

To the Accreditation Council of the  
Eurasian Center for Accreditation and  
Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Healthcare  
April 20, 2023

**REPORT  
OF EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION  
ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL  
PROGRAMME  
7R01144 "SURGICAL DENTISTRY"  
FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS OF  
POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION PROGRAMMES (RESIDENCY  
SPECIALTIES) OF MEDICAL EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS  
NON-PROFIT JSC "KAZAKH NATIONAL MEDICAL UNIVERSITY NAMED  
AFTER N. S.D. ASFENDIYAROV"**

**external expert evaluation period: April 18-20, 2023**

**Almaty, 2023**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	List of designations and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	2
2.	General part of the final report	5
2.1	Presentation of the Non-profit JSC “Kazakh National Medical University named after. S.D. Asfendiyarov and the educational programme in the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical dentistry"	5
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	7
2.3	Conclusion on the results of the reviewing the self-assessment report of the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards of Postgraduate Education Programmes (Residency Specialties) of Medical Educational Organizations and conclusions	7
3.	Description of external expert evaluation and conclusion	8
4.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of external evaluation 7R01144 - "Surgical dentistry"	10
5.	Recommendations for improvement 7R01144 - "Surgical dentistry"	31
6.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	31
	Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation and educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical dentistry"	33
	Attachment 2. List of documents reviewed as part of the external expert evaluation	34

## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS AND DEFINITIONS

Abbreviation	Definition
AMS	Administrative and Managerial Staff
HEI	High Education Institution
SCC	State Certifying Commission
SCES	State Compulsory Educational Standard
DSHR	Department of Science and Human Resources
ECAQA	Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care
FCE	Final Certifying Examination
IEP	Individual Education Plan
CS	Clinical Specialties
CHIS, AIS, Damu	Health Information Systems
CP	Clinical Protocol
CoC	Component of Choice
ESC	Elective Subjects Catalogue
MoH	Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MoEDSc	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
SR	Scientific Research
NSCS	A.N. Syzganov National Scientific Centre for Surgery Joint Stock Company
NCIE	National Centre for Independent Examination
EP	Educational Programme
OSCE	Objective Structured Clinical Examination
MS	Major Subjects
PGCE	Department for Postgraduate Continuing Education
PHC	Primary Health Care
ATS	Academic Teaching Staff
SYL	Syllabus
RCHD	Republican Centre for Health Development
IWR, GWR	Independent Work of Residents, Work of Residents Guided by a Teacher
ST RK ISO, QMS	Quality Management System of the Republic of Kazakhstan
TSYL	Typical Syllabus
TP	Training Package on
EMB	Educational and Methodological Board
AB	Academic Board
CBL	Case-based learning
ESG	European Standards and Guidelines
ESC	European Society of Cardiology
MCQ	Multiple-choice question
RBL	Research based learning
TBL	Team-based learning

## 2. General part of the final report

### 2.1 Presentation of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical dentistry"

EP 7R01144 "Surgical Dentistry" was developed and entered into the Register of Educational Programmes of Higher and Postgraduate Education in 2022. The structure and content of the EP were developed in accordance with the requirements of the State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan - 2022 in accordance with the order of the Minister of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 20, 2022 No. 2 "On approval of state compulsory standards of higher and postgraduate education" and registered with the Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 27, 2022 No. 28916.

Residency training in the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" is carried out full-time, the term of apprenticeship is 2 years. In the 2022 - 2023 academic year, the first admission to the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" was held in the amount of 1 student on a contractual basis, since there was no state order.

### 2.2 Information about previous accreditation

Accreditation of the educational programme of residency 7R01144 "Surgical Dentistry" is carried out for the first time.

### 2.3 Conclusion on the results of the reviewing the self-assessment report of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01144 "Surgical dentistry" for compliance with the accreditation Standards of postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions

The self-assessment report of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01144 "Surgical dentistry" (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 42 pages of the main text, attachments on 3 pages, copies or electronic versions of 38 documents located at the link <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/10y0qAhpXymKMku9etl6Dag5FnGDwNv-I?usp=sharing>.

The report is characterized by the completeness of answers to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structuredness taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme provided to the educational organization by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. A cover letter is attached to the report which is signed by Rector Shoranov Marat Yedigeyevich, which confirms the accuracy of the quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 1 chairman of 28 members of the internal commission on self-assessment indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme. **The Chairperson of the internal commission on self-assessment:** Baildinova K.Zh. - Candidate of Medical Sciences, Vice-Rector of the Academic Block. In total, the commission consists of 34 people (a self-assessment of 7 educational residency programmes was carried out), including in the direction of dentistry:

1. Tezekbayeva G.A., Deputy Dean of the School of Dentistry;
2. Yesirkepov A.A., Deputy Dean of the School of Dentistry;
3. Baskakova I.V., Chairperson of the CEP, Associate Professor of the Department of Therapeutic Dentistry;
4. Mirzakulova U.R., Professor of the Department of Surgical Dentistry;
5. Menzhanova D.D., head teacher of the Department of Surgical Dentistry.

Self-assessment of the educational programme of residency 7R01144 "Surgical dentistry" was carried out on the basis of the order of the rector of the university No. 31 dated 18.01.2023. "On the establishment of a working group to prepare a self-assessment report and conduct primary specialized accreditation of educational programmes for undergraduate, graduate and residency."

The report was reviewed by the accreditation expert Aldabergenova Taurzhan Kalibekovna and the review noted the strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions

and changes, which were taken into account in the process of feedback from the representative of the university and the corresponding changes and additions were made to the self-assessment report.

All standards provide the actual practice of the University in training residents in the specialty 7R01144 "Surgical Dentistry", taking into account the start of admission of students in 2022, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is quite complete and updated in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, learning outcomes, knowledge and skills assessment results, the material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners, financial information, plans for development and improvement.

The report is submitted to ECAQA in a finished appearance, with data adjusted according to the above recommendations, written in competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, described in accordance with the criteria of the standards, the tables contain references in the text and are consecutively numbered.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for the transition to the next stage of the accreditation procedure - external evaluation. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be obtained during a visit to the educational organization, i.e. verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

### **3. Description of external expert evaluation**

External expert work within the framework of the evaluation of the educational programme 7R01144 "Surgical Dentistry" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for conducting the External Evaluation of ECAQA Educational Organizations and Educational Programmes and in accordance with the programme approved on February 10, 2023 by the ECAQA Director General Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the vice-rector of Non-profit JSC KazNMU named after Asfendiyarov Baildinova K.Zh. dated April 10, 2023. Dates of the visit to the organization from April 18 to April 20, 2023.

The external evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying the indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of the accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit implementation within 3 days is detailed in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the programme), which is located in the documentation of the accreditation center. The programme is proof of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of an external expert evaluation.

To obtain objective information, the members of the EEC used the following methods and their results:

- conversation with management and administrative staff - 20 people;
- conversation with heads of departments - 7 people;
- interviews with residents - 15 people;
- study of the website [www.kaznmu.kz](http://www.kaznmu.kz) ;
- interviewing 14 employees, 11 teachers and 6 mentors;
- questioning of 28 teachers and 19 residents;
- observation of the training of residents: attending 1 practical lesson, topic of the lesson: "Periodontal surgery", teacher - Stabayeva Gulim Seydilkyzy, resident of the 1st year of study, place of the lesson City Clinical Hospital No. 5 Maxillofacial and ENT surgery;
- review of resources in the context of fulfilling accreditation standards: 7 clinical engagement bases were visited - Dental Clinic "Dobrodent", Dental Clinic "Eurodent", Family Dental Center "Vita Dental Clinic", Children's Dental Clinic, City Clinical Hospital No. 5, Maxillofacial and ENT surgery; Dental clinic of the School of Dentistry, "SS Team" Clinic, where training is provided in 4 educational programmes with the participation of 2 full-time teachers;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 38 units, both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (the list of examined documents is in **Attachment 2**).

On the part of the staff of the accredited organization, the presence of all persons indicated in the visit programme and according to the lists of interview and conversation sites was ensured (Table 1).

**Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, conversations with the EEC members**

<b>№</b>	<b>Job title</b>	<b>Quantity</b>
1	Vice-Rector	3
2	Dean	3
3	Acting Head of the Department for Academic Affairs	1
4	Head of the Alumni Career Center	1
5	Head of the Department for Academic Affairs	1
6	Head of the Alumni Career Center	1
7	Head of Human Resources Development Department	1
8	Head of the Staff Management Department	1
9	Chairman of the Committee for Educational Programmes	2
10	Head of the Department of Clinical Work	1
11	Head of the Scientific research Institute of fundamental and applied medicine named after B. Atchabarov	1
12	Head of the Department of Science	1
13	Financial director	1
14	Chief Accountant	1
15	Head of Planning and Budget Execution Department	1
16	Head of Department for Clinical work	1
17	Deputy Financial Director	1
18	Acting Library Manager	1
19	Deputy Head of the Scientific research Institute of fundamental and applied medicine named after B. Atchabarov	1
20	Department head	7
21	Head of the simulation center	1
22	Teachers	10
23	Residents	7
24	Employers	11
25	Clinical Mentors	11

A visit to the ECAQA Non-profit JSC "KazNMU" by EEC within the framework of accreditation of EP 7R01144 "Surgical Dentistry" was carried out according to the programme from April 18 to April 20, 2023.

In the process of visiting the departments of the University, the experts found that the University has departments that are directly related to the educational programme 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry", which can be noted as the best practice in education, namely, the EP in the specialty of residency was developed based on the requests of internship graduates "dentistry" and practical healthcare (availability of vacancies in dental clinics in Almaty (more than 100 vacancies according to websites: HeadHunter, Jobs in Almaty, Market.kz, Jooble, Rabota.nur.kz, etc.), which demonstrates the work on demand of the labor market.

Despite the existence of residency for the first year, all educational and methodological documentation and resource base are available in full and meet accreditation standards. During conversation with residents, teachers and employers, their participation in the development and evaluation of the EP, topics of elective classes, participation in collegial advisory bodies was clarified. The main direction of EP 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" is "patient-oriented education" by providing them with wide access to patients at the City Clinical Hospital No. 5, maxillofacial and ENT surgery and at the Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology. The teaching staff has scientific achievements and the first, highest medical qualification categories, closely cooperates with practical



healthcare. The clinical base has a study room equipped with a multimedia installation and laptops for conducting the theoretical part of the lesson and a sufficient number of thematic patients.

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of the EEC members was held following the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, the study of documents, the results of conversation, interviews, and questionnaires was held. EEC members have begun drafting the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the results of the external evaluation are made. The experts individually completed the "Quality Profile and External Evaluation Criteria for the Educational Programme 7R01144 - Surgical Dentistry" for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards. No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed and the final open vote was held by EEC Chairperson Kabildina Nailya Amirbekovna on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for the accreditation period of 5 years.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC, access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of the corporate culture of the University, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to the EEC members.

### **3. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01144 "Surgical dentistry"**

#### **Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES**

##### **Evidence of Compliance:**

##### **1.1 Mission statement**

The mission of the educational programme 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" is aimed at implementing the mission of the University by training a qualified physician in surgical dentistry, who has a system of universal knowledge and professional competencies, capable and ready for independent professional activity, organization and provision of qualified and specialized surgical dental care ([www.kaznmu.kz](http://www.kaznmu.kz), Residency web page).

According to the mission, the educational programme is aimed at training competitive specialists in the field of surgical dentistry who are able to meet the needs of society in providing surgical dental care, apply and develop advanced innovative technologies in practice and science, use the achievements of information and communication technologies, and improve public health.

Thus, the mission statement reflects all the requirements for the training of a resident physician with a broad professional outlook, possessing all the necessary key competencies, able to independently develop and be useful to society.

When implementing the activities of the visit programme, namely, based on the results of interviews with the heads of the organization, in interviews with residents and teachers, compliance with the criteria of **standard 1** was established. The mission of the EP is described in accordance with the available resources, opportunities in accordance with the requirements of the labor market with its own understanding of social responsibility, with a discussion of the mission and goals of the EP at all levels of the advisory commissions of the university with approval by the advisory and consultative board of the university in accordance with the legislation and regulatory legal acts (Minutes of the meeting of the department No. 1 dated 24.08.2022, approved at the meeting of the CEP of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education No.1 dated 31.08.2022), with the systematic collection, accumulation and analysis of information on the activities of the Department of Surgical Dentistry, which implements the educational programme of residency with assessment of strengths and weaknesses (SWOT analysis) to determine the policy and direction of strategic and tactical plans.

The mission of the EP was brought to the attention of all department employees, residents by posting the EP, syllabuses and information about the residency on the university website ([www.kaznmu.kz](http://www.kaznmu.kz), web page "Residency").

From interviews with teachers, it was found that the mission is brought to the attention of the teaching staff at meetings of the departments. Interviews with residents showed that the mission is brought to the attention of students at curatorial hours, meetings with deans, posted on the information stands of the university buildings, the official website of the university. During the work of the EEC according to the programme, following the results of interviews with the university administration, heads of structural divisions, as well as during meetings with teachers, mentors, residency students and employers, everyone confirmed their knowledge of the mission and final results of residency educational programmes, as well as active participation in its formation and implementation.

An analysis of the compliance of the University's activities with the criteria of this Standard as a whole indicates the presence in this organization of a strategic plan for KazNMU for 2019-2023, the corresponding mission and vision. The management of the university conducts an analysis of target indicators of activities, monitoring and improvement measures

### **1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy**

The postgraduate educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01144 - Surgical dentistry, implemented at the university, is built on the basis of a specific mission, taking into account the requirements of the State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan - 2022 and the professional standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan "Dental Activities" (Attachment No. 1 to the Order of the Deputy Chairman of the Board of National Chamber of Entrepreneurs of the Republic of Kazakhstan "Atameken" No. 285 dated October 22, 2018).

A visit to the clinical base of the City Clinical Hospital No. 5, maxillofacial and ENT surgery, a visit to a practical lesson on the topic: "Periodontal surgery", teacher - Stabayeva G.S., meetings with heads of departments, teachers, curators, mentors and residents showed a competence-oriented EP, which allows to train a surgeon-dentist capable of the following types of professional activities: medical; organizational and managerial; scientific-research.

The University, on the basis of State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan-22, independently developed EP 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry", conducted an assessment, selection and admission of residents, selection of teachers, employment conditions and distribution of resources. The compilation of syllabuses, Elective Subjects Catalogue, individual education plan, Working Curriculum, the form, structure and procedure for the development of these documents are determined by the University independently, and all educational and methodological documentation was reviewed and approved at all levels of the university advisory commissions with approval by the advisory and consultative council of the university in accordance with the law and regulatory legal acts

To verify **standard 1**, a meeting was held with the head of the organization Baildinova Klara Zhenisovna. This interview provided evidence that the mission of the residency programme and the mission of the university are fully consistent with each other. The vice-rector announced a strategy for the development of postgraduate education, including residency programmes, which indicates a clear vision of the university and an interest in improving residency programmes, taking into account the needs of practical healthcare.

*19 residents completed the survey on the <https://webanketa.com/> resource, of which 52.6% are residents of the 1st year of study, 47.4% are residents of the 2nd year of study, who answered 24 questions, including questions related to the quality of the educational process and the educational programme.*

*It has been established that 73.7% of residents will recommend studying in this educational institution to their acquaintances, friends, relatives. And 84.2 respondents believe that the leaders of the educational programme and teachers are aware of the problems of students related to learning. To the question "In your opinion, does this organization of education allow you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in your chosen specialty?", 73.68% of residents answered positively, 10.53% could not answer this question yet, and 15.79% would like to believe.*

*28 teachers participated in the questionnaire for teaching staff, consisting of 23 questions, of which 84.38% were full-time employees, 6.25% - part-time, 6.25% - do not teach residents, 1.56% - mentors, while their length of teaching experience was up to 5 years - 0%, up to 10 years - 10.7%, over 10 years - 89.3%. Teachers of the therapeutic profile - 48.44%, surgical profile - 29.69%,*



*pediatric direction (including pediatric infection and neonatology) - 4.69%, diagnostic direction (functional diagnostics, radiation diagnostics) - 4.69%, oncology, radiology, radiation therapy - 6.25%, dental profile - 6.25%.*

*When asked whether the organization of labor and the workplace in this organization of education suits them, 89.29% of teachers answered that they are completely satisfied, and 10.71% partially agree with this statement. According to the survey data, KazNMU has a healthy microclimate, so 67.19% of teachers note that the management of the organization systematically listens to the opinion of teachers regarding questions on the educational process, research and development, clinical work, 26.56% - sometimes, 4.69% did not give an answer. According to 84.38% of KazNMU teachers, there is an opportunity to be realized as a professional in their specialty completely, and 10.94% agree partially, 3.13% partially disagree.*

### **1.3 Final Learning outcomes**

The EP of the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" is aimed at the formation of professional competencies based on a competency-based approach to learning. The competencies that a resident must master upon completion of training are defined in the "Qualification Characteristics of a Graduate" in accordance with the Dublin descriptors, the State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan - 2022 and the professional standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan "Dental Activities" (Attachment No. 1 to the Order of the Deputy Chairman of the Board of the National Chamber of Entrepreneurs of the Republic of Kazakhstan "Atameken" No. 285 dated October 22, 2018). For a consistent, step-by-step mastering of these competencies, each curriculum and discipline syllabus determine the final learning outcomes. Each discipline, in turn, is a pre- or post-requisite of a cognate discipline. Consolidation of these skills is ensured by training at clinical bases.

The quality control of the overall final results of the competencies of students is carried out through final certification, in accordance with the requirements of the State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan - 2022. The commission for final exams includes teaching staff of the University and representatives of practical healthcare operating in medical organizations in Almaty. The monitoring results are heard at the Board of Studies of the University and the Academic Council, where administrative decisions are determined. Employers expect from new employees not only professional knowledge, skills, competencies and outlook, but also innovative thinking skills and creative experience, experience of personal achievements, teamwork skills and effective communication skills, and a desire for professional development. All material resources are used in order to worthily implement the missions and goals of the University and EP 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry". It should be noted that the university pays great attention to the formation of proper behavior among students in relation to colleagues, patients and their relatives.

*Of the 28 teachers surveyed, 57.14% answered that they were fully satisfied with the level of previous training of residents, and 39.29% were partially satisfied.*

A clear continuity has been established between the final results of the previous training of residents (prerequisites) and training in residency, and subsequent programmes of continuous professional development. The organization has developed 47 programmes of additional education, including for the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical dentistry. Residents are informed about this.

### **.4 Participation in the formulation of the mission and final results**

The University implements the mission of the EP, taking into account the needs of all stakeholders - students, residency graduates, university staff, healthcare authorities, healthcare organizations, employers of all forms of ownership, professional associations, the public, strives to fulfill their requirements and wishes, constantly working to improve. The EP is focused on the expectation of the employer and the needs of the labor market. The effectiveness of the educational programme is evidenced by 100% employment.

At a meeting with employers, it was found that the university, together with them, is discussing the educational programme in terms of choosing compulsory major disciplines and Catalog of elective disciplines.

To the question to residents, employers "Do you participate in formulating the mission and goals of the organization, educational programme 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry"? There was a clear answer: "Yes."

To the question to residents and employers “What personal contribution did you make to improving the educational programme?”. Residents answered that they express their opinions and wishes after mastering a particular discipline and at the end of the course of study in questionnaires. And employers answered this question that they constantly express their recommendations, opinions and wishes at the meetings of the CEP, scientific and practical meetings of the University, as well as in reviews of the EP. (<https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/10y0qAhpXymKMku9etl6Dag5FnGDwNv-I?usp=sharing>).

*Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.* Compliant with 17 standards: fully - 17.

*Standard 1: implemented*

*There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit.*

## **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME**

### **Evidence of Compliance:**

#### **2.1 Framework parameters for the postgraduate medical education programme**

To implement the educational programme in the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry", the organization's documents contain the teaching materials, which defines the goal, takes into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, independent work in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan-2022.

Attending a practical lesson on the topic: "Periodontal surgery", the teacher - Stabayeva Gulim Seidilkyzy, the place of the lesson is City Clinical Hospital No. 5, maxillofacial and ENT surgery, made sure that the training is carried out in accordance with the syllabus approved by the dean of the faculty of postgraduate education, according to the plan and includes the form of conducting a lesson in the form of a literature review on this topic, interviews, solving situational problems, compiling clinical situations, curation and oral presentation of the patient, there was feedback from the teacher, the resident had the opportunity to improve the skill in surgical methods of treating periodontal diseases

Residents during the interview confirmed that in KazNMU the observance of ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational programme is ensured in accordance with the “Regulations on the Ethical Council”, the decision of the Board of KazNMU, protocol No. 2 dated 20.03.2020.

The analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in the relevant disciplines were taken into account, additions were made to the bibliography of the teaching materials and syllabuses, and teachers use them in the classroom.

The mentoring system was also evaluated, which is described in the "Regulations on mentoring" (order of the rector No. 231 dated 16.09.2019). The results of interviews with mentors showed that the resident in the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" has 2 mentors, in connection with this, the Department of Surgical Dentistry is recommended to maintain the ratio of the number of mentors and residents 1:3. The tasks of mentors are to train a highly qualified specialist, a comprehensively developed, moral, cultural personality.

The procedure for informing residents about their rights and obligations is reflected in the Academic Policy of the University, Order No. 418 dated 01.09.2022.

This indicates compliance with standard 2 in terms of adapting training to the needs of residents. Also, KazNMU has the principles of quality and academic honesty, which are described in the Code of Academic Honesty of Students Order No. 615 dated 24.11.2021. The university operates the software "Anti-plagiarism University", acquired by KazNMU (license agreement No. 524 dated 28.06.2018).

#### **2.2 Scientific method**

In KazNMU, scientific research is an obligatory component of education and much attention is paid to the research and development work of teaching staff and students who have the opportunity to conduct joint scientific research, the results of which are presented at scientific conferences and

publications. For the successful implementation of research and development work, the educational programme includes elective disciplines, in addition to mandatory ones, such as medical law, management, marketing and audit in dentistry of scientific research as elective disciplines. They are necessary for in-depth study of scientific research standards, organization of conducting the scientific research, evidence-based medicine, information technology, data processing and analysis, publication of results. Since, through the direct participation of the residents themselves, as well as through various forms of organization of the educational process, stimulating the student to search, generalize and analyze information, identify problems, formulate a research question, key conditions for the training of innovatively active specialists are provided.

*When questioning residents, it was found that the educational organization has access to the participation of students in research and development work and 78.57% of respondents are completely satisfied with this, 21.43% are partially satisfied. When asked whether residents should do R&D, 78.95% of the respondents answered that they are already doing R&D, 10.53% have started planning R&D, and 10.53% answered that the teacher did not offer to do R&D.*

*Also, 70.31% of teachers fully agree that in this educational organization they have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of R&D, 28.13% - partially and 1.56% (1 person) completely disagree.*

### **2.3 Structure, content and duration of the residency programme**

The educational programme 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" was developed in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan and standard professional curriculum documents, the National Qualifications Framework, the industry qualifications framework and professional standards, and is consistent with the Dublin descriptors and the European Qualifications Framework

When forming the EP, the following factors were taken into account: the contribution of each discipline to the formation of competencies at a certain level, the definition of competencies for each discipline.

EP 7R01144 - "Surgical dentistry" is designed for 2 years of study (140 credits). Major disciplines are 134 credits - these are "Purulent Oral Surgery" - 20 credits, "Reconstructive Oral Surgery" - 37 credits, "Dental Oncology" - 20 credits, "Dental Implantation" - 30 credits, "Guided Bone Regeneration" - 27 credits, elective component - 4 credits, end-of-course assessment - 2 credits.

All 2 years of study, residents must work in the surgical department of a dental clinic, where they master the principles of providing outpatient care to patients with surgical dental diseases.

In accordance with the Classification of Specialties, the specialty is legitimate and persons who have completed training on residency educational programme and successfully passed the end-of-course assessment are awarded the qualification "physician – surgeon-dentist" and a certificate of completion of residency is issued.

*The EP of the residency complies with the International requirements and level 7 of the National Qualifications Framework in Medical Education and the Framework for Qualifications in the European Higher Education Area (ESG).*

*According to the results of the survey, 89.47% of residents are completely satisfied with the provision of methodological and didactic materials, additional literature for preparation for classes by teachers, 10.53% are dissatisfied. 84.2% of residents are fully provided with the necessary educational literature, 5.3% are partially provided, 10.5% are not fully provided. 68.4% of residents are satisfied with the conditions and equipment of classrooms, audience of this educational organization, and 31.6% are partially satisfied. 78.9% of residents have personal access to equipment (educational and real) in order to master practical skills in their specialty, partially - 21.1%.*

The organization has a dental clinic of the School of Dentistry, a Simulation Center of the School of Dentistry, and also signed 2 contracts with medical organizations. And to the question of the questionnaire "Is there enough time for practical training (follow-up of patient, etc.)", 100% of residents answered in full agreement. At the same time, 73.68% of residents claim that after the completion of classes, the teacher provides feedback (listens to your opinion, conducts mini-questionnaires, error analysis session), and 26.32% of teachers give feedback sometimes.

To the question “Do representatives of residents participate in the development of educational programmes?”, the experts received the answer: “Yes”. *The schedule of training sessions is fully satisfied by 94.74% of the residents surveyed.*

## **2.4 Organization of training and the relationship between postgraduate medical education and health care delivery**

From interviews with vice-rectors, it was established that the vice-rector for academic activities is the responsible vice-rector for the educational activities of the residency. Clinical bases are selected by the Department of Surgical Dentistry, and their suitability for training in the residency programme is determined by the Department of Clinical Work.

When attending a practical lesson on the topic: "Periodontal surgery", teacher - Stabayeva Gulim Seidilkyzy, place of the lesson is City Clinical Hospital No. 5, maxillofacial and ENT surgery and a conversation with residents, we saw that residents deepen their theoretical knowledge, develop communicative skills.

Practical training is carried out through the daily personal participation of a young specialist in medical activities using diagnostic and treatment methods based on evidence-based medicine, mastering the practical skills provided for by the training programme, and promoting a healthy lifestyle. *100% of the interviewed residents have enough time for practical training (follow-up of patient, bedside rounds, clinical discussions, assisting in operations). Among all the respondents, 78.9% rate the organization of clinical training as "excellent", 10.5% had a good impression, 10.6% were not satisfied. In turn, 93.75% of the interviewed teaching staff fully agree that residents have free access to patients at clinical bases and all conditions for improving practical skills, 6.25% agree partially.*

Thus, thanks to the opportunity to work in clinics and independently engage in medical work, residents have increased responsibility to the patient and colleagues.

This is also facilitated by mentoring, which is carried out in the organization. *89.5% of residents fully agree that the teacher (mentor, curator) of this educational organization is an example for them as a professional physician, a person (ethics, communications, appearance, speech), and 10.5% completely disagree.*

To improve the educational process, various teaching methods are used to achieve the final result of education. Innovative teaching methods that are practice-oriented are being actively introduced. The average duration of a resident's daily work is 9 academic hours. The practical part of education occupies 90% of training. Resident training methods include: seminars, webinars, conferences, case studies, problem-based learning (PBL); case-based learning (CBL), team-based learning (TBL); simulation-based learning, role-playing, brainstorming, portfolios, combined surveys, presentations, projects, etc.

*Among the 19 residents surveyed, 94.68% answered that teachers in the classroom use active and interactive teaching methods quite often, 26.32% believe that rarely or sometimes.*

*Teachers in the questionnaire indicated that in the process of teaching residents they use a variety of teaching methods, but more often analysis of situational problems (78.13%), compiling and solving cases (64.06%), work in small groups (64.06%), problem-oriented learning (60.94%), interactive learning (60.94%), oral questioning of students (54.69%), oral discussion of the topic (50%), test solving (43.75%), practical studies on clinical skills in a clinical training center (42.19%).*

**Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.** Compliant with 30 standards: fully -28, partially - 2, do not comply - 0.

**Standard 2: implemented**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

- 1) Develop quantitative indicators of R&D performance by residents (2.2.1.).
- 2) Increase the list of elective disciplines on an interdisciplinary basis (2.4.2.).

## **Standard 3: EVALUATION OF RESIDENTS**

### **Evidence of Compliance:**

#### **3.1 Evaluation methods**



The policy and methods for evaluating residents of EP 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" are reviewed and approved at a meeting of the CEP of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education. The general policy, principles, methods for evaluating residents are reflected in the following internal regulatory documents of KazNMU:

- Academic policy of the university No. 418 dated 01.09.2022;
- "Regulations on the ongoing monitoring of academic performance, interim and end-of-course assessment of students of Non-profit JSC "KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov" (Meeting of AC Minutes No. 5 dated 25.08.2022);
- SOP "Maintaining an electronic journal" (Meeting of the AC, Minutes No. 1 dated 31.10.2022)
- SOP "Development and approval of a system for assessing educational achievements" (AC meeting, Minutes No. 12 dated 25.08.2022)
- SOP "Formation, examination and approval of control and measuring tools in the format of testing" (AC meeting, Minutes No. 1 dated 31.10.2022)
- SOP "Organization and conduct of an exam in the form of testing, including remotely" (Order of the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs No. 200 dated 26.04.2021)
- SOP "Rules for monitoring the progress of a student" (Order of the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs No. 301 dated 11.11.2019).

The list of compulsory disciplines for conducting the summative assessment during the period of interim assessment is regulated by the disciplines passed and reflected in the Working curricula. The number of test questions is compiled according to the number of credits passed by disciplines. The system for monitoring the educational achievements of residents at the University includes: current and midterm examination, interim assessment of residents and final state certification. The assessment of the educational achievements of residents was carried out on the basis of measuring the level of competence formation in the form of: control questions, test tasks, situational tasks, clinical situations.

At the first lesson in the disciplines, teachers bring to the attention of the residents the evaluation criteria. The forms of carrying out all types of control are displayed in syllabuses. Electronic versions of syllabuses, EP are available in AIS "Sirius". Information about the grade - rating system of assessment is available on the website [www.kaznm.kz](http://www.kaznm.kz). Current examination is evaluated according to the evaluation sheet, checklist, midterm examination is calculated according to a 100-grade rating system. Evaluation sheets for all types of assessment are discussed at a meeting of the department, approved at a meeting of the CEP. The form of the summative assessment in the disciplines is presented in the form of a two-stage exam - from a mini-clinical exam and in the form of testing. The final state attestation is carried out in 2 stages: complex testing (in all disciplines) and a practical (mini clinical) exam at the bedside of the patient at the National Center for Independent Examination. The results of the residents' achievement are displayed in the electronic journals of the AIS "Sirius" system, and the progress is analyzed.

A resident who has completed the course program in full, but has not scored the minimum transfer score, is given the opportunity to re-study individual disciplines in the summer semester on a paid basis and re-take exams in order to increase the average score.

Responsibility for the implementation of the policy for assessing the educational achievements of residents lies with the teaching staff of the department, head of the department, office registrar.

A resident with an admission rating of at least 50 points is allowed to take the exams. Exams are held as scheduled. The number of exams is regulated in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan 2022. The form of the exams is determined by the decision of the CEP, the Academic Committee. The content of the examination materials (test tasks, checklists, etc.) is developed by the staff of the department, approved by the CEP of the faculty of postgraduate education.

In case of disagreement with the results of the rating of the summative assessment, the end-of-course assessment in the discipline, the resident has the right to file an application for an appeal addressed to the chairman of the appeal commission. The procedure for conducting an appeal is regulated by the rules for conducting appeals of the Academic Policy of KazNMU.

After the exams, a survey of residents is conducted to study their opinion on the quality of teaching the discipline, the exam procedure, the results of the sessions are analyzed by the department and the Council of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education. During the final state attestation to assess the educational achievements of residents, the commission will include practical healthcare specialists in the educational programme "Dentistry", external examiners.

A review of the website showed that its pages contain teaching materials and information which is necessary for residents that is regularly updated. Review of control and measuring instruments is carried out at several levels - within the department - from an employee of the department, within the university - from a university employee or external review, when employees of external organizations, associations or employers act as reviewers. Reviews are recorded at a meeting of the department or meetings of the CEP.

*89.5% of the surveyed residents are satisfied with the methods of assessing knowledge and skills, and 10.55% would like to change*

### **3.2 Relationship between assessment and learning**

A visit to KazNMU of EEC members showed that the methods used to assess the competencies of students at KazNMU are prescribed in syllabuses for disciplines that are discussed and approved at meetings of department, CEP, AC, SC.

Interviews with teachers confirmed that an objective assessment of theoretical knowledge is carried out using an oral survey and testing, practical skills – by a mini clinical exam using checklists. Residents also noted that assessment methods are fully comparable with teaching and learning methods and cover the assessment of all competencies of students both during practical classes and during exams.

*According to the survey data, 73.7% of the respondents claim that after the completion of the classes, the teacher constantly provides feedback (listens to your opinion, conducts a mini-questionnaire, corrects mistakes), and 26.3% - sometimes.*

During a visit to the simulation center, Talkimbayeva Nailya Anuarovna showed evaluation sheets for each practical skill.

*The conclusions of the EEC by the criteria compliant with 11 standards: in full - 11.*

*Standard 3: implemented*

*There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit.*

## **Standard 4: RESIDENTS**

### **Evidence of Compliance:**

#### **4.1 Admission and selection policy**

Admission to residency is carried out in accordance with the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan “On approval of the Standard rules for admission to study in educational organizations that implement educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education” dated October 31, 2018 No. 600, State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan - 2022, Rules for admission to residency at Non-profit JSC KazNMU approved by the decision of the Board of Directors dated June 29, 2022, order No. 6 and posted on the website [www.kaznmu.kz](http://www.kaznmu.kz).

Admission, examination and appeal commissions have been established at the University to receive documents and organize entrance examinations.

Baimakhanov Abylai Niyatovich, Dean of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education, spoke about the policy for the admission of residents: “The resident consulting service is represented by the admissions committee, the dean’s office (dean, deputy dean, chief specialist, specialist), employees of the registrar’s office, DIT, libraries, curators, clinical mentors, the military department, accounting, head of legal and passport and visa work. The regulatory framework for the admission of residents to KazNMU is contained on the website of the university. This provision is being reviewed depending on the amendments to the current directive legal documents regulating the policy of selection of residency students. The EP of residency assumes a clinical orientation of education and in-depth specialized



training in the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical dentistry". The admission of citizens to residency is carried out on a competitive basis based on the results of entrance examinations. Applicants to residency take an entrance exam in their specialty. During admission, the personal achievements of the applicant, the results of research and development work, etc. are also taken into account.”

According to EP 7R01144 "Surgical Dentistry", the first enrollment was carried out in the 2022 academic year in the amount of 1 student on a contractual basis. Currently, the resident is studying in the 1st year.

Thus, selection and admission to residency is carried out in accordance with regulatory documents. The policy of selection and admission of students to the university are clear, consistent with the mission and goals

#### **4.2 Number of residents**

The number of accepted residents is regulated by the state order of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan for the training of medical personnel, the possibilities of clinical, practical training, the maximum allowable workload for curators, the provision of educational, educational and methodological and scientific literature, the capacity of clinical bases, as well as the material and technical resources of the University.

Admission of residency students is carried out by the selection committee.

The number of accepted students is agreed with the relevant stakeholders, taking into account the needs of practical healthcare and the labor market in graduates of the educational programmes being implemented, therefore, annually, the University sends a request for the need for scientific and pedagogical personnel and clinical residency specialties to the Department of Science and Human Resources (DSHR) of the Ministry of Healthcare (MH) of the Republic of Kazakhstan. In accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the university has the right to carry out admission in excess of the state order on the basis of contracts with tuition fees at the expense of individuals or legal entities. In the 2022-2023 academic year, the State order for residents under the educational programme 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" was not allocated. 1 resident enrolled for training on a paid basis.

#### **4.3 Support and advice to residents**

The University has a system of academic consulting for residents at the departments: before the start of each examination session, the department develops and approves a schedule for consultations on disciplines by experienced teachers, associate professors, professors.

By order of the vice-rector of the academic block, the resident is assigned a curator from among the teaching staff of the department, who provides the functions of an academic mentor, participates in the formation and implementation of an individual curriculum, manages the educational and scientific activities of the student, and assists in employment. In addition, a clinical mentor in a medical organization is assigned to the resident, coordinating the training of the resident in the process of mastering practical skills and competencies in accordance with the EP. Information about teachers is posted on the AIS of KazNMU portal. Residents are consulted based on the results of assessment and questioning of residents. During the academic year, it can be presented both in person and remotely (on online platforms, in chats, etc.).

The programme "Healthy University", a social programme to support students and teaching staff "Health of teaching staff" and "Health of students", "Programme for the prevention and early detection of tuberculosis among students of KazNMU", a program to provide discounts for various groups of residents on a paid basis are being implemented.

Those in need are provided with social assistance in accordance with the “Regulations on the provision of social assistance to students” (Decision of the Board, minutes No. 1 dated 01.02.2022), social assistance to students is assigned by order of the rector by decision of the Economic Council in the form of: one-time material assistance, provision of free accommodation in a dormitory of university (orphans), discounts on tuition fees - for special categories of residents. A resident in the educational programme 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" did not apply to the University for social assistance.

Residents receive information about support services on the basis of information provided at the stands of the departments, the dean's office and the University's website [www.kaznmu.kz](http://www.kaznmu.kz), where there

is also a rector's blog, an internal information forum, and information about the National Helpline for Children and Youth (150). When providing social support, counseling, the principle of confidentiality is strictly observed.

#### **4.4 Representation of residents**

Participation in the development and evaluation of the EP is carried out by students of the residency by providing systematic feedback and representation in the CEP, AC, AC and SC of the university.

Resident students have the opportunity to attend meetings of advisory bodies, actively participate in the discussion of issues in the context of their specialty. The proposals and recommendations of the students are necessarily taken into account by the members of the advisory bodies and taken into account when forming the final decision of the meeting.

*According to the results of the survey, 73.7% of residents believe that programme managers and teachers constantly involve students in the work of advisory bodies (methodological council, academic council, educational programme committees), do not involve -10.5%, involve, but sometimes -5.3 %, do not know about it - 10.5%.*

#### **4.5 Working conditions**

According to the order of the Minister of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 15, 2020 No. ҚР ДСМ-270/2020 “On approval of the rules for placing a state order, admission for education and training of medical personnel in residency”, resident doctors studying under the state educational order are paid a scholarship.

Residents are provided with holidays between academic periods. The duration of the holidays during the academic year is six weeks, with the exception of the graduation course. It is allowed to combine education with work for 0.5 rate in areas close to his/her future specialty in his/her free time from study with the consent of the curator, head of the department and residency department.

When interviewing residents, during meetings with employees of the department of postgraduate education and university management, it was found that residents have the opportunity to express their opinions and wishes regarding their participation in the decision-making process, ensuring academic quality and other professional, financial and social issues. All issues raised and discussed at these meetings are resolved in a timely and appropriate manner.

*Of the 19 residents surveyed, 94.7% are completely satisfied with the organization of teaching (the amount of time for practical training, the location of the seminars, the topics of the seminars), and 5.3% of the respondents are partially satisfied.*

**Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.** Compliant with 30 standards: fully - 30.

**Standard 4: implemented**

**There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit.**

### **Standard 5: TEACHERS**

#### **Evidence of Compliance:**

##### **5.1 Recruitment and selection policy**

The total number of teachers and mentors at the Department of Surgical Dentistry is 40 people, including full-time - 15, part-time workers - 11, timeworkers - 6, mentors - 8. The degree of the department is 69%.

The personnel policy of KazNMU is guided by the following legal documents: “Rules for the search, recruitment, selection, admission and adaptation of university employees” (Decision of the Board No. 10 dated December 09, 2019) “Personnel policy of KazNMU” (order No. 7 dated October 14, 2019 ); "Qualification requirements for the positions of the teaching staff of KazNMU" (Order of the Rector No. 281 dated 05.06.2019), "Regulations on the teaching load" (Meeting of the Academic Committee No. 12 dated 25.08.2022), "Regulations on mentoring" (Order of the rector No. 231 dated 16.09.2019).

The teaching staff implementing the residency programme of the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry", is the Department of Surgical Dentistry, 4 employees were involved to work with the resident in the 2022-2023 academic year, including the head of the department, 2 professors, 1 associate professor with higher medical qualification categories and 2 mentors per 1 resident.

The results of the interviews of the mentors showed that the resident in the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical dentistry" has two mentors Seitkulov Amangeldy Baskambayevich - head of the department of maxillofacial surgery No. 1, the City Clinical Hospital No. 5 and Kim Georgiy Grigoryevich – hospital physician of the head and neck department of the Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology with a specialist certificate "Oral and Maxillofacial Surgeon", when a tutor with a specialist certificate "General Dentist" or "Dental Surgeon" is required to train a resident in the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry". The department does not maintain the ratio of the number of mentors and residents 1:3.

*When questioning teachers, it was found that 89.28% are completely satisfied with the organization of labor and workplace, and 10.71% of teachers are partially satisfied. Also, 84.38% of teachers claim that they can fully realize themselves as professionals in their specialty in this educational institution, and 10.94% agree partially, 3.13% partially disagree. 78.57% of teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research and development. 57.14% of teachers are completely satisfied with the salary, 25% are not satisfied.*

## **5.2 Teacher commitment and development**

When meeting with the teaching staff of the university, it was found out that the University has implemented a policy of activity and development of the teaching staff, which guarantees the recognition of academic activity, with an appropriate emphasis on pedagogical, research and clinical qualifications, which is carried out in the form of awards, promotion or remuneration. So, in the reporting year, the following employees of the Department of Surgical Dentistry were awarded: Mirzakulova U.R. - Letter of thanks from the rector of KazNMU, 2022; Medal of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan "Yenbek Ardageri", 2022; 2. Menchisheva Yu.A. - Honorary diploma of the University, 2022

One of the priority areas for the development of teaching staff is to increase the level of pedagogical skills. Teaching staff have the opportunity to undergo various scientific and practical trainings and internships. From 2018 to 2020, the staff of the Department of Surgical Dentistry passed 14 advanced trainings, master classes and seminars in educational organizations of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

In order to verify the data of **standard 5**, at a meeting with the head of the personnel department and during interviews with teachers, experts received an opinion on approaches to the development of the pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation to work with residents, mentoring, which includes the organization of advanced training cycles in pedagogical skills for mentors, teachers (certificate of completion of the cycle of 60 hours), material incentives in the form of bonuses to employees. However, given the level of EP - residency, the experts identified a limited opportunity for international professional internships for teaching staff.

*There is an opportunity for career growth and development of teacher competencies in the organization - 71.43% of the surveyed teachers answered completely agree, and 25% partially agree with this and disagree - 3.57%. 39.29% studied at professional development programmes during this year, 53.57% more than 3 years ago, 7.14% more than 5 years.*

*The organization implements social support programmes for teachers - 57.14% answered that "yes, such programs exist", 25% of respondents do not know about this and 17.86% doubt the answer.*

**Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.** Compliant with 7 standards: fully - 5, partially - 2, do not comply - 0.

**Standard 5: implemented**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

- 1) Involve a mentor with appropriate qualifications in the implementation of the educational programme (5.1.1)
- 2) Increase the number of international clinical fellowships (5.2.4.).

## **Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

### **Evidence of Compliance:**

#### **6.1 Logistics and equipment**

The university has a developed material and technical base for the implementation of

professional training of residents in the educational programme 7R01144 "Surgical Dentistry" and includes the presence of lecture halls, classrooms, a scientific library, information technology facilities, cultural and social facilities, a university dental clinic of the School of Dentistry, Simulation Center of the School of Dentistry, clinical bases of the Department of Surgical Dentistry - City Clinical Hospital No. 5 (Contract No. 540 dated 01.09.2022,) and the Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology (Contract dated 01.09.2022).

In 2022-2023, the material and technical base of the Department of Surgical Dentistry, which provides residency training for this educational programme, was updated - 4 monoblocks, 1 laptop, 1 multimedia display, 4 headlights with magnifying loupes were purchased.

According to the programme of the visit to KazNMU, the experts visited the Simulation Center, which was created within the framework of the programme of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan 003/109 "Creation of educational and clinical centers at state medical higher educational institutions", a library. When visiting the dental clinic of the School of Dentistry, the experts visited the Simulation Center of the School of Dentistry.

*An analysis of the residents' survey showed that 68.42% of residents were completely satisfied with the conditions and equipment of the classrooms and lecture halls of this educational organization, and 31.58% were partially satisfied. To the question whether the resident has access to equipment (training and real) in order to master practical skills in the specialty, 78.95% answered that have full access and 21.05% - partial access. The organization of clinical training in the opinion of 78% of residents is excellent, 10, 53 are good, and 20.53% are satisfactory. 63.2% of residents are fully satisfied with the library fund of KazNMU, and 15.8% are partially satisfied.*

*76.56% of teachers fully agree that the organization has enough equipment and resources to conduct training for residents under accredited programmes, 20.31% agree partially*

## **6.2 Clinical bases**

According to the programme of visiting EEC KazNMU, 7 clinical training bases were visited: Dental Clinic "Dobrodent", Dental Clinic "Eurodent", Family Dental Center "Vita Dental Clinic", Children's Dental Clinic, City Clinical Hospital No. 5, maxillofacial and ENT surgery; Dental clinic of the School of Dentistry, "SS Team" Clinic, where training is provided in 4 educational programmes.

For the implementation of the EP in the specialty 7R01144 "Surgical Dentistry", the clinical bases of the Department of Surgical Dentistry are the City Clinical Hospital No. 5 (Contract No. 540 dated 01.09.2022) and the Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology (Contract dated 01.09.2022). The City Clinical Hospital No. 5 has hospital deployed with 200 beds in 4 profiles: "Maxillofacial surgery for adults", "Maxillofacial surgery for children"; "Otorhinolaryngological (ENT) surgery for adults" and "ENT surgery for children". The hospital provides round-the-clock emergency surgical care to patients with injuries of the maxillofacial region, ENT organs and dental care, within the guaranteed volume of free medical care for locals of Almaty and not locals. In addition, planned surgical care in the profiles of "Maxillofacial Surgery" and "ENT Diseases" for adults and children, according to the guaranteed volume of free medical care for all residents of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology provides all types of medical care to cancer patients, including patients in the department of head and neck tumors.

The clinical bases determined by the Department of Surgical Dentistry for training in the specialty 7R01144 "Surgical Dentistry", according to the agreements - the City Clinical Hospital No. 5 (Contract No. 540 dated 01.09.2022) and the Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology (Contract dated 01.09.2022) are hospitals and do not have a sufficient number of patients and equipment to master the practical skills provided for by the training programme for the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical dentistry", since the accredited specialty provides for the training of a dentist-surgeon to work in the surgical department of a dental clinic.

Also during the interview, the resident himself and his/her mentors confirmed that all classes of the resident in the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical dentistry" are held at the City Clinical Hospital No. 5 in the department of maxillofacial and ENT surgery and, according to the schedule and duty schedule, the resident is on duty in the hospital 4 shifts per month together with clinical mentors or department staff



(full-time or part-time), which is unacceptable according to Attachment 46 to Order No. 4 dated 09.01.23 of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan “On Approval of Standard Curricula for Medical and Pharmaceutical Specialties”.

Due to the fact that EP 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" provides for in-depth clinical training of an outpatient dentist-surgeon, it is recommended that the Department of Surgical Dentistry determine dental clinics as clinical bases for training of residents. All 2 years of study, residents must work in the surgical department of a dental clinic, where they master the principles of providing outpatient care to patients with surgical dental diseases.

At the City Clinical Hospital No. 5, they attended a practical lesson for a resident of the 1st year of study, conducted by a teacher Stabayeva G.S. on the topic: "Periodontal surgery", where the resident's documents (portfolio, results of the assessment of residents-check-lists, syllabus) were also studied.

The residents showed their commitment to the University, during the conversation they were distinguished by their activity, showed their command of the English language, answering the questions of the foreign expert Katrova L.

### **6.3 Information technology**

In KazNMU, the computer park of the university has been updated by 60%, a system for identifying books using a barcode in the library is working, a project has been implemented to create a Situation Center with an IP video surveillance system.

KazNMU has *a scientific library*. Fund of the library of KazNMU is more than 1,428,434 copies of literature, 13952 copies of electronic textbooks. The library's electronic catalog is available in all academic buildings via the Internet - from the library's website <http://lib.kaznmu.kz>. Since 2019, the KazNMU library has access to: Web of Science - [webofknowledge.com](http://webofknowledge.com), Elsevier - Science direct - [sciencedirect.com](http://sciencedirect.com), Scopus - [scopus.com](http://scopus.com), Cochrane Library, DynaMedPlus, MEDLINE Complete, eBook Clinical Collection, RMEB - [rmeb.kz](http://rmeb.kz), “Epigraph” database. The scientific library is equipped with 135 computers, 1 laptop, 1 video projector, 2 screens, duplicating and copying equipment.

*A survey of residents found that 63.2% were fully satisfied with the library fund of KazNMU, and 15.8% were partially satisfied.*

### **6.3 Clinical teams**

Residents in the specialty 7R01144 - Surgical Dentistry, daily develop the skills of coordinating work with colleagues and other healthcare professionals during examination, treatment and emergency care for patients in clinics. The resident is present during the consultations, carries out the instructions of senior colleagues within the framework of his/her competence. The result of the resident's activity is checked by the teacher and reflected in the diary-report.

*Students have free access to patients at clinical bases and all the conditions for improving their practical skills - 85.71% of teachers fully agree with this, 14.29%% partially agree.*

### **6.4 Medical research and developments**

Since the formation of scientific competence is one of the results of the training of residents, the acquisition of experience in conducting scientific work of residents in the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" begins with the "Learning through Research" programme. The result of the training is evaluated according to the output data - this is an article, thesis, report, participation in the work of the scientific circle of the department. Residents participate in scientific practice, starting with the analysis of literature data, processing clinical material, entering information into databases, and ending with writing an article and making a scientific report. Residents can be involved in scientific research not only by the curator, but also by the physician of the base institution.

At the Department of Surgical Dentistry, research is being carried out on the topic: “Development and implementation of regenerative methods: the use of autologous platelet-rich plasma and fibrin in order to optimize the healing of bone cavities of the jaws and soft tissue wounds of the maxillofacial region” and in this regard, the resident of the 1st year of study is on topic planning stage of research work of a resident, is involved in the diagnosis and treatment of patients with diseases of the salivary glands under the guidance of Prof. Doctor of Medicine Mirzakulova U.R., in the study and implementation of various modifications of sinus lifting, dental implantation under the

guidance of Associate Professor, Candidate of Medical Science Uglanova Zh.Sh.; study in depth the features of the surgical treatment of periodontal diseases under the guidance of Professor, Candidate of Medical Science Stabayeva G.S.; study the effect of platelet-rich plasma, fibrin and powder, participate in bone grafting under the guidance of the head, doctor PhD Menchisheva Yu.A.

*Interviews with 28 teachers, including 15 full-time teachers, showed that there are no problems in the management of education, depending on the specific base (the admission of residents to equipment, a sufficient number of thematic patients, time to maintain medical records, independent work). And the residents in the questionnaire to the question whether they are currently engaged in scientific work under the guidance of their teacher or mentor, 78.9% of the respondents answered: "Yes", 10.5% have started planning the implementation of research and development, 10.5% of the residents say that the teacher did not offer them to engage in research and development .*

### **6.5 Expertise in the field of education**

The development of expertise in educational assessment and research in the discipline of medical education is a systemic process and is ensured through the joint work of the DAD (approval of the EP), the Faculty of Postgraduate Education (implementation of the EP), the Committee for Educational Programmes (CEP) (planning, development and evaluation of the EP), EMA (OP monitoring). The CEP includes teachers, representatives of professional associations, employers, and students.

Employees of the University and the department were trained in writing educational programmes and got acquainted with the experience of other universities in the formation of EP (Nazarbayev University, KIMEP).

In order to develop the skills of expert evaluation of residency educational programmes at the University, teachers, members of the CEP were trained on the basis of the School of Pedagogical Excellence (SPE) named after Kh.S. Nasybullina, winter and summer Schools organized by the DAD.

*According to the results of the survey of 28 teachers, 75% of the respondents are completely satisfied with the work of the department of postgraduate education, 20.31% - partially, the rest - are not satisfied or doubt the answer.*

### **6.6 Training in other institutions**

The University implements the programmes "Academic mobility of students" and "Visiting professor of KazNMU" in accordance with the principles of the Bologna process and in accordance with the goals and needs of students and staff in compliance with ethical principles. The implementation of these programmes contributes to the internationalization of education and integration into the global educational space and is in line with the University's Strategic Plan for 2019-2023.

"Regulations on the academic mobility of residents, teachers and employees", (minutes No. 9 of the Decision of the Board of Non-profit JSC KazNMU dated November 11, 2019) determines the general procedure and conditions for organizing academic mobility of residents and teaching staff in KazNMU and was developed in order to improve the quality of education, further expand and strengthen cooperation between foreign and Kazakh universities and higher educational institutions.

To ensure the academic mobility of residents and the recognition of educational programmes (all levels and forms of higher and postgraduate education) in the European educational space, Kazakh credits were recalculated into ECTS credits.

Academic mobility of the teaching staff of the Department of Surgical Dentistry was carried out by:

1) prof. Mirzakulova U.R. and PhD Menchisheva Yu.A. at the Tashkent State Dental Institute, from 9 to 19 February 2020 at the Department of Diseases of the Maxillofacial Region and Traumatology (Order No. 49-k dated 07.02.2020);



2) head of the Department, Doctor PhD Menchisheva Yu.A. at Samarkand State Medical University, Samarkand, Uzbekistan from November 16 to November 30, 2020 online (Order No. 241-k dated 20.11.2020);

3) head of Department, Doctor PhD Menchisheva Yu.A. at the Medical University of Sofia, Bulgaria (Order 3 dated 10.10.2022).

Academic mobility of residents in view of the first admission in the 2022-2023 academic year is planned for the next 2023-2024 academic year.

**Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.** Compliant with 21 standards: fully - 20, partially -1, do not comply - 0

**Standard 6: implemented**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

- 1) Determine the place of clinical practice - a dental clinic in accordance with the specialty of the educational programme 7R01144 - "Surgical dentistry" (Standard 6, paragraph 6.2.1)

## **Standard 7: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME EVALUATION**

### **Evidence of Compliance:**

#### **7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms**

The University has a multi-level EP evaluation system, including constant monitoring by the residency department, as well as by the Department for Academic Affairs. Academic achievements are systematically analyzed according to the mission and learning outcomes of the EP. The University monitors progress based on the results of sessions, the results of the state final exam and interim assessment. Independent monitoring of the final learning outcomes is carried out at the National Center for Independent Examination and by surveying employers. The monitoring results are heard at the Board of Studies of the University and the Academic Council, on the basis of which corrective measures are developed.

In order to monitor the implementation of the EP and identify problems, including those related to resource provision, the following documents are approved and updated at the University: SOP "Assessment and analysis of educational programmes of KazNMU" (meeting of AC No. 3 dated November 26, 2020), SOP "Formation, discussion, approval of CED. Registration for an elective component" (meeting of the AC dated August 12, 2022).

*An analysis of the survey of residents and teachers showed that, according to 78.95% and 67.19%, respectively, accreditation of an educational institution and an educational programme is an important and necessary mechanism for ensuring the quality of education in residency, and 21.05% and 28.13% doubt answer and 23.44% of teachers expressed the opinion that yes, it is, but in combination with other mechanisms (attestation, audits, independent assessment of students' knowledge).*

#### **7.2 Feedback from teachers and residents**

Feedback on the EP at the Department of Surgical Dentistry is carried out once a year, the head of the department and the teacher responsible for residency are responsible for collecting and processing the results of the discussion.

The Department of Academic Work conducts a survey of the heads of residency departments, heads of structural divisions, teachers and residents to assess all components of the educational programme (perception of the programme, mastering the programme and achieving learning objectives). The assessment of the perception of the educational programme is analyzed based on the results of a survey of students by year of study, regarding their impressions of the content of the EP and the learning process as a whole. The questionnaire includes a list of questions related to the quality of the educational process. The results of all surveys are discussed at meetings of the Quality Council. Questionnaires are periodically updated. In the process of monitoring, on the basis of the data obtained, the educational programme is adjusted, taking into account the main priority areas in education, by the responsible structural divisions for their implementation.

For feedback with teachers and residents, the rector's blog is used, where students and university staff receive answers to their questions about the conditions for the implementation of

the EP. Representatives of the residents are members of the Faculty Council, CEP, Academic Council, where they participate in discussing the implementation of the educational programme.

Feedback results are analyzed and discussed at the meetings of the departments, CEP, Academic Council. In general, the use of feedback contributes to a better understanding of the current needs of residents and teachers and is systematic when making changes to the educational programme.

Also, for the purpose of feedback, an annual survey of employers is conducted to assess the degree of satisfaction with university graduates, to identify the compliance of the educational programme with the real requirements of the labor market, opportunities for its improvement, as well as the degree of compliance of graduates' competencies with positions in the workplace.

### **7.3 Resident and graduate results**

There was no graduation from the EP in the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry".

### **7.4 Stakeholder Engagement**

Stakeholders in the evaluation and improvement of the EP at KazNMU are:

- Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan, which conducts an independent assessment of the knowledge of residents (National Center of Independent Examination);
- employers are medical institutions of the Republic of Kazakhstan that promote employment and adaptation of graduates to the labor market, annually there is a correspondence about the quality of training of residency graduates, reviews of physicians on the results of training are collected;
- representatives of the Committee for the Control of Medical and Pharmaceutical Services and representatives of practical healthcare - KazNMU widely uses the principle of independent objective assessment, involving as chairpersons, members and examiners of the state attestation commission for the final attestation of graduates;
- representatives of public associations of physicians - organize scientific and practical conferences on topical issues of medical education and EP.

To study the opinions of stakeholders, activities are carried out: career guidance work among school graduates, questioning and interviews with applicants, questioning of students, employers, teaching staff, university graduates. Based on the analysis of the activities carried out, measures are formed to improve activities and meet the needs, as a result of which the goals and objectives, as well as the mission of the university, are updated.

Taking into account the opinions of representatives of practical healthcare who are part of the AC, as well as according to the trajectory of training in the specialty, a catalog of elective disciplines is formed and approved annually. The number of hours of the elective component (elective disciplines), their correlation with compulsory disciplines is regulated by the State Compulsory Educational Standards of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The representatives of practical healthcare in the CEP and in other advisory bodies are the President of United Kazakhstan Association of Dentists Bekturganova Nazym Dauletzhanovna and the President of the Association of Endodontists and Periodontists Kopbayeva Maira Taitoleuovna, who are also employees of the departments of the School of Dentistry, in connection with this it was recommended to expand the representation of stakeholders in the advisory and collegiate bodies.

Interviews with 11 employers included such questions as: knowledge of the mission of the university, participation in the development of the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in the training of residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, 100% employment of residency graduates, etc..

### **7.5 Approval procedure for educational programmes**

The expertise of the EP in the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" is carried out according to the developed mechanism for approving the EP:

- CEP for compliance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard, carries out a systematic study and comprehensive assessment of the EP in order to improve and quality assurance (determining the value of the programme, achieving goals, implementing tasks, the degree of compliance with the needs

of society, the requirements of employers, the effectiveness of teaching methods), as well as assessing educational and methodological support;

- CED, taking into account pre- and post-requisites, evaluates the choice of methods for assessing the learning outcomes of residents, taking into account all the proposals of stakeholders.

**Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.** Compliant with 15 standards: fully - 14, partially - 1, do not comply - 0.

**Standard 7: implemented**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

- 1) Expand the representation of stakeholders in advisory and collegiate bodies. (7.4.2.)

## **Standard 8: MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION**

### **Evidence of Compliance:**

#### **8.1 Management**

KazNMU has a developed management system that provides for the fulfillment of the mission and goals, maintains institutional efficiency and integrity, creates and maintains an environment for learning and conducting research and creative activities.

On the basis of the LSI of the Republic of Kazakhstan, in order to implement the mission and strategic plan of the university for 2019-1023, the Regulations on structural divisions were developed and approved, which determine the main directions of their activities, requirements for administrative and legal consolidation, its status in the organizational structure of the university management dated July 15, 2020, list of normative documents; job descriptions of employees, which determine the procedure for their appointment and dismissal, rights, duties, powers.

The implementation of the residency programme in the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical dentistry" is carried out in accordance with:

- The Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" subparagraph 2-1 of Article 5 in order to implement the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated May 20, 2013 No. 500 "On approval of the state educational order for the training of specialists with higher and postgraduate education", which regulates the number of state educational orders for training of residents in the field of healthcare;

- "On Approval of the Standard Rules for Admission to Education in Educational Organizations Implementing Educational Programmes of Higher and Postgraduate Education", subparagraph 11) of Article 5 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education", which determines the procedure for admitting citizens to residency;

- the State Compulsory Educational Standard of residency in medical specialties and a standard professional curriculum for medical specialties of residency;

- The academic policy of KazNMU defining the Basic concepts, the procedure for organizing and conditions for the implementation of educational programmes at all levels of training of a resident (Order of the rector No. 418 dated 01.09.2022);

Students who have mastered the EP of residency and successfully passed the state attestation are issued a state-recognized document on the qualification "Physician-surgeon-dentist", on the basis of the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 28, 2015 No. 39 "On approval of types and forms of documents on education of the state standard and Rules for their issuance", in accordance with subparagraph 6-3) of Article 5 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" dated July 27, 2007.

The quality of the implementation of the EP in the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" is the responsibility of the Dean's Office of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education, the Department of Surgical Dentistry. Ensuring the quality of the educational process in the residency is determined by the fulfillment of the mandatory requirements for the level of preparation of the State Compulsory Educational Standard 2022 and the creation of a system for monitoring the effectiveness of the teaching staff and the implementation of the IEP of the resident (open classes, intra-departmental control). Monitoring of the quality of the educational process is carried out by educational departments, members of the committee of educational programmes, the dean's office, and independent experts.

The transparency of the management of the EP is carried out through the discussion of educational and methodological documentation for the residency programme at a meeting of the department, CEP, AC and is approved by the vice-rector of the academic unit. The website of the "Dean's Office of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education" is functioning. KazNMU website is available through RSS zhanalyk, Twitter, Facebook, YouTube, VK, Izdeu, Zhanalyktar. The page of the dean's office's website provides information on residency educational programmes: information for applicants, class schedule, academic calendar, catalog of elective disciplines, etc.

## **8.2 Academic leadership**

The University annually reviews and approves the Academic Policy, which regulates in detail the rights, duties and responsibilities of residents and the administration of the University, the procedure for organizing the educational process. These Rules fix the officials responsible for the proper implementation of the Rules and the scope of their responsibility.

Management of the educational process is carried out in accordance with the organizational structure of KazNMU, approved by the Board of Directors No. 1 dated July 15, 2020.

The executive body of the University is the Rector Chairman of the Board.

Residency issues are under the supervision of the vice-rector of the academic block in terms of the educational process.

The direct management of residency programmes and the coordination of the activities of residents from the moment of the existence of the residency is carried out by the dean's office of postgraduate education. The main goal of the dean's office is to conduct continuous organizational, coordinating and administrative work aimed at achieving the mission and goals of the EP, including residency in an accredited educational programme. The activity of the dean's office of the faculty of postgraduate education is managed by the dean, who is appointed to the position by order of the rector. The general management of the dean's office is carried out by an elected representative body - the Faculty Council, which organizes its work under the leadership of the dean. The composition of the Council is approved by order of the vice-rector. The Dean's Council consists of the following positions: Dean of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education (Chairman of the Council); heads of departments, professors and associate professors of departments; stakeholder representatives (residents, employers). The dean's office is responsible for making the following decisions: the development and approval of the mission of the programmes, the rules for organizing the educational process in residency, recommendations for the recruitment of residents. The dean's office supervises residents, maintains relations with the practical healthcare sector and residency graduates, interacts with other structural units of the University involved in the implementation and support of residency programmes (DAD, DIT).

*When asked whether you are satisfied with the work of the department of postgraduate education, 75% of teachers answered that they are completely satisfied, 20.31% - partially, the rest - are not satisfied or doubt the answer. Also, 75% of teachers answered that the heads of the organization systematically listen to their opinion regarding issues on the educational process, research and development, clinical work, 14.29% not always and 10.71% left the question unanswered.*

## **8.3 Training budget and resource allocation**

The financial and economic policy of KazNMU and the management structure of the university are determined by the rector of the Chairman of the Board and the DEF.

Financing of the residency programme depends on the formation of the annual state order. Every year, the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan approves the state educational order for the training of specialists with higher and postgraduate education, in accordance with which the funding of bachelor's, master's, doctoral and residency programmes by type of educational institution is determined. In accordance with the order of Acting Minister of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 19, 2021 No. ҚР ДСМ-6 "On Approval of the Methodology for Forming the Cost of Education for Healthcare Education Programmes", a financial and economic calculation of the cost of training a resident within the framework of the state educational order, the rational use of funds allocated from the republican budget for training of specialists with medical and pharmaceutical education is carried out.



Ensuring the implementation of residency programmes consists of the salary fund of residency teachers, providing residents with educational resources (educational and scientific literature, access to the Internet and international information databases of literature, information and communication technologies), strengthening the programme through invited foreign teachers, academic mobility programmes and the possibility of participation of residents at international and republican conferences, seminars.

The financial activities of the university are also quarterly, annually reviewed at a meeting of the Supervisory Board. Accounting and preparation of financial statements is carried out in accordance with the National Financial Reporting Standard No. 2. Separate accounting for the implementation of the Plan of financial and economic activity is carried out in the context of state programmes and income from paid services.

To ensure effective planning for the implementation of the educational programme by the Department of Administrative and Personnel Work, the Department of Economics and Finance, the Department of Academic Affairs, the dean's office forms the staffing table (number of teaching hours, number of teachers), class schedule, etc. The Public Procurement and Analysis Department annually at the beginning of the academic year collects applications for the purchase of goods that support the implementation of the residency educational programme. The Department of Clinical Work supervises the conclusion of contracts with clinical bases, where the departments implementing residency programmes are located.

All departments that train residents are provided with an auditor fund. The commission for the purchase of educational and methodological literature at the end of the academic year forms an application for the purchase of the necessary literature for the implementation of the educational programme in the new academic year. The IT department ensures the uninterrupted functioning of the Internet and WIFI on the territory of the university, thereby guaranteeing the ability of residents to use electronic and library resources.

In order to ensure the efficient use of financial resources (including distribution), a budget commission has been established to review the results of the formation and use of financial resources.

#### **8.4 Administration and management**

When interviewing the AMP and teachers, EEC members noted that the University clearly defined the responsibility of the academic leadership in relation to the development and management of the educational programme. During an online conversation with focus groups, a response was received from the interviewers that the University periodically evaluates the academic leadership regarding the achievement of the mission and the final learning outcomes. Administration and management are implemented in accordance with international standards, regularly updated internal regulations in the field of healthcare and education, which ensures the increase of competence and the achievement of the final results of training in residency.

#### **8.5 Requirements and regulations**

The EEC established that KazNMU closely cooperates and fulfills all the requirements of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan on the organization of the educational process in residency, implements the EP in the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry" on the basis of the State Compulsory Educational Standard-2022 and coordinates with the priority areas of national legislative and policy documents.

*Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.* Compliant with 15 standards: fully -15.

*Standard 8: implemented*

*There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit.*

#### **Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

##### **Evidence of Compliance:**

The University, in order to continuously improve the postgraduate educational process, taking into account the needs of practical healthcare in the Republic of Kazakhstan, is constantly in the process of reform, regularly initiating a review and updating of processes.

At the same time, the review procedure is carried out at 3 levels and is accompanied by a documentation procedure:

- administration and management of the university, working groups for the examination and evaluation of curricula, methods of teaching and assessment, development and monitoring of the portfolio of residents, examination of the catalog of elective disciplines, audit of the QMS - 1 time per year, analysis is carried out for compliance with the fundamental concepts and criteria of the European Model of Excellence;

- internal audit (head of the department) based on the individual plan of the teacher, the individual plan of the resident, EEC (the annual plan is approved at the beginning of the academic year) - once a year, with a discussion at the meeting of the department and inclusion in the annual report of the department;

- feedback from residents and teachers - implemented through a questionnaire.

All areas of the university's activities are regulated by corporate documents (Procedures, Regulations, Instructions, Rules, Standard Operating Procedures, Methodological Recommendations, etc.).

Based on the analysis of the documented review, resources are allocated at all levels and an action plan is determined to update the postgraduate educational process and improve management.

The university has a QMS in order to monitor and obtain high-quality results in the training of specialists, the competence of a residency graduate in all specialties is constantly being modified.

To ensure the training of specialists, modern teaching technologies, interdisciplinary approaches in the development of disciplines and principles of evidence-based medicine have been introduced into the educational process.

To develop and improve clinical skills, simulation technologies have been introduced into the educational process at the Simulation Center.

The university is constantly working to update resources in accordance with the needs of the university and the needs of employers. The university develops the potential of the teaching staff, the policy of selection and admission of teaching staff, attracts highly qualified specialists in medical science and practical healthcare to train residents. In the future, the teaching staff continues continuous education in the clinical specialty and pedagogy. The equipment upgrade at the clinical bases is constantly updated and the clinical bases are equipped with modern equipment.

EEC members, after analyzing the submitted documents, the results of the survey of teaching staff and teachers and talking with the participants of the focus groups, came to the conclusion that the University, as a dynamic and socially responsible institution, initiates procedures for regular review and revision of the content, results, competence, assessment and educational environment.

***Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.*** Compliant with 1 standards: fully -1.

***Standard 9: implemented***

***There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit.***

## **CONCLUSION:**

When conducting an external evaluation of the educational programme in the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical Dentistry", it was found that out of **147 standards** (including basic standards - 91 and improvement standards - 56), 9 accreditation standards demonstrate full compliance, including 91 basic standards and 56 standards of improvements. 2 base standards and 4 improvement standards are partially met. No non-compliance with standards has been established. The implementation of improvement standards indicates the compliance of the educational organization with international consensus.

## **5. Recommendations for improving the educational programme in the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical dentistry":**

- 1) Develop quantitative indicators of R&D performance by residents (2.2.1.);



- 2) Increase the list of elective disciplines on an interdisciplinary basis (2.4.2.);
- 3) Involve a mentor with the appropriate qualifications for the implementation of the educational programme (5.1.1);
- 4) Increase the number of international clinical fellowships (5.2.4.);
- 5) Determine the place of clinical practice - a dental clinic in accordance with the specialty of the educational programme 7R01144 - "surgical dentistry" (6.2.1);
- 6) Expand the representation of stakeholders in advisory and collegiate bodies (7.4.2).

#### 6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

EEC members have established the compliance of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical dentistry" with Accreditation Standards and came to a unanimous decision to recommend to the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit this programme for a period of 5 years.

Commission members	Full name	Signature
Chairman	Kabildina Naila Amirbekovna	
Foreign expert	Katrova Lidia Georgievna	
Academic Expert	Aldabergenova Taurzhan Kalibekovna	
Academic Expert	Sultanova Gulnar Dostanovna	
Academic Expert	Maukayeva Saule Boranbaevna	
Academic Expert	Shabdarbayeva Daria Muratovna	
Employers' representative	Vovk Victor Evgenievich	
Resident's representative	Abylgazieva Aidana Bakytzhanovna	

**Attachment 1.**

**Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme  
(generalization)**

Standard	Criteria for evaluation	Number of standards	Basic standards */ Standards Improvements	Evaluation		
				Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Not compliant
1.	MISSION AND OUTCOMES	17	10/7	17		
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	30	22/8	28	2	
3.	RESIDENTS ASSESSMENT	11	7/4	11		
4.	RESIDENTS	30	18/12	30		
5.	ACADEMIC STAFF/TEACHERS	7	5/2	5	2	
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	21	10/11	20	1	
7.	EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	15	10/5	14	1	
8.	MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION	15	8/7	15		
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	1	1/0	1		
		147	91/56	141	6	
				147		

**List of documents reviewed by EEC members as part of an external evaluation of residency educational programme**

<b>№</b>	<b>Document names</b>	<b>Quantity</b>
1.	Regulations on mentoring	1
2.	Regulations on supervision	1
3.	Qualitative and quantitative indicator of the department	1
4.	syllabuses	6
5.	Minutes of the meeting of the department, where there is a discussion of the progress and attendance of the resident of the department of surgical dentistry	1
6.	Minutes of the CEP on the discussion of the catalog of elective disciplines	1
7.	Certificates of advanced training for mentors in pedagogical competencies	1
8.	Memo on the pedagogical training of mentors	1
9.	Contracts with clinical bases of the Department of Surgical Dentistry	2
10.	Regulations on teaching load	1
11.	Book availability in electives and disciplines of residents of the Department of Surgical Dentistry	1
12.	Minutes of the discussion of changes in the educational programme of residency in the specialty "Surgical Dentistry" in connection with the State Compulsory Educational Standard 2022	1
13.	Organizational structure of Non-profit JSC "KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov"	1
14.	Composition of the CEP of School of Dentistry	1
15.	Regulations on educational programmes	1
16.	Ethics of the teaching staff	1
17.	Policy and quality objectives of Non-profit JSC "KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov" for 2021-2023	1
18.	Working curricula of the educational programme	1
19.	Work plan of the Department of Surgical Dentistry	1
20.	Proposals for placing a state educational order for training in residency for the 2022-2023 academic year of Non-profit JSC "KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov"	1
21.	Letter of application for participation in the competition of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan in clinical specialties of residency	1
22.	Extract from the minutes of the Meeting of the committee on academic activities of KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov "On approval of the updated EP and working curricula for undergraduate, internship, residency, master's, doctoral studies"	1
23.	CEP protocol in the specialty "Dentistry" Discussion of projects of educational programmes	1
24.	External review of the educational programme of residency 7R01144 - "Surgical dentistry" of Non-profit JSC "Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov"	1
25.	Practical Skills Assessment Checklists	9
26.	Learning outcomes, teaching methods and assessment of residency educational programme in the specialty 7R01144 - "Surgical dentistry"	1
27.	Statement of admission rating evaluation (ARE)	1
28.	Sirius magazine with grades	2

29.	The amount of tuition fees for educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education for 2022-2023, 2023-2024	1
30.	Regulations on the provision of social assistance to students	1
31.	Minutes of the round table with employers “Discussion of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01144 – Surgical Dentistry”	1
32.	Regulations on the department	1
33.	Job descriptions of the head of the department	1
34.	Job descriptions of the professor of the department	1
35.	Job descriptions of the associate professor of the department	1
36.	Job descriptions of assistant of the department	1
37.	Regulations on the Quality Council	1
38.	Quality guide	1

ECAQA