resources for successful implementation of the residency programme in the specialty 7R01103 "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's).

8.3 Training budget and resource allocation

The budget of NEI KRMU is formed from two sources: the republican budget (state order for training of personnel of higher and postgraduate education, advanced training of medical workers, development of scientific research, transfers) and provision of paid educational services. No additional purchases of equipment or other costs were incurred under this EP. Residents in this specialty are studying under a state grant transferred this year from another university.

8.4 Administration and Management

The staffing table of the department is approved annually taking into account changes in the number of students. According to Art.52 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" dated 27.07.2007. No. 319-SH, the total number of faculty members is formed on the basis of an average ratio of residents and teachers – 3:1.

The structural unit responsible for ensuring the quality of management is the Department of Strategic Development and QMS, which organizes a regular audit of the work of departments and structural units.

Internal regulatory documents are open and available on the official website <https://medkrmu.kz/>

8.5 Requirements and regulations

The Regulation on Residency was developed in accordance with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education", the Concept for the Development of Medical Education and determines the procedure for training medical personnel in the Residency in the organizations of medical education and science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, regardless of the forms of ownership, having a license for this type of educational activity and clinical bases.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 15 standards: fully – 15.

Standard 8: Implemented

There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit

Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

Evidence of compliance:

To date, the KRMU educational programme has not been accredited. At the same time, teachers have extensive experience in training residents in allergology. Training and methodological documentation has been developed and all relevant resources have been provided. Residents under this educational programme were transferred from KazMUNO in 2021. Accreditation of the educational programme 7R01103 "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's) in KazMUNO was carried out by the accreditation agency IAAR in 2016, so it was not possible to conduct monitoring in another university from this time. In this regard, the general positive dynamics of the university of KRMU is presented.

EEC experts have established that EP is regularly monitored and evaluated through feedback from residents, TS and stakeholders, including employers, as well as conducting an analysis of the academic achievements of residents. For feedback from residents and employees at the university there is a blog of the rector on the website of the university, residents have a representation in the Academic Council, Academic Council, CEP, student scientific society, council of young scientists. In addition, the participation of residents in the development of the educational programme is also carried out through the choice of elective disciplines. AIS Platonus is being upgraded in the Residence for more efficient use of electronic document management. In order to update educational resources in accordance with the changing needs of the medical organization of education, work is being carried out to develop joint educational programmes with foreign partner universities with the possibility of two-degree education. The strategic development plan for 2019-2025 reflects plans to improve the material and technical base of the university.

This tendency and practice is given in relation to all educational programmes of the residency, which were previously accredited.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 4 standards: fully - 4.

Standard 9: Implemented


There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit

**6. Recommendations for the improvement of the educational programme 7R01103
"Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)"**

1. The scientific component should be included in the thematic plan in the form of tasks based on the application of scientific analysis methods (2.2.4)
2. Develop quantitative indicators of R&D (2.2.4)
3. Include only the subjects of prerequisites in the programme of entrance examinations and exclude highly specialized topics (4.1.6)
4. Develop evaluation criteria for teaching staff and clinical mentors (5.2.4)
5. Ensure implementation of the pediatric component at appropriate clinical sites (6.2.1)
6. Update information on the website for resident students (class schedule, EP, self-control questions, syllabuses, training tasks) (6.3.3)
7. Individual plans are recommended to reflect research activities (R&D topic, programme, publications, conferences, etc.) (6.5.4)
8. Develop a system to motivate health education research staff (6.6.3)

7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

Members of the EEC established the compliance of the educational programme 7R01103 "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's) with the Accreditation Standards and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend to the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit this programme for a period of 5 years.

Председатель Внешней экспертной комиссии	Курманова Алмагуль Медеубаевна	
Зарубежный эксперт	Закирова Гузель Закировна	
Национальный академический эксперт	Кауышева Алмагуль Амангельдиновна	
Национальный академический эксперт	Сарсенбаева Гульжан Искендировна	
Национальный академический эксперт	Бачева Ирина Викторовна	
Национальный академический эксперт	Уразова Салтанат Нургожаевна	
Национальный академический эксперт	Ларюшина Елена Михайловна	
Национальный академический эксперт	Султанова Гулнар Достановна	
Эксперт – представитель работодателей	Нургалиев Нурлан Ермекбаевич	
Эксперт – представитель резидентов	Майкенова Арайлым Мураткызы	

**Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme
(generalization)**

Standard	Evaluation Criteria	Number of standards	Evaluation		
			Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Not compliant
1	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES	17	17	-	-
2	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	30	29	1	-
3	ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS	11	11	-	-
4	STUDENTS	30	29	1	-
5	FACULTY	7	6	1	-
6	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	21	17	4	-
7	PROGRAMME EVALUATION	15	15	-	-
8	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	15	15	-	-
9	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	4	4	0	0
	Total:	150	143	7	
			150		