REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSIONS ON THE EVALUATION OF
THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME 7R09141 "AMBULANCE AND
EMERGENCY MEDICAL CARE" OF ASFENDIYAROV KAZNMU FOR
COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR
PROGRAMMES OF POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION (RESIDENCY
SPECIALTY) MEDICAL ORGANIZATIONS OF EDUCATION

period of external expert evaluation: 18.11.-20.11.2020

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission
In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 18 of 23.10.2020, an External Expert Commission was
formed to conduct accreditation of educational programmes of residency specialties of Asfendiyarov
KazNMU in the period 18-20.11.2020 in the following composition:

Chairman of the External Expert Commission
TURGUNOV ERMEK MEYRAMOVICH,
Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the
Department of Surgical Diseases of the NJSC
"Medical University of Karaganda", President of
the NGO "Surgical Association of the Karaganda
Region", a member of the International Surgery
Society, a member of the "Association of
Independent Experts of Astana" and the "Union
of Independent experts of KSMU "

Foreign expert
KASHIRSKAYA NATALIA YURIEVNA,
Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Chief
Researcher, Laboratory of Genetic Epidemiology,
Federal State Budgetary Scientific Institution
"Medical Genetic Research Centre named after
Academician N.P. Bochkov",
Moscow, Russian Federation

National academic expert
JUMALINA AKMARAL KANASHEVNA,
Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of
the Department of Pediatric Diseases with
Neonatology
NJSC "West Kazakhstan State Medical
University named after Marat Ospanov"
National academic expert
RAMAZANOVA RAYGUL MUKHANBETOVNA, MD, Head of the Hematology Course JSC "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education"

National academic expert
ESENGARAYEVA SAULE DAMIROVNA, Ph.D., Head of the Department of Medical Rehabilitation with the Course of Sports Medicine JSC "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education"

National academic expert
BEKETOVA BAYAN BEISENGALIEVNA, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Assistant of the Department of Clinical and radiation oncology NJSC "Semey Medical University"

National academic expert
AKHMETOVA ALMIRA KALIKAPASOVNA, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Dermatovenereology and Cosmetology NJSC "Semey Medical University"

National academic expert
URAZOVA SALTANAT NURGOZHAEVNA, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of General Medical Practice with a course of evidence-based medicine NJSC "Astana Medical University"
National academic expert
KALIEVA SHOLPAN SABATAEVNA, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Clinical Pharmacology and Evidence-Based Medicine NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda"

National academic expert
ZHANTELEIEVA LAZZAT ASANOVNA, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Deputy Chairman of the Board for Research Work of JSC "Scientific Centre of Urology named after B.U.Dzharybusynov"

National academic expert
MADYAROV VALENTIN MANARBEKOVICH, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Surgery with a course of anaesthesiology and resuscitation, Non-Profit Organization "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University"

National academic expert
SADIEVA ZHANAR ZAMANKHANOVNA, anaesthesiologist-resuscitator, head of the postgraduate education department of the South Kazakhstan Medical Academy JSC

National academic expert
LOVINSKAYA ANNA VLADIMIROVNA, Senior Lecturer of the Department of Molecular Biology and Genetics, Al-Farabi Kazakh National University, Senior Researcher of the Research Institute of Biology and Biotechnology Problems of the RSE “Al -Farabi Kazakh National University"
The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC (Order of
the ECAQA Director General No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" of KazNMU for compliance with the Accreditation Standards programmes of postgraduate education (specialty residency) of medical educational institutions of ECAQA, recommendations of the EEC on the further improvement of the educational activities of the university in the field of postgraduate education.

2. General part the final report of the EEC

2.1 Presentation KazNMU them. S.D. Asfendiyarov and the educational residency programme in the specialty 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care"

In 2020, KazNMU turns 90 and in 2018 the university was reorganized into a non-profit joint-stock company (hereinafter - NJSC) by the Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 5, 2018 No. 166 and received the status of a research university (resolution of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 12.11.2018).

In accordance with the Strategy of KazNMU for 2019-2023, the basis of KazNMU's activities is the trinity - the integration of academic, scientific and clinical activities in order to provide high-quality and modern medical care to the population and training of professional personnel. In this regard, by 2018, the university included 5 republican state enterprises, including: JSC Scientific Center for Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology, JSC Scientific Center for Pediatrics and Pediatric Surgery, JSC Scientific Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Medicine, JSC "Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology", JSC "Scientific Center of Surgery named after A.N. Syzganov ".

KazNMU is one of the founders of the Academic Demanding League, which aims to improve the quality of education by implementing and promoting the principles of academic honesty. The international information and analytical platform Web of Science in November 2019 awarded KazNMU an independent award "Leader in publication activity in the Web of Science Core Collection over the past 5 years among medical universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan."

KazNMU cooperates with 102 universities, medical and scientific organizations of the near and far abroad, including with TOP-500 universities, implementing joint scientific, research and educational projects.

KazNMU is a full member of international Associations: International Association for Medical Education in Europe (AMEE), European Association of Dental Education (ADEE), World Federation of Dentists (FDI), European Federation of Dentists (EROFDI), European Association of Universities (EUA), International Association of Universities (IUA), the Association of Higher Schools of Management (GSM Barcelona), the World Federation of Pharmacists, the Association for Distance Education "Siberian Open University", the Association of Schools of Public Health in Europe (ASPHER). In 2015, KazNMU became a member of the Association of European Medical Schools (AMSE) and the Organization of PhD Education in Biomedicine and Health Sciences in the European System (ORPHEUS).

Residency was introduced in accordance with the Law "On Education". The first admission to residency was held in 2008. The first issue of residents was carried out in 2010.

For 2020, residency is being implemented in 44 specialties, including 19 educational programmes being accredited for the first time. 605 residents studied at KazNMU from 2017 to 2020. The University trains residents on the basis of 104 clinics, polyclinics, research institutes, and scientific centers. University clinics are: clinic "Aksai", clinic of internal diseases of KazNMU, professorial clinic of KazNMU, dental clinic.

Thus, KazNMU is an innovation-oriented and socially responsible university, a leader in the Republic of Kazakhstan and Central Asia in multi-level training of competitive healthcare and pharmacy specialists through the implementation of a competence-based model of medical and pharmaceutical education with the wide involvement of domestic and foreign scientists and a constant increase in scientific research potential.
The main educational, scientific and clinical structural unit of the University, which coordinates training at the second stage of medical education in one or more related specialties, is the Dean's Office of Internship and Residency, renamed from August 3, 2020 to the Faculty of Postgraduate Education. The dean's office unites all the departments related to the specialties included in the internship and residency, as well as those general scientific and fundamental departments that, in terms of the content of their work, are closest to the profile of the second level of higher medical education.

2.2 Information on previous accreditation
Accreditation of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" has not yet been carried out.

2.3 Analysis of the self-assessment report of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care"

The self-assessment report of the educational programme is presented on 137 pages of the main text, applications on 13 pages and copies or electronic versions of documents on the organization of education, located by the link https://kaznmu.kz/rus/postupajushhim/postdiplomnoe-obrazovanie/rezidentura/

The report is characterized by the completeness of answers to all 9 accreditation standards, structuredness, taking into account the recommendations of the ECAQA Self-Assessment Guidelines, as well as the internal unity of the information provided to the accredited educational programme. The report is accompanied by an accompanying letter signed by the rector prof. T.S. Nurgozhin confirming the accuracy of the information and data contained in the report.

The report contains information about the representative of KazNMU, responsible for the self-assessment of educational programmes, Ph.D. Zhankalova Zulfiya Meirkhanovna, Dean of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education.

Self-assessment of educational residency programmes carried out on the basis of the order on the basis of the order dated 04.08.2020 No. 337 "On approval of the composition of the working group for preparation for accreditation educational programmes of specialties of residency ".

The working group on the preparation of the self-assessment report has done a certain amount of work: the content of the accredited educational programme, the conditions for its implementation, staffing, educational resources have been analysed, the necessary information has been collected in accordance with Accreditation standards for postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations (hereinafter referred to as accreditation standards); a thorough analysis, updating and addition of methodological and educational materials was carried out, their content is reflected in the report. The content of the Self-Assessment Report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards and includes a description of strengths, areas for improvement for each of the 9 standards.

2.4 General assessment of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (specialty residency) of medical educational organizations.

Based on the analysis of the self-assessment report by external experts, it was found that the content of the self-assessment report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA accreditation standards and the recommendations of the Self-Assessment Manual, at the same time, based on the results of the expert evaluation, recommendations for adjustments were made, which were taken into account by the working group.

The report is written consistently in compliance with the logic in the description of the standards, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, the tables contain references in the text and are numbered consecutively. There are links to regulations, model rules, regulations,
The self-assessment and description were carried out in accordance with the criteria of the ECAQA accreditation standards and the questions formulated in the Self-Assessment Guidelines were answered. All standards show actual practice of KazNMU for training residents in the specialty 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" taking into account the beginning of the admission of residents, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. Self-assessment report description fairly complete and updated in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on the selection and admission, the results of training, the results of the assessment of knowledge and skills, the material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, development plans and improvement, etc.

Conclusion on each of the 9 accreditation standards includes a description of the strengths and areas for improvement identified in the course of introspection and development prospects for the specialty.

Thus, the self-assessment report of the accredited educational residency programme of KazNMU contains objective, detailed, structured information on all types of activities in accordance with the ECAQA accreditation standards, and the university made the appropriate corrections in the report at the expert evaluation stage.

3. Description of external expert evaluation

External expert work on the assessment of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" of KazNMU was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external assessment of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by the order of the Director general of the NU "Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care "No. 5 of February 17, 2017) and according to the programme and schedule approved on November 8, 2020 by the Director general of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the rector T.S.Nurgozhin...

To obtain objective information on the expert assessment of the accredited educational programme, the members of the EEC used the following methods: interviews with management and administrative staff, interviews with residents, observation, study of the website, interviewing employees of various structural units, teachers, questioning teachers and residents, review of resources in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards, study of 14 educational and methodological documents both before the visit to the university and during the visit.

The KazNMU staff ensured the presence of all persons indicated in the visit programme and according to the lists of interview sites (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with members of the EEC

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>FULL NAME.</th>
<th>Position</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Bayldinova Clara Zhenisovna</td>
<td>Vice-rector for academic affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Zhankalova Zulfiya Meirkhanovna</td>
<td>Dean of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Tashetova Aigul Balabekovna</td>
<td>And about. Director of the Department of Academic Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Nagasbekova Bayan Serikkanovna</td>
<td>Head of Human Development Department resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Kulzhakanova Samal Sagatovna</td>
<td>Head of the Alumni Career Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Tulepbaeva Gulzhan Sovetovna</td>
<td>Head of Clinical Department</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The sequence of the visit within 3 days is detailed in the Visit Programme, which is in the documentation of the accreditation centre and in the annex to this report.

**The first day of the visit is 11/18/2020.**

An interview with the management and key employees of KazNMU made it possible to determine the fulfillment of most of the criteria of accreditation standards 1, 2, 5, 7, 8, 9, namely, to identify approaches in developing the mission of the educational programme and its compliance with the strategic goals of the university, the role and place of postgraduate education in clinical direction in the strategy of the university (plan), mechanisms in determining the appropriate specialty of residency of clinical sites and qualified teachers, guaranteeing the adequacy of educational resources through planning public procurements and concluding agreements with country and international partners (more than 100 contracts). Realizing that the accredited residency programme is relatively new, since the first enrollment of the student took place in 2019-2020, the experts studied the documentation in detail,

The experts found that KazNMU strictly adheres to the requirements of regulatory legal acts and SCES in the implementation of educational programmes, and the management systematically monitors this process during internal audits (QMS, mutual control, control of the vice-rector for academic work, reporting, etc.).

The basis for effective management is the Quality Assurance Policy of KazNMU and the "Policies of the Chairs" developed at the departments of residency, as well as adherence to the Quality Guidelines when documenting the educational process (QMS has been constantly supported and certified since 2012).
Conversation with the Dean of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education Zhankalova Z.M. allowed experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees of clinical bases for teaching residents, about the strategy and tactics of recruiting residents for different specialties, information security of postgraduate education, as well as identifying problems in the management and development of human resources, since most practicing doctors do not know the teaching methodology...

To obtain objective information about the quality of educational programmes and the entire infrastructure of the university, to clarify the content of self-assessment reports, meetings were held:

- Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs - Bayldinova Clara Zhenisovna, Dean of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education - Zhankalova Zulfiya Meirkhanovna, Acting Director of the Department for Academic Work - Tashetova Aigul Balabekovna, Head of Human Development Department - Bayan Serikkanovna Nagasbekova, head of the Graduates Career Centre - Samal Sagatovna Kulzhakhanova, Head of the Department of Clinical Work - Tulepbaeva Gulzhan Sovetovna, Acting director of the university clinic - Tuleyev Bakhyt Izidinovich, Head of the B.A. Atchabarova - Timur Muydinovich Saliev, sam. CFO - Syzdykova Aigul Temirbulatovna, library manager - Modovov Nurbol Alimbaevich, deputy. head of the library - Zhanbolatova Gulnara Abzhanovna, heads of departments - Nurmakhanova Zhanna Makhmutovna, Israilova Venera Karypbekovna, Akhmetova Gulsim Zhumagalievna, Nersesov Alexander Vitalievich, Rakhimov Kairolla Duisembayevich, head of the simulation centre - Talkimbayeva Naylya Anuarovna, Ph. Committee of Educational Programmes - Zhanat Makhmutovna Nurmakhanova, Zoya Zharbulatovna Ensegenova, Secretary Academician Committee - Kaliyeva Meruert, Associate Professor of the Department of Internal Diseases - Sugraliev Akhmetzhan Begalievich, Associate Professor of Pediatric Surgery - Momynkulov Aydar Ordabekovich, Head of the Department of General Surgery - Medeubekov Ulugbek Shalkharovich, Head of the Department of Intensive Care Medicine - Israilova Venera Karypbekovna Department of Mathematics, Associate Professor medical genetics - Salimbaeva Damilya Nurgazyevna, Head of the Department of Plastic Surgery - Momunzhan Talgatovich Nadyrov, residents - Kalmanova Ayman, Ali Sultan. An interview with the management and key employees of KazNMU allowed to determine the fulfillment of most of the criteria for accreditation standards 1, 2, 5, 7, 8, 9, namely, to identify approaches in the development of the mission of the educational programme and its compliance with the strategic goals of the university.

The experts found that the university strictly adheres to the requirements of regulatory legal acts and SCES in the implementation of educational programmes, and the management systematically monitors this process during internal audits (QMS, mutual control, control of the vice-rector for academic work, reporting, etc.).

The basis for effective management is the Quality Assurance Policy of KazNMU and the "Policies of the Chairs" developed at the departments of residency, as well as adherence to the Quality Guidelines when documenting the educational process (QMS has been constantly supported and certified since 2012).

Accredited residency programme in the specialty 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" is relatively new, since the first enrollment of students took place in 2019-2020, experts studied in detail the documentation, including journals of progress and attendance (paper and AIS-KazNMU) working curricula, syllabuses, instrumentation, examination sheets.

Conversation with the Dean of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education Zhankalova Z.M. allowed experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees of clinical bases for teaching residents, about the strategy and tactics of recruiting residents for different specialties, information security of postgraduate education, as well as identifying problems in the management and development of human resources, since most practicing doctors do not know the teaching methodology.

The second day of the visit is 11/19/2020.

This day was devoted to visiting clinical sites for the implementation of residency programmes in the specialty 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care", including scientific centres
and research institutes affiliated with KazNMU (Research Institute of Internal Diseases, Scientific Centre of Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology, Scientific Centre of Oncology).

The commission in the amount of 3 people visited the clinical base of the Department of Emergency and Emergency Medical Aid (AIMS) of the NJSC “Asfendiyarov KazNMU” residency in the specialty 7R09141" Ambulance and emergency medical care ". The department of ambulance and emergency medical care is located at the bases of the city ambulance station - substations 2, 3, 6, 7, 8 (12 training rooms), the city cardiology centre - in the emergency room (1 study room), WWII polyclinic No. 7 (2 study rooms), an emergency hospital (1 study room). The clinical base of the department is the state communal enterprise "City ambulance station" in Almaty (cooperation agreement No. 91 of 3.09.17). PSE on REM "Ambulance Service" of the Public Health Department of Almaty is the largest organization of emergency medical care in the republic, which has an extensive network of substations, modern ambulance vehicles and qualified personnel. Address: Kazybek bi 115. At the clinical bases, experts surveyed the resources of the accredited educational programme, their compliance with residency training courses, accessibility for teachers and residents, to what extent this equipment is modern and meets the needs of students and practical Health care. Chief physician Ospanov B.Zh., doctor of the highest category. At the clinical sites, experts examined the resources of the accredited educational programme, their compliance with the training courses in residency, accessibility for teachers and residents, how modern this equipment is and meets the needs of students and practical Health care. Chief physician Ospanov B.Zh., doctor of the highest category. At the clinical sites, experts examined the resources of the accredited educational programme, their compliance with the training courses in residency, accessibility for teachers and residents, how modern this equipment is and meets the needs of students and practical Health care. Chief physician Ospanov B.Zh., doctor of the highest category.

The structure of the PSE on the REM "Ambulance Service" includes 11 substations located in all districts of the city with the aim of the quickest arrival of teams to the place of call, 200 ambulance teams: resuscitation, intensive care teams, pediatric, medical, paramedics and a large staff of highly qualified specialists with practical work experience using modern medical technologies. The experts visited the 6th PSE on the REM “Ambulance station” in Almaty. The Information and Organizational Dispatching Department (IODD) of the PSE on the REM " Ambulance station " (department 103) carries out round-the-clock work on receiving calls from the population of Almaty, consulting the population by senior doctors of the IODD. An interview was held with the deputy. Director for quality control of medical services of the PSE on the REM "Ambulance Service" in Almaty Lozhkin A.A.

Then we visited the 6th substation PSE at the REM Ambulance Service in Almaty serves calls on the assigned territory (city centre) - 28 ambulance teams: (2 resuscitation, 5 BIT, 3 pediatric, linear), and talked with the head of the PSE at the PSV "Ambulance Service" Badirov Sh.Sh. The teams are equipped with everything necessary for timely diagnosis and assistance to patients and victims at the pre-hospital stage. The training rooms of the Department of ATS, based on the 6th substation of the PSE on the REM “Ambulance Service” in Almaty, are equipped with everything necessary for the educational process (computers, dummies, wireless Internet, blackboards, furniture, etc.) - 7 rooms.

At the department of NJSC "Asfendiyarov KazNMU" met with the head of Department - Candidate of Medical Sciences, prof. Akhmetova G. D. and responsible for residency in the specialty 7R09141 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" Ph.D., prof. Almukhambetova E.F. and Doctor of Medical Sciences, Prof. Musaev A.T., Assistant, Master of Medical Sciences Balkanay G.B. We got acquainted with the documentation of the residency. A meeting was held - a conversation with residents of the 1st year of study in the specialty 7R09141 "Ambulance and emergency medical care": Kerimbay Akyl Urbanaliuly (20SiNMP-01), Smanul Ayakuz Kaysargyzy (20SiNMP-05) and Bektamdigiban We got acquainted with the portfolio of residents. Work on the 6/17 brigade (linear) was demonstrated.
A review of resources showed that the clinical base of the Department of Emergency and Emergency Medical Care (EMS) of the NJSC “Asfendiyarov KazNMU” corresponds to the goals and objectives of the accredited educational programme in terms of the profile of beds, the number of thematic patients, modern equipment and its availability to all students, and the department staff provide collegial and ethical relations with the medical staff, the leadership of the clinical base to achieve the final results of the educational programme. The clinical base has 16 training rooms, despite the fact that residents spend most of their time at the patient's bedside and in diagnostic departments. Before the start of the corresponding discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during training.

The experts obtained evidence of compliance with accreditation standards 2 and 6, as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report of the educational programme.

On the same day, interviews with teachers, residents and employers (representatives of practical health care) took place. It is necessary to take into account the fact that there was no graduation from the accredited educational programme, so it was not possible to interview graduates, however, the experience and authority of KazNMU in training residents (since 2007) shows a high percentage of employment (> 90%) of graduates of other programmes residencies and their demand by medical organizations in all regions of Kazakhstan.

Interview with teacher as providers of the residency programme in the specialty 7R09141 "Ambulance and emergency medical care", showed that there are both successes and problems in the management of the educational programme, depending on the specific clinical base (admission of residents to equipment, a sufficient number of thematic patients, time for medical documentation, independent work of residents). 2 teachers were present. The experts received answers about the teacher training programme, the financing of this training, the availability of certification in teaching methods for teachers.

On the same day, experts studied materials on the admission of residents and the selection of teachers.

Residents were interviewed to validate the performance of the self-assessment report data and to obtain evidence of the quality of the programmes. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with studying at the university, sufficient time for practical training, supervision of patients and work with medical records, as well as satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers. In general, residents are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this university, since they believe that KazNMU has excellent clinical bases and experience in teaching residents, at the same time, residents would like more independent work with patients, especially prompt assistance and more modern literature and interactive teaching methods when dealing with complex cases. Residents believe

Residents showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgments on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, opportunities to participate in research, funding, etc.). The experts studied the documents of residents (portfolio, results of assessment of residents-checklists, results of a questionnaire survey of residents).

Interview with 2 employers for an educational residency programme applied for accreditation in the specialty 7R09141 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" KazNMU was conducted online and included such issues as: knowledge of the mission of the university, participation in the development of the mission and proposals in the strategic plan, participation in the deliberative bodies of KazNMU, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in training of residents through mentoring, provision of the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, the employment of residency graduates, etc.

The third day of the visit November 20, 2020
Experts studied documentation of the department of Ambulance and emergency medical care, which confirmed the compliance with accreditation standards (nomenclature of the department's affairs, plan for 5 years, annual plan for 2019-2020 academic year and report for 2019, journal of residents' progress, EMCD, feedback questionnaires with residents, teachers, reports on the results of the questionnaire and the measures taken, the code of ethics, etc., control and measuring instruments), including documentation (49 documents) at the request of the EEC members.

Then a meeting of the EEC members took place following the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion of the results of external assessment, study of documents, results of interviews, questionnaires was held. The members of the EEC began to design the final report of the EEC.

A meeting of the EEC members took place. EEC members made generalizations of the results of the external evaluation. The experts individually completed the "Quality profile and the criteria for external assessment of the NIC for compliance with the Accreditation Standards of the ECAQA Medical Education Residency Programme". No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the postgraduate education sector in general and the department implementing the accredited educational programme were discussed. A draft report with recommendations was prepared.

Chairperson of the EEC prof. Turgunov E.M. a final open vote on recommendations for KazNMU and a final vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council were held. Then the chairperson of the EEC for the management and employees of the educational organization announced recommendations based on the results of an external assessment as part of the accreditation of educational programmes for residency specialties.

**Questioning.** An observer from ECAQA in November 16-18, 2020 conducted an online survey of KazNMU residents and teachers on the resource https://webanketa.com/.

**Residents survey results:**

- The total number of responding residents - 154... Of the total number of respondents, residents of the specialty "family medicine" prevailed - 40%, further on the list: pulmonology - 12%, clinical pharmacology - 12%, therapy - 11%, pediatric oncology and hematology - 6%, general surgery 4%, pediatric surgery - 3%, medical genetics - 2%, other specialties - 1% each.

- Will recommend this university as an educational organization - 69% fully agree, partially - 26%. 71% of the respondents fully agree and 23% partially agree that programme managers and teaching staff are aware of their learning problems. Fully (64%) and partially (29%) are satisfied with the conditions and equipment of classrooms and classrooms of the university. According to 62% (in full) and 26% (in part) office equipment is available for residents in practice bases. Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes - 73% fully agree, partially - 22%. Fully (72%) and partially (25%) are satisfied with the library fund and resources. 76% of respondents have access to electronic educational resources, and 20% believe that it is partially.

- The organization of clinical training for residents in the opinion of 81% fully satisfies them, and 15% partially. Fully (74%) and partially (22%) are satisfied with the teaching methods. There is enough time for practical training (supervision of patients, etc.) - 82% fully agree, partly 13%. Satisfied with the methods of assessing my knowledge and skills - 78% fully agree, partially 21%. According to 73% of teachers in the classroom, they use active and interactive teaching methods regularly, and according to 23% - rarely.

- According to 81% of the respondents, teachers constantly provide feedback after the end of classes, but according to 16% - sometimes and 2% - rarely, 81% of respondents are fully satisfied that they are studying at a university, partially 16%, disappointed - 1% of respondents. The university allows you to improve or acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the chosen specialty of residency 82% are sure, 7% are not sure, 9% cannot give an answer, 1% would like to believe it, 1%
began to doubt it. Fully (76%) and partially (23%) are satisfied with the organization of teaching at KazNMU.

According to 71% of respondents, accreditation is a necessary mechanism to improve educational programmes, but 12% believe that it is not necessary to carry out and 14% doubt the answer. The work of the EEC was assessed as positive - 74%, satisfactory - 14%, i.e. most.

**Results of the survey of teachers of residency programmes:**
The total number of teachers on the list is 40. The total number of respondents is 39, including those with up to 5 years of experience - 18%, up to 10 years - 21%, over 10 years - 62%. 59% are fully satisfied with the organization of the educational process, partially - 33%. At the university, ethics is observed and subordination is fully agreed by 72%, partially - 26%. 67% of respondents are completely satisfied with the organization of work and workplace, partially 26%. In the organization there is an opportunity for career growth and development of competence for teachers - 67% fully agree, partially - 26%.

In this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish research results - 72% fully agree, 23% partially. 59% of respondents are fully satisfied with the work of the personnel department, 28% are partially satisfied. The majority of those surveyed have undergone advanced training for the last 5 years. Only 69% fully agree that they can realize themselves as professionals, and 29% partially. Unfortunately, 33% did not answer the question of whether the university supports the teacher in participating in international and national events, and 21% did not address this to the management or the relevant administrative staff of the university. The majority of respondents (74%) fully agree, and 23% partially agree that residents have free access to patients and clinic resources. In a practical lesson, teachers provide residents primarily with syllables (87%), control and measuring instruments (90%), case studies (72%). The level of prior training of residents upon admission to training programmes is fully satisfied by 28% of respondents, partially - 62%. 58% of respondents do not know about the implementation of social programmes to support teachers and 8% of respondents doubt about their existence. Management and administration systematically listen to the opinion of teachers - 28%, sometimes - 28% of respondents. When teaching residents, a variety of teaching methods are used, but more often work in small groups (74%), analysis of situational tasks (90%), oral questioning and analysis of a topic (74% and 87%, respectively), also problem-oriented training (62%), solving tests (64%), less often cases are compiled and solved (56%). Completely according to 59%.

The results of the questionnaire are presented in the appendix and, in general, demonstrate the positive aspects of training in residency programmes, at the same time, they identify areas for improvement (social support programmes for teachers, availability of leadership and administration for teachers and residents, pedagogical competencies and professional development of teachers).

**Conclusion on the basis of the external evaluation:**
Members of the EEC have carefully studied and assessed the main indicators of the accredited educational programme. The information received by external experts during the study of the self-assessment report, preparation of a written review with recommendations for improvement, implementation of the activities of the visit programme of KazNMU was analysed. All the information received was compared with the data of the self-assessment report, which made it possible to make sure of the accuracy of the information provided to KazNMU and supporting documents for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards.

Despite the fact that in the self-assessment report of the educational programme, KazNMU described its best practice in observing accreditation standards, during the external expert evaluation, the EEC members studied the main documents (mission, strategic plan until 2023, teaching materials of disciplines, syllables, control and measuring instruments, checklists, portfolio of residents, individual plans of residents for the 2019-2020 academic year, publications of teachers, rules for admission to residency, personnel policy, internal quality assurance system programme, resources for
training were viewed directly at the clinical bases of departments (classrooms, office equipment available for residents to work with literature, patient documentation, educational and methodological literature), which made it possible to identify the compliance of the educational organization with the basic accreditation standards.

When conducting an external examination, the Rules for the training of medical personnel in residency were taken into account (order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated September 18, 2018 No. KR DSM-16), paragraph 13. It was established that the clinical bases of all residency programmes are 106, which provide training for all levels of medical care (from primary health care to highly specialized). The accredited educational programme has 1 clinical base, of which 1 was visited by experts. 1. The volume of study load and treatment and prophylactic work in specialties is determined by the individual work plan of the student of residency (item 14) for one year and is monitored by monthly reports of the resident in any form. The accounting of completed tasks is drawn up in the form of a portfolio according to the recommendations in the syllabus.

In connection with the new edition of order No. 647 On the approval of state compulsory standards and standard professional training programmes for medical and pharmaceutical specialties dated July 31, 2015 (as amended by the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 02.21. No. KR DSM-12/2020 Chapter 2. Requirements for the content of residency educational programmes with a focus on learning outcomes), the educational programme has undergone changes and additions in relation to the development of the research competence of residents, which must participate in the work of the research team.

In this regard, the experts assessed the involvement of residents in the work of the research team. There is no general provision or requirements for the implementation of scientific work at the university, at the same time, the departments conduct proactive research in which residents participate through writing reviews, collecting patient data, analysing the literature and patient examination results, preparing reports and presentations at conferences). Also, in accordance with Article 222 of the Residency of Clause 4 of the Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan On People's Health and the Healthcare System No. 360-VI ZRK dated July 7, 2020, external experts studied the activities and held conversations with mentors of residents, and it was established that each resident was provided with a mentor.

The experts took into account the fact that the accredited educational programme for the current state educational standard is being implemented for 2 academic years, therefore, at this time there is no graduation of students, nevertheless, the entire educational, methodological, personnel and resource base has been assessed for compliance with accreditation standards. Through interviews with teachers and interviews with students, it was possible to determine their direct participation in the development (CEPs, meetings of departments), the assessment of educational programmes (CEP), decision-making on a number of key issues in the choice of clinical sites, topics of electives, participation in the appeal commissions for admission and assessment of residents, development of the content of individual plans of residents and selection of mentors.

At the same time, this substantiated the need for inclusion in post-accreditation monitoring, along with the implementation of the EEC recommendations, an analysis of the implementation of the criteria of Standard 9, an annual report on the contingent of students.

Recommendations for improving activities in the implementation of the educational residency programme in the specialty “Ambulance and emergency medical care” on compliance with the Accreditation Standards, developed by the EEC based on the results of the expert assessment, were presented at a meeting with the management on November 20, 2020.

The programme of the 3-day visit of the external expert evaluation of the EEC has been fully completed. On the part of the KazNMU team, the participation of all persons indicated in the programme is ensured.

Thus, the external assessment and the visit of the EEC members made it possible to verify and validate the data of the self-assessment report of the residency programme in full in accordance with
the Regulation on the External Expert Commission, the Guidelines for the external assessment of the medical organization ECAQA education.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all necessary information and material resources of the accredited educational programme was organized. Experts note the high level of corporate culture and discipline of those responsible for postgraduate education of KazNMU employees, departments, employees of clinical bases, a high degree of openness of the team in providing information to members of the EEC.

The clinical base where the residents are trained - the largest scientific centre in the country with specialized departments, highly qualified personnel, allows creating conditions for high quality training for residents under the educational programme “Ambulance and emergency medical care”.

4. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" of KazNMU and an overview of the strengths for each standard.

Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES

The presented materials adequately reflect the criteria of this standard.

Mission of the Asfendiyarov KazNMU is aimed at serving society through the training of competitive specialists in the treatment, preservation and strengthening of people's health, improving health care through the integration of advanced educational, scientific and medical technologies". The mission of the educational programme (EP) in the specialty 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" is aimed at implementing the mission of the University by training a qualified doctor in gastroenterology with a system of universal knowledge and professional competencies, capable and ready for independent professional activities in the treatment of diseases.

The educational programme for residents in the specialty 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" was first created in connection with the addition of 05/31/2019 No. KR DSM-89 to the Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan N 27.53 "On approval of the lists of clinical specialties of training in internship and residency" dated January 30, 2008 and an addition from 02/21/2020 No. KR DSM-12/2020 to the order of the acting Minister of Health and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 647 "On approval of state compulsory standards and standard professional training programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties" dated July 31, 2015.

The mission of the EP was brought to the attention of all employees of departments, residents by posting on the university website (www.kaznmu.kz, website "Residency"). Responsible for the residency programme is the Department of Emergency and Emergency Medical Aid (EMC) of the NJSC "KazNMU named after D. Asfendiyarov" applies a variety of innovations in the learning process, allowing the development of basic and special competencies of residents, namely, work at the patient's bedside, clinical analyzes, solving situational problems, protecting medical records, training in laboratories. At the same time, the involvement of residents in the scientific work of the department is insufficient, is not of a systemic nature (1.1.7), it is more carried out on the initiative of the residents themselves. The university has developed a Student Ethics Code with which residents are familiarized and work on the development and improvement of communication skills is carried out systematically and integrated into the work programme. At the same time, the participation of practical Health care in the development of the mission and goals of the educational programme is not sufficiently reflected, expert evaluation is formalized and feedback from practical Health care is not collected when forming optional components.

Strengths:

It should be noted that the strengths: Orientation of educational programmes of residency in the specialty 7R091410 "Emergency and emergency medical care" to the expectations of the employer and the needs of the labor market; the focus of the educational process on the formation of
professional responsibility, clinical skills, knowledge and skills to protect the patient's health, the desire for continuous self-improvement, continuous professional development and lifelong learning, carries out strategic partnerships with international partners (universities, associations).

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 17 standards conform: completely -9 standards basic standard (BS), improvement standard (IS) - 2, significantly - basic standard (BS) -1, improvement standard (IS) - 5, partially - 0, do not match - 0.

**Standard 1: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1. Develop quantitative indicators for the implementation and assessment of scientific work by residents

**Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES**

Accredited specialty residency programme 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" is implemented in accordance with the State Compulsory Standards and Model Professional Curriculum for Medical and Pharmaceutical Specialties dated July 31, 2015 (as amended by the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 21, 2020 No. КР DSM-12/2020 Chapter 2. Requirements for the content of educational programmes of residency with a focus on learning outcomes) for 2 years and during this period a lot of work has been done to develop teaching materials, organize a place for training residents, form the composition of departments and identify mentors. A model of residents' competencies has been introduced in accordance with the qualification requirements for the specialty. The structure, content and duration of the programme are clearly defined. The mechanism for the development and approval of the residency programme is determined and regulated by the CEP. Staff of departments in the specialty 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" possesses the necessary competencies for training, at the same time, the mentors represented by the employees of the clinical bases, despite their professional level, do not fully possess pedagogical techniques, which limits the implementation of a high-quality transfer of professional knowledge and skills. The teachers of the departments use a variety of methods of active (business games, brainstorming, clinical analyzes, case studies, etc.) and traditional (oral analyzes, mini-lectures) training, according to which staff members are periodically trained within the university, less often in other organizations (Nazarbayev University, NJSC "MUK", etc.). All learning conditions are provided with consistency, continuity of their content, consistent development of all competencies, taking into account their continuity. The model of the educational programme based on the established final learning outcomes of residents and the qualifications they receive is also ensured by the transparency of training. The dean's office is trying to monitor this process and, through the School of Pedagogical Skills, train newly hired teachers. Due to the availability of clinical bases for residents, they spend most of their study time in close contact with patients, medical records, including automated Health care systems. Residents are taught by mentors to work with the latter. When conducting interviews with residents 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" the experts were convinced that the organization of training and work is focused on patients, at the same time, there is not always a sufficient number of thematic patients, time for theoretical analysis of complex topics and study of literature in modern databases. Clinical training is carried out in the conditions of accredited multidisciplinary clinics and highly specialized scientific centres in Almaty and the region. Total accredited educational program 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" mentors 10 in clinics that carry out their activities in accordance with the Regulation on Mentors. No precedents of inequality, lack of ethics or other violations of a gender, cultural or religious nature have been established in the process of external assessment.

When examining an educational programme 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" it was found that the scientific foundations and methodology of medical research, evidence-based medicine are applied, by the same time residents are not fully involved in the scientific work of the departments, do not have clearly defined research topics, performance criteria, including clinical trials.
Thus, the educational residency programme in the specialty 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" demonstrates the integration between education and health care.

**Strengths:**

the educational programme is developed in accordance with the regulatory requirements and the needs of practical health care; in the preparation of residency students, a credit-modular system and an integrated training approach in the preparation of residents are used.

educational programme provides training in various clinical settings - research institutes, highly specialized hospitals, municipal hospitals, polyclinics, family medicine organizations, simulation centres are used to improve skills.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 31 standards conform: fully -21 basic standards (BS), improvement standard (IS) - 6, significantly - basic standard (BS) -1, improvement standard (IS) - 3, partially - 0, do not match - 0.

**Standard 2: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1. The scientific component should be prescribed in thematic plans in the form of the implementation and defense of scientific projects.

**Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF TRAINEES**

The policy and procedure for assessing learning outcomes within the EP is carried out using criteria developed in accordance with the goals and objectives for the implementation of the EP and awarded qualifications within the framework of the current point-rating system for assessing knowledge and monitoring the educational process in accordance with directive, regulatory and internal documents.

Resident appraisal policies and methods in the specialty 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" are considered and approved at a meeting of the committee of educational programmes (CEP) residency... The general policy, principles, methods of assessing residents in KazNMU are reflected in the following internal documents: Academic policy of the University No. 195 of 28.08.2019; The regulation on current monitoring of progress, intermediate and final certification of students of NJSC KazNMU is spelled out in the Academic Policy for the 2019-2020 academic year and approved by the Board. Minutes No. 5 dated 28.08.2019. The results of the achievement of students are displayed in the electronic journals of the AIS "Sirius" system.

KazNMU provides for an official procedure for considering applications / appeals by residents. A resident who has completed the course programme in full, but has not received the minimum transfer score, in order to increase the average grade, is given the opportunity to re-study certain disciplines in the summer semester on a paid basis and re-pass exams on them.

**Strengths:**

Formation and assessment of all key competencies of the graduate of the residency of the Republic of Kazakhstan; a transparent procedure for assessing educational achievements at all stages of training a student of residency; active participation in research work, which must necessarily end with the publication of a scientific article or a report at scientific and practical conferences with instilling in students the skills of research work; monitoring the mastery of learning outcomes by residency students through feedback.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 11 standards conform: completely -5 basic standard (BS), improvement standard (CS) - 4, significantly - basic standard (BS) -2, improvement standard (CS) - 0, partially - 0, do not match - 0.

**Standard 3: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none**

**Standard 4: TRAINEES**

In KazNMU, in the specialty 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care", systematic vocational guidance work is carried out, aimed at preparing and selecting students who have
deliberately chosen educational programmes. At the department in the specialty 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" there are conditions that ensure the stability of the recruitment of residency students for training in educational programmes. KazNMU, specialty 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care", analyzes and evaluates the main indicators of educational results and constantly monitors the employment and career growth of graduates, as well as interacts with employers to improve the quality of training. In order to facilitate the employment of University graduates, the alumni career centre annually conducts personal distribution of graduates with the participation of representatives of health departments, pharmaceutical companies and departments for public health protection of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The duration of the development of the educational residency programme in the specialty 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" depends on the previous level of education or work experience and is 2 or 3 years, depending on specialties. The duration of training is 3 years.

Due to the fact that the addition of the order "On the approval of the lists of clinical specialties of training in internship and residency" dated January 30, 2008 N 27, paragraph 53. Ambulance and emergency medical care (order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 05/31/2019 No. KR_DSM-89) published last year, in the specialty 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" recruiting such residents in KazNMU not yet produced.

But in view of the CVI pandemic, changes have been made in the admission rules that the university can make on its own on the basis of autonomy: the documents are accepted online and the entrance exams have been changed in a format where instead of a traditional interview, all personal achievements of the student will be taken into account with an online interview mode.

**Strengths:**

- ensuring high qualifications of the teaching staff of the departments involved in the implementation of the educational programme;
- training of residents is carried out in the advanced clinical centres of the city of Almaty, where innovative results of scientific activity have been introduced.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 30 standards conform: completely -18 basic standard (BS), improvement standard (IS) - 12, significantly - basic standard (BS) -0, improvement standard (IS) - 0, partially - 0, do not match - 0.

**Standard 4: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:** none

**Standard 5: TRAINERS**

Personnel policy, being one of the strategic priorities in the development of the university, is aimed at ensuring qualification requirements for the implementation of educational programmes, maintaining the professional potential of the teaching staff, creating conditions for increasing professional motivation and career growth of teachers, creating a favorable moral and psychological climate in the team. The teaching staff of the university meets the qualification requirements for licensing educational activities and the profile of educational programmes.

All activities of the teaching staff in the specialty 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" correspond to the mission, goals and objectives of the university. The teaching staff is formed based on the needs for the effective implementation of educational programmes, as well as on the basis of the total volume of the study load. When drawing up the staffing table for the new academic year, in order to conduct classes for residents, a mandatory requirement for teachers is the availability of basic education, compliance with the code of the specialty of the academic degree, academic title (for example, obstetrics and gynecology, nephrology, pediatrics) and work experience. Since the training of personnel in residency in the specialty 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" is carried out in a clinical specialty, the qualification level of the teaching staff plays an important role, then the requirements should include the availability of the first or the highest medical qualification category for the employees, the availability of the academic degree of doctor and candidate of medical sciences.
**Strengths:**

1. KazNMU is the bearer of the best traditions of the national medical school; has a National status, is a leader in the system of higher education in universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan, postgraduate and continuing medical education in the Republic of Kazakhstan, in the general rating and rating of educational programmes.

2. Leaders of the University, teaching staff of departments - strengthen the culture of excellence; preserve and develop unique traditions; honor the history of the University and its legendary personalities, introduce the principles of pedagogical management, actively cooperate with Kazakhstani and foreign universities.

3. KazNMU has a certificate of ISO 9001: 2015 accreditation “Educational activities in the field of higher and postgraduate education; medical services, fundamental and applied scientific research in the field of medicine”, valid until 06/18/2023.

4. PPP Chairs in the specialty 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" consists from highly qualified employees with scientific achievements, high medical qualifications, who are experts in health care and medical education.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 7 standards conform: completely -5 basic standard (BS), improvement standard (IS) - 2, significantly - basic standard (BS) -0, improvement standard (IS) - 0, partially - 0, do not match - 0.

**Standard 5: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none**

**Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

The material and technical base of the university includes: lecture halls, study rooms, educational and research laboratories, a library, information technology facilities, premises for the cultural and social sphere, university clinics, clinical bases - leading medical clinics in Almaty. KazNMU has a unified system of library and information services. Taking into account the needs of the departments and the analysis carried out, DEMW forms university-wide applications for the purchase and publication of textbooks, teaching aids for the new academic year. The scientific library of KazNMU signed agreements with international companies for access.

Constant work is underway to improve the IT technologies and infrastructure of the university. The uninterrupted operation of the Internet was ensured, a local computer system was created, a system of video broadcasting of lectures in classrooms, a unique computer product AIS KazNMU was developed and implemented. To connect clinical departments located in remote areas to the Internet, it is planned to introduce mobile Internet and purchase 3JETUSB modems for them. At the department in the specialty 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" there are corresponding computer programmes designed to study the discipline of LUTS, to control knowledge, to carry out practical and laboratory work, which students use in preparation for practical classes (for example, the Classroom, Zoom, Zoom).

The Clinical Experimental Laboratory (CEL) is a scientific, methodological and educational support unit of the Aitchabarov Research Institute of Physics and Mathematics, established on the basis of the decision of the Academic Council No. 35 dated 09/30/12 in order to ensure the educational process for the development of practical skills by residents, as well as to improve the level and quality of scientific research in terms of clinical and experimental justification, approbation of treatment methods and preclinical testing of new drugs.

**Strengths:**

Sufficient material and technical base for training residency students in specialties; for the development of clinical competencies, the university provides an educational programme with clinical bases in accordance with the level of medical care, the profile of patients of different ages; the university provides opportunities for independent training of students, providing access to educational resources of the library and the Internet; direct joint activities of residency students with
employees of clinical bases in all areas of their activities, at all stages of providing medical qualified and specialized care;

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 21 standards conform: completely -9 basic standard (BS), improvement standard (CS) - 11, significantly - basic standard (BS) -1, improvement standard (CS) - 0, partially - 0, do not match - 0.

Standard 6: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none

Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION

Monitoring and evaluation of EP in the specialty 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" is carried out at all levels, a multi-level approach is used, including profiling / graduating and related departments, the profile Committee of the educational programme, the DAR, the Academic Committee, the Senate, the student government, the Centre for the Admission and Career Guidance of Students (general monitoring of the quality of educational programmes through a survey of stakeholders ( employers, professional associations and students)). The University has a system of control over the quality of preparation of educational and methodological documentation, including the content of educational programmes. The university has developed a system for assessing educational programmes, which provides for the assessment of programmes at the stages of planning, implementation, analysis of results and implementation of changes, which allows monitoring the process of educational implementation and the progress of students. The process of improving the EP is implemented through a specialized CEP, which includes groups of experts on various issues of the educational process (monitoring of the educational process, development of educational programmes, development of CIS, interactive teaching methods, a group on language competence, publishing), based on the results of a survey of residents, teaching staff, employers. The process of improving the EP is implemented through the specialized CEP, which includes groups of experts on various issues of the educational process (monitoring of the educational process, development of educational programmes, development of CIS, interactive teaching methods, a group on language competence, publishing), based on the results of a survey of residents, teaching staff, employers. The report of the FSA chairperson on the results of certification of residents is annually heard at the Council of the dean's office, AC KazNMU. Based on the results, an action plan is developed, aimed at improving and eliminating the identified problems and shortcomings in the educational programme.

Strengths: the university has formed a system for monitoring and evaluating the educational programme,

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 15 standards conform: completely -10 basic standard (BS), improvement standard (CS) - 4, significantly - basic standard (BS) -0, improvement standard (CS) - 1, partially - 0, do not match - 0.

Standard 7: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none

Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION

KazNMU has developed and approved the main internal document defining the scope of duties and powers of the University in relation to EP residency, including the obligation to provide the educational process in full with all necessary information sources and access to network educational resources, including “Academic policy” (decision of the Board, minutes No. 5 of 28.08.2019). This document is guided by the dean's office and departments in the management of the educational residency programme. Coordination of the implementation, control and monitoring of the implementation of residency programmes in all licensed specialties is carried out by the dean's office of the faculty of internship and residency under the supervision of the vice-rector for academic activities (Rector's Order No. 577 dated July 20, 2018) for the educational process and the provost - for clinical activities.
The transparency of EP management is carried out: by the functioning of the quality management system (QMS); through the discussion of educational and methodological documentation on the residency programme at meetings of departments / modules, CEP, AC KazNMU and after receiving their positive opinion, is approved by the vice-rector for academic activities; the presence of internal regulations (academic policy) governing the implementation of the residency programme; the functioning of the system for collecting feedback from stakeholders, the functioning of collegial advisory management bodies, which include university staff and students. To ensure effective planning of the implementation of the educational programme in the specialty 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" by the beginning of the academic year, the staffing table is formed (the number of teaching hours, the number of teachers), the schedule of classes, etc. An independent internal audit system has been created and is functioning in KazNMU.

**Strengths:** transparency of the management system and decisions made; the responsibility of the academic leadership in relation to the development and management of the educational programme is determined; stable financial condition of the University; extensive collaboration with partners in the health sector.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 15 standards conform: fully -8 basic standards (BS), improvement standard (IS) - 6, significantly - basic standard (BS) -0, improvement standard (IS) - 1, partially - 0, do not match - 0.

**Standard 8: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:** none

---

**Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

An important condition for the continuous improvement of the postgraduate educational process is the assessment of the quality of learning outcomes / competencies, assessment of knowledge and skills, the learning environment of the programme. The CEP has experts in assessing the quality of training sessions with residents, a group of testologists, the contingent of a group of experts and testologists is renewed annually by attracting specially trained young employees. In KazNMU, the implementation of the teaching staff training programme has begun, according to the approved Model of the competencies of the teacher of KazNMU: advanced training courses were held for the teaching staff of the departments of KazNMU according to the Competence Model, which made it possible to introduce innovative methods of teaching residents. A convincing example of the process of continuous improvement of approaches to the implementation of EP residency is the active participation of stakeholders (primarily, The work carried out allows for continuous improvement in various areas of the university's activities. Based on the results of the analysis by the management, decisions are made on improving and improving educational management, justifying the need to make changes to the EP quality management system, including updating educational documentation.

**Strengths:** professional development of teaching staff every 5 years, incl. on pedagogical competencies; teaching staff participation in training events (seminars, master classes, conferences); comprehension of their own experience in the implementation of pedagogical technologies in the educational process; exchange of experience on the implementation of pedagogical technologies in the educational process with colleagues from other educational and scientific organizations implementing residency programmes; EP management processes, including monitoring, evaluation and revision. An important direction of the departments' work is the formation of stable partnerships with independent experts from practical health care who are invited to take exams.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 4 standards conform: completely - 4, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 9:**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:** none
Thus, all 9 accreditation standards have been met, no inconsistencies in the fulfillment of the criteria of each of the basic accreditation standards in the process of analyzing the self-assessment report and carrying out the examination as part of the tasks of the external expert evaluation programme were found.

5. Recommendations for improving the educational residency programme in the specialty 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" KazNMU:
   1) Develop quantitative indicators for the implementation and assessment of scientific work by residents.
   2) The scientific component should be prescribed in thematic plans in the form of the implementation and defense of scientific projects.
7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Board
The members of the EEC came to a unanimous decision to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R091410 "Ambulance and emergency medical care" for a period of 5 years

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chairman</th>
<th>Turgunov Ernek Meyramovich</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The foreign expert</td>
<td>Kashirskaya Natalia Yurievna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic expert</td>
<td>Zhumalina Akmaral Kanasheva</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic expert</td>
<td>Ramazanova Raigul Mukhanbetovna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic expert</td>
<td>Esengaraeva Saule Damirovna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic expert</td>
<td>Beketova Bayan Beysengalievna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic expert</td>
<td>Akhmetova Almira Kalikapasova</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic expert</td>
<td>Urazova Saltanat Nurgozhavin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic expert</td>
<td>Kalieva Sholpan Sabataevna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic expert</td>
<td>Zhantelieva Lyazzat Asanova</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic expert</td>
<td>Madyarov Valentin Manarbekovich</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic expert</td>
<td>Sadiya Zhanar Zamankhanova</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic expert</td>
<td>Lovinskaya Anna Vladimirovna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Representative of practical health care</td>
<td>Zholdasbaeva Kyrmizy Zhumabekovna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Representative of practical health care</td>
<td>Nartpayeva Asel Tarasovna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The representative of the residents</td>
<td>Bayashov Erdos Nuridinuly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The representative of the residents</td>
<td>Tarasyukov Alexander Andreevich</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The observer ECAQA</td>
<td>Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Attachment 1.

Quality profile and external evaluation criteria (summary)
Of educational programme in the specialty of residency 7R091410
"Ambulance and emergency medical care" of KazNMU

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Standard</th>
<th>Criteria for evaluation</th>
<th>Assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Totally coincides</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number of standards = BS * / IS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>MISSION AND END OUTCOMES 17 = 10/7</td>
<td>9/2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME 31 = 22/9</td>
<td>21/6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>ASSESSMENT OF TRAINEES 11 = 7/4</td>
<td>5/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>TRAINEES 30 = 18/12</td>
<td>18/12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>TRAINERS 7 = 5/2</td>
<td>5/2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES 21 = 10/11</td>
<td>9/11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>PROGRAMME EVALUATION 15 = 10/5</td>
<td>10/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION 15 = 8/7</td>
<td>8/6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>CONTINUOUS RENEWAL 4 = 1/3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total: 151 = 91/60</td>
<td>85/47</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

151