REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION
ON THE RESULTS OF EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL
PROGRAMME
PHD DOCTORAL PROGRAMME 8D10100 "MEDICINE" OF NON-PROFIT
JOINT STOCK COMPANY "MEDICAL UNIVERSITY OF KARAGANDA"
FOR COMPLIANCE WITH STANDARDS FOR ACCREDITATION OF
POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION PROGRAMMES (DOCTORSHIP)
IN MEDICAL EDUCATION ORGANIZATIONS

external expert evaluation period: May 12-14, 2021

Karaganda, 2021
## CONTENT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>List of symbols and abbreviations</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. EEC composition</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. General part of the final report of the EEC</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Presentation of the Non-profit Joint Stock Company &quot;Medical University of Karaganda&quot; and the educational residency programme in the specialty &quot;Obstetrics and gynecology, including children's »</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Information about previous accreditation</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Analysis of the self-assessment report of the educational residency programme in the specialty &quot;Obstetrics and gynecology, including children’s&quot;</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Description of the stages of external expert evaluation and conclusion</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of external assessment and the educational programme of residency in the specialty &quot;Obstetrics and gynecology, including children&quot; NJSC MUK and an overview of the strengths for each standard</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Recommendations for the improvement and educational programme of residency in the specialty &quot;Obstetrics and gynecology, including children&quot; NJSC MUK</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Appendix 1. Quality profile and criteria for external assessment and educational programme of residency in the specialty &quot;Obstetrics and gynecology, including children&quot; NJSC MUK for compliance with ECAQA Accreditation Standards</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Appendix 2. List of documents requested by EEC members in the framework of specialized accreditation</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

SCES - State Compulsory Education Standard
DLT - distance learning technologies
ECAQA - Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and health care
FA - final attestation
IEP - individual educational plan
IR - research work
QED - catalog of elective disciplines
MoH RK - Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES RK - Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
NJSC MUK - Non-profit joint stock company "Medical University of Karaganda"
DPE – Department of postgraduate education
PD - professional development
RT - retraining
EP - educational programmes
WC - working curriculum
NCIE - national center for independent examination
QMS - quality management system
WRUSCM - the work of a resident trainee under the supervision of a clinical mentor during the period of clinical activity of the resident trainee
IWR - independent work of a resident trainee
EMC - educational and methodical council
EMCD - educational and methodological complexes of disciplines
GPA - Grade Point Average - the arithmetic means of the grades received for all completed courses, taking into account the time spent on them
1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 15 dated April 19, 2021, an External Expert Commission was formed to conduct accreditation of educational programmes for bachelor's, residency, master's, doctoral studies in the period May 12-14, 2021 of Non-profit joint-stock company "Medical University of Karaganda" (NJSC MUK) in the following composition:

**Chairperson of the External Expert Commission**
ERMUKHANOVA LYUDMILA SERGEEVNA, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Public health care NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov "
Tel.: +77022330465, e-mail: aleka_2807@mail.ru

**Foreign expert (online)**
SULAEVA OKSANA, PhD, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Secretary General of the Organization of PhD Education in Biomedical Sciences in the European Education System (ORPHEUS), Head of the Pathology Department of the Ukrainian Endocrinological Surgical Center for Research and Practice, Kiev, Republic of Ukraine. In 2012-2014. Director of PhD programmes at Donetsk National Medical University, Member of the European Society of Pathologists, Member of the Inflammation Research Network of Canada.
tel.: +38 099 3809417 e-mail: oksana.sulaieva@gmail.com
National academic expert
URAZOVA SALTANAT NURGOZHAEVNA, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Family Medicine No. 3 NJSC "Astana Medical University"
tel.: +77752248377, e-mail: saltanat.uraz@mail.ru

National academic expert
KURMANOVA ALMAGUL MEDEUBAEVNA, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Clinical specialties of the Higher School of Medicine of the Kazakh National University named after Al-Farabi, leading researcher of JSC "Scientific Center for Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology", Almaty
Tel.: 87058112598, e-mail: zulfiya-zhankalo@mail.ru

National academic expert
ZHAKYPBEKOV KAYRAT SAPARKHANOVICH, PhD, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Organization, Administration and Economics of Pharmacy and Clinical Pharmacy of NJSC Asfendiyarov KazNMU
Tel. +77479224950, e-mail: kairat_phd@mail.ru

Expert - employers' representative
VITT SVETLANA VLADIMIROVNA, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Deputy Director for Medical Work of LLP "City Center of Primary Health Care Karaganda"
tel.: +7 7013579954, e-mail: svvitt@mail.ru
Expert - resident representative (online)
SHAIKHINA DINARA,
1-year resident doctor in the specialty "Anesthesiology and resuscitation, including children's" NUO "Kazakh-Russian Medical University"
tel. + 7777 8189904, e-mail: danara_1107@mail.ru

Expert - student representative
ISKAKOVA SALTANAT MUKTAROVNA,
2nd year student in the specialty "Pharmacy" of the Private Institution Academy "Bolashaq"
tel.: +7 701 2165065, e-mail: balken_1974@mail.ru

ECAQA Observer
UMAROVA MAKPAL ALDIBEKOVNA,
Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department
Of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care
tel.: +7 747 5609212, e-mail: info@ecaqa.org

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC (Order of the ECAQA Director General No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational programme of PhD doctoral studies 8D10100 "Medicine" NJSC "MUK" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards PhD doctoral programmes in health care ECAQA, recommendations of the EEC on further improvement of educational activities of NJSC "MUK" in the field of postgraduate education.

2. General part of the final report of the EEC

2.1 Non-profit joint-stock company "Medical University of Karaganda" and the educational PhD doctoral programme 8D10100 "Medicine"

Karaganda State Medical University was established on the basis of the Decree of the Council of Ministers of the Kazakh SSR No. 65 dated January 20, 1950... According to the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 16, 2018 No. 646, it was reorganized into...
the Non-profit Joint Stock Company "Medical University of Karaganda" (NJSC "MUK"). In 2019 NJSC "MUK" awarded the status of a research university (dated June 27, 2019, No. 453).

The organizational structure of the university includes 7 schools (School of Medicine, School of Dentistry, School of Public Health and Biomedicine, School of Pharmacy, School of Nursing Education, Research School, School of Residency and Professional Development) and the International Faculty of Medicine, Center for Physical Health, Center for Simulation and Educational Technologies (hereinafter – CS&ET), the Center for the Development of Languages and 15 departments. The university teaches 8 undergraduate programmes, 13 graduate programmes, 5 doctoral programmes and 30 residency programmes. In addition, additional training is offered for health and education workers in 52 specialties.

The mission of NJSC "MUK" is to provide a high-quality educational environment that contributes to the training of world-class specialists and worthy citizens, achieving excellence in the development of affordable and high-quality health care, promoting Kazakhstani science, working in partnership with leading universities and introducing innovations to improve the well-being of the population of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Preparation for the PhD doctoral programme 8D10100 "Medicine" in NJSC "MUK" is carried out since 2012. PhD Doctorate Educational Activity 8D10100 "Medicine" is being implemented on the basis of license No. KZ32LAA00016018 dated May 06, 2019; 100 doctoral students were enrolled in training, 59 people were trained, 38 doctoral dissertations were successfully graduated, 37 graduates were awarded PhD degrees, 41 people continue their education.

The purpose of the doctoral educational programme 8D10100 "Medicine" is achievement of such a level of knowledge and skills among trained specialists, which should be sufficient for them to take leading positions in the development and implementation of research and practical programmes in a specific area of medicine and practical work in health care and social security organizations.

The infrastructure of research activities of NJSC "MUK" is represented by:

- Research center, acting as an educational, scientific and practical base of NJSC "MUK", which includes a laboratory for collective use, created in 2012 as part of the implementation of the State Programme for the Development of Health care of the Republic of Kazakhstan "Salamatty Kazakhstan";
- The Institute of Public Health and Occupational Health, which includes an occupational health clinic and a research sanitary and hygienic laboratory.
- Research school, which carries out planning, organization, coordination and methodological support of scientific and innovative activities of the university, implementation of educational programmes of postgraduate education (doctoral studies);
- Scientific and expert council, carrying out the examination of the scientific research of the university, including the dissertations of doctoral students;
- The Bioethics Committee, which carries out the ethical and moral and legal assessment of the university's scientific projects and doctoral students' dissertations, the objects of which are humans and animals;
- The Committee for the Control of Clinical Trials, providing methodological assistance and advisory support in the organization and conduct of clinical trials;
- a quarterly scientific and practical journal "Medicine and Ecology", which publishes articles on various problems of clinical, practical, theoretical and experimental medicine, organization, history and economics of health care, ecology and hygiene, medical and pharmaceutical education. The journal was included in the List of publications recommended by the Committee for Control in Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan until December 31, 2020, indexed in international information resources: Index Copernicus, eLibrary, VseNauki, CyberLeninka, OAL;
- 3 Dissertation Councils (DS) for the defense of doctoral dissertations for the award of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD). The Dissertation Council for the defense of doctoral dissertations for the award of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the specialty 6D110100 "Medicine" was organized by order of the Committee for Control in Education and Science of the
Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 316 dated March 31, 2016, in 2019 DS included in the list of dissertation councils at higher educational institutions that do not have a special status and approved by order of the Committee for Control in Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 207 dated March 04, 2019;

- The main link in the organization of scientific research in NJSC "MUK" are the departments and schools in which educational and scientific laboratories operate and temporary research teams are created, scientific personnel are trained in the framework of the magistracy and PhD doctoral studies.

Priority areas of university research for 2017-2021 (Minutes of the Academic Council No. 8 dated April 10, 2017) are:

- Preventive environment as the basis of public health;
- Personalized approach to the management of a number of significant diseases;
- Comprehensive research aimed at the development and implementation of pharmaceutical products based on domestic herbal raw materials into pharmaceutical production;
- Medical and social problems of the elderly and senile age;
- Research in medical education.

Over the past five years, the university has completed 5 scientific and technical programmes funded from the republican budget (MES RK, MoH RK).

2.2 Information on previous accreditation

PhD Doctorate Educational Activity 8D10100 "Medicine" is being implemented on the basis of license No. KZ32LAA00016018 dated May 06, 2019 in the direction - Postgraduate education, Code 7R091. The name of the direction of training - Health care (medicine).

Specialized accreditation of the educational programme PhD 8D10100 "Medicine" has not been conducted before.

2.3 Analysis of the self-assessment report of the educational programme PhD 8D10100 "Medicine" of NJSC "MUK"

Preparation for specialized accreditation of NJSC "MUK" was carried out on the basis of the order dated January 28, 2021 No. 21 "On approval of the composition of the self-assessment committee." Study Programme Self-Assessment Report presented on 63 pages of main text and electronic versions of documents by reference https://cloud.mail.ru/public/Wa8v/6MkNvxv8Z7

The report is characterized by completeness of answers to all 8 accreditation standards, structuredness, taking into account the recommendations of the ECAQA Self-Assessment Guidelines, as well as internal consistency of information. The report is accompanied by an accompanying a letter signed by the Chairperson of the Board, Rector of NJSC "MUK" R.S. Dosmagambetova, confirming the accuracy of the information and data contained in the report.

The report contains information about the representative of NJSC "MUK" responsible for self-assessment of educational programmes M.A. Ernazarova, Chief Specialist of the Department of Strategic Development and Quality Management.

A working group of 14 people, headed by the chairperson, Ph.D. Ricklefs V.P. Some work was done to prepare the self-assessment report: the content of the accredited educational programme, the conditions for its implementation, staffs, educational resources were analyzed, the necessary information was collected in accordance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education (doctoral) programmes of medical educational organizations (hereinafter - the accreditation standards); a thorough analysis, updating and addition of methodological and educational materials was carried out, their content is reflected in the report. The content of the Self-Assessment Report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards and includes a description of strengths, areas for improvement for each of the 8 standards.

All standards show actual practice NJSC "MUK" for the preparation PhD doctoral students in the specialty 8D10100 "Medicine" taking into account the beginning of the admission of students since 2012, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the
requirements of accreditation standards. In the self-assessment report description fairly completed and updated in term of the number of doctoral students, teachers, administration, information about the selection and admission, the results of training, the results of the assessment of knowledge and skills, the material and technical base of the university and clinical bases. Conclusion on each of the 8 accreditation standards includes a description of the strengths and areas for improvement identified through introspection and development prospects for the specialty.

Thus, the self-assessment report of the accredited educational residency programme of NJSC "MUK" contains objective, structured information on all types of activities in accordance with the ECAQA accreditation standards, and the university made the appropriate corrections in the report at the expert evaluation stage.

3. Description of external expert evaluation

External expert work on the evaluation of the educational programme PhD 8D10100 "Medicine" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for conducting an external assessment of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by order of the Director General of the "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care" No. 5 dated February 17, 2017) and according to the programme and schedule approved on April 19, 2021 Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the rector of NJSC "MUK" R.S. Dosmagambetova...

To obtain objective information on the expert assessment of the accredited educational programme, members of the EEC used the following methods: interviews with management and administrative staff, interviews with doctoral students, observation, study of the website, interviewing employees of various structural units, teachers, questioning teachers and doctoral students, review of resources in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards, the study of regulatory and educational-methodological documents both before the visit to the university and during the visit.

On the part of the NJSC "MUK" staff, the presence of all persons indicated in the visit programme and according to the lists of interview participants (Table 1) was ensured.

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with EEC members on May 12-14, 2021

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Full name</th>
<th>Position</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Dosmagambetova Raushan Sultanovna</td>
<td>Chaiperson of the Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Turmukhambetova Anar Akybekovna</td>
<td>Vice-rector for strategic development and science</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Ricklefs Victor Petrovich</td>
<td>Vice-rector for Academic Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Kosherova Bakhyt Nurgalievna</td>
<td>Vice Rector for Clinical Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Toleubekov Kuat Kuanyshbekovich</td>
<td>secretary responsible for reception</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Loseva Irina Viktorovna</td>
<td>Dean of the School of Pharmacy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Dauletaliyeva Zhania Abaevna</td>
<td>Dean of the School of Public Health and Biomedicine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Edilbaeva Tanzira Tokhtarkhanovna</td>
<td>Dean of the Research School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Tashkenbaeva Venera Bazarbekovna</td>
<td>Dean of the School of Residency and Professional Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Vlasova Lenina Mikhailovna</td>
<td>6B07201 &quot;Technology of pharmaceutical production</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Kayupova Gaukhar Serikovna</td>
<td>7M10108 &quot;Management in public health&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Edilbaeva Tanzira Tokhtarkhanovna</td>
<td>8D10100 &quot;Medicine&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Turdunova Gulmira Sansyzaevna</td>
<td>7R01101 &quot;Obstetrics and gynecology, including children’s&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Sheveleva Nailya Igorevna</td>
<td>7R01129 &quot;Physical medicine and rehabilitation&quot;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The sequence of the visit during December 7-10, 2020 is detailed in the Visit Programme, which is located in the documentation of the accreditation center and in the annex to this report.

Interviews were held with the leadership of the university, questions were asked about risk management in the development of educational programmes (EP), compliance with the principles of openness and transparency, the procedure for evaluating EP, job requirements for EP managers, the availability of academic degrees, the average Hirsch index, publication activity in journals with a high impact factor, how many scientific projects on PTF and MES grants, incentives for teachers for publication activity, the status of the medical journal "Medicine and Ecology", on personnel policy; the presence of our own clinical bases, what measures are being taken for their development, the presence of simulation centers at clinics, during quarantine - the provision of PPE for teachers and students, the possibility of distance learning, issues of commercialization of educational services, international collaboration.

Interviews were held with 39 teachers (including 10 in the specialty 8D10100 "Medicine"), 10 doctoral students in the specialty PhD 8D10100 "Medicine", 17 employers (including 4 in the specialty 8D10100 "Medicine"), 36 graduates (including 10 in the specialty PhD 8D10100 "Medicine").

Interviews with teachers as programme providers PhD 8D10100 "Medicine", showed that there are both successes and problems in the management of the educational programme, since the main developer of the programme in the specialty PhD 8D10100 "Medicine" is the dean of the research school, candidate of chemical sciences Edilbaeva Tanzira Tokhtarkanovna, and teachers in the specialty PhD 8D10100 "Medicine" involved in the preparation of instrumentation and educational and methodological documentation. In order to verify the data of the standard, external experts obtained an opinion on personnel policy and approaches to the development of pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation to work with doctoral students as a scientific advisor. Experts have found that the topics of scientific research is initiated by the departments, the organization of scientific research is carried out through the Research School, at which educational and scientific laboratories function. Doctoral students' dissertations are subjected to various examinations by the Scientific Expert Council, the Bioethics Committee, and the Clinical Trials Control Committee. Questions were asked to teachers on the participation of doctoral students in intra-university, grant research projects, in which publications doctoral students are published, is there a cost reimbursement for publication in WoS Q1-Q2 journals, what are the requirements for scientific supervisors, members of the Dissertation Council, the percentage of successful defenses, how feedback from the doctoral student, which includes a
mandatory component in the preparation for the EP of doctoral studies in the specialty PhD 8D10100 "Medicine", Do scientific laboratories of the university have accreditation?

In order to validate the fulfillment of the data of the self-assessment report and obtain evidence of the quality of the programmes, interviews were conducted with 10 doctoral students in the specialty PhD 8D10100 "Medicine" on the zoom platform. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with studying at NJSC "MUK", the sufficiency of time to collect material, the possibility of scientific internships abroad, participation in international conferences, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, the availability of international databases of professional literature by the resource, the possibility of publication in journals included to the Scopus database and WoS Q1-Q2, the possibility of completing scientific work at the end of the doctoral studies. In general, doctoral students are satisfied with the training, assessment methods and purposefully entered this organization, since they believe that NJSC "MUK" has educational resources, the status of a Research University and international relations.

Doctoral students showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering questions from external experts, including with a foreign expert, Doctor of Medical Sciences, ORPHEUS General Secretary Oksana Sulaeva, demonstrated their judgments on organizing training, assessing their skills, consulting support, opportunities to participate in R&D, funding. The experts studied the documents of doctoral students (curricula, assessment results).

An interview with employers on all educational programmes of residency of NJSC "MUK" declared for accreditation was conducted online and included such questions as: knowledge of the mission of the university, participation in the development of the mission and proposals in the strategic plan, participation in the deliberative bodies of NJSC "MUK", satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of doctoral students, providing the department and doctoral students with the necessary resources, about the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, employment of doctoral graduates, etc.

The resource review showed that NJSC “MUK” has a Research Center, including a Laboratory for Collective Use with a total budget of 1,030 million tenge. The laboratory for collective use is located in a separate wing of the first floor of a four-storey planned building with an autonomous ventilation and air cleaning system, a double redundant power supply system, and a set of specialized rooms. The total area of the Laboratory is 1023.1 sq.m.

The clinic of the Medical University is a structural subdivision of NJSC "MUK" was established in 2018, is located in a 3-storey capital building, covers an area of 2122 sq.m, is equipped with modern medical and diagnostic equipment, an operating room with an uninterruptible power supply, simulation room, pathological bureau.

NJSC "MUK" provides a sufficient material and technical base for teachers and doctoral students, allowing to ensure the high-quality implementation of the educational programme. The material and technical base of the university includes: educational buildings; library and publishing center; laboratory for collective use of the research center; Center for Simulation and Educational Technologies; university clinics; Student Service Center.

Library and publishing center with reading rooms and an electronic library hall with a total area of 1394 sq.m., provides library information, publishing and printing products and services for effective information support of the educational process and research activities of the university...

Center for Simulation and Educational Technologies with a total area of 1300 sq.m. classrooms, 15 classrooms, sector computer technology... More than 27,000 hours are allocated annually for teaching practical skills by clinical departments. Students in 25 disciplines study and practice 171 clinical skills. 3D technologies allow the formation of clinical skills in conditions close to reality, competitions are held for work in the interdisciplinary team "Territory of emergency conditions".

The experts examined the documentation for the educational programme PhD 8D10100 "Medicine" link https://cloud.mail.ru/public/Wa8v/6MkNxv8Z7, which confirmed the compliance with accreditation standards, including documentation on teachers and at the request of members of the EEC.
Then a meeting of the EEC members took place following the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion of the results of external assessment, study of documents, results of interviews, questionnaires was held. The members of the EEC began to design the final report of the EEC.

Individually filled by experts "Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme PhD 8D10100 "Medicine" for compliance with ECAQA Accreditation Standards. No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the postgraduate education sector in general and the department implementing the accredited educational programme were discussed. A draft report with recommendations was prepared.

The Chairperson of the EEC Lyudmila Sergeevna Ermukhanova held a final open vote on recommendations for NJSC "MUK" and a final vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council. Then the chairperson of the EEC for the management and employees of the educational organization announced recommendations based on the results of an external assessment as part of the accreditation of educational programmes for residency specialties.

Results of the survey.

On May 12, 2021, an observer from ECAQA conducted an online survey of students of the Medical University of Karaganda on the resource https://webanketa.com/...

Results of the survey of students:

Total number of respondents - 48... Of these, 52 % are residents of the 1st and 2nd years of study, 16.67% are residents of the 3-4th year of study, 4.17% are bachelors of TFP, 2.1% are undergraduates, 25% are doctoral students, thus in the online survey involved students from all 5 accredited educational programmes.

Based on the results of the survey, students will recommend this university as an educational organization - 87.5% fully agree, and 12.5% partially. The fact that programme managers and teachers are aware of the problems associated with learning - 89.6% strongly agree, 10.42% - partially agree.

Programme managers and teachers involve students in the work of advisory bodies (methodological council, academic council, committees of educational programmes) - answered that they constantly - 87.5%, do not involve or do not know about it, the remaining number of survey participants answered.

97.92% of the respondents are completely satisfied with the conditions and equipment of classrooms, classrooms of this educational organization, partially 2.08%, at the same time, 7.69% are completely dissatisfied. In this educational organization, conditions have been created for students to rest and eat (rest rooms, benches / gazebos on the territory, buffet-dining room) in between classes - 97.92% completely agree. Office equipment (computers, laptops, printers) are available for students in classrooms and practice bases - 95.83% completely agree.

Teachers provide students with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes - 97.92% of respondents are fully satisfied. Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes - to this question 92.31% answered that they completely agree.

The organization of education has access to the participation of students in research work - 95.83% of respondents are fully satisfied, and 4.17% are partially satisfied. Completely (97.92%) and completely dissatisfied (2.08%) with the library fund of the university. Access to electronic educational resources is fully satisfied with 97.92% of people, partially - 2.08%. Satisfied with the availability of students to medical services - 93.75%.

Fully satisfied with the activities of mentors, curators, scientific advisers - 95.83% of the respondents. Agree that teachers and employees of the educational organization are respectful of students - 95.83% of the respondents, but 4.17% do not agree with this. Agree that the university has and is implementing social programmes to support students - 95.83% of people, 4.2% have not heard of such programmes. Know about the activities of the student career counseling service - 85.42% of students, the rest of the students did not hear about it or doubted the answer. 100% of respondents fully agree that the university has a system of self-study for students, residents, undergraduates and doctoral
students. The organization of clinical training at the university was assessed as "excellent" - 79.2%. Good - 20.8%. All respondents are satisfied with the schedule of training sessions.

We fully agree that the university has sufficient time for practical training (supervision of patients, clinical rounds, clinical reviews, assistance in operations, work in laboratories and pharmaceutical production) - 89.6% of respondents.

Fully satisfied with the methods of assessing the knowledge and skills of students - 91.67%, partially - 8.33% of the respondents.

The content of the educational programme (list of disciplines) in the chosen specialty meets my expectations - fully according to 91.67%, partially - 8.33%.

According to 95.83% of respondents, teachers regularly use active and interactive teaching methods. 100% of respondents answered that teachers regularly provide feedback (listens to your opinion, conduct mini-questionnaires, work on mistakes). The teacher (mentor, curator) of this educational organization is an example for residents -91.67% answered that they completely agree with this, at the same time 8.33% of students noted that “not all university teachers”.

According to 91.67% of respondents, there is sufficient time for practical training (supervision of patients, clinical rounds, clinical reviews, assistance during operations). 100% of the answers stated that the university leadership is available to students. More than 89% of respondents are engaged in research and development. More than 47% of respondents have one publication in the journal, more than one in 41.67%, more than 6% are planning to publish it, which is understandable, since the respondents were undergraduates and doctoral students.

100% of the respondents are satisfied with the organization of teaching and are confident that this organization of education allows you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the chosen specialty.

The majority (91.67%) of respondents believe that the accreditation of an educational institution and educational programmes is an important and necessary mechanism for ensuring the quality of education in residency, the rest doubt the answer. 97.92% of the respondents gave a positive assessment to the work of the External Expert Commission on accreditation of the university. At the same time, more than 89% of the respondents participated in the self-assessment of the university and in organizing a meeting of the commission.

Conclusions: with their answers, most of the students of 5 educational programmes are completely satisfied with the organization of training, relationships with teachers, the attitude of the university administration towards them, and the availability of educational resources. More than 95% of respondents highly rated the hands-on training and teaching methods used by the teachers. In general, the university has a corporate spirit and student support. At the same time, some of the respondents have complaints about equipping classrooms and classrooms, and not all students know about the work of the employment center and graduates' careers.

The work of the external expert commission of the accreditation center was highly appreciated and the respondents had an understanding of the need for accreditation as a procedure for ensuring the quality of higher and postgraduate education.

Results of a survey of teachers of the Medical University of Karaganda
The ECAQA observer, as part of the external evaluation programme, conducted a questionnaire survey on May 12, which included 22 questions, allowing to draw conclusions about the attitude of teachers to the organization of the educational process and identify existing problems.

The total number of respondents - 27, including those with work experience of up to 5 years - 3.7%, up to 10 years - 7.41%, over 10 years - 88.89%. The survey included teachers of the following educational programmes (%):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Educational Programme</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pharmaceutical Manufacturing Technology (Bachelor's Degree)</td>
<td>14.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Health Management (PH), Master's Degree</td>
<td>11.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medicine, doctoral studies</td>
<td>18.52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health care / Health care Management, Doctorate</td>
<td>3.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Fully satisfied with the organization of the educational process 74.07%, partially - 22.22%, no answer - 3.7% (1 person). At the university, ethics is observed and subordination is fully agreed by 92.6%. 74.07% of respondents are completely satisfied with the organization of work and workplace, partially 25.93%. In the organization there is an opportunity for career growth and the development of competence for teachers - 92.59% fully agree, 3.7% partially, but there were some answers that spoke of disagreement on this issue (3.7%).

In this educational organization, 81.48% of teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research, but the rest of the respondents deny this fact. Only 51.85% of the teachers surveyed are satisfied with the salary. 74.07% are completely satisfied with the personnel service.

More than 74% of respondents underwent advanced training during the last year, at the same time 18.52% - more than 5 years ago, and 7.41% did not give an answer.

77.8% of respondents fully agree that the discipline they teach is provided with sufficient resources (classrooms, equipment). Fully agree that at the university there is an opportunity for teachers to realize themselves as professionals in their specialty - 85.2% of the respondents, the rest either partially agree with this or completely disagree (7.41%).

More than 85% of the teachers who answered the questionnaire actively participated in the development of the educational programme, others either did not participate (14.8%), or were only electives (7.41%), or did not answer the question (7.41%). The timeliness of the execution of applications for the acquisition of methodological and didactic materials, office equipment, stationery to ensure the educational process in the organization is considered to be timely - 77.8% of the respondents. The university supports participation in conferences (international, republican): by paying for travel, travel expenses, registration fees, according to only 44% of teachers, and 26% did not apply for this to the management, at the same time 14.81% did not give an answer to this question at all.

More than 74% of the interviewed teachers fully agree that students have free access to patients and resources of the university practice bases.

University teachers rated their publication activity on a 5-point scale as follows: 3 points (18.52%), 4 points (48.15%), 5 points (18.52%), 49.74% did not rate themselves in any way ...

Only 63% of respondents know about the implementation of social programmes to support teachers, but at the same time, almost 37% of respondents doubt and do not know about it.

Almost 52% of the respondents note that the management of the university systematically listens to teachers on issues related to the educational process, research and development, clinical work, sometimes - 25.93%, rather rarely - 7.41%, never - 3.7%, not answered this question 11.11%.

When organizing classes, teachers use a variety of teaching methods, but more often analysis of situational tasks (74.07%), work in small groups (74.07%), problem-oriented learning (62.96%), written assignments (59, 26%), interactive learning (55.6%). As before, oral polls and analysis of the topic are often used (51.8% and 44.4%, respectively), solving tests and completing projects / term papers (44.4% each), drafting and solving cases (40.74%) and lectures (48%). At the same time, lectures are still read (33%), although this is not provided for in the residency programme.

Almost 63% of teachers fully agree that this survey is useful for developing recommendations for improving the key areas of the university's activities, and 25.93% - in part.

More than 89% of respondents participated in self-assessments within the framework of specialized accreditation.

More than 33% of those surveyed want to become experts on accreditation of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care, and 11.1% previously participated in the work of external expert commissions. The remaining 56% of respondents are not interested in this question or have doubts about the answer.
More than 92% of respondents believe that the work of the external expert commission on accreditation can fully cover all issues related to the quality of implementation of educational programmes of the university, since a visit to the university is preceded by a stage of self-assessment of educational programmes (70.4%), the commission examines all the main processes of programme implementation (52%), the programme of the commission's visit is very rich and covers all key aspects of education at the university (41%). The programme of the commission includes interviews and interviews with stakeholders, allowing to draw conclusions about the quality of education (48.15%), however, 37% of faculty responded that the professionalism and competence of accreditation experts play an important role.

In its work, the external expert commission on accreditation uses various techniques and methods of assessment, but the most important are interviews with the management of the university and heads of educational programmes (14.8% each), interviews with alumni (7.41%), studying resources and visiting practical classes (3.7% each). However, all of the above approaches are equally important in the opinion of 37% of respondents.

Conclusions: The survey showed that more than 2/3 of the respondents are satisfied with the organization of the educational process at the university and the majority have the opportunity to engage in research and development. At the same time, more than a quarter of the respondents underwent advanced training more than 5 years ago. It was determined that only 2/3 believe that the discipline they teach is fully provided with appropriate and sufficient resources and that students have free access to the resources of practice bases. It is alarming that almost 40% of the respondents could not assess their publication activity in any way and do not know about the social programmes to support teachers existing at the university.

Almost half of the respondents doubt that their opinion is taken into account by the university administration and only 63% believe that the results of this survey can be useful for developing recommendations for improving the key areas of the university's activities...

Thus, areas for improvement have been identified: improving the qualifications of teachers in pedagogy, teaching methods; increasing the publication activity of teachers and supporting the university in this matter; informing teachers about social support programmes.

**Conclusion on the basis of the external evaluation:**

Members of the EEC have carefully studied and evaluated the main indicators of the accredited educational programme. The information received by external experts during the study of the self-assessment report, preparation of a written review with recommendations for improvement, implementation of the activities of the visit programme for NJSC "MUK" May 12-14, 2021 All the information received was compared with the data of the self-assessment report, the information was validated for each criterion of accreditation standards and the indicators of the appendix to the self-assessment report were verified, which made it possible to make sure of the reliability of the information provided by NJSC MUK information and supporting documents for compliance with ECAQA Accreditation Standards.

Despite the fact that in the self-assessment report of the educational programme, NJSC "MUK" described its real educational practice in postgraduate education. Before visiting the organization by accessing https://cloud.mail.ru/public/saYd/McFP3ceBy, experts reviewed more than 120 documents, and also during an external expert assessment by members of the EEC studied the main documents (mission, academic policy, Code of honor of teachers and students, the position of the research center, teaching materials of disciplines, syllabuses, control and measuring instruments, individual plans of doctoral students for the 2019-2020 academic year, publications of teachers, rules for admission to doctoral studies, personnel policy, the programme of the internal quality assurance system, resources for training were viewed directly at the clinical bases of departments (classrooms, office equipment available for doctoral students to work with literature, patient documentation, educational and methodological literature), which made it possible to identify the compliance of the educational organization with basic accreditation standards.

The accredited educational programme of doctoral studies was approved by the Academic
Committee of the School of Medicine (Protocol No. 8 of April 17, 2019), the Academic Council of NJSC "MUK" (Protocol No. 6 of April 23, 2019) and approved at a meeting of the Academic Council of NJSC "MUK" (Minutes No. 11 dated April 25, 2019). After approval, the educational programme was entered into the Register of educational programmes, passed the examination procedure, registered in the register on 09.12.

For an accredited educational programme PhD 8D10100 "Medicine" there are Center for Simulation and Educational Technologies, Research Center with a Laboratory for Collective Use, clinical bases of the university in health care organizations and its own medical clinics (medical university clinic, dental clinic, professional health clinic).

The educational component makes up 30% of the total EP (53 academic credits), consists of cycles of basic and major disciplines, which include disciplines of the university component and an optional component, teaching and research practice. The scientific component of the EP of doctoral studies is formed from the research work of a doctoral student, scientific publications, writing and defense of a doctoral dissertation. The volume of the scientific component is 64% or 115 academic credits.

The Dissertation Council for the defense of doctoral dissertations for the award of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the specialty 6D110100 "Medicine" was organized by order of the Committee for Control in Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 316 dated March 31, 2016, in 2019 DS included in the list of dissertation councils at higher educational institutions that do not have a special status and approved by order of the Committee for Control in Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 207 dated March 04, 2019.

In connection with the new edition of the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated March 31, 2011 No. 127 "On approval of the Rules for awarding degrees" there have been changes and additions in the educational programme in relation to the presentation of the dissertation - in the form of a thesis or a series of at least two articles and one review published in publications included in the first and / or second quartile according to Journal Citation Reports by Clarivate Analytics; in one of the articles the doctoral student is the first author or the first author for correspondence.

The experts took into account the fact that the accredited educational programme for the current state educational standard is being implemented for 3 academic years, at this time there are 5 issues. All educational, methodological, personnel and resource bases were assessed for compliance with accreditation standards. Through interviews with teachers and interviews with students, it was possible to determine their direct participation in the development of the educational programme, the assessment of educational programmes, decision-making on a number of key issues in the choice of clinical sites, topics of electives, participation in the appeal commissions for admission and assessment, the development of the content of individual plans doctoral students.

Recommendations for improving activities in the field of implementation of the educational programme PhD 8D10100 "Medicine" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards, developed by the EEC based on the results of the expert assessment, were presented at a meeting with the management on May 14, 2021.

The programme of the 3-day visit (12-14.05.2021) of the external expert assessment of the EEC has been completed in full. On the part of the team NJSC "MUK" participation of all persons specified in the programme is ensured.

Thus, the external assessment and the visit of the EEC members made it possible to verify and validate the data of the programme self-assessment report. PhD 8D10100 "Medicine" in full in accordance with the Regulation on the External Expert Commission, Guidelines for external evaluation of a medical organization ECAQA education.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all necessary information and material resources of the accredited educational programme was organized. Experts note the high level of corporate culture and discipline of employees responsible for postgraduate
education in NJSC "MUK", department, employees of clinical bases, a high degree of openness of the team in providing information to members of the EEC.

4. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of the PhD educational programme "Medicine" and an overview of the strengths for each standard.

**Standard 1: RESEARCH ENVIRONMENT**
NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda" is one of the leading educational and scientific centers of the Karaganda region. Has many years of successful experience in performing scientific research in the field of medicine. The university has historically established scientific schools and directions "Surgery", "Clinical medicine" and "Study of biochemical, genetic, morphological mechanisms of the development of pathological processes."

Over the past five years, the university has completed 5 scientific and technical programmes funded from the republican budget (MES RK, MoH RK), 14 grant funding projects, 10 clinical trials under contracts with domestic and foreign organizations, including 3 international multicenter clinical trials (III phase).

The infrastructure of research activities of NJSC "MUK" is represented by the Research Center, the Institute of Public Health and Professional Health, the Research School, the Scientific Expert Council, the Bioethics Committee, the Clinical Trials Control Committee, the Dissertation Council for the defense of doctoral dissertations for the award of the degree of doctor philosophy (PhD) with a degree in Medicine.

There are clinical bases with the ability to access information systems (CIIS). Center for Simulation and Educational Technologies (CSET). The university has been a member of the Academic Integrity League since 2018.

**Strengths:**
1. Purposeful policy to attract young researchers and students to the implementation of scientific research of the university;
2. Special status of a research university;
3. The demand for educational programmes for doctoral studies and additional education among potential students;
4. A stable reputation among medical organizations and development prospects, taking into account modern requirements for health care professionals;

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 6 standards conform: completely - 5, significantly - 1, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**
1. Provide for the possibility of developing joint educational programmes in the accredited specialty with foreign universities

**Standard 2: OUTCOMES**
The end results of doctoral studies are:
- the corresponding number of collected credits;
- publication of the main results on the research topic in reputable scientific journals in accordance with the requirements of the Rules for awarding degrees;
- defense of dissertation work.

Graduates of educational doctoral studies are in demand in the labor market in the field of education and science in the field of health care, as evidenced by 100% employment of doctoral graduates, mainly in the NJSC "MUK".

**Strengths:**
1. Competencies obtained during the period of study in doctoral studies allow to fully fulfill labor duties in educational, clinical and scientific activities;
2. Implementation of educational programmes at relevant clinical sites and laboratories;

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 3 standards conform: completely - 3, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 2: completed**

*Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:* not

**Standard 3: ADMISSION POLICY AND CRITERIA**

The NJSC "MUK" has developed an "Academic Policy", "Regulations on the rating system for evaluating students' academic performance". The annual review of the admission policy for doctoral studies is carried out in accordance with the regulatory documents of the authorized body, internal decisions of the NJSC "MUK", taking into account social and professional data, as well as the requirements of the labor market.

The criteria for applicants entering the doctoral program "Medicine" are determined according to the requirements of the State Educational System of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the current Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education", "Standard rules for admission to educational organizations implementing educational programs of higher and postgraduate education", approved by Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 31.10.2018 No. 600.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year of start of training</th>
<th>Number of doctoral students accepted for training</th>
<th>Year of completion of training</th>
<th>The number of doctoral students who completed their studies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2015 year</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2018 year</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016 year</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2019 year</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017 year</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>2020 year</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total:</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>Total:</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

When approving the topics of dissertation research, the provision of the material, technical and laboratory base of NJSC "MUK" is considered for the full implementation of research using its own resources, if necessary, resources of republican and foreign universities and scientific organizations are involved on the basis of existing memorandums of cooperation...

**Strengths:**

1. Assessment of educational achievements of students is carried out using criteria, regulations and procedures developed in accordance with the goals and objectives for the implementation of the educational programme;
2. Eligibility of Applicants for PhD doctoral programme 8D10100 "Medicine" of NJSC "MUK" regulatory documents RK;

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 6 standards conform: fully - 5, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 3: completed**

*Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:* not

**Standard 4: PHD TRAINING PROGRAMME**

The main goal of the educational programme of doctoral PhD "Medicine" is to achieve a level of knowledge and skills among trained specialists, which should be sufficient for them to take leading positions in the development and implementation of research and practical programmes in a specific direction of medicine and practical work in health care organizations and social security.

To achieve these tasks, the university ensures that doctoral students acquire the necessary knowledge and competencies based on the study of basic and specialized disciplines, the formation of skills and abilities during professional (pedagogical, research) practice and when performing research
The PhD educational programme 8D10100 "Medicine" of NJSC "MUK" in the scientific and pedagogical direction is implemented with a training period of at least three years, is a full-time form of study and involves full-time employment. The use of distance learning technologies for postgraduate education programmes is provided.

**Strengths:**
1. Doctoral students have the opportunity to participate in training events with the involvement of leading foreign experts, to participate in foreign internships, in educational activities for the development of professional skills;
2. Involvement of students in the work of consultative and advisory bodies to participate in decision-making regarding the educational programme;

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 10 standards conform: fully - 9, significantly - 1, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

**Standard 4: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**
- Provide for the possibility of developing joint educational programmes in the accredited specialty with foreign universities.

**Standard 5: SUPERVISION**

33 Doctors of Sciences, 17 Candidates of Sciences, from 2019 - 2 PhDs in Medicine were involved in supervising the dissertation work of doctoral students of the EP Doctoral study "Medicine" from among the staff of the teaching staff of the university. The total number of domestic consultants was 54, of which 51 are full-time teachers, 3 are freelance teachers. Admission to teaching positions at the university is carried out in accordance with the Rules of admission for employment in NJSC "MUK".

Candidates for scientific consultants for the EP doctoral studies "Medicine" are considered and discussed at the School Council and approved by the Senate of the University in accordance with the Regulations on doctoral studies and Academic Policy of NJSC "MUK". Scientific guidance is approved by the order of the Chaiperson of the Board - Rector of NJSC "MUK" on the basis of the decision of the Senate.

The number of doctoral students assigned to the main scientific advisor does not exceed 3 students. When performing dissertation research at the junction of various scientific areas, the introduction of a co-supervisor of a doctoral student is practiced.

When choosing scientific consultants for doctoral students, they are guided by the following principles: high professional competence, active research practice in the field of health and medical sciences, the presence of a scientific degree (doctor or candidate of sciences) or a PhD degree, experience of scientific and pedagogical work for at least three years, by the author 2 articles in scientific journals that are 1, 2, 3 quartile according to JCR data in WoS or have a CiteScore percentile of at least 35, or a Hirsch index of 2 or more.

**Strengths:**
1. HR policy of MUK, taking into account scientific, pedagogical and clinical merit of the applicants.
2. The programme for the development of pedagogical competencies and organizers of educational programmes, which provides an opportunity to improve the qualifications of teaching staff in foreign scientific and clinical centers.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 14 standards conform: completely - 13, significantly - 1, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 5: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:** none

**Standard 6: PHD THESIS**

NJSC "MUK", when evaluating dissertations, complies with the requirements for the publication
of the main scientific results of the dissertation for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), doctor in the field. Human and animal research theses are subject to good clinical practice and ethical requirements, and Turnitin has been implemented to identify coincidences...

Requirements for the number and quality of publications are reflected in the Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated March 31, 2011 No. 127 "On approval of the Rules for awarding degrees" with additions.


**Strengths:**
1. Security 98% of successful defenses with the award of a PhD degree in the last 3 years...
2. Support of educational programmes with appropriate IT technologies, library resources with access to international databases of professional literature;

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 11 standards conform: completely - 11, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

**Standard 6: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

**Standard 7: ASSESSMENT**

Requirements for the content and design of a doctoral dissertation are set out in the instructions for the design of the dissertation and the author's abstract, approved by the order of the Chairperson of the Higher Attestation Commission of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated September 28, 2004 No.

During the period of study in doctoral studies, the following assessment of dissertation works is provided and implemented:
- a preliminary discussion of the dissertation work is carried out at a meeting of the department / division of the university,
- the procedure for discussing the dissertation work of a doctoral student at the Scientific and Expert Council of the University,

The regulation on the Dissertation Council meets the requirements of regulatory documents by the Committee for Control in the Field of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan. When appointing official reviewers, the Dissertation Council is guided by the principle of independence of reviewers and scientific consultants from each other. In order to comply with the principle of transparency, openness and accessibility of the results of the dissertation, conducting the defense of the dissertation for interested parties and the public, the Dissertation Council places materials on the Internet resource of NJSC "MUK" about the defenses of doctoral students and the activities of the Council

**Strengths:**
1. Compliance with the principles of openness and transparency in the assessment of dissertation work.
2. The presence of a dissertation council for the defense of dissertations in the direction of "Medicine"

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 9 standards conform: completely - 0, significantly - 1, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 7: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**
1) Attracting foreign scientists to the dissertation council

**Standard 8: GRADUATE INSTITUTION STRUCTURE**
In accordance with the strategic plan, the university plans and further provides a financial strategy corresponding to the mission, goals and objectives of the university, mainly to ensure the implementation of educational programmes.

The main financial document of the university is the Development Plan, which is approved at a meeting of the Board of Directors.

There is an Internet resource of the university, on which educational resources are available for teaching staff and students, information about structural divisions is posted, the main events from the life of the university are highlighted.

Quality assessment at the level of the educational programme is ensured by the Quality Assurance Commission, at the institutional level by the Department of Strategic Development and Quality Management.

**Strengths:**

1. Availability of all necessary resources for the proper implementation of the doctoral programme.
2. Transparency of educational programme management;
3. Awareness of participants in the educational process through the placement of information on the educational programme on the website;

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 9 standards conform: completely - 9, significantly - 0, partially - 1, do not correspond - 0

**Standard 8:** completed

*Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none*

Thus, all 8 accreditation standards have been met, no inconsistencies in the fulfillment of the criteria of each of the basic accreditation standards in the process of analyzing the self-assessment report and conducting the examination as part of the tasks of the external expert evaluation programme were found.

5. **Recommendations for improving the educational programme of doctoral PhD "Medicine":**

1) Provide for the possibility of developing joint educational programmes in the accredited specialty with foreign universities
7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council
The members of the EEC came to a unanimous decision to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit the PhD doctoral programme 8D10100 "Medicine" of NJSC "MUK" for a period of 5 years.

Chaiperson
Ermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeevna
Foreign expert
Sulaeva Oksana Nikolaevna
Academic expert
Urazova Saltanat Nurguzhaevna
Academic expert
Kurmanova Almagul Medeubayevna
Academic expert
Zhakypbekov Kairat Saparkhanovich
Representative of practical health care
Vitt Svetlana Vladimirovna
Resident Representative
Shaikhina dinara
Student Representative
Iskakova Saltanat Mukhtarovna
ECAQA Observer
Umarova Makpal Aldibekova
Quality profile and external evaluation criteria (summary) of PhD doctoral programme 8D10100 "Medicine" Of NJSC "MUK" for compliance with Accreditation standards of ECAQA for doctoral PhD programmes in health care

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Standard</th>
<th>Criteria for evaluation</th>
<th>Total Standards</th>
<th>Assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number of standards = BS * / SU</td>
<td></td>
<td>Completely corresponds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. RESEARCH ENVIRONMENT</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. OUTCOMES</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. ADMISSION POLICY AND CRITERIA</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. PHD TRAINING PROGRAMME</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. SUPERVISION</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. PHD THESIS</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. ASSESSMENT</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. GRADUATE INSTITUTION STRUCTURE</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* BS - the basic standard must be fulfilled by each medical educational organization, and the fulfillment must be demonstrated during an external assessment of the medical educational and scientific organization.
## Appendix 2.

### List of documents requested by EEC members within the framework of accreditation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Names of documents</th>
<th>number</th>
<th>Date of approval (if applicable)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Information about educational buildings of NJSC &quot;MUK&quot;</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>03/06/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Information about the university library</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>03/06/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Characteristics of clinical sites, organizations for training doctoral students</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>03/06/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>List of foreign organizations that have concluded an agreement on joint training of PhD doctoral students</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>03/06/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Expected competencies of PhD doctoral students</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>03/06/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Contingent of PhD doctoral students in the specialty &quot;8D10100 - Medicine&quot;</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Arrears of doctoral students for tuition fees enrolled in an accredited educational programme (if any)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>03/06/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Quantitative characteristics of the educational programme in the specialty &quot;8D10100 - Medicine&quot;</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>03/06/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Information about the disciplines of the educational programme of doctoral studies 8D10100 &quot;Medicine&quot;</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>03/06/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Information about the participation of doctoral students in scientific events</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>03/06/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Pedagogical and / or industrial practice</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>03/06/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Research (experimental) work</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>03/06/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>The staff of teachers of the departments implementing the educational programme</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>03/06/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>Indicators of research activity</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>03/06/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>Information about the teachers of the profiling departments who have been trained in professional skills</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>03/06/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>Order No. 142 On the transition to training using distance educational technologies</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>03/14/2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>Regulations on doctoral studies at NJSC &quot;MUK&quot;</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>26.08.2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.</td>
<td>Regulation on the Scientific and Expert Council</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>03/11/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.</td>
<td>Regulations on the Bioethics Committee of NJSC &quot;MUK&quot;</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>05/23/2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20.</td>
<td>Regulations on the Dissertation Council</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>28.03.2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21.</td>
<td>Educational programme &quot;8D10100 - Medicine&quot;</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>04/25/2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22.</td>
<td>Code of Business Ethics NJSC &quot;MUK&quot;</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>24.08.2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23.</td>
<td>Information about the employment of PhD doctoral graduates</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>03/06/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24.</td>
<td>Information about the teachers of the profiling departments who have been trained in professional skills</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>03/06/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25.</td>
<td>Indicators of research activity</td>
<td></td>
<td>03/06/2021</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>