

To the Accreditation Council of the
Eurasian Centre for Accreditation
and Quality Assurance
of Education and Health Care
14.06.2024

**REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION
ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL
PROGRAMME
IN THE SPECIALTY: 7M10102 - "MEDICINE" OF THE
NEI "KAZAKHSTAN-RUSSIAN MEDICAL UNIVERSITY"
ON COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS FOR ACCREDITATION OF
EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMEMES OF MASTER'S SPECIALTIES IN
HEALTHCARE**

**Period of external expert evaluation:
from 03.06 to 05.06.2024**

Almaty, 2024

CONTENTS

	List of designations and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	4
2.1	Presentation of the educational programme of the master's degree in the specialty: 7M10102 - "Medicine"	4
2.2	Information on the previous accreditation	6
2.3	Brief characteristics of the results of the analysis of the report on the self-assessment of the educational programme of the master's degree in the specialty: 7M10102 - "Medicine" for compliance with the Standards for accreditation of educational programmes of master's degree specialties in health care and conclusions on completeness	6
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	7
4.	Analysis for compliance with standards for accreditation based on the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme of the master's degree in the specialty: 7M10102 - "Medicine"	8
5.	Recommendations for improving the educational programme of the master's degree in the specialty: 7M10102 - "Medicine"	42
6.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council for accreditation	42
	Annex 1. Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation and the educational programme of the master's degree in the specialty: 7M10102 - "Medicine"	43
	Annex 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	44

LIST OF DESIGNATIONS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Designation
AC	Academic Council
AMP	Administrative and managerial personnel
BD	Basic disciplines
EEK	External expert commission
WFME	World Federation of Medical Education
SCES	State compulsory educational standards
ECAQA	Eurasian centre for accreditation and quality assurance in education and health care
FAC	Final attestation commission
IWP	Individual work plan
IEP	Individual educational plan
CIS	Control measuring tools
CEP	Committee of educational programmes
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
LEC	Local ethics commission
MSHE RK	Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES RK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MTB	Material and technical base
RW	Research work
RWMS	Research work of a master's student
NCC	Scientific and clinical council
LSI	Laws and Statutory Instruments
NEI	Non-governmental educational institution
OHPE	organization of higher and postgraduate education
EP	Educational programme
Academic staff	Academic staff
PHC	Primary health care
PD	Profiling disciplines
WC	Working curriculum
IWMT	Independent work of a master's student with a teacher
ECC	Educational and clinical center
SC	Scientific council
ERWM	Experimental research work of a master's student

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with the order of the ECAQA No. 20 dated 27.05.2024, the External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the educational programme of the master's degree in the specialty 7M10102 - "Medicine" in the period from 03.06.2024 to 05.06.2024 in the following composition:

№	Status in the EEC	Full name	Academic degree/title, position, place of work/place of study, year, specialty
1	Chairman	Shamsutdinova Alfiya Gumarovna	MD, MSc, BA, Fogarty Fellow, Head of the Department of Science, Deputy Director of the Research Institute of Fundamental and Applied Medicine named after B. Atchabarov, President of the Association of Bioethics and Medical Law, Doctor of the Highest Category in Public Health.
2	International Expert	Lilian Shaptefratsi	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor. Head of the Department of Histology, Cytology and Embryology of the State University of Medicine and Pharmacy named after Nicolae Testemitanu, Republic of Moldova. Director of the School of Doctoral Students in Medical Sciences.
3	Academic Expert	Abdrakhmanova Aliya Zhanalykovna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Breast Tumour Centre of JSC "Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology", Specialist in Plastic Surgery.
4	Academic Expert	Serikova-Yesengeldina Dinara Serikovna	PhD, Senior Lecturer, Head of the Department of Public Health of the Semey Medical University.
5	Employer Expert	Amangeldi Diana Yerbolkyzy	General Practitioner of "Audio-Fon" LLP, Senior Lecturer of the Department of Clinical Disciplines of the Al-Farabi Kazakh National University.
6	Student Expert	Sarzhigitova Kuralai Shokankyzy	First-year master's student in the specialty "Public Health" of the Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov.

Observer from the ECAQA is Amandykov Alibek Begendikovich, Head of the International Cooperation and Public Relations Department, non-profit institution "Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Health Care".

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulation on the EEC.

The EEC report includes a description of the results and the conclusion of the external evaluation of the educational programme of the master's degree 7M10102 - "Medicine" for compliance with the Standards for accreditation of educational programmes of master's degree specialties in health care and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Standards for accreditation), recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above-mentioned educational programme and recommendations for the Accreditation Council of the ECAQA for accreditation.

2. General part of the final report

2.1 Presentation of the educational programme of the master's degree in the specialty 7M10102 - "Medicine"

Name of the organization, legal form of ownership, BIN	NEI "Kazakh-Russian Medical University", private, BIN - 970 240 002 300
Managing body	General meeting of participants
Full name of the first director	Dzhainakbayev Nurlan Temirbekovich
Date of the university foundation	July 08, 1992
Location and contact details	Almaty, Abylai Khan Ave. 51/53, +7 (727) 250 83 75 info@medkrmu.kz
State license for educational activities in master's programs (date, number)	State license No. 0137388, application for master's degree on February 15, 2018
Inclusion in the Register of educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education of the National Centre for Higher Education Development of the Ministry of Higher Education and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan	Date of inclusion in the Register - 05/23/2020
Year of the beginning of the implementation of the accredited educational programme (EP)	2018
Duration of study	2 years
Total number of graduates since the beginning of the EP	29
Number of master's students in the EP since the beginning of the current academic year	12
Full-time teachers/part-time workers involved in the implementation of the EP, incl. % of sedateness	Total number of teachers - 20, including full-time - 17, part-time - 3 Sedateness, % - 89.47% Categorization, % - 85%
Website Instagram Facebook with active	https://krmu.edu.kz/ https://www.instagram.com/medkrmu?igsh=MXBvb2R3dHUwczltbQ==

NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" (hereinafter referred to as the University) was established in 1992 as the "Kazakhstan Medical Institute", in 2010 it was reorganized and renamed into NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" (certificate of state re-registration No. 9833-1910-U-e dated May 4, 2010; license for educational activities AB No. 0137388, issued by the Committee for Control in the Sphere of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated June 2, 2010). In 2024, the University changed its legal address (certificate of state re-registration No. 101000040043139 dated 02/27/2024).

The University is a medical educational organization with a private form of ownership, which has the necessary material and technical and scientific and educational base, highly qualified teaching and scientific personnel. The University trains specialists on the basis of existing state licenses at the levels of higher and postgraduate education in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The University is managed through collegial bodies: the Academic Council (AC), the Scientific and Clinical Council (SCC), the Local Ethics Commission (LEC). The University develops its activities through the Strategic Development Plan of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" (long-term) <https://krmu.edu.kz/dokumenty-universiteta-2/> and the Tactical Plan for the implementation of the strategy.

The educational programme 7M10102 - "Medicine" was compiled based on a study of the needs of practical healthcare for specialists and their level of training, in agreement with stakeholders: practical healthcare specialists, discussed and approved at meetings of the Educational programmes Committee (minutes No. 5 of 06/18/2019), the Academic Council (minutes No. 6 of 06/27/2019), the Academic Council (minutes No. 11-1 of 07/24/2019), which include representatives of all stakeholders.

The number of students in the master's degree educational programme (6M110100 and 7M10102 - "Medicine") for 5 years since 2019 was 32 people, of which 25 master's students were admitted by state order and 7 - on a fee-paying basis. Tuition is 850 thousand tenge per year. Currently, 7 people are studying in the Master's program 7M10102 - Medicine (2022-2024 years of study) and 7 Master's students studying in 2023-2025.

Over the entire period of implementation of the accredited program, 2 Master's students were expelled of their own free will, 2 people were expelled due to moving to another city, 1 Master's student was expelled due to failure to master the established volume of academic credits of the educational programme, 1 Master's student - for failure to comply with the terms of the agreement on the provision of educational services (refusal to repeat a year of study).

17 faculty members are involved in training Master's students in the 2023-2024 academic year, their degree completion rate is 94.1%. From 2019 to 2023, 10 people of the University were awarded departmental awards of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The training of students in EP 7M10102 - "Medicine" is conducted in the state and Russian languages. The form of study is full-time, daytime.

The main applied scientific direction of the university is the development of innovations for implementation in practical healthcare, including the development of mobile medicine for the rural population.

2.2 Information about previous accreditation

In 2019, the University was accredited for specialized self-assessment of educational programmes 6M110100 - "Medicine" and 6M110200 - "Public Health" by the Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Health Care (certificate of specialized accreditation dated 05/24/2019 No SA00011 and No SA00012, valid from 05/24/2019 to 05/23/2024) <https://enic-kazakhstan.edu.kz/ru/accreditation/akkreditovannye-programmy-magistratury-1> .

In 2024, the University was accredited as a subject of scientific and scientific-technical activities (accreditation certificate No. 000494 dated February 28, 2024).

2.3 Brief description of the results of the analysis of the self-assessment report of the educational programme in the specialty: 7M10102 - "Medicine" for compliance with the Standards for accreditation of educational programmes of master's degree specialties in health care and conclusions on the completeness

The self-assessment report of the educational programme of the master's degree 7M10102 - "Medicine" (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 95 pages of the main text, annexes on 63 pages, electronic versions of 88 documents (according to standard 1 - 21 documents, according to standard 2 - 18, according to standard 3 - 14, according to standard 4 - 12, according to standard 5 - 17, according to standard 6 - 6, according to standard 7 - 1, according to standard 8 - 16 documents; some of them are repeated), located at the link <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1vCvX-79eCdIvezwhoB9-7mXuSb8YFWxi?usp=sharing>

The report is characterized by completeness of answers to all 9 main standards for accreditation and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for conducting self-assessment of the educational programme, provided to the educational organization by the accreditation centre - ECAQA, as well as internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by the rector Dzhainakbaev Nurlan Temirbekovich, who confirms the reliability of the quantitative information and data included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 16 members of the internal self-assessment commission indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting self-assessment of the educational programme - Zhanat Amandykovna Liang, Head of the Audit and Strategic Development Department (+7 705 314 3345, e-mail: zh.lyan@medkrmu).

Self-assessment of the educational programme 7M10102 - "Medicine" of the NEI "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" was carried out on the basis of order No. 26-02-40-Н/К dated 04/23/2024 "On preparation for accreditation and organization of the process of self-assessment of educational programmes".

All standards provide the University's real practice of training master's students in the specialty 7M10102 - "Medicine" taking into account the start of admission of students in 2019; substantiated data, examples of the implementation of the objectives of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of standards for accreditation. The description in the self-assessment report is quite complete and up-to-date in terms of the number of master's students, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, training results, knowledge and skills assessment results, educational resources and practical training environment, practice bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations), financial information, plans for the development and improvement of master's students' training and the timeliness of completing the dissertation research.

The report is presented to the ECAQA in a completed form, written in literate language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, and described in accordance with the criteria of the standards, tables and figures contain references in the text and have continuous numbering.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure - external evaluation. The experts validated the report data, compared the information from the report with the information obtained during a visit to the educational organization, i.e. verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

3. Description of the external expert evaluation

The external expert work within the framework of the evaluation of the educational programme 7M10102 - "Medicine" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programmes of the ECAQA and according to the program approved on 27.05.2024 by the Director General of the ECAQA Sarsenbaeva S.S. and agreed with the

Rector of the NEI "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" (hereinafter referred to as the University) Dzhainakbayev Nurlan Temirbekovich. Dates of the visit to the organization: June 03 - June 05, 2024.

The external evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying the indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of standards for accreditation.

The sequence of the visit over 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Program (hereinafter referred to as the program), which is in the documentation of the accreditation centre. The program is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of the external expert evaluation.

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- interviews with management and administrative staff – 23 people;
- interviews with graduate students – 24 people.
- study of the website <http://medkrmu.kz/en/>
- interviews with 17 employees, 16 teachers, 7 scientific supervisors;
- questionnaires of teachers and graduate students – 12 and 24, respectively;
- review of resources in the context of fulfilling standards for accreditation: 2 clinical training and scientific research bases were visited, including 1) MSE on the REM “Almaty Regional Multidisciplinary Clinic”, Roza Baglanovaya str., 69, 2) MSE on the REM “Mental Health Center”, Abish Kikelbayuly str., 117
- study of regulatory, educational, methodological and reporting documents in the amount of 133 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (the list of documents examined is in Annex 2).

The staff of the accredited organization ensured the presence of all persons specified in the visit program and in the lists of interview sites and conversations (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, and conversations with members of the EEC

№	Position	Quantity
1	Rector	1
2	Vice-Rector	4
3	Heads of structural divisions	8
4	Specialists of structural divisions	4
5	Scientific supervisors	7
6	Teachers	16
7	Master's students	24
8	Representatives of practical health care	6
9	Master's graduates	10

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of the EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, examination of documents, interview results, and questionnaires was held. The EEC members began drafting the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the external evaluation results were made. The experts individually filled out the "Profile of quality and compliance with the criteria of external evaluation of the educational programme 7M10102 - "Medicine" for compliance with the ECAQA Standards for accreditation". Recommendations were given for three standards (standards 2, 8 and 9). Recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed and the chairperson A.G. Shamsutdinova held a final open vote on the recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for the accreditation period.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC; access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the university, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to the ECAQA Accreditation Council members. The work of the EEC was carried out in strict accordance with the visit program. Thanks to effective time management, all planned meetings and visits were successfully held, which allowed the planned program to be fully implemented. The coordinated and professional work of the commission and university representatives contributed to the achievement of all set goals.

While conducting a survey of graduate students, 88.5% rated the work of the External Expert Commission on Accreditation as positive, 3.8% as satisfactory, 7.7% answered that they doubted the answer. The majority of respondents (92.3%) believe that it is necessary to accredit an educational organization or educational programmes.

According to 91.7% of teachers, the survey conducted by the ECAQA is useful for developing recommendations for improving key areas of activity of the accredited educational organization.

At the end of the visit program, the chairman of the EEC announced recommendations for the management and employees of the educational organization based on the results of the external evaluation as part of the specialized accreditation.

3. Analysis of compliance with standards for accreditation based on the results of external evaluation of the educational programme of the master's degree 7M10102 - "Medicine"

Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES

1.1 Statement of the mission, goals and end results of training

The University has formulated the mission and goal of the educational programme, which includes increasing the scientific and pedagogical potential of national health care personnel, developing the competencies and personality of a new generation of specialists who think creatively, professionally implement knowledge and skills, and are competitive in the global community. This

formulation is presented in an accessible form for graduate students and employers and ensures the attractiveness of the educational programme.

During the implementation of the program activities, namely, following the interview with the first head of the organization, members of the Academic Council and the Academic Council, in an interview with teachers, compliance with the criteria of **standard 1.1** was established, since the final learning outcomes contain both theoretical knowledge and the formation of analytical thinking (through the discipline "Methodology and methodology of scientific research"), communication skills (through the discipline and "Psychology of Management"). The educational programme formulates the goals of developing practical skills through mastering such disciplines as "Methodology and methodology of scientific research", "Pedagogy of higher education", "Clinical epidemiology and evidence-based medicine".

The University applies ethical approaches in training master's students. The experts familiarized themselves with the Code of Ethics for Students and Teachers (approved at the meeting of the Academic Council No. 4 dated November 26, 2021). During a conversation with 24 master's students, the experts were convinced that they know about this document and apply it in their studies and communication with teachers and colleagues.

1.2 Participation in formulating the mission and final learning outcomes

All participants in the educational process know the mission of the educational programme, took part in the formation of proposals for formulating the mission (p. 1.2), Educational programme 7M10102 - "Medicine", including its mission, was developed taking into account the needs of practical healthcare for qualified specialists and their level of training. The program was agreed upon with stakeholders, including practical healthcare specialists, and discussed at meetings of the Educational programmes Committee (minutes No. 5 of 18.06.2019), the Academic Council (minutes No. 6 of 27.06.2019) and the Academic Council (minutes No. 11-1 of 24.07.2019), which include representatives of all stakeholders. Every year, the university management organizes meetings with representatives of medical organizations as part of a job fair. At these meetings, issues of graduate training quality are discussed, proposals for improving the strategy and tactics of student training are developed, and both the strengths and weaknesses of the university's activities are noted. This allows for the timely development and implementation of measures to eliminate identified deficiencies.

The experts found that the mission of the educational programme is communicated to master's degree applicants, master's students, and employers through the website, social networks, and information letters to medical organizations. From interviews with master's students, it was found that before classes, teachers inform about the mission and work plans of the university, and also tell where to get the necessary information about the educational programme, teachers, and training bases.

During their visits to the University's departments, the experts noted the strengths of the accredited educational programme, including:

- High quality of the educational programme content that meets the needs of practical healthcare.
- Orientation of the educational programme to employers' expectations and labour market needs.
- Use of modern educational technologies and methods.
- Attracting qualified teachers with practical experience.
- Availability of an effective system for monitoring and evaluating the quality of education.

The University has departments that are directly related to the educational programme of the Master's degree 7M10102 - "Medicine", which can be noted as the best practice in education, namely:

- The Department of Master's and Residency, which provides administrative support (organization and coordination of the educational process, assistance in registering for courses and modules, ensuring the timely execution of all necessary documents), academic support (consulting master's students on the curriculum and requirements for completing educational and scientific assignments, coordinating the interaction of students with teachers and academic supervisors, support in choosing a scientific direction and topic of the master's thesis), ensuring interaction with clinical bases.

- The Centre for Simulation Training, which provides students with the opportunity to practice practical skills on modern simulators, which increases the level of preparation for real clinical practice.
- The Career and Employment Centre, which helps master's students to find suitable internships and jobs, providing them with support in building a professional career.
- The International Cooperation Centre, which coordinates exchange and internship programs abroad, expanding opportunities for students to gain international experience.

During visits to these departments and interviews with their employees, experts noted a high commitment to the accredited program, support for master's students and personalized support for each master's student, as well as an attentive attitude to the suggestions and comments of master's students, aimed at continuously improving the educational programme. For example, master's students noted that they needed to update their knowledge of biostatistics, which they studied in their undergraduate studies. Following their requests, information on biostatistical methods was added to the discipline "Methodology and Methodology of Scientific Research".

During interviews with master's students and employers, experts received answers to the following questions: "Do you participate in formulating the mission and goals of the organization, educational programme?", "What is the personal contribution of master's students to improving the educational programme?" To these questions, the master's students answered that they actively participate in discussions and provide their suggestions for improving the educational process, and also participate in surveys and questionnaires aimed at collecting feedback. Employers responded as follows: they periodically provide their recommendations and expectations, participate in the development and adjustment of the educational programme, and also note the importance of the opinions of master's students in the process of improving the program.

1.3 Institutional autonomy and academic freedom

To verify **Standard 1.3** a meeting was held with the rector of the university Dzhanakbaev Nurlan Temirbekovich and the vice-rector for scientific and clinical work Seidalin Arystan Oskarovich. During the conversation, the experts asked the following questions: *"What freedom does the university provide in relation to the development of the educational programme? What resources are needed to implement the educational programme and how are they distributed? How does the university control the quality of the developed educational programmes?"*. During the answers, the rector and vice-rector confirmed that the university has autonomy in developing educational programmes, including the master's program in the specialty 7M10102 - "Medicine". The responsibility of the administration and the teaching staff in drawing up the educational programme is ensured through the procedure for reviewing and approving these programs: by the Educational programmes Committee (minutes No. 5 of 18.06.2019), the Academic Council (minutes No. 6 of 27.06.2019), the Academic Council (minutes No. 11-1 of 24.07.2019), which include representatives of all interested parties.

The elective components were developed taking into account the opinions of graduate students and representatives of practical healthcare. For example, the elective on the topic "Marketing of medical services in healthcare" was developed in connection with the need to increase competitiveness and quality of service, efficient resource management, development and implementation of new services, increasing patient loyalty, increasing income, adapting to changes in the market, as well as for the development of leadership skills and strategic thinking.

While choosing a base for practical training, master's students select those that are related to the topic of the master's thesis and the area of activity of the master's students. Thus, during the visit, the experts visited the MSE on the REM "Almaty Regional Multidisciplinary Clinic", Rozy Baglanovoy str., 69, where the scientific consultant Yesentayeva Suriya Yertugyrova supervises the work of master's students in the specialty "Oncology", and also visited the MSE on the REM "Mental Health Centre", Abish Kikelbayuly str., 117, where the scientific consultant Yeshimbetova Saida Zakirovna works with master's students in the specialty "Psychiatry". Master's students are provided with all the

necessary resources for preparing a dissertation (library, access to international databases - see more in Section 6.) There are the necessary Academic staff of 24 people in order to maintain the ratio - teacher: master's student, as 1:3.

1.4 Name and description of the programme

The results of the documentation study demonstrate that the mission of the organization and the mission of the educational programme 7M10102- "Medicine" correspond to international standards, which confirms the high quality of the educational process, promotes the recognition of diplomas and ensures graduates' competitiveness in the labour market.

The educational process is built in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard and current LSI in postgraduate education and healthcare. The educational programme, including the mission of the educational programme 7M10102 - "Medicine", was compiled based on a study of the needs of practical healthcare for specialists and their level of training, in agreement with stakeholders: practical healthcare specialists, discussed and approved at meetings of the Committee of Educational programmes (minutes No. 5 of 06/18/2019), the Academic Council (minutes No. 6 of 06/27/2019), the Academic Council (minutes No. 11-1 of 07/24/2019), which include representatives of all stakeholders.

The experts studied 133 pieces of documentation, including those directly related to the accredited master's program.

To implement the educational programme in the specialty 7M10102 - "Medicine" in the organization's documents there are teaching and methodological complexes, which define the goal, take into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, independent work. Conformity with the State Compulsory Educational Standard and standard requirements is established.

Information on teaching methods in the master's program is provided. Particular attention is paid to the use of innovative interactive teaching methods focused on practical activities, such as case studies, problem-oriented learning, team learning, business and role-playing games, the "brainstorming" method, group discussions, combined surveys, training in small groups and presentations. The list of teaching methods is described on the website www.medkrmu.kz. The University has developed a multi-level system for approving and implementing these methods, which is confirmed by implementation acts. The policy for assessing students' academic achievements is formulated and presented in the Academic Policy of the NEI "KRMU" <https://krmu.edu.kz/wp-content/uploads/2023/08/r-01-17-14-akad.politika-31.08.2022-s-izm.-ot-23.11.22-24.02.23.pdf>, in the Regulation on the current monitoring of academic performance, midterm and end-of-course assessment of students <https://krmu.edu.kz/ru/pravila-provedeniya-tekushhego-kontrolya-promezhutochnoj-i-itogovoj-attestaczii-obuchayushhihsya/>. The documents of master's students are accepted by the Admissions Committee appointed by the order of the rector. Admission of persons entering the University is carried out by placing a state educational order for the training of personnel in scientific, pedagogical and specialized areas, as well as payment for tuition at the expense of the students' own funds and other sources. The University also accepts students for master's programs under an intra-university grant <https://krmu.edu.kz/wp-content/uploads/2023/06/pr-03-13-12-pravila-prisuzhdeniya-vnutrivuzovskogo-obr.granta.pdf>. The tuition fee is 850,000 tenge per year.

A master's student who disagrees with the results of the end-of-course assessment has the right to appeal. To consider appeals, the Rector of the University issues an order to create an appeals commission, which includes teachers whose qualifications correspond to the profile of the contested disciplines.

The procedure for filing complaints and applications from master's students is currently being developed based on the latest recommendations received at the seminar on anti-corruption policy, and will be included in the "Rules for the Admission of Master's Students".

The rights and obligations of master's students are spelled out in the Academic Policy of the University <https://krmu.edu.kz/wp-content/uploads/2022/11/r-01-17-14-akademicheskaya-politika-ot-31.08.2022-4-izd.pdf>

The objectives and requirements for the design of the dissertation are described in detail in MU - 03-58-08 / on the implementation of the final work (master's dissertation). https://krmu.edu.kz/wp-content/uploads/2020/03/MU-03-58-08-MU-po-oformleniyu-diplom.proekta-i-magist.dissertatsii_2-ya-CHAST-1.pdf

Experts have established that the principles of academic honesty and anti-plagiarism are fully implemented in the educational organization. This is reflected in the document <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1Y8ItIjy0ZLYGFCgUpvDEdAH6KkSbmD69>. Academic honesty is applicable at such stages of training of master's students as tests, essays, dissertations. In case of violation of the Rules of Academic Honesty, disciplinary sanctions are applied to participants in the educational process, in accordance with the Code of Academic Honesty, approved by the minutes of the Academic Council dated 04/27/2019 No. 9. The procedure for informing master's students about their rights and responsibilities is reflected in the Academic Policy.

The master's student support system is assigned to the student service centre, which is at the formation stage; it is planned to develop an SOP for the student support system, including master's students.

The conditions for the selection and enrolment of a master's student are contained in the document "Rules for Admission to the Master's Program", approved in PR-03-13-05 dated 19.08.2021 (with additions and amendments as of 12.08.2022).

The experts were familiar with the approved Policy for Ensuring the Quality of Education (minutes No. 1 dated 27.08.2021).

During a visit to the university and during an interview with employees: Seidalin Arystan Oskarovich, Vice-Rector for Scientific and Clinical Work; Kusainova Arman Sailavbekovna, Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs; Sovostyanova Tatyana Anatolyevna, Vice-Rector for Educational Work; Vdovtsev Aleksandr Viktorovich, Vice-Rector for Digital Development; Heads of structural divisions: Liang Zhanat Amandykovna, Head of the Audit and Strategic Development Department; Orakbay Lyazzat Zhadigerovna, Head of the Residency Department; Orazaeva Flyura Ganievna, Head of the Master's and Doctoral Studies Department; Nurgalieva Kadisha Kaliaskarovna, Head of the Educational and Methodological Work Department; The EEC was convinced that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and staff, and includes such documents as annual operational plans, annual reports, departmental regulations, agreements with teachers and graduate students, and educational and methodological documentation (work program, working curricula, syllabuses, journals), assessment tools (checklists, statements), certificates, and ID cards.

A review of the website showed that its pages contain the sections "Educational programmes", "Procedure for Admission to the Master's Program" necessary for graduate students, where the admission procedure is explained in detail and step by step, and a list of required documents is provided. This information is updated regularly. The site is currently being reconstructed, but all the necessary information is available on both the old and new versions of the university's website: <https://new.krmu.edu.kz/>

The strategic plan for the development of the university for a period of 5 years from 2019-2025, including 9 areas, including the direction for the development of postgraduate education, which describes the development of the university's research potential and the integration of science with the clinic.

The Strategic Development Plan of the NEI "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" (long-term) is posted at <https://krmu.edu.kz/dokumenty-universiteta-2> and the Tactical Plan for the implementation of the strategy (academic year) was discussed and approved at a meeting of the Academic Council of the University (dated December 26, 2019, protocol No. 5) with the participation of stakeholders.

According to experts, all of the above confirms the implementation of the Standards for accreditation and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the university.

While conducting a survey of 24 master's students (on the resource <https://webanketa.com/>), out of 39 questions, a number were devoted to the quality of the educational process and the

educational programme. It was found that 88.5% of master's students will recommend studying at the university to their acquaintances, friends, relatives. And 84.6% of respondents believe that the heads of the educational programme and teachers are aware of the problems of students related to training. To the question "Do you think the university allows you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in your chosen specialty?", 96.2% of master's degree students answered positively, 3.8% could not yet answer this question.

The 12 teachers surveyed (23 questions in the questionnaire) also answered that 91.7% are satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace at the university, and 8.3% partially agree with this statement. The experts determined that the university has a healthy microclimate, since the head is quite accessible to master's degree students and employees, responds promptly to applications/requests. According to 91.7% of respondents, they have the opportunity to realize themselves as professionals in their specialty. Teaching experience of over 10 years is 100% of the Academic staff.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Comply with 5 basic standards: fully - 5, partially - 0, do not comply - 0.

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME

2.1 Methods of learning and teaching

For the effective implementation of the master's degree program in the specialty 7M10102 - "Medicine" in the departments of "Public Health", "Hygiene and Epidemiology", "Information and Communication Technologies", "Language Disciplines", "History of Kazakhstan and Social and Humanitarian Disciplines" the following teaching methods are used: theoretical part of training - lecture/video lecture (review and illustrative, problem-based), conversation, discussion, writing a literature review, article, case-based learning (CBL), including analysis of specific situations (ACS or case study); team-oriented learning (TBL), creative tasks (video films, crosswords, quizzes, etc.); use of problem and situational tasks in practical classes; e-learning, distance learning technologies (web technologies) on the university's information educational platforms (Moodle, AIS Platonus), etc.

Practical classes: oral survey, work in small groups, testing, discussions, presentations, feedback, work with medical literature, searching for information on the Internet, discussing the results of individual and group assignments. The practical part of the training is conducting scientific research, professional practice (pedagogical, research).

Both classical and innovative forms of lectures and seminars are used in educational practice. Lectures are provided in a brief form, with subsequent clarification and expansion of the material at seminars. Various methods of encouraging educational activity are also used, with an emphasis on active forms of learning and the organization of independent work of graduate students. This contributes to the development of their independence in presenting and defending their views, making decisions and forms teamwork skills.

The University organizes training for Master's students in the educational and clinical centre, as well as in the mobile medical complex, where they form and develop such practical skills as the ability to analyse symptoms, make a diagnosis and develop a treatment plan, perform procedures and manipulations necessary for diagnosis and treatment, make informed decisions in complex clinical situations, effectively communicate with patients, their families and colleagues. Master's students participate in the provision of medical care to patients with various diseases, collect prospective and retrospective information about patients, and conduct research at the university's clinical bases in order to complete the writing of their dissertation.

Considering that the dates of the EEC visit coincided with the Master's students conducting research work, the program of the EEC visit did not include attending their practical classes.

The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational programme, since the experts studied the Code of Ethics (approved at the SC on

November 26, 2021, protocol No. 4) and during the interview, the Master's students responded that they were informed about the content of this document.

In a conversation with master's degree students, the experts saw that the university promotes the development of their practical competencies by providing opportunities to participate in clinical internships, simulation trainings and practical classes, as well as organizing cooperation with medical institutions to gain real work experience. At the same time, master's degree students deepen their theoretical knowledge and develop communication skills.

The training of master's degree students in the specialty 7M10102 - "Medicine" is aimed at meeting the needs of practical healthcare, since when analysing the shortage of specialists for 2023, a significant number of vacancies were identified in clinical and therapeutic areas. Therefore, the university provides a number of opportunities and conditions for qualified training of specialists in various medical fields. Thus, during a conversation with Aumoldayeva Zaure Maratovna, head of the educational and clinical centre, and Rakhalskaya Natalya Nikolaevna, head of the department of professional practice and clinical work, the experts received the following information: the university actively cooperates with leading medical institutions, organizes regular practical classes and internships, and offers programs for exchanging experience with international colleagues. Also, the university teachers confirmed that the training of master's students is carried out in accordance with international standards and includes the use of innovative educational technologies. Master's students in this specialty can supervise patients with diseases such as cardiovascular pathologies, chronic lung diseases, diabetes, infectious diseases and many others.

Of the 24 surveyed master's students, 88.5% answered that teachers use active and interactive teaching methods in classes quite often, 7.7% believe that sometimes, and 3.8% answered that they have never used them.

2.2 Development of academic skills

Experts received evidence that the educational programme develops academic skills in master's degree students, including independent thinking, analytical skills, critical thinking, and decision-making skills. During the interview with master's degree students, experts came to the conclusion that master's degree students reason competently, are capable of critical perception of information, and have the communication skills necessary for a scientist-teacher-healthcare specialist. For example, the experts asked the following questions: "What modern diagnostic and treatment methods have you used in your practice?" and "How do you evaluate the effectiveness of an interdisciplinary approach in treating patients with chronic diseases?" The master's students answered: "We actively use innovative diagnostic technologies, such as PCR and ELISA tests, as well as modern visualization methods, including MRI and CT. For treatment, we use the latest pharmacological drugs and minimally invasive surgical interventions" and "An interdisciplinary approach allows us to take into account all aspects of the patient's health, which significantly improves the quality of treatment and rehabilitation. Teamwork of specialists from different fields helps to comprehensively approach the treatment of complex cases."

The experts familiarized themselves with the individual work plan of master's students (IWPM) Em I.V., Rakhimbaeva M.Zh., second-year master's students, which contains information on completed scientific research, clinical practice, attendance at specialized seminars and conferences, publications in scientific journals, as well as intermediate and final training results and planned projects.

The IPRM structure was developed and approved by the rector's order No. 195a dated August 25, 2018 "On approval of the rules for organizing the educational process in the master's program".

Teachers provide master's students with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, with which 84.6% of the surveyed master's students are completely satisfied, 7.7% are partially satisfied, 7.7% are unsure about the answer.

2.3 Program content, scope

To implement the educational programme of the master's degree in the specialty 7M10102 - "Medicine", the organization's documents contain teaching and methodological documents that define the goal, take into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, and provide for independent work. Compliance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard and standard requirements has been established, including requirements for the quality of educational services, accreditation criteria, the required number of hours for mastering disciplines, as well as the inclusion of interdisciplinary links and the use of modern educational technologies.

There are documents that set out the requirements for the content of educational programmes, including curricula, methodological recommendations and standards for accreditation. The university management and the Academic Council are responsible for the selection and implementation of innovations in the educational process.

Each topic of the master's program includes: theoretical training, including the study of cycles of basic (history and philosophy of science, foreign language (professional), pedagogy of higher education, psychology of management) and specialized disciplines (clinical epidemiology and evidence-based medicine, methods and methodology of scientific research, quality standards for scientific research in healthcare, global health, methods of teaching in medicine, organization and management of healthcare, prevention and formation of a healthy lifestyle). As well as practical training of master's students: various types of practices, professional internships; research work, including the completion of a master's thesis - for scientific and pedagogical master's programs; experimental research work, including the completion of a master's thesis - for a specialized master's program; midterm and end-of-course assessments.

The educational programme is developed on the basis of a modular system of studying disciplines indicating the number of hours/credits, reviewed at a meeting of the CEP, the Academic Council and approved by the decision of the Academic Council.

The responsibility for the selection and implementation of innovations in the educational process lies with the CEP, approved on September 12, 2023, No. 26-02-85-NK

The content of the work programs and the catalog of elective disciplines reflect the needs of the healthcare system, including the training of specialists in the prevention and treatment of non-communicable diseases, healthcare management, as well as in the marketing of medical services in healthcare and strategic management. In addition, the specifics of research work and the scientific achievements of teachers are taken into account. These include the following achievements: development of new diagnostic and treatment methods, publications in scientific journals, participation in international conferences, as well as the introduction of innovative educational technologies and methods in the educational process.

While developing the master's program, the developers relied on professional medical literature, including WHO guidelines, current clinical protocols, and scientific monographs on key medical topics, articles from leading medical journals, as well as textbooks and guidelines.

The surveyed teachers responded that 66.7% were fully satisfied with the level of previous training of master's students, and 33.3% were partially satisfied.

The experts established a clear continuity between the final results of previous training of master's students (prerequisites) and training in the master's program, as well as subsequent programs of continuous professional development. The university has developed 217 additional education programs, including 22 for the specialty 7M10102 - "Medicine". Master's students are informed about this.

Seventy-five (75%) of the respondent teachers believe that university students have a high level of knowledge and practical skills after completing the training program, and 25% partially agree with this.

To carry out clinically focused scientific research, master's students on scientific topics use the university's clinical bases: MSE on the REM "City Clinical Hospital No. 4", MSE on the REM "Almaty Regional Multidisciplinary Clinic", MSE on the REM "City Clinical Hospital No. 7"; MSE on the REM "Centre for the Prevention and Control of AIDS", LLP "Medcenter - Rakhat"; MSE on

the REM "Mental Health Centre" of the Healthcare Institution of Almaty; MSE on the REM "Centre for Children's Emergency Medical Care", OKC, laboratories of the RSE on the REM "Institute of Molecular Biology and Biochemistry named after M.A. Aitkhozhin" in accordance with the agreement for the provision of scientific and methodological assistance in the implementation of research work of master's students. In total, the university has concluded 43 agreements, including with 16 foreign institutions:

- 1) (Federal State Budgetary Institution "Federal Centre of Heart, Blood and Endocrinology named after V.A. Almazov" of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation
- 2) Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education "Saratov State Medical University" of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation
- 3) University of West Attica, Greece
- 4) University of Joannina (University of Ioannina, Greece)
- 5) First Moscow State Medical University named after I.M. Sechenov, Russian Federation, Moscow;
- 6) Educational Institution "Kyrgyz State Medical Academy named after I. Akhunbaev"
- 7) Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education "Saint Petersburg State Medical University" of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation
- 8) Erzincan Binali Yildirim University Turkey
- 9) Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education "Novosibirsk State Medical University" of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation
- 10) Altai State Medical University, Russian Federation, Barnaul;
- 11) Bashkir State Medical University, Russian Federation, Udmurt Republic, Ufa;
- 12) Belarusian State Medical University, Republic of Belarus, Minsk;
- 13) Vitebsk State Medical University, Republic of Belarus, Vitebsk;
- 14) Izhevsk State Medical Academy, Russian Federation, Izhevsk,
- 15) Omsk State Medical Academy, Russian Federation, Omsk;
- 16) Siberian State Medical University, Russian Federation, Tomsk.).

And to the question of the questionnaire "Is there enough time for practical training (patient supervision, etc.)", 88.5% of master's degree students answered with full agreement, 7.7% partially agreed, 3.8% doubted the answer. At the same time, 92.3% of master's degree students claim that after the end of classes the teacher provides feedback (listens to your opinion, conducts a mini-questionnaire, works on mistakes).

2.4 Research and grants

The analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all scientific achievements in the relevant disciplines are taken into account, additions are made to the bibliography of the teaching and methodological complex and syllabuses, and teachers use them in the classroom.

The educational programme includes scientific foundations and methodology of medical research (discipline "Design of scientific research in health care", topic "Research methodology", number of hours 45), including clinical research and clinical epidemiology (number of hours 15 hours). During the conversation with the master's degree students, the experts learned that they use scientific data in their training and know the basics of evidence-based medicine. The teachers said that they teach master's degree students methods of critical evaluation of literature, articles and scientific data, the application of scientific developments.

The university implements 6 scientific and technical programs (STP), the results of which can become the basis for the research practice of master's degree students. For example, the STP (intra-university funding) "Study of risk factors for the development of diseases of the oral mucosa among young people" can significantly affect the training of master's degree students in the specialty "Medicine" by developing their research skills, an in-depth understanding of the epidemiology and pathogenesis of oral diseases, as well as teaching methods of prevention and treatment. Participation in the project promotes the acquisition of ethical and legal standards, improvement of communication and interdisciplinary skills, and the application of theoretical knowledge in practice. The research project

(intra-university funding) "Study of post-COVID syndrome in somatic diseases" can significantly influence the training of master's students, developing their research skills and deepening their understanding of post-COVID complications. Participation in the project will provide master's students with practical experience in collecting and analysing data, which will strengthen their competencies in epidemiology and biostatistics. The project promotes the acquisition of modern methods of diagnosis and treatment of post-COVID syndrome, as well as training in the ethical and legal aspects of medical research. As a result, master's students will be better prepared for interdisciplinary work, improve their communication skills and learn to apply the acquired knowledge in practice, which will improve the quality of medical care and their readiness for professional activities in the context of post-pandemic healthcare.

While surveying master's students, it was found that the university has access to students' participation in research work and 92.3% of people are completely satisfied with this, 3.9% are partially satisfied, 3.8% are unsure about the answer. Master's students should engage in R&D and in response to the questionnaire, 92.3% wrote that they are already engaged in R&D, 7.7% plan to start.

2.5 Structure and duration of the programme

The educational programme of the master's degree 7M10102 - "Medicine" consists of: theoretical training, including the study of cycles of basic and specialized disciplines of the compulsory component and the elective component; practical training, consisting of various types of practices and scientific or professional internships; and includes research work, which involves writing a master's thesis for the scientific and pedagogical master's degree and end-of-course assessment.

The duration of study in the educational programme of scientific and pedagogical master's degree 7M10102 - "Medicine" is 2 years. The duration of the program is 3600 hours. The academic year begins on September 1 and ends before July 1. The mandatory components of the master's degree program are: a university component, professional practice, research work, end-of-course assessment - 2430 hours (67.5%), an elective component (disciplines) - 1170 hours (32.5%) and includes such topics as "Compulsory social health insurance", "Prevention and formation of a healthy lifestyle", "3-D modelling in medicine", "Marketing of medical services in healthcare", etc. The allotted time for independent study is (SRMP and SRM) 2/3 and 1/3 of the classroom and is intended for in-depth study of the material, consolidation of the knowledge gained, completion of practical assignments and preparation for control events. The program describes approaches to formative (current) and summative (final) assessment of the master's degree student.

Feedback from master's degree students is carried out regularly and includes the following questions: "How do you rate the quality of theoretical training in basic and specialized disciplines? How useful do you find the elective courses you have chosen? Are you satisfied with the organization and conduct of the final assessment? Do you have any suggestions for improving the educational programme of the master's degree in "Medicine"?" Thus, the results of the survey of master's degree students, which was conducted by the Department of "Public Health" showed a high level of satisfaction with the training program, positive feedback on the quality of teaching, and also highlight the main areas requiring improvement, such as access to modern educational materials, practical classes and opportunities for professional development.

Providing feedback to master's students includes regular surveys and questionnaires, individual interviews and conversations, using electronic platforms and feedback forms, integrating feedback questions into academic consultations, holding forums and discussions, analysing and discussing the results, requesting feedback upon completion of courses, and using the feedback received to improve the educational programme.

The end-of-course assessment in the master's program is 12 academic credits and is carried out in the form of writing and defending a master's thesis. The main results of the master's thesis are presented in at least one publication and (or) one presentation at a scientific and practical conference. To be admitted to the end-of-course assessment, the master's student must pass a preliminary defence of the master's thesis at an extended meeting of the department. The procedure for conducting the end-

of-course assessment is described in the Academic Policy. <https://krmu.edu.kz/ru/akademicheskaya-politika-2>. Based on the results of the end-of-course assessment, the decision of the FSC, graduates of the master's program who have completed their studies in the master's program and successfully defended their dissertations are awarded a master's degree in medical sciences (for the scientific and pedagogical direction) and are issued a diploma of completion of the master's program and a transcript. The awarded qualification corresponds to level 7 of the European Qualifications Framework.

The procedure for extending and interrupting studies is described in the Rules for granting academic leaves to students (PR-03-20-10, approved by SC No. 1 of 08/27/2021). During the reporting period, not a single master's student in the specialty 7M10102 - Medicine took advantage of this opportunity.

For the successful implementation of the educational programme in the specialty 7M10102 - "Medicine", the university has the necessary resources to organize the assessment of the practical skills of master's students: a modern simulation centre equipped with medical equipment and mannequins; clinical bases for internship; qualified mentors and teachers with experience in clinical medicine; access to current medical literature and electronic databases; as well as constant updating and support of the material and technical base.

Practical training of master's students is carried out in the conditions of such medical organizations as the MSE on the REM "City Clinical Hospital No. 4", the MSE on the REM "Almaty Regional Multidisciplinary Clinic", the MSE on the REM "City Clinical Hospital No. 7"; MSE on the REM "Centre for the Prevention and Control of AIDS", LLP "Medcenter - Rakhat"; MSE on the REM "Mental Health Centre" of the DPH of Almaty; MSE on the REM "Centre for Children's Emergency Medical Care", OKC, laboratories of the RSE on the REM "Institute of Molecular Biology and Biochemistry named after M.A. Aitkhozhin", which guarantees the acquisition of skills by graduate students in various aspects (research, supervision, examination, management, teaching) of the selected area of healthcare.

2.6 Process of developing an educational programme

The management of the educational process, reflected in the self-assessment report (Standard 2) and general approaches to management were also confirmed during a visit to the Master's and Doctoral Studies Department, in a conversation with the head (Orazaeva Flyura Ganievna) and employees. At the same time, the verification of Standard 2 revealed partial fulfilment of paragraph 2.4.5. of the standard, which states: "Master's students demonstrated skills in developing original research and scientific grants that are relevant to their learning context." This is due to the fact that the university implements only grants for internal university funding and there are no projects financed from external sources, such as program-targeted funding of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan or grants from the Ministry of Health and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as international ones, with the exception of the ERASMUS educational project. The university's participation in such projects is necessary.

The experts familiarized themselves with the work of the departments and councils involved in the development of the educational programme of the master's degree 7M10102 - Medicine, including specialized departments (oncology with a course in radiology, psychiatry and narcology), members of the Educational programmes Committee, the Academic Council and the Academic Council. A total of 4 meetings were held, and during the cross-interview it was established that the program development process takes into account modern requirements and standards, and also actively involves representatives of different departments and councils. This ensures an interdisciplinary approach and the integration of scientific research into the educational process. However, some areas for improvement were also identified, such as the need to strengthen interaction with external experts and attract additional sources of funding to expand the scientific and educational capabilities of the program.

The process of developing an educational programme includes an assessment of the need for specialists. Thus, the application for state orders for program 7M10102 - "Medicine" in the 2022-2023

academic year was 20 people, in the 2023-2024 academic year also 20 people, in the 2024-2025 academic year - 12 people. The cost of tuition on a paid basis is 850,000 (eight hundred fifty thousand) tenge.

The master's program 7M10102 - Medicine was developed at the Department of Oncology and Mammology with a course in visual diagnostics of the university and at the Department of Internal Medicine with a course in clinical pharmacology, approved at the meeting of the SC No. 11-1 dated July 24, 2019. This program was reviewed by Shakirov N.Ye., chief physician of "Burch Medical" LLP, Sema clinic, Almaty. The reviewer noted that the program complies with academic standards; it includes a practical part, which facilitates interaction with clinical sites for more effective training of specialists. Thus, the experts analysed the hierarchy and sequence of development and approval of the master's programme 7M10102 - Medicine.

However, there are difficulties in developing educational programmes; namely, there are problems with the participation of foreign external experts and partners, which limits the opportunities for receiving feedback and exchanging best practices. It is necessary to more actively involve international experts and create conditions for academic mobility of master's students and teachers in order to improve the quality of educational programmes and their compliance with international standards.

At the same time, to the question "Are representatives of master's students involved in the development of educational programmes?", the experts received the following answer: representatives of master's students are involved in the process of developing educational programmes. Their opinion is taken into account through regular surveys and questionnaires, as well as by including master's students in the composition of the COP, the Academic Council and the Academic Council. Master's students have the opportunity to make suggestions for improving programs, share their experience and feedback. The surveyed Master's students are fully satisfied with the schedule of classes (88.5%).

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliance out of 21 standards (including 19 basic, 2 Standards of improvement): fully - 18 basic and 2 Standards of improvement, partially - 1 basic standard, do not comply - 0.

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) To increase the amount of fundamental and applied scientific research funded from external sources in order to expand scientific capabilities, attract additional resources and strengthen the university's position in the international academic community (clause 2.4.5).
- 2) To resume the targeted provision of intra-university grants, which will ensure the continuity of the Academic staff, supporting young teachers and researchers in the development of their research projects and careers, and will contribute to the preservation of human resources, academic mobility and scientific activity at the university (clause 2.4.5).

Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF MASTER'S STUDENTS

3.1 Assessment methods

The policy for assessing the academic achievements of students, including master's students, is formulated and presented in the Academic Policy of the University <https://drive.google.com/file/d/1KGAKzFXbYYW59WUCtaLbKggFZhhljNKK/view> (document P-01-17-14, approved at the meeting of the Academic Council, minutes No. 1 of 08/31/2022); the Regulation on the current monitoring of academic performance, midterm and final certification of students <https://drive.google.com/file/d/10rdZn92GBOpvmU1f1roXLcNog5CtgWLk/view> (document PL-03-35-11, approved at the Academic Council, minutes No. 1 of 08/27/2021). They reflect the principles and methods used to assess master's students, including criteria for admission to exams, the number of exams, the number of permitted retakes (no more than once and free of charge). The choice of certain methods for assessing master's students is made by the teacher based on the acceptability and effectiveness of the assessment methods and formats in relation to the established final learning

outcomes, and is reflected in the syllabus. Data on current monitoring of academic performance, midterm and final assessment, and student attendance are reflected in the AIS Platonus. The objectivity and transparency of assessments and the grading process are ensured through this system. The academic achievements of master's students in all types of control are assessed using a point-rating system for assessing academic achievements with translation into a traditional grading scale

So that the results of the assessment of master's students are available to external experts, they are posted: https://docs.google.com/document/d/17mxZEIhNVXNTEcu2im2r_0JHiDQnTrCv/edit.

The assessment methods for midterm and final control are reviewed and approved at the meeting of the CEP, AC. The results of the current control assessment are documented by the teacher, midterm and end-of-course assessment - by the examiner, professional practice - by the practice supervisor, research - by the secretary of the certification committee.

The study of the control and measuring tools (40 tests, 10 tasks, 8 assessment sheets <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1KvWV-JwvtrpS7Tt0SBcstneIdZrhx5Fe>) showed that the university has implemented an appropriate assessment policy that allows for a comprehensive assessment of the academic achievements of master's students. During the interview, the master's students shared their experience of various forms of assessment, the use of assessment sheets and closed tests, noting their satisfaction with this process. In addition, they receive regular feedback from teachers.

A master's student who does not agree with the assessment results for the final form of control has the right to appeal. To conduct appeals, an appeal committee is created by order of the Rector of the University from among teachers whose qualifications correspond to the profile of the disciplines being appealed. The master's student submits applications for appeal to the master's department before 13-00 hours of the next day after the announcement of the exam results, and in the case of a test form of the exam, immediately after the end of the exam in the Platonus system in online mode. The appeal is conducted no later than 3 days from the date of filing the application. The system of appeal of assessment results is reflected in the Academic Policy and there have been no precedents of appeal during the period of work of the educational organization

To verify the *Standard 3* data, the experts asked the head of the master's and doctoral department Orazava F. G. questions about when and by whom the control and measuring tools (CMT) for master's students in the specialty "Medicine" were developed, by whom they were reviewed, and whether their revision is planned, and if so, when and for what reasons. The experts also checked the documents and methods for assessing master's students. Documentation of assessment results: current control in an electronic journal, midterm and final control, assessment of practice and research in Platonus. For each discipline, departments develop EMCD, which includes methodological developments, a syllabus and CMT, reviewed and approved at the CEP, ASC CMT are reviewed by an external and internal reviewer.

The assessment of academic skills corresponds to the level of a master's degree, since such methods are used as tests and exams (closed and open), assessment of practical skills in simulation centres and internships, writing and defending a master's dissertation, term papers and projects, regular feedback from teachers, self-assessment questionnaires, as well as assessment of participation in group projects and seminars. These methods allow for a comprehensive assessment of theoretical knowledge, practical skills and research abilities of master's degree students.

The methods and results of the assessment avoid conflicts of interest, because they are based on objective and transparent criteria developed and reviewed by independent experts. The assessment process is carried out by different teachers and specialists, which eliminates the influence of personal preferences. The use of anonymous tests and assessment standards also contributes to impartiality and fairness in assessing the achievements of master's students. During the final state certification of master's students, leading specialists from other universities and practical healthcare are involved as members of the certification committee.

The assessment system for master's students includes the principles of anti-plagiarism (document PR-03-64-13 "Rules for using the StrikePlagiarism.com system" dated January 28, 2022 was

implemented) and academic honesty, which excludes the possibility of using other people's work without proper citation, ensures that the originality of all written work is checked using specialized software and provides strict measures in relation to academic violations. These measures help maintain a high level of academic ethics and encourage independent completion of educational and scientific assignments.

The experts inspected the resources for organizing the assessment of knowledge and practical skills, and the testing centre for obtaining an independent assessment of students, which is a modern division of the university, equipped with computer stations with access to specialized software, video surveillance systems to ensure the integrity of testing and individual workstations for each participant. The centre employs qualified administrators and technical specialists who help with registration and testing, and monitor compliance with the rules. Manapova Damira Yedygeevna, head of the testing centre, confirmed that the procedures for identifying participants and strict security measures guarantee the protection of personal data and testing results, ensuring an objective and equal assessment of knowledge and skills.

The 10 employer representatives interviewed also pointed out that the training of graduates corresponds to the modern development of medical practice and science, since the educational programme is regularly updated in accordance with the latest scientific achievements and clinical recommendations, master's degree students gain practical experience on the basis of modern medical institutions, and also actively participate in research activities and projects.

The employers said (in particular, Nurbaev Rolan Mamyrovich - head of the MSE on the REM "Regional Children's Clinical Hospital", Zhumataeva Zarina Akhmetovna - chief physician of the clinic "Rakhat") that they themselves participate in the assessment of master's degree students, since they are included in the certification committees. Employers believe that such skills in master's degree graduates as clinical thinking and decision-making skills, and knowledge of modern medical technologies and methods of treatment, they wanted to see as the strongest.

At the same time, there are difficulties in developing control and measuring tools, including adaptation to the specifics of students and constant updating of the content of tests and assignments taking into account the changing requirements of medical science and practice.

3.2 Feedback from graduate students

Experts received information that each graduate student provides feedback through individual and detailed written feedback after formative and summative assessments. Questionnaires and surveys aimed at assessing the quality of the educational process and teaching activities have been developed. Surveys are conducted regularly to obtain feedback from graduate students on the quality of teaching, logistical support and organizational aspects of the educational process. For example, when surveying graduate students, university teachers received information about the need to improve the availability of literary resources for research work and increase the frequency of practical classes using modern technologies, based on the results of which changes were made to the schedule and teaching methods.

3.4 Quality assurance of the assessment system

The organization assesses the reliability and validity of assessment methods by analysing statistical data, comparing the results of different assessment methods, and regularly updating the content of assignments in accordance with current educational standards and the requirements of professional practice.

A reputable scientist, a highly qualified specialist who is not a full-time employee of the university, is appointed as the chairman of the final assessment of graduates of the master's program. The master's thesis is reviewed by external experts with academic degrees, academic titles, whose qualifications correspond to the profile of the defended master's thesis (project) (clause 4.6.12 Academic Policy) <https://krmu.edu.kz/wp-content/uploads/2023/08/r-01-17-14-akad.politika-31.08.2022-s-izm.-ot-23.11.22-24.02.23.pdf>

During a visit to the university, the management was asked the question: "Are external examiners involved in order to increase the fairness, quality and transparency of the assessment process?" And the answer was received that external examiners are regularly involved to conduct independent examination procedures, which helps to ensure objectivity and fairness in assessing the academic achievements of students.

While interviewing 16 teachers regarding assessment methods, the experts received convincing information that the methods used ensure objective and reliable assessment of master's students' knowledge and skills, corresponding to academic standards and professional training requirements.

Master's students also shared their opinions on the timeliness of testing, pre-exam counselling, clarity of the entire assessment procedure and its fairness. For example, master's students said that they have access to testing materials in advance, which allows them to prepare more effectively, and expressed satisfaction with the transparency of the assessment criteria, which contributes to fair and equal assessment of all students.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria comply with 10 basic standards: fully - 10.

Standard 4: MASTER'S STUDENTS

4.1 Admission and selection policy

The organization has a policy for the admission of master's students, which is called "Rules for Admission to the Master's Program" (document PR-03-13-05 dated 19.08.2021, as amended in 2022). Orazava Flyura Ganievna, Head of the Department of Master's and Doctoral Studies, spoke about the policy for the admission of master's students. Admission of master's students is carried out by placing a state educational order for training personnel in the scientific and pedagogical direction of the specialty 7M10102 - "Medicine", as well as paying for tuition at the expense of the students' own funds and other sources. Approaches to the admission of master's students are based on the requirements of the country and internal regulations, namely, they take into account the qualification requirements for candidates, the conditions for the provision of a state educational order, competitive selection mechanisms and admission criteria, as well as established procedures for confirming their qualifications for training in the scientific and pedagogical direction of specialty 7M10102 - Medicine. The experts familiarized themselves with the documentation for the admission of master's students, including: Regulations on the scientific supervisors of master's and doctoral students (document PL-03-13-13, approved by the decision of the SC, protocol No. 2 of 09.24.2021), Regulations on inclusive education (document PL-03-17-08, approved by the decision of the US, protocol No. 3 of 10.15.2020), Regulations on social support for students (document P-03-21-D6, approved 21.06.2019).

Regarding the practice of academic counselling, personal support for master's students and the development of not only professional skills, the experts interviewed the employees responsible for the admission of master's students. Kaliyeva Gulbanu Batyrkhanovna, Executive Secretary of the Admissions Committee, emphasized that the University's Admissions Committee provides consultations on the choice of postgraduate educational programmes, helps with the registration of applications for participation in comprehensive testing on the official website of the National Testing Centre of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, introduces all stages of testing, checks the authenticity and accepts documents from applicants to the University's master's program. Members of the commission also check the authenticity and validity of the presented certificates when submitting applications for participation in the competition for educational grants financed from the republican or local budget, or when enrolling on a paid basis at the University.

The organization has a practice of awarding an intra-university educational grant, which is reflected in the document "Rules for awarding an intra-university educational grant for study in a master's degree" of the University <https://krmu.edu.kz/wp-content/uploads/2023/06/pr-03-13-12-pravila-prisuzhdeniya-vnutrivuzovskogo-obr.granta.pdf>.

Master's students are included in such advisory bodies as the Academic Council (Bigalievna Akmanar Mukhitkyzy, 2nd year), Academic Council (Rakhimbaeva Maria Zhumabaykyzy, 2nd year), CEP (Em

Igor Vladimirovich, 2nd year). The experts also familiarized themselves with the portfolios of these master's students, in which they found confirmation (orders) on the inclusion of master's students in the advisory bodies.

4.2 Recruitment of Master's students

The university has implemented a policy and process for the admission of Master's students based on their previous achievements, principles of equality and objectivity. Admission of Master's students is based on state standards and requirements, as well as internal regulations: rules for competitive selection, criteria for assessing the academic and scientific achievements of candidates, and procedures for submitting and reviewing documents.

The university determines the admission policy and selects for the Master's program in accordance with the mission of the educational programme, focusing on the priorities of the needs of specialties and scientific and pedagogical personnel. This is expressed in the formation of an admission plan, which includes the planned contingent for training under a state order, an internal university grant and on a fee-based basis. The admission plan is based on an analysis of the university's needs for scientific and pedagogical personnel and an assessment of the resource availability of the educational programme.

For the period from 2019-2023, 32 people were admitted to the Master's program, 6 of whom were expelled before the end of the term of study. In 2021, 13 master's students were transferred from KazMUCE, of which 1 was expelled before the end of their studies. 29 people successfully completed their master's degree, including those transferred from KazMUCE. At the same time, according to the results of the final certification, 17 people received "excellent", 12 - "good".

The issues of organizing the education of people with disabilities and people with disabilities are reflected in the internal documents "Regulations on social support for students" <https://krmu.edu.kz/wp-content/uploads/2021/03/Polozhenie-o-Sotsialnoj-podderzhke-obuchayushhihsya.pdf> and "Regulations on inclusive education" <https://drive.google.com/file/d/196nn7Ix7C7Qv1NRc10ZvRQqZ10z7R68v3/view>. During the reporting period, master's students with special needs were not accepted.

4.3 Support and counselling for master's students

The University offers master's students various support programs throughout the entire period of study at the University. For this purpose, support and counselling services for master's students have been created: 1) Admissions Office, 2) Department of Academic Process Planning, 3) Registrar's Office, 4) Youth Policy Centre, 5) Career Centre, 6) Department of Educational and Social Work, 7) Department of Master's and Doctoral Studies (MDS), 8) Department of Educational and Methodological Work, 9) Department of Marketing and Public Relations, 10) Library, 11) Department of International Relations and Academic Mobility.

The Department of Master's and Doctoral Studies organizes and supervises the educational process, and also consults students on academic issues, such as the schedule of classes, the appointment of a supervisor, the choice of a base for practical training, the preparation of an individual curriculum, registration for elective courses, referral to conferences and scientific internships, participation in competitions and Olympiads, as well as assistance in employment.

Supervisors of master's students, together with the staff of the department, provide direct consultations on issues of practice, theory and science of medicine. The Department of Scientific Work provides scientific and methodological assistance in information retrieval.

The University has a Career Centre, whose responsibilities include informing, consulting on matters of career guidance, career planning, employment <https://krmu.edu.kz/ru/tsentr-karery/>.

A professional psychologist is available to provide psychological assistance to students. The University has signed a memorandum of cooperation with the MSE on the REM "City Polyclinic No. 7" of the Almaty City Health Department, the purpose of which is to provide mutual information and methodological support.

The University student support program is implemented in accordance with the internal document "Regulations on social support for students", approved by the order of the rector dated June 21, 2019. The Social Affairs Commission, chaired by the rector, considers each case individually. <https://krmu.edu.kz/wp-content/uploads/2021/03/Polozhenie-o-Sotsialnoj-podderzhke-obuchayushhihsya.pdf>

Information about assistance and counselling programs for master's students is communicated to them through the official website of the University, the University pages on Facebook, Instagram, VK, Telegram, as well as through the University Management Information System. In addition, information about service departments is distributed via corporate mail magistratura@medkrmu.kz, via phone chat and via e-mail.

The University guarantees the confidentiality of counselling and support provided. Counselling in the Master's program is an integral part of the holistic individual educational process. In the event of a professional crisis associated with abuse of office or fundamental disagreement with the supervisor or colleagues, the Master's student is supported by the Master's and Doctoral Department.

Master's students studying on state grants receive a stipend of 111 thousand tenge per month. Students studying on an intra-university grant do not receive a stipend; a scientific internship is paid in the amount of 62 MCI.

During a conversation with Master's students, the experts received evidence that they are provided with academic, financial (including assistance in publications and participation in conferences) and psychological support. For example, the University paid for a trip to a conference in Tashkent for 2nd-year Master's student Rakhimbaeva M. Zh.

4.4 Representation of Master's students

Master's students are included in the work of advisory bodies to participate in the development, management and evaluation of educational programmes, as well as other issues related to master's students. Thus, 2nd-year Master's student in the specialty 7M10102-"Medicine" Rakhimbaeva Maria Zhumabaykyzy, 2nd year, by order No. 26-02-83-n / k dated 09/04/2023 was included in the Academic Council for the 2023-2024 academic year. The Academic Council includes 2nd-year Master's student in the specialty "Medicine" Bigaliev Akmanar Mukhitkyzy, and the CEP includes Em Igor Vladimirovich, a 2nd-year Master's student in the same specialty. They actively participate in various aspects of the educational process and contribute to the development of both their professional skills and the educational environment as a whole. An example is their participation in research projects, which not only help to deepen their knowledge, but also help to improve the educational programme.

Master's students participate in the development of the educational programme (EP) of the master's degree, including through the choice of elective courses. Students have the right to propose new elective courses for inclusion in the catalogue if they consider them necessary and conducive to improving the EP. For example, a course on marketing in healthcare was developed based on suggestions from master's students and employers.

4.5 Requirements for graduates

Requirements for master's degree students regarding the completion of the programme (projects, dissertation, internship, portfolio, transcripts, etc.) are described in the Rules for organizing the educational process in the master's program of the NEI "Kazakh-Russian Medical University", approved by the order of the rector No. 195a dated 08/25/2018. Requirements for the design of an individual work plan for a master's degree student are included in the Rules for organizing the educational process in the master's program of the NEI "Kazakh-Russian Medical University", approved by the order of the rector No. 195a dated 08/25/2018.

The experts were shown evidence of the development of research and critical analysis skills in master's degree students at a meeting with master's degree students and a visit to clinical sites, when familiarizing themselves with their research project works, presentations at scientific and practical

conferences and publications, where master's degree students had the opportunity to apply theoretical knowledge and develop their analytical skills.

4.6 Progress indicators and reasons for lagging

The requirements for the progress of a master's degree student are set out in the educational programme for the specialty 7M10102-"Medicine" and are regulated by internal regulatory documents of the University, such as the Academic Policy, the Regulation on the current monitoring of academic performance, midterm and final certification of students (document PL-03-35-11, approved by the AC, protocol No. 1 dated 08/27/2021).

The faculty of departments heads of departments/courses, and the registrar's office are responsible for implementing the policy for assessing students' academic achievements. The system for monitoring the academic achievements of master's students is organized by the department of master's and doctoral studies and the registrar's office, which maintains the history of the academic achievements of master's students throughout the entire academic period of study, which is reflected in the transcript.

The academic performance of master's students is recorded by the department - the Registrar's Office. During its visit, the experts familiarized themselves with the work of the registrar's office staff, the registration and grading system, the criteria for admission to midterm assessment and end-of-course assessment. Kalieva Gulbanu Batyrkhanovna, head of the department for work with students, provided the report cards of the academic performance of master's students, as well as the personal files of master's students in printed and electronic form. Performance indicators of master's students in the 7M10102 Medicine program in dynamics: in the 2019-2020 academic year - 100%, in the 2020-2021 academic year - 100%, in the 2021-2022 academic year - 100%, in the 2022-2023 academic year - 88.9%, 2023-2024 academic year - 100%.

There is a system for monitoring master's students whose progress gives cause for concern. For example, if a master's student has problems with completing the curriculum, failing to meet deadlines for submitting assignments, low grades in key subjects, or frequent absences from classes, the university administration and academic supervisors conduct individual consultations, develop corrective plans, and offer additional resources and support to improve academic performance.

A total of 6 master's students were expelled from 2020 to 2023, of which 2 were due to moving to another city, 3 were expelled at their own request, and 1 master's student was expelled due to failure to comply with the terms of the agreement on the provision of educational services. On academic leave are 0 master's students.

Thus, the experts *validated* the data according to Standard 4. In general, all criteria comply with the standards for accreditation of postgraduate medical education.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Of the 12 basic standards, 12 are fully compliant.

Standard 5: ACADEMIC STAFF

5.1 Selection Policy

The University has 139 doctors of science, 308 candidates of medical science, 29 PhD doctors and 133 masters of Science teaching.

The experts were familiarized with the Personnel Policy (document R-01-23-01, approved at the meeting of the Academic Council on December 25, 2020, protocol No. 5), which reflects: selection and hiring of employees, development and activities of employees, promotion of employees, etc. They also reviewed the Regulation on the competitive replacement of positions of faculty and research staff (document PL-03-23-07), approved by the decision of the Academic Council on April 29, 2022, protocol No. 9 <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1vCvX-79eCdIvezwhoB9-7mXuSb8YFWxi?usp=sharing> and the Regulation on the scientific supervisors of a master's student and a doctoral student (document PL-03-13-13, approved by the decision of the Academic Council,

External experts received the opinion of teachers on the personnel policy, which includes issues of recruitment, professional development and retention of employees. The teachers noted that the average age of the teaching staff tends to increase annually, especially among those with a PhD. So in the 2023-2024 academic year it is 62.9 years old, in the 2022-2023 academic year - 59.4 years old. The teachers expressed the general opinion that the university attaches great importance to the training of its own personnel and allocates intra-university grants for training in master's and doctoral programs.

The current personnel policy ensures maintaining a balance between medical and non-medical teachers, as well as between full-time and part-time employees. The educational process maintains the necessary balance between teachers of basic biomedical, behavioural and social disciplines, as well as clinical (profile) disciplines.

The interview with Verevkina Vera Ivanovna, Head of the HR Department, covered such issues as personnel selection procedures, motivation systems and employee performance assessment, and allowed the experts to learn about approaches to attracting clinical site employees for teaching (there are 7 such teachers in the 2019-2020 academic year, 10 in the 2020-2021 academic year, 11 in the 2021-2022 academic year, 13 in the 2022-2023 academic year, and 10 in the 2023-2024 academic year).

While surveying teachers, it was found that the majority (91.7%) were completely satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace at the university, and only 8.3% expressed the opinion that they were partially satisfied. At the university, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of R&D: 91.7% completely agree, 8.3% partially. Satisfied with the work of the HR service are 83.3%, 17.7% partially. Satisfied with the salary - 66.7% completely agree, 8.33% answered more YES than NO, 25% answered More NO than YES.

5.2 Personnel Commitments and Development

During the meeting with the head of the HR department and during the interviews with the teachers, the experts received information about the approaches to the development of the pedagogical competence of teachers, their motivation to work with master's students and implement scientific supervision, which includes advanced training programs, participation in scientific conferences and seminars, the introduction of modern educational technologies, as well as a system of incentives and recognition for achievements in teaching and research.

The experts received answers about the advanced training program for teachers. In order to ensure a high level of qualification of the teaching staff, which is a key factor in the quality of the educational services provided, the university has a school of teachers, as well as a system of advanced training and professional development of personnel. Thus, in 2023, 237 faculty members were issued certificates for successfully completing the 72-hour "Teacher's School" training seminar.

For faculty and administrative staff, professional development plans are developed annually. Professional development is carried out in various areas: in the specialty, management, pedagogy, inclusion, etc. In 2023, 227 people were trained in pedagogy, 90 people in the clinical mentor cycle, 29 people in inclusion, and 53 people in the specialty. In 2024, 26 people completed the basics of project management, 3 people completed management in education, and 133 people completed inclusion. Experts checked the certificates that were included in the faculty portfolio.

The experts found that teachers initiate research topics for master's students stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature and medical documentation. They also actively participate in mentoring, helping graduate students formulate research questions, develop methodology and analyse results. Teachers create conditions for critical thinking and discussion, encourage participation in conferences and publication of scientific articles. Thanks to this approach, graduate students develop not only scientific and research skills, but also gain confidence in independent work, which significantly increases their readiness for professional activities.

In a conversation with experts, Liang Zhanat Amandykovna, Head of the Audit and Strategic Development Department, emphasized that the department ensures proper monitoring of the activities of teachers through regular assessments and reviews of teaching activities. Feedback on satisfaction with the educational process, professional and personal development is carried out once a semester.

The university provides opportunities for career growth and development of teacher competencies - 91.7% of the surveyed teachers answered positively, and 8.3% of respondents partially agree with this. Studied in professional development programs are 50% from 1 to 5 years ago, 50% during the current year.

The university implements social support programs for teachers - 50% answered that "yes, such programs exist", 8.3% "I have already used this", 0% of respondents answered that there are no such programs, and 41.7% of respondents do not know about this.

5.3 Number and qualifications of teaching and management staff

The teaching staff involved in the implementation of the educational programme 7M10102-"Medicine" for the 2023-2024 academic year is 20 people, of which 7 people work 1.0 full-time, 10 people work 0.5 full-time, and 3 people work 0.25 full-time. Of the 20 teaching staff, 3 people work part-time. The faculty has a 95% degree (9 candidates of medical sciences, 9 doctors of medical sciences, 1 PhD). The staffing of the educational programme is carried out in accordance with the requirements, the percentage ratio of staffing and degrees established by regulatory acts is observed in the staffing (85%; 95%).

At the University, the average student-to-teacher ratio for calculating the total number of faculty in the Master's program is 1:6, according to the National Program of Education.

Master's students have scientific supervisors (mentors) who help them with their dissertation work. The scientific supervision of Master's students is provided by: 9 Doctors of Science, 9 Candidates of Science, 1 PhD doctor. The University's faculty implements 6 research projects financed from the University's own budget, as well as by the European Union within the framework of the Erasmus program (1 project). The scientific potential of the faculty contributes to the sustainable development of the University's research activities. In 2023, the number of faculty publications in the Scopus database was 29 (in 2022 - 12), and in Web of Science - 17 (in 2022 - 12). However, according to the teachers themselves, it is necessary to increase the number of publications in highly ranked journals. The University publishes its own scientific journal "Current Issues of Theoretical and Clinical Medicine", where most of the works of Master's students are published.

5.4 Administrative support

The University's employee incentive procedure is defined by the Regulation "On Remuneration", approved by the Decision of the Academic Council, November 29, 2017, Protocol No. 4 <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1vCvX-79eCdIvezwhoB9-7mXuSb8YFWxi?usp=sharing>. This document helps increase the material interest of employees in improving the results of their activities, fulfilling planned tasks, and introducing progressive forms and methods of the educational process.

The University has a system of incentives for the professional and personal development of teachers and employees, which includes moral and material incentives. Moral incentives include expressions of gratitude, awarding certificates, and nominations for state and departmental awards. Material incentives include a system of rewarding teachers and employees for their personal contribution and achieved results in their work. Bonuses are awarded to employees based on the results of their work during the academic year, successful completion of the admissions committee, certification, accreditation, scientific results, birthdays and anniversaries. In a conversation with the teaching staff, they confirmed that these measures are motivating to increase their professional activity and achieve high results in their work.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Comply with 7 basic standards: fully – 7.

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES AND LEARNING ENVIRONMENT

6.1 Learning environment

The basic training of master's students of EP 7M10102 - Medicine is carried out in the administrative and educational building located at the address: Almaty, Abylai Khan Street, 51/53. The educational building is equipped with the necessary modern infrastructure. For conducting midterm and final assessment of students' knowledge in accordance with the standard program, there is a Test Centre equipped with 122 computers and 12 video surveillance cameras. There is a library with a collection of 616,040 thousand storage units at the beginning of the 2023-2024 academic year, taking into account the collections of partner libraries with which cooperation agreements have been signed. The total number of library collections for the Master's degree programs "Medicine" and "Public Health" is 3,456 copies. A total of 102 copies have been received over the past five years. The collection renewal rate was 2.95%.

The University acquired the automated library information system "IRBIS-64". The program has the modules "Registration", "Catalogizer", "Acquisition", "Book Issue", "Web Catalogizer". On the University's website, in the "Library" section, students and faculty have access to the electronic catalogue. Based on the Author's Agreements, a repository of the works of the KRMU faculty has been created on the university website. In addition, the "Ask the Librarian" reference service has been organized there, where students can ask questions of interest to them.

A review of the resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities. The experts visited the clinical sites of the "Almaty Regional Multidisciplinary Clinic" (69 Rozy Baglanova St.) and the "Mental Health Centre" (117 Abisha Kikelbayuly St.). During the visit to the clinical sites, the experts examined the resources for their compliance with the training programs, accessibility for teachers and graduate students, as well as modernity and compliance with the needs of students and practical health care. The experts received evidence of compliance with Standard 6 and confirmed the reliability of the data presented in the self-assessment report.

The staff of the educational organization maintains collegial and ethical relationships with the medical staff and the management of the clinical base to ensure the achievement of the final results of the master's degree students. The students have a sufficient number of thematic patients and modern equipment that is available for training. The staff, acting as teachers and curators (mentors), guarantees high-quality training, observing ethical and deontological standards. Before the beginning of each discipline of the educational programme, the master's degree students receive a syllabus from the teacher, which clearly defines the skills that they must acquire and develop during the training.

The students have free access to patients at clinical sites and all the conditions for improving their practical skills - 91.7% of the teachers completely agree with this, 8.3% partially agree.

An interview with 12 teachers, including 9 full-time, showed that there are both successes and problems in the management of education, depending on the specific base. For example, in the "Mental Health Centre" master's students are very actively involved in scientific publishing activities: together with their supervisor, they develop methodological manuals, information sheets and brochures for patients. In the "Almaty Regional Multidisciplinary Clinic" in the oncology department, master's students are actively involved in the clinical process and writing their master's thesis based on the clinic's database. However, teachers noted that not all clinical sites provide master's students with sufficient access to the medical equipment necessary for full-fledged training. In addition, there is a shortage of subject patients for practical classes, limited time for maintaining medical records and independent work. In this regard, difficulties arise in ensuring full practical training, which can affect the quality of training and acquisition of the necessary skills.

To validate the data of the self-assessment report and obtain evidence of the quality of the programs, an interview was conducted with master's students in the specialty 7M10102 - Medicine. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with the training, sufficient time for patient supervision, work in the Damumed system with medical documentation, as well as satisfaction with teaching methods and the qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for master's students who need it,

and the availability of resources from international databases of professional literature. In general, the master's students expressed satisfaction with the training, assessment methods, and entered the university purposefully, believing that the university has good resources, image, and international connections. However, they expressed a desire to improve the mobility program, since not all expenses for trips to international universities or clinics are covered by the educational grant.

The master's students demonstrated their commitment to the university, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgment on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, research, and financing.

The experts studied the master's students' documents (IWPM, results of the assessment of master's students, results of the survey of master's students).

6.2 Information technology

Vdovtsev Aleksandr Viktorovich, Vice-Rector for Digital Development, gave a presentation for the EEC on information policy and information support for the university and accredited educational programmes. He noted that the information policy is aimed at the effective use and evaluation of information, communication and distance technologies in the preparation of students, including master's students. The information policy is reflected in several documents of the University: Academic Policy (No. P-01-17-14 dated 08/31/2022), Code of Corporate Culture and Ethics (No. K-03-21-11 dated 11/26/2021), Regulation on the website of the NEI "KRMU" (No. PL-03-33-08 dated 04/30/2021), Regulation on the processing, protection and storage of personal data of employees and students (No. PL-03-23-06 dated 06/17/2019), Internal Regulations (No. PR-03-24-07 dated 06/10/2022).

The university has 4 of its own servers, which ensures reliable storage and processing of data, high performance of information systems and educational platforms, and uninterrupted access to electronic resources and databases for teachers and students. This contributes to the effective organization of the educational process, including distance learning and online research, and ensures a high level of cybersecurity and information protection.

There is also an "information and communication technologies" office, which consists of 3 classrooms, each room has 12 seats. The offices are equipped with printers and 38 computers. The computers have installed applications such as: a full package of Microsoft Office, Microsoft FrontPage XP, Macromedia Flash, Hyper Cam, Adobe Photoshop CS2, Windows Movie Maker, Camtasia, Cisco packet tracer, Iren - a test program, Electronic textbooks.

In the system of distance learning, organized on the platform (<https://moodle.medkrmu.kz>), various platforms ZOOM, Skype, Classroom are used, with the presentation of contact over a distance.

The University has a website krmu.edu.kz, where information about the Master's degree is located. The University has AIS Platonus (<https://platonus.medkrmu.kz>), version 5.2 with an up-to-date database of students, which is integrated online into ESUVO and then into NEDB. Situational monitoring is carried out from video surveillance systems in the administrative and academic buildings and visual control of the external territory of the University.

The University territory is provided with Internet and WI-FI.

For conducting research, writing a dissertation, independent learning and access to the necessary information for master's students, access to international databases is organized, including: <https://www.scopus.com/>, <https://www.sciencedirect.com/>; <http://elibrary.kaznu.kz/ru/node/1205>, <http://library.kaznpu.kz/kz/>, <https://www.openU.kz/>, <http://kazneb.kz/>, <http://kingmed.info/knigi>, <http://Polpred.com>. The following were in test access: Electronic library system of the "Lan" publishing house, Cochrane Library (Cochrane, www.cochrane.org), Wiley, Bookapp, BMJ, Znanium.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Comply with 4 basic standards: fully – 4.

Standard 7: MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME

7.1 Mechanisms for monitoring and evaluating the program

Work to improve the educational programme is carried out annually on the basis of the conducted evaluations of the EP and receiving feedback from students, employers and teachers. The experts were provided with the documented results of the survey and a discussion of these results <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1NHHGWUqICt6TIBgG3aE3fV8NAGbdJ-hp>.

The Department of Audit and Strategic Development is preparing an analytical report based on the results of the survey "Satisfaction with the quality of educational programmes" and "Satisfaction with the conditions and results of training". This report includes quantitative and qualitative criteria, as well as recommendations for improving the educational programme and teaching methods. Based on these reports, the departments, the department of master's and doctoral studies develop an action plan to improve the educational programme. The survey results are also taken into account when compiling a catalogue of elective disciplines, developing educational and methodological complexes and introducing innovative teaching methods.

The responsibility of the administration and the teaching staff in compiling the educational programme is ensured through the procedure for reviewing and approving these programs at meetings of the department and collegial bodies of the university (CEP, AC). The university Academic staff is given freedom to change and supplement the program, which allows making appropriate adjustments to the educational process. Employers and healthcare professionals are involved in discussing the expected learning outcomes; in assessing the academic achievements of students and their educational trajectories. This was confirmed by experts during a conversation with employers and graduates of the Master's program in Medicine.

As a result of monitoring and evaluating the Master's program, areas requiring improvement were identified. These include increasing the number of case patients for Master's students to practice, expanding the mobility program with increased funding for international exchange, optimizing the time for maintaining medical records, supporting independent work of Master's students, introducing innovative teaching methods and improving the quality of feedback.

7.2 Feedback from teachers and graduate students

The graduate department collects feedback from students to determine the level of satisfaction with the content of the EP, the organization of the educational process in the form of a questionnaire, monitoring requests to the rector's blog, discussing current issues on a social network (http://vk.com/krmu_page; <https://www.facebook.com/profile.php?id=100009529651668>)

Specialized departments collect feedback from students, representatives of practical healthcare and teachers of other educational organizations in the form of reviews. The experts reviewed the report on the results of the survey "Employer Satisfaction with the Quality of Master's Degree Training" https://drive.google.com/file/d/1rC8gxkO73_7_O5legn4dt2BbYUv5e0dn/view. The results showed that *"One of the indirect indicators of satisfaction with the quality of master's degree training is the desire of employers to recommend the graduate to other employers. 83.3% of respondents would recommend the master's degree to other employers. The rest answered "Yes, but not all". To improve the master's degree program, the opinion of employers and their participation in the development of the program is important. All 100% of respondents believe that the master's degree programs implemented by the university meet the needs of their organizations. In their recommendations, respondents indicated the need to strengthen the practical focus of the program and increase the hours for scientific and pedagogical practice.*

Feedback is collected annually, at the end of the academic year.

In 2022, a survey was conducted among 12 master's degree students. The survey results revealed an insufficient connection between theoretical training and practice and insufficient use of practical cases. In this regard, it was recommended to introduce a problem-based teaching method, which allows for the simultaneous integration of theory and practice. These recommendations were taken into account when making changes to the educational programme.

7.2 Activities of Master's students and graduates

In 2020, there were 3 Master's students, with a qualitative performance indicator of 100%, dissertations defended on time - 100%. In 2021, there were 15 Master's students, with a qualitative performance indicator of 100%, dissertations defended on time - 100%. In 2022, there were 3 Master's students, with a qualitative performance indicator of 88.9%, dissertations defended on time - 100%. In 2023, there were 8 Master's students, with a qualitative performance indicator of 100%, dissertations defended on time - 100%. There were no expelled Master's students. Employment in 2020 - 100%, in 2021 - 86.6% (13 master's students are employed, 2 people are free to work due to having a child under 3 years old), in 2022 - 100%, in 2023 - 100%. 3 people continued their education in PhD doctoral studies - 29 graduates of the master's program in the specialty "7M10102 - Medicine".

During interviews with graduates of the master's program, experts learned that they like studying at this university, as it offers good quality teaching, modern information support and resources, and also supports the development of research activities. Graduates also noted the friendly and supportive atmosphere, which contributes to their personal and professional growth. However, they expressed wishes for strengthening practical training and increasing interaction with potential employers.

The results of the analysis of the performance of master's students (academic performance, dissertation defence) are provided by the Department of Master's and Doctoral Studies to the Academic Council and the Academic Council. The department reports to the Vice-Rector for Research and Clinical Work. After the annual analysis of the academic performance of master's students and dissertation defence, the department makes changes to the CED.

Interviews with six employers were conducted online and included questions about knowledge of the university's mission, participation in developing the mission and making proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of master's students, participation in training master's students through mentoring, providing the department and master's students with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, problems of interaction with departments and the university as a whole, as well as the percentage of employment of master's graduates and other aspects of cooperation.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Comply with 8 basic standards: fully – 8.

Standard 8: MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION

8.1 Management (supervising vice-rector's office)

The management structure of the EP 7M10102 - "Medicine" includes collegial bodies (AC, SC) and structural divisions (specialized department, department of master's and doctoral studies). The highest governing body of the University is the Academic Council. The key structural division responsible for the training of master's students is the specialized department.

The educational programme of the master's degree in the specialty 7M101002- "Medicine" at the university has been functioning since February 15, 2018 on the basis of the state license for educational activities and postgraduate education No. 0137388 dated June 2, 2010 and the corresponding annex to it. The educational process at the postgraduate level is managed by the Vice-Rector for Research and Clinical Work, reporting to the Rector. The Department of Master's and Doctoral Studies is a structural unit of the university responsible for monitoring and managing the educational process of master's students in the specialty 7M10102 - "Medicine", ensuring the implementation of the program and the achievement of the final learning outcomes of master's students.

The Department of Master's and Doctoral Studies has developed the following regulatory documents: "Regulations on the Department of Master's and Doctoral Studies" (dated 14.05. 2019), job descriptions of the department's employees (dated 14.05.2019).

During the meeting with the university management, in particular, with the supervising vice-rector Seidalin Arystan Oskarovich, issues of improving the quality of the educational programme, making changes to it, monitoring the achievements of students, interaction with clinical sites, employment of master's students and the level of satisfaction of practical healthcare organizations with graduates of the program were discussed. Measures to strengthen interaction with medical institutions for practical classes and research increase the academic mobility of students and their participation in research projects and events were also discussed.

8.2 Program Manager (Department of Master's and Doctoral Studies)

The functions of the Department of Master's and Doctoral Studies include participation in the work of the Admissions Committee, consultations with students and faculty on educational issues, analysis of students' academic performance, conducting midterm and final assessments, participation in the work of the CEP, AC, SC; development of internal Regulations and instructions concerning the educational process, as well as documentation of students' academic achievements, enrolment of students in elective disciplines, registration of WC, monitoring of students' academic performance, control over the movement and reporting on the contingent.

The Department of Educational and Methodological Affairs also participates in organizing training in the Master's program; it is responsible for planning the university's educational process, assigning disciplines to departments, monitoring the compliance of documents, procedures and the process as a whole with the requirements of LSI, formation of WC, coordination and development of educational programmes in areas of training, monitoring the organization of educational and methodological work in the university departments, coordination of the formation of a catalogue of elective disciplines in areas of training of all specialties and levels of training; drawing up an academic calendar, drawing up a schedule of classes, midterm assessment, end-of-course assessment.

The Department of Master's and Doctoral Studies works in close cooperation with the Department of Science, the Department of International Cooperation and Academic Mobility, the Office Registrar, the Department of Financial Work and the CEP. At a meeting with experts, the chief specialist of the Department of International Cooperation and Academic Mobility, Tanabergenov Ilan Aikhuatovich, spoke about the internal mobility of master's students at KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov. He also noted that due to the pandemic, external mobility was temporarily suspended, and current mobility requires special attention, given the format of frontal classes for master's students. However, the grant does not always cover the costs of mobility sufficiently. This was confirmed by the master's students in a conversation with experts and they expressed wishes for the allocation of additional funding for mobility.

The analysis of the quality of education and correction of the identified deficiencies in the implementation of the master's degree program in the specialty 7M10102 - Medicine is carried out by the Committee of Educational programmes.

To the question of the questionnaire "Do the organization's leaders listen to your opinion regarding issues related to the educational process, research, clinical work?", 91.7% of teachers answered that they do so systematically, 8.3% answered "sometimes", 0% "quite rarely", 0% "never".

8.3 Academic management (department)

The master's degree program in the specialty 7M10102 - Medicine is implemented in 15 departments. A master's student is assigned to the department where his or her scientific supervisor works.

The Academic staff is presented for the 2023-2024 academic year: Doctors of Science - 9; Candidates of Science - 9; PhD – 1.

The department is the main educational and scientific structural unit that carries out educational, methodological and research work in one or several related disciplines, educational work among students, as well as training of scientific and pedagogical personnel and improving their qualifications. The departments monitor academic performance, make changes to the educational programme in order

to improve the learning process, provide the educational process with faculty and modern educational facilities.

Periodic assessment of the academic leadership of the educational programme at the University includes self-assessment and reporting of the leadership, external evaluation by independent experts (during program accreditation), regular surveys of students and teachers, monitoring and analysis of data on learning outcomes and employment, as well as control over the absence of conflicts of interest. Thus, in a conversation with the teaching staff, the teachers emphasized the importance of regular feedback from students to improve the quality of teaching and confirmed the desire of graduate students to actively participate in research activities.

Also, in a conversation with the teachers of the departments, it was found out that the University pays attention to the continuous professional development of the teaching staff and conducts most of the training at the expense of the University. The teachers confirmed that the advanced training courses are held regularly, ensuring 100% participation of all university employees in the advanced training program.

8.4 Program Management

Educational programme "7M10102 - Medicine" was developed by the working group for the development of educational programmes and sent for discussion and consideration to the Committee of Educational programmes (minutes No 5 of 18.06.2019). Educational programmes, including the accredited one, if their quality is positively assessed, are sent for discussion and approval to the Academic Council (minutes No 6 of 27.06.2019). The approved educational programmes are implemented and realized by the heads of specialized departments.

The academic leaders (program managers) are the Master's and Doctoral Studies Department (Head - Orazoeva F.K.) under the supervision of the Vice-Rector for Research and Clinical Work Seidalin A.O.). The employees have the appropriate qualifications. In their work, they are guided by the Regulations on the Department and job descriptions: https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1sL_NPZW67IYqA2D3tnTxS7KsSa5wMn5S7

The main function of this unit is to participate in the work of the Admissions Committee, consult students and faculty on educational issues, analyse the success of master's students, organize and conduct midterm and end-of-course assessments, participate in committees on the educational programme, academic council, educational and methodological commission; development of internal regulatory documents and instructions related to the educational process, as well as documenting the academic achievements of students.

8.5 Training budget and resource allocation

The self-assessment report provides detailed information on the budgeting of the accredited educational programme, shows the organization's income and expenses, including in dynamics (Table 1), and also provides diagrams. During the visit, experts verified these indicators.

Table 1. Income and expenses for the period from 2019 to 2023. thousand tenge

№	Indicators	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023
1.	Funds received by KRMU for training of master's students in the EP "Medicine"	2796,8	5788,7	7573,8	11322,6	14553,2
	including budget funds	1105,7	3122,0	5268,4	9284,4	13278,2
2.	Expenses, total	1774,3	2899,9	3238,9	7229,1	12703,6
	Salaries and taxes	1240,9	2272,4	2775,0	5852,8	11379,1
	including salaries and taxes of Academic staff	868,6	1590,7	1882,0	3461,6	6075,3
3.	Expenses for advanced training of Academic staff	50,0	55,0	60,0	65,0	70,0
4.	Expenses for the purchase of	97,8	125,4	33,7	271,9	257,2

	educational and scientific literature, electronic textbooks					
5.	Utility expenses	0,13	0,26	0,3	0,42	0,53
6.	Expenses for evaluation of professional readiness	55,1	80,0	-	73,5	82,8
7.	Equipment of material and technical base	50,7	100,4	101,9	554,1	648,5
8.	Other expenses	279,7	266,4	268,0	411,4	265,5

The funds received by KRMU for training master's students in the EP "Medicine" increased by 5.2 times in 2023 compared to 2019, including from budgetary funds - by 12 times (!). There was also an increase in expenses on all items: salaries and taxes, expenses for advanced training of Academic staff, expenses for the purchase of educational and scientific literature, electronic textbooks, utility costs, expenses for evaluation professional readiness, equipping the material and technical base.

The experts received confirmation of the budgeting of the EP in a conversation with the director of the financial work department, Yelemesova Madina Timurovna. She also answered clarifying questions from the experts and confirmed that the university management pays great attention to material and technical equipment, including the implementation of the accredited program. To the experts' questions about the allocation of funds for academic mobility for master's students, Yelemesova M.T. answered that the mobility expenses are allocated in the amount of 62 MCI, but this is not always enough to cover transportation (airfare) and other expenses, master's students pay extra themselves.

8.6 Administration

The structural division of the University responsible for educational programmes and the achievement of the final learning outcomes are the departments, the CEP (Committee of Educational programmes), the DEMW (Department of Educational and Methodological Work), the registrar's office, the Master's and Doctoral Department (MDD). Master's students are included in the CEP (Em Igor Vladimirovich, 2nd year), the Academic Council (Rakhimbaeva Maria Zhumabaykyzy, 2nd year).

At the University, the average ratio of the number of students to teachers for calculating the total number of Academic staff in the field of training in the master's program is 1:6, according to the NPD data.

The process of *administering the educational activities of graduate students* at the University includes planning educational processes (development of curricula and programs, their coordination with state educational standards), organization of the educational process (distribution of teaching staff by academic courses, scheduling classes and exams), quality control of education (periodic monitoring of graduate students' academic performance, conducting midterm and end-of-course assessments, feedback from students and teachers), provision of resources (management of the material and technical base, provision of educational materials, access to library and electronic resources), professional development of employees (organization of advanced training courses and internships for teachers and administrative staff).

The process of *managing the accredited educational programme 7M10102 - Medicine* includes: development of the EP (definition of the program goals and objectives, formation of the curriculum, coordination with state standards and requirements of accreditation bodies), implementation of the EP (ensuring a high-quality educational process, selection of qualified teachers, organization of classes and practical classes), monitoring and evaluation (regular collection and analysis of data on learning outcomes, academic performance of master's students, employment of graduates), conducting an internal audit and self-assessment of the EP, improving the EP (making changes and improvements based on the results of monitoring and feedback from master's students, teachers and practical health workers).

During the visit of the EEC to the University and its divisions, as well as to clinical sites, the experts validated the process of administering the educational activities of master's students and managing the educational programme, specified in the university self-report. The validation was carried out through a cross-sectional survey of university employees, teaching staff, master's students and graduates of the EP, as well as by checking the relevant documentation.

8.7 Requirements and legal documentation

During the accreditation of the educational programme 7M10102 - "Medicine", experts studied 133 units of documents, including regulatory, educational and methodological and reporting documents both before visiting the organization and during the visit to the departments (the list of documents studied is in Annex 2).

The university's website contains regulatory and legal documents that are the basis for the implementation of master's degree educational programmes. Adherence to these documents is reflected in all Regulations and procedures governing the procedure and rules for the implementation of the Master's program: State Compulsory Educational Standard, Academic Policy <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1vCvX-79eCdIvezwhoB9-7mXuSb8YFWxi?usp=sharing> ,

Rules for conducting ongoing monitoring, midterm and final certification of students <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1vCvX-79eCdIvezwhoB9-7mXuSb8YFWxi?usp=sharing> .

Also, the work plan of the educational and methodological centre for the 2023-2024 academic year (dated 08/25/2023, Acting Head of the EMC Sh. Uisenbaeva), consisting of 35 planned events, was studied in detail and validated by experts.

8.8 Review and approval process

A documented process of planning, discussing and updating the educational programme for the specialty 7M10102 - "Medicine" has been introduced (approved at meetings of the Educational programmes Committee (minutes No. 5 of 18.06.2019), the Academic Council (minutes No. 6 of 27.06.2019), and the Academic Council (minutes No. 11-1 of 24.07.2019). The department of master's and doctoral studies is responsible for the implementation of the program; everything is recorded in the minutes. The educational programme for the specialty 7M10102 - "Medicine" was updated in the 2022-23 academic year due to changes in the State Compulsory Educational Standard (Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 4, 2022 No MOH RK-63 "On approval of state compulsory standards for levels of education in (in the field of health care).

Documentation of joint activities with other educational organizations is carried out through the conclusion of memorandums and cooperation agreements. The University has signed Cooperation Agreements with the Russian Medical and Healthcare Institution, with JSC "KazIOR", LLP "Kazakh Medical University" KSPH", Republican Library for Blind and visually impaired citizens, LLC "Institute of Healthcare Management Problems", with Al-Farabi Kazakh National University, KBTU, KRHMC and others. In total, there are more than 20 Agreements. For the purpose of conducting practical training and scientific research, agreements have been concluded with 110 clinical bases, laboratories, scientific organizations and healthcare institutions.

Agreements have been concluded under the ERASMUS+ program with foreign partners: Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation "Novosibirsk State Medical University", Erzincan University named after Bilali Yildirim, Ryazan State Medical University named after Academician I. P. Pavlov, Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation "Novosibirsk State Medical University", Scientific Research Clinical Institute of Childhood of the Ministry of Health of the Moscow Region, National Medical Research Centre named after V. A. Almazov, Tashkent Dental University. Within the framework of these agreements, academic mobility of master's students is provided, including under the master's program in specialty 7M10102 - "Medicine" for an internship.

Applicants are admitted to the Master's program based on the decision of the Admissions Committee and in accordance with the Model Rules for Admission to Education in Educational Organizations Implementing Professional Postgraduate Education Programs, approved by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018. No. 600, the Rules for Admission to the Master's Program (PR-03-13-05, dated August 19, 2021), the Rules for Awarding an Intra-University Grant for Studying in the Master's Program of the NEI "KRMU"

<https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1vCvX-79eCdIvezwhoB9-7mXuSb8YFWxi?usp=sharing>

Responsibility lies with the Master's and Doctoral Studies Department (Head Orazova F.G.).

8.9 Financing

The University has financial stability, which is ensured by the state order for the training of masters in the specialty 7M10102 - "Medicine" and tuition on a fee-paying basis (the cost of tuition is 850,000 tenge per year). The cost of training is determined on the basis of the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 16, 2018 No. 199 "On approval of the State order for the training of specialists with higher and postgraduate education, as well as technical and vocational, after secondary education in educational organizations financed from the republican budget (with the exception of educational organizations training specialists for the armed forces, other troops and military formations, as well as special state bodies) for the 2019-2020, 2020-2021 academic years", as well as the order of the Minister of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated June 30, 2023 No. 302 "On approval of the state educational order for the training of personnel with higher and postgraduate education, in educational organizations financed from the republican budget with the exception of educational organizations training personnel for the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan, other troops and military formations, as well as special state bodies for 2021-2022, 2022-2023, 2023-2024 academic years". The cost of tuition on a paid basis is regulated by the order of the rector annually: order of 26.06.2019 No. 162; order of 21.06.2020 No. 26-03-46-n / k; order of 28.05.2021 No. 26-02-38-n / k; order of 24.06.2022 No. 26-02-66-n / k; order of 03.07.2023 No. 26-02-65-n / k. In addition, the University allocates an intra-university grant for study in the master's degree program at the expense of its own funds in the amount established for financing master's students, at the time of enrolment in the master's degree program. This is regulated by the "Rules for awarding an intra-university educational grant for training in a master's degree" (PR-03-13-10, approved by the SC protocol No. 1, dated 08/14/2021)

In 2023-24, 13 people are studying under state orders, 2 master's students are studying on a fee-paying basis. The main sources of formation of financial resources for the educational process at the university are funds from the republican budget, funds under training contracts on a reimbursable basis and funds from the provision of educational paid services.

The salary fund of master's degree teachers is 6075.3 thousand tenge per year. The average salary of a teacher involved in teaching master's students in the specialty 7M10102 - "Medicine" is 450,000 tenge. In dynamics, the salary of teachers increased by 20% in the 2023-2024 academic year compared to the 2022-2023 academic year.

The costs of purchasing equipment and replenishing the library fund in 2023 amounted to 257.2 thousand, which is 2.7 times more compared to 2019.

8.10 Financial Management and Integrity

Financial matters are under the jurisdiction of the Director of the Department of Financial Work and the Chief Accountant of the University, whose job responsibilities and powers are established by the job description and the Regulation on the Department of Financial Work. The implementation of Master's programs is supported by the salary fund of Master's teachers, provision of students with educational resources (educational and scientific literature, access to the Internet and international information databases of literature, information and communication technologies).

During a conversation with Yelemesova M.T., Director of the Department of Financial Work, she confirmed that the University uses the principle of centralized distribution of financial resources and formation of material assets. Distribution of financial resources occurs in accordance with the approved form of the financial and economic activity plan for the current year.

The scholarship fund is calculated on the basis of orders of the "Office-Registrar" department, issued at the end of each academic period. The scholarship is calculated on the basis of Order No. 26-02-77n/k, issued by NEI "KRMU" on the basis of the Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 02/07/2008 No. 116 in order to implement paragraph 7 of Article 47 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 07/07/07 "On Education".

Approval of financial statements is carried out at the Academic Council annually for the university as a whole.

8.11 Information about the program

Full information about the educational programme is available in the Department of Master's and Doctoral Studies and posted on the university website to be accessible to interested parties. There are various communication channels, including a website, social networks (Instagram, Telegram, VKontakte, YouTube, TikTok and Facebook), leaflets and brochures have been developed containing background information about EP 7M10102 - "Medicine".

The website <https://krmu.edu.kz/> has information on admission to the master's program in three languages in the section Applicant - Master's program.

The university has a structural unit - the Marketing and Public Relations Department, which carries out its work on the basis of the regulation on the structural unit. This department is involved in the admission process to the master's program, disseminating information about the programs through various communication channels, organizing information days, providing consulting services to potential applicants, collaborating with external partners to attract candidates, analysing the educational services market and supporting current master's students throughout their studies.

During interviews with master's students, graduates of the master's program and representatives of practical health care, it turned out that many are not sufficiently aware of the master's programs at this particular university. They emphasized the need for broader information, suggesting increasing the number of advertising and information campaigns, improving the presence in social networks and organizing more events dedicated to the master's programs in order to attract the attention of potential applicants and increase the recognition of the university.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliance with out of 19 basic standards: fully - 17, partially - 2, non-compliance - 0

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) To strengthen research activities by attracting financial resources from third-party organizations and businesses (p. 8.5.2)
- 2) To increase funding for academic mobility programs and research internships (p. 8.5.2)
- 3) To strengthen the marketing strategy to attract more Master's students to the University's educational programmes (p. 8.11.1.)

Standard 9: CONTINEIUS RENEWAL

The University uses the following methods for monitoring and periodic evaluation of its educational programmes as internal university control: certification of current student performance, final certification, certification of all types of practice, checking the state of methodological support for the educational process, collecting and analysing data on consumer satisfaction, and internal audits.

Every year, the Department of Educational and Methodological Work of the University checks the state of methodological support for all departments, as a result of which inspection reports are drawn up. The monitoring results are reported at a meeting of specialized methodological commissions in areas of activity, and specific measures are taken for each department.

In order to create a favourable and effective learning environment, the University annually conducts feedback monitoring in accordance with the Procedure for Evaluating Consumer Satisfaction through Questionnaires. The survey results are analysed at meetings of structural divisions, the Academic Council, and the Scientific Council.

Based on the results of the self-assessment of the educational programme of the master's degree 7M10102 - "Medicine", weaknesses were identified, including the need to introduce a trilingual education program and improve the academic mobility program for Academic staff and master's students in universities of Kazakhstan, as well as near and far abroad. The development of joint educational programmes with foreign partner universities was identified as an opportunity to improve the educational programme.

The organizational structure of the university is reviewed annually in accordance with the ongoing reforms in the field of education and healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan, changes in the practice of global educational management. The organizational structure of the university was updated in 2024 in order to optimize all processes, 4 departments were created: the Department of Audit and Strategic Development, the Department of Educational and Methodological Work, the Department of Work with Students, the Department of Science and International Cooperation (approved at the SC, Minutes No. 8 dated March 29, 2024).

Based on the results of external and internal assessments, a program of corrective measures is developed. For example, in 2019, the University was accredited for a specialized self-assessment of the educational programme 6M110100 - "Medicine" and was recommended to improve the academic mobility program, strengthen the research component, and expand cooperation with international partners to improve the quality of education and ensure compliance with international standards. The University entered into cooperation agreements with Russian universities and prepared an academic mobility program, but the situation with the Covid-19 pandemic suspended the implementation of this program.

As a measure to improve research activities, the University provided for the allocation of intra-university grants, in the implementation of which students are actively involved. These grants are aimed at supporting research projects of students and postgraduates, stimulating their participation in scientific conferences and publishing research results in international journals.

Risk assessment in the educational process is carried out by the Education Quality Management Department, whose tasks include identifying potential risks, analysing and monitoring the educational process, developing measures to minimize risks, and ensuring that educational programmes and processes comply with established standards and requirements. The following risks have been identified with regard to the Master's program: insufficient language training of students for trilingual education, limited opportunities for academic mobility, insufficient funding for scientific research, and possible difficulties in attracting highly qualified teachers due to competition with other educational institutions.

The University conducts benchmarking and includes such leading universities in the country as the Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov, the Medical School of Nazarbayev University, and the Medical University of Karaganda. As a result of benchmarking, innovative methods of educational process management (education quality management system), management of the Master's educational programme (modular rating system), teaching methods (project-oriented learning), methods of assessing Master's students (comprehensive exams and portfolios), and research work (research projects and grant support) have been introduced into the educational process.

However, experts noted that the Academic staff involved in the Master's degree program is dominated by representatives of the older age group. In addition, there is a tendency for the average age of the teaching staff to increase: in the 2023-2024 academic year, it is 63.64 years old compared to 59.81 years old in the 2019-2020 academic year. During the conversation with the University management, this issue was discussed, to which it was noted that, in this regard, the University is actively preparing Master's and Doctoral students for their subsequent employment as teachers, thus

ensuring the renewal and continuity of the Academic staff.

The University allocates resources for continuous improvement, which is documented in the University's strategic development plan for 2019-2025 and in the financial plan (budget) for each academic year. During the EEC visit, the experts reviewed the financial documents of the University and thereby verified the planned, revenue and expenditure parts of the budget for the implementation of EP 7M10102 - "Medicine" for the 2023-2024 academic year. The experts noted an annual increase in expenses, including for advanced training of Academic staff and for equipping the material and technical base.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Of the 4 basic standards, 3 comply fully, 1 partially, 0 do not comply.

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) To involve young teachers in the implementation of educational programmes for the master's degree.

CONCLUSION:

During the external evaluation of the educational programme, it was found that out of 90 standards (including 88 basic standards and 2 improvement standards), 86 standards for accreditation demonstrate full compliance, including 84 basic standards and 2 improvement standards. 4 basic standards are partially fulfilled. No non-compliance with standards was found.

5. Recommendations for improvement of the educational programme 7M10102 - "Medicine":

- 1) To increase the amount of fundamental and applied scientific research financed from external sources in order to expand scientific capabilities, attract additional resources and strengthen the university's position in the international academic community (clause 2.4.5).
- 2) To resume the targeted provision of intra-university grants, which will ensure the continuity of the teaching staff, supporting young teachers and researchers in the development of their research projects and careers, and will contribute to the preservation of human resources, academic mobility and scientific activity at the university (clause 2.4.5).
- 3) To strengthen research activities by attracting financial resources from third-party organizations and business structures (clause 8.5.2)
- 4) To increase funding for academic mobility programs and research internships (clause 8.5.2)
- 5) To strengthen the marketing strategy to attract more Master's students to the University's educational programmes (clause 8.11.1.)
- 6) To attract young teachers to implement Master's educational programmes (Standard 9).

6. Recommendation to the ECAQAQA Accreditation Council

The members of the EEC established the compliance of the educational programme of the master's degree 7M10102 - "Medicine" with the ECAQA Standards for accreditation and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend that the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit this program for a period of 5 years.

	Full name	Signature
Chairman	Shamsutdinova Alfiya Gumarovna	
International Expert	Lilian Shaptefratsi	
Academic Expert	Abdrakhmanova Aliya Zhanalykovna	
Academic Expert	Serikova-Yesengeldina Dinara Serikovna	
Employer Expert	Amangeldi Diana Yerbolkyzy	
Student Expert	Sarzhigitova Kuralai Shokankyzy	

Quality profile and external evaluation criteria according to standards for accreditation of the educational programme of the master's degree in the specialty 7M10102 - "Medicine"

standard	Evaluation criteria	BS/IS*	Total standards	Оценка		
				Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Does not correspond
1	MISSION AND OUTCOMES	5/0	5	5/0	-	-
2	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	19/2	21	18/2	1/0	-
3	ASSESSMENT OF MASTER'S STUDENTS	10/0	10	10/0	-	-
4	MASTER'S STUDENTS	12/0	12	12/0	-	-
5	ACADEMIC STAFF	7/0	7	7/0	-	-
6	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES AND LEARNING ENVIRONMENT	4/0	4	4/0	-	-
7	MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	8/0	8	8/0	-	-
8	MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION	19/0	19	17/0	2/0	-
9	CONTINEIUS RENEWAL	4/0	4	3/0	1/0	-
	* BS – basic standards, IS – improvement standards TOTAL	88/2	90	84/2	4/0	-

Список документов, изученных членами ВЭЖ в рамках проведения внешней оценки образовательной программы магистратуры 7М10102 - «Медицина»

№	Наименования документов	Количество
1.	Организационная структура Университета	1
2.	Стратегический план на 5 лет и мониторинг его выполнения	2
3.	Академическая политика	1
4.	Правила приема в магистратуру	1
5.	Кодекс этики преподавателей; Кодекс этики/поведения	2
6.	Кодекс корпоративной культуры	1
7.	Политика в области качества	1
8.	Отчет по независимому анализу обучения магистрантов	3
9.	Планы и отчеты работы подразделений	8
10.	РУП ОП Магистратура	2
11.	Положения о АС, УС, КОП, НИД, НИРС, ЛЭК	6
12.	Состав Академического совета, УС, КОП, ЛЭК	4
13.	План работы АС, УС, КОП, ЛЭК	4
14.	Выписки из протоколов заседаний совещательных органов	10
15.	Приказы о зачислении в магистратуру, утверждении тем, назначениях научных руководителей и др.	12
16.	Правила присуждения внутривузовских грантов	1
17.	Положение о проведении текущего контроля успеваемости, промежуточной и итоговой аттестации обучающихся	1
18.	Положение о научно и экспериментально-исследовательской работе магистрантов	1
19.	Положение о научных руководителях	1
20.	Положение о инклюзивном образовании	1
21.	Положение о социальной поддержке обучающихся	1
22.	Положение об аттестационной комиссии	1
23.	Положение по прохождению профессиональной практики магистрантами	1
24.	Положение об институте постдипломного образования	1
25.	План улучшения обучения в магистратуре	1
26.	Таблицы к стандартам (ожидаемые компетенции магистрантов, структура заинтересованных сторон и анализ их участия в формулировании миссии и конечных результатов, количественная характеристика образовательной программы по специальности «7М10102-медицина» и др)	18
27.	Инструкция по разработке ОП	1
28.	Рецензия на ОП	6
29.	Правила пользования системы Антиплагиат	1
30.	Меморандумы с зарубежными партнерами	10
31.	Меморандумы с медицинскими организациями	7
32.	Методы обучения (методические инструкции)	1
33.	Чек-листы, контрольные карты	5
34.	Учет успеваемости магистрантов, динамика	1
35.	Портфолио магистрантов	4
36.	Портфолио ППС	4

37.	Результаты анкетирования работодателей	1
38.	Сведения о научной деятельности ППС	1
39.	Кадровая политика	1
40.	Правила внутреннего распорядка	1
41.	Сведения об академической мобильности ППС	1
42.	Сведения об укомплектованности педагогическими и преподавательскими кадрами	1
43.	Финансовая отчетность ОП магистратуры «Медицина»	1

ECAQA