To Accreditation Council
Of the Eurasian Centre for Accreditation
and quality assurance in Higher education
and Health care

May 30, 2021

REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION
ON THE RESULTS OF THE ASSESSMENT OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME
7R01127 - "OPHTHALMOLOGY, INCLUDING CHILDREN'S"
OF NJSC ASFENDIYAROV KAZAKH NATIONAL MEDICAL UNIVERSITY " FOR
COMPLIANCE WITH STANDARDS OF ACCREDITATION OF POSTGRADUATE
EDUCATION PROGRAMMES (RESIDENCE SPECIALTIES) IN MEDICAL EDUCATION
ORGANIZATIONS

period of external expert evaluation: 26.05.-28.05.2021

Almaty, 2021
## CONTENT

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>List of symbols and abbreviations</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. EEC composition</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. General part of the final report of the EEC</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Presentation of the NJSC &quot;Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University &quot;(KazNMU) and the educational residency programme in the specialty 7R01127 - &quot;Ophthalmology, including children's&quot;</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Information about previous accreditation</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Analysis of the self-assessment report of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01127 - &quot;Ophthalmology, including children’s»</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Description of the stages of external expert evaluation and conclusion</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment and an educational residency programme in the specialty 7R01127 - &quot;Ophthalmology, including children's&quot; of KazNMU and an overview of the strengths for each standard</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Recommendations for the improvement and educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01127 - &quot;Ophthalmology, including children's» of KazNMU</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria for external assessment and the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01127 - &quot;Ophthalmology, including children's» of KazNMU for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Attachment 2. List of documents studied by members of the EEC in the framework of specialized accreditation</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Symbol/Abbreviation</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GPA</td>
<td>Weighted average assessment level of educational achievements of a student in the chosen specialty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECTS</td>
<td>European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PBL</td>
<td>Problem-based learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TBL</td>
<td>Team-Oriented Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AIS - NJSC &quot;KazNMU&quot;</td>
<td>Automated information system of KazNMU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AC KazNMU</td>
<td>Academic Council of KazNMU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JSC RIC&amp;IM</td>
<td>Joint Stock Company “Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Medicine”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMP</td>
<td>Administrative and management personnel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BD (O)</td>
<td>Basic disciplines (training)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GD</td>
<td>General doctor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University</td>
<td>Higher educational institution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAC</td>
<td>State Attestation Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civil Defense and Emergencies</td>
<td>Civil defense and emergencies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCES</td>
<td>State compulsory education standard</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DAD</td>
<td>Department of Academic Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DS&amp;HR</td>
<td>Department of Science and Human Resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DET</td>
<td>Distance educational technologies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEMW</td>
<td>Department of educational and methodical work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECAQA</td>
<td>Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FSA</td>
<td>Final state certification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPE</td>
<td>Institute of Postgraduate Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IEW</td>
<td>Individual educational work (resident)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KRIOR</td>
<td>Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CVI</td>
<td>Coronavirus infection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COC</td>
<td>Component of choice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEP</td>
<td>Committee for educational programmes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QED</td>
<td>Catalog of elective disciplines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEL</td>
<td>Clinical and experimental laboratory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MoH RK</td>
<td>Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MES RK</td>
<td>Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEO</td>
<td>Medical education organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MJ RK</td>
<td>Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IAAR</td>
<td>Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NJSC &quot;KazNMU&quot;</td>
<td>Non-profit joint-stock company &quot;Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Institute FAM</td>
<td>Research Institute of Fundamental and Applied Medicine named after B. Atchabarov</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RWR</td>
<td>Research work of a resident</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acronym</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IQAA</td>
<td>Independent Kazakh Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SSC</td>
<td>Scientific student circle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STP</td>
<td>Scientific and technical programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCIE</td>
<td>National Centre for Independent Examination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Science Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCS</td>
<td>Scientific Centre of Surgery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCOGP</td>
<td>Scientific Centre for Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCP&amp;PS</td>
<td>Scientific Centre for Pediatrics and Pediatric Surgery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PO</td>
<td>Public organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EP</td>
<td>Educational programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DP&amp;CEP</td>
<td>Department of planning and control of the educational process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OSCE</td>
<td>Objective structured clinical examination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IC</td>
<td>Intermediate certification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MG</td>
<td>Major disciplines (training)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PHC</td>
<td>Primary health care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCDMP</td>
<td>Noncommunicable Disease Management Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RSE on REM</td>
<td>Republican state enterprise on the right of economic management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WC</td>
<td>Working curricula</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QMS</td>
<td>Quality Management System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOP</td>
<td>Standard operating procedures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IWR</td>
<td>Independent work of residents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Simulation centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IWRST</td>
<td>Independent work of a resident under the supervision of a teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TC</td>
<td>Typical curriculum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ERWR</td>
<td>Educational and research work of residents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMA</td>
<td>Educational-methodical association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UC</td>
<td>University clinic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AC</td>
<td>Academic Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCU</td>
<td>Centre of collective usage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GCV</td>
<td>Graduate Career Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STE</td>
<td>School of teaching excellence</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2. **Composition of the External Expert Commission**

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 19 dated April 26, 2021, an External Expert Commission was formed to conduct institutional accreditation and accreditation of educational programmes for specialties of KazNMU residency during May 26-28, 2021, in the following composition:

**Chairperson of the External Expert Commission**
MORENKO MARINA ALEKSEEVNA, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Children's Diseases with courses of allergology, immunology, hematology and endocrinology, NJSC "Astana Medical University"
Vice President of the Association of Allergists and Clinical Immunologists of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Member of the Union of Pediatricians of Russia

**Foreign expert (online)**
NASYROV RUSLAN ABDULLAEVICH, Doctor of Medical Sciences Professor, Vice-rector for scientific work, Head of the Department of Pathological Anatomy with the course of forensic medicine, St. Petersburg State Pediatric Medical University of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation, Member of the New York Academy of Sciences

**Foreign expert**
RYZHGIN SERGEY ALEXANDROVICH
Doctor of Medical Sciences, Deputy Director of the Russian Medical Academy of Continuous Development (Moscow), Associate Professor of the Department of Radiation Diagnostics, Head of the Department of Additional Professional Education of the Kazan State Medical Academy, accredited expert of the Federal Service for Supervision in Education and Science (Rosobrnadzor).

**National academic expert**
DZHANDAEV SERIK ZHAKENOVICH, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor Department of Otorhinolaryngology, NJSC "Astana Medical University"
Academician of the "International Academy of Head and Neck Surgery"
National academic expert
LIGAY ZOYA NIKOLAEVNA,
Doctor of Medical Sciences,
head of the department of general medical practice with a course of medical care
NJSC "Kazakh-Russian Medical University"

National academic expert
MADYAROV VALENTIN MANARBEKOVICEH,
Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Surgery with a course of anesthesiology and resuscitation, NJSC "Kazakh-Russian Medical University"

National academic expert
ZHANALINA BAHYT SEKERBEKOVA,
Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Surgical and Pediatric Dentistry
NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov"
Excellence in Health care of the Republic of Kazakhstan

National academic expert
JUMALINA AKMARAL KANASHKEVA,
Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Pediatric Diseases with Neonatology, NJSC "West Kazakhstan State Medical University named after Marat Ospanov"

National academic expert
KUDABAeva KHATIMIA ILYASOVA,
Candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor
Department of Internal Medicine №1
NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov"

National academic expert
ABDULLINA VENERA RAVILEVA,
Candidate of Medical Sciences,
Associate Professor of the Department of Ophthalmology
NJSC "Kazakh-Russian Medical University"
National academic expert
IGIMBAEVA GAUKHAR TLEUBEKKYZY, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor, Republican Coordinator of Continuous Professional Development of Health Personnel on the Issues of Mortality Reduction from BSC of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Consultant Cardiologist of the Highest Category at the Orhun Medical Clinic (Turkey-Kazakhstan)

National academic expert
KABILDINA NAILA AMIRBEKOVNA. Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Oncology and Radiation Diagnostics, doctor oncosurgeon PSE ROD of NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda"

National academic expert
KUSAINOVA FARIDAT AZYMOVNA, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Obstetrics, Gynecology and Reproductive Technologies LLP "Institute of Reproductive Medicine", Almaty

National academic expert
BACHEVA IRINA VIKTOROVNA, PhD in Medicine, Associate Professor of the Department of Internal Medicine Head of the educational programme of residency in the specialty "Nephrology, including adult" of NJSC Medical University of Karaganda

National academic expert
MAUKAEVA SAULE BORANBAEVENA, candidate of medical sciences, doctor of the highest category, Head of the Department of Infectious Diseases and Immunology NJSC "Semey Medical University"
The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC (Order of the ECAQA Director general No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01127 - "Ophthalmology, including children’s" of KazNMU for compliance with the Accreditation Standards programmes of postgraduate education (specialty residency) of medical educational institutions of ECAQA, recommendations of the EEC on the further improvement of the educational activities of KazNMU in the field of postgraduate education.
2. General part of the final report of the EEC

2.1 Presentation of the NJSC "Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University "(KazNMU) and the educational residency programme in the specialty 7R01127 - "Ophthalmology, including children's"

Since 2018 at KazNMU reorganized into a non-profit joint-stock company (NJSC) in accordance with the decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (dated April 5, 2018 No. 166) and received the status of a research university (decree of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 11/12/2018). KazNMU conducts training of students on the basis of 106 health care organizations, including 5 research centres affiliated with the university. There are also 4 university clinics: Aksai clinic, internal medicine clinic of KazNMU, professorial clinic of KazNMU, dental clinic.

The university successfully implements dual training with involvement in the development and implementation of educational programmes of employers and field training of interns and residents in the regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan, branches of KazNMU in Taldykorgan, Taraz and Kyzylorda and other regions of Kazakhstan.

The first admission to residency was held in 2008. The first issue of residents was carried out in 2010.

Currently, in accordance with the state license No. KZ74LAA00017008 of 09/19/2019, training is carried out in Kazakh, Russian and English at undergraduate and postgraduate levels of training in 44 specialties of residency.

In KazNMU from 2016 to 2020, 5422 people received postgraduate education, including 719 residents.

Employment of residency graduates over the past 5 years is 100%.

The staff of the University is 2099 people. Of these, the teaching staff - 1283, incl. academicians - 9, doctors of sciences - 151, candidates of sciences - 401, doctors of PhD - 20. The teaching staff of KazNMU has a high scientific and pedagogical potential. The holders of the grant of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan "The best teacher of the Republic of Kazakhstan" are 17 university teachers.

In the international institutional rating ARES among Kazakhstani universities in 2020, KazNMU took the fourth place in the overall ranking of universities, and a leading position among medical universities of the republic.

According to the results of the rating assessment of medical universities, research institutes, scientific centres of the Republic of Kazakhstan, conducted by the Republican Centre for Health Development, according to indicators of scientific and innovative activities for 2019 and an assessment of the dynamics of rating indicators over the past three years, KazNMU took 1st place. In November 2019, KazNMU became the owner of the independent award "Leader in publication activity in the Web of Science Core Collection over the past 5 years among medical universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan" according to the international information and analytical platform Web of Science.

According to a social online survey, according to the information of the President of the Alliance of Students of Kazakhstan Ilyas Tustikbaev, NJSC Asfendiyarov KazNMU entered the TOP 10 best universities in Kazakhstan.

According to the results of the National rating of the best universities in Kazakhstan -2019, conducted by the Independent Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education (IQAA), KazNMU took 1st place in the institutional rating in the category of medical universities... In the institutional rating of the IAAR in 2019, KazNMU took 2nd place in terms of demand.

In the published Webometrics Ranking of World Universities, which evaluates more than 30 thousand educational institutions around the world, KazNMU entered the four best sites in the country and in the 11 best sites in the world.

Currently, 40 educational programmes at 4 levels of education are accredited by the IAAR. Since 2018, KazNMU has a certificate of institutional accreditation for 5 years.
KazNMU is one of the founders of the Academic Demanding League, which aims to improve the quality of education by implementing and promoting the principles of academic honesty.

KazNMU is a member of the following international associations: AMEE, Association Siberian Open University, UNAI.

During the period of implementation of KazNMU, 124 agreements on cooperation with universities, medical and scientific organizations of 34 countries of the near and far abroad have been concluded.

For the period from the 2015-2016 academic year to the 2019-2020 academic year, 107 visiting professors were invited. External outgoing and incoming academic mobility for the reporting period amounted to 59 university employees and 172 residents.

KazNMU was visited by visiting professors from Turkey, Russia, Lithuania, Warsaw, Georgia, Ukraine, Belarus. Academic mobility of professors and teachers –16. Outgoing external academic mobility of residents - 22.

Within the framework of the Erasmus + programme in 2015 agreements were signed with European universities - Finland, Lithuania, Spain, Estonia. In 2020, KazNMU won 4 grants for projects: AccelEd, HARMONE, LMQS, FOR21, aimed at promoting the modernization and sustainable development of the education and training system.

The main educational, scientific and clinical structural unit of KazNMU, which coordinates training in residency is the dean's office of internship and residency, renamed from August 3, 2020 to the faculty of postgraduate education.

Total number of students in residency 2019-2020 years was 453 residents, including in the specialty 7R01127 - "Ophthalmology, including children’s" 23 people. In 2019 and in 2020 respectively, in the specialty 7R01127 - "Ophthalmology, including children’s" - 4 and 6 respectively.

The total number of teachers involved in the educational process of residency in the above specialty is 6 people, among them, MD - 2, Ph.D. - 1, no degree (presence of a medical category) - 3...

2.2 Information on previous accreditation

Accreditation of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01127 - "Ophthalmology, including children’s" of KazNMU was carried out in 2016 by the Accreditation Body of the IAAR.

2.3 Analysis of the self-assessment report of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01127 - "Ophthalmology, including children's"

Preparation for specialized accreditation of KazNMU was carried out on the basis of order No. 91 dated February 26, 2021 "On approval of the composition of the working group for preparation for self-assessment of educational programmes of KazNMU residency"

Self-assessment report educational programme presented on 149 pages of the main text, as well as attachments on 132-149 pages, 23 attachments in PDF format, electronic versions of documents via the link in Google drive https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1FjbOSq-JcHvquVn42DkTdJ5p-VCFLmnb? usp = sharing.

The report is characterized by answers to the criteria for each of the 9 accreditation standards, structuredness taking into account the recommendations of the ECAQA Self-Assessment Guidelines for educational programmes, as well as internal consistency of information.

The report is accompanied by an accompanying a letter signed by the rector T.S.Nurgozhin, confirming the accuracy of the information and data contained in the report.

The report contains information about the representative of the NCIE responsible for the self-assessment of educational programmes - A.N.Baimakhanov, Dean of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education.

The working group on the preparation of the self-assessment report has done a certain amount of work: the content of the accredited educational programme, the conditions for its implementation,
staffing, educational resources, development dynamics since the date of the previous accreditation in 2016 have been collected, the necessary information has been collected in accordance with the Accreditation Standards for Postgraduate Education Programmes (specialties of residency) of medical educational institutions of ECAQA (hereinafter referred to as accreditation standards); analysis, updating of methodological and educational materials, relevant documents on residency (regulations, rules), their content is reflected in the report. The content of the Self-Assessment Report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards.

All standards show actual practice KazNMU for the training of residents in the specialty 7R01127 - "Ophthalmology, including children's", at the same time, the beginning of training from 2016, in 2019-2020 at the Department of Ophthalmology of KazNMU studied 22, in 2020-2021. 23 residents are studying.

The self-assessment report contains reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the objectives of the educational programme, assessment of residents, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. Self-assessment report description is fairly completed and updated in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information about the selection and admission, the results of training, the results of the assessment of knowledge and skills, the material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (medical organizations, practice bases, universities), financial information, plans for development and improvement, etc.

Conclusion on each of the 9 accreditation standards includes a description of the strengths and areas for improvement identified in the course of introspection and development prospects for the specialty.

Thus, the self-assessment report of the accredited educational residency programme of KazNMU contains objective, detailed, structured information on all types of activities in accordance with the ECAQA accreditation standards, and the university made the appropriate corrections in the report at the expert evaluation stage.

### 3. Description of external expert evaluation

External expert work on the evaluation of the educational programme residency in the specialty 7R01127 - "Ophthalmology, including children's" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external assessment of educational institutions and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by order of the Director general of the "Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care" No. 5 dated 17.02.2017) and according to the programme and schedule approved on 11.05.2021 by the Director general of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the rector prof. Nurgozhin T.S.

To obtain objective information on the expert assessment of the accredited educational programme, the members of the EEC used the following methods: interviews with management and administrative staff, interviews with residents and teachers, observation, studying the website, interviewing employees of various structural units, questioning teachers and residents, reviewing resources with a visit to clinical bases in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards, attending practical (seminar) classes of residents, including online in a pandemic, studying regulatory and educational documents both before a visit to KazNMU and during a visit.

On the part of the university staff, the presence of all persons indicated in the visit programme and according to the lists of interview sites is ensured (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with members of the EEC

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>FULL NAME.</th>
<th>Position</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Bayldinova K. Zh.</td>
<td>Vice Rector for Academic Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Position</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Baymakhanov A.N.</td>
<td>dDean of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Tusupbekova S.K.</td>
<td>Director of the Department of Academic Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Kulzhakhanova S.S.</td>
<td>Head of the Alumni Career Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Nagasbekova B.S.</td>
<td>Head of Human Development Department resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Sapakova M.M.</td>
<td>Head of HR Department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Tulepbaeva G.S.</td>
<td>supervisor Department of Clinical Work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Nurmakhanova Zh.M.</td>
<td>Chairperson of the Committees of Educational Programmes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Interview with 3 residents (room 205) Temirova N. Mekenbaeva M. Utepova G.</td>
<td>Ophthalmology residents, including children’s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Modovov N.A.</td>
<td>library manager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Saliev T.M.</td>
<td>Supervisor of SRIFM named after Atchabarov SRIFM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Balmukhanova A.V.</td>
<td>Deputy Head of the Atchabarov SRIFM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Talkimbaeva N.A.</td>
<td>Head of the Simulation Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Shonbasova M.B.</td>
<td>Head of the Testing Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Residency teachers:</td>
<td>Head of the Department of Ophthalmology, MD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Suleimenov Marat Smagulovich Utelbaeva Zauresh Tursunovna</td>
<td>Professor of the Department of Ophthalmology, MD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Kanafyanova Elmira Gazizovna (employer)</td>
<td>Chief physician of KazNRI Eye Diseases LLP, MD</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The sequence of the visit during May 26-28, 2021 is detailed in the Visit Programme, which is located in the documentation of the accreditation centre and in the Attachment to this report.

Vice-rector for academic activities Bayldinova K. Zh. Presented EEC and provided information on the purpose of the visit. This interview provided evidence that the mission of the residency programme and the mission of the university are fully consistent with each other. The vice-rector voiced the strategy for the development of postgraduate education, including residency programmes, which indicates a clear vision of the university and an interest in improving residency programmes, taking into account the needs of practical health care.

Meeting with the Dean of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education Baimakhanov A.N. and Director of the Department for Academic Work Tusupbekova S.K. allowed the experts to find out how the Internal Quality Assurance Policy in postgraduate education works in the context of the ESG. To search for evidence of compliance with standard 4, experts asked questions about the current status of a resident in accordance with the Health Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The following tasks of the dean's office were also analyzed - the formation of state orders for specialties, the admission of residents, the provision of resources, the assessment of educational programmes of residency. It was found that the dean's office closely cooperates with the departments teaching residents. During the period of implementation of KazNMU, 124 agreements on cooperation were concluded with universities, medical and scientific organizations of 34 countries of the near and far abroad, including with TOP-500 universities, implementing joint scientific, research and educational projects. From the conversation with the dean, it was determined that the residents work in the clinics in a safe environment.

When interviewing the head of the Graduate Career Centre Kulzhakhanova S.S., the experts evaluated the approaches to the implementation of monitoring the employment of residents. In general, the employment rate is very high and amounts to 100%, at the same time it is necessary to conduct monitoring over several years. The experts studied the results of a survey of graduates and employers
about the level of satisfaction of employers and other stakeholders with the quality of training of residents.

As a result of an interview with the head of the human development department resources Nagasbekova B.S. and the head of the personnel management department Sapakova M.M., the information was received on providing staff of the departments of residency, compliance with qualification requirements for teaching staff. Also, the policy of recruiting mentors, the system of motivation of teaching staff and mentors used in the university and its results were analyzed.

Supervisor Department of Clinical Work Tulebaeva G.S. reported to the experts on provision of resources for clinical practice and the work of residents, about cooperation with clinical bases. Gulzhan Sovetovna gave a description of mentoring in residency, representation of residents in the advisory and advisory bodies (CSR) of the university.

Interview with chairperson of educational programmes committees Nurmakhanova Zh.M. and Ensegenova Z.Zh. showed that the development and evaluation educational programmes in the areas of training are carried out by the profile committee of educational programmes (CEP), which includes representatives of residents and practical health care. The catalogs of elective disciplines are developed on the basis of the State Educational Standard, consumer suggestions and regional specifics in accordance with the unified approach to the organization of the educational process adopted at the University and focus on the Mission of the University. Elective courses reflect current trends in the development of ophthalmology.

Interviews with residents were held, while the EEC was divided into 5 subgroups for a more detailed clarification of issues related to training, resources and training methods. A total of 55 residents attended the interview, of which 3 were on the program 7R01127 - "Ophthalmology, including children."

Interview with residents (Temirova N., Mekenbaeva M., Utepova G.), students of the accredited educational programme, took place in an online format. Nevertheless, it was possible to get answers about the possibility of determining an individual trajectory of training (microsurgery, functional diagnostics, advisory reception), about social support for students in residency, about the availability and timeliness of filling out the EMCD discipline, objectivity of knowledge assessment, about the authority of the teaching staff. The opinions of residents about possible ways to improve the educational process at KazNMU were also heard.

The experts also asked questions about satisfaction with training at KazNMU, the sufficiency of time for supervising patients, mastering work in Damumed with medical documentation, the availability of resources of international databases of professional literature. In general, residents are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, since they believe that KazNMU has good educational resources, image and international connections, at the same time, residents would like more independence in managing patients and holding international events.

Residents showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their line of judgment on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, the ability to participate in research and development, funding. They also demonstrated competence when answering questions from foreign experts - prof. R.A. Nasyrova (St. Petersburg) and Doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor Ryzhkin S.A. (Moscow / Kazan).

Interview with the head of the library N.A. Modovov allowed us to estimate provision of the residency programme with educational, methodological and scientific literature, including electronic forms. So, according to the accredited programme, there are 115 textbooks, 6 monographs. Residents-ophthalmologists have access to periodicals: Journal "Bulletin of Ophthalmology", "Russian Ophthalmological Journal", "Ophthalmological Journal of Kazakhstan", periodical "Glaucoma". Also there is access to 5 international databases, which provides an opportunity for residents and teachers to participate in research and development and other events (http://www.eyepress.ru).

Interview with the manager of SRIFM named after Atchabarov SRIFM Saliev Timur Muymdinovich and deputy Balmukhanova Aigul Vladimirovna allowed the experts to learn about the
scientific directions of the university, the system of motivation and participation in R&D of teachers of the departments of residency and residents, about the organization of R&D by residents on practice bases, the possibility of publishing R&D results of residents and teachers in journals, including university journals. KazNMU Bulletin.

One of the important tools for accreditation expertise is the conduct and interviews with employers - representatives of practical health care, which are not affiliated with KazNMU. A total of 16 people were interviewed, including the Chief Physician of the KazNRI of Eye Diseases LLP, Ph.D. Kanafyanov E.G.

Interviews with employers on all educational programmes of residency of KazNMU declared for accreditation were conducted online and included such issues as: knowledge of the mission of the university, participation in the development of the mission and proposals in the strategic plan, participation in the deliberative bodies of KazNMU, satisfaction with basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in the training of residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, 100% employment of residency graduates, etc.

Thus, during the first day of the visit, the expert validated the data of the self-assessment report of the educational programme according to standards 1,4,7,8 and partially 6.

The second day of the visit is May 27, 2021.

In order to assess the resources that ensure the effective implementation of the educational programme, the expert visited the following clinical sites: Professorial clinic of NJSC "KazNMU named after S. D. Asfendiyarov "Ophthalmological Centre".

A review of resources showed that the university's clinical base for the implementation of an accredited educational programme, available for review at the time of an external visit, corresponds to the goals and objectives, since there is a sufficient number of thematic patients, modern equipment and demonstrates accessibility to students, and employees who simultaneously perform the role of teachers and curators (mentors), provide quality teaching in an ethical and deontological manner. Before the start of the corresponding discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during training.

The experts examined the documentation on the educational programme 7R01127 - "Ophthalmology, including children's" by the link https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1FjbO6q-JcHVn42DkTJp-VCFLmbb?usp=sharing, which confirmed the compliance with accreditation standards, including documentation about teachers Utelbaeva Z.T., Suleimenov M.S., Berdysheva A.A. and mentors of residents Zhurgumbayeva G.K., Kanafyana E.G. and at the request of EEC members.

The experts studied the documents of residents (portfolio, results of assessment of residents-checklists, results of a questionnaire survey of residents).

The expert visit included a visit to review the test centre resources and the proctoring system. The head of the Testing Centre, Shonbasova Maral Beibitzhanovna, demonstrated the use of the proctoring system during the exam, talked about the functional responsibilities of proctors, detailed instructions for students before the exam, and the appeal system.

The head of the office-registrar - Nabieva Gulnaz Sotsialovna spoke in detail about the work of the system of the office-registrar, starting from the moment of admission of a resident and ending after 3 years of his studies. She also talked about the possibility of creating a virtual office registrar.

Interviews with teachers, as providers of the residency programme, showed that there are both successes and problems in the management of the educational programme, since the main developer of programmes and teaching and methodological documentation is the Dean's office of postgraduate education, and teachers are more involved in the practical training of residents and mentoring. In order to verify the data of Standard 5, external experts obtained information about personnel policy and approaches to the development of pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation to work with
residents, and mentoring. The experts found that teachers initiate research topics for residents, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature and medical documentation.

In order to validate the fulfillment of the data of the self-assessment report and obtain evidence of the quality of the programmes, interviews were conducted with 3 graduates of the residency at the University clinic.

In order to assess compliance with Standard 6, the experts were shown the distance learning platform and showed how it is used in training residents. For example, AIS-KazNMU, digital services https://dis.kaznmu.kz/pluginfile.php/217295/mod_folder/content, https://dis.kaznmu.kz/pluginfile.php/217295/mod_folder/content/0/Moodle, https://dis.kaznmu.kz/pluginfile.php/217295/mod_folder/content/0/Zoom...

Then, a meeting of the EEC members was held on the results of an external assessment, and the experts came to the conclusion that during the second day of the visit, it was possible to find evidence of compliance with standards 2,3,6,7.

**The third day of the visit - May 28, 2021**

An online meeting was held with the head of the youth policy department Askarov Elnur and questions were asked about the participation of residents of the accredited programme in the volunteer movement, helping patients with COVID-19, image work https://t.me/studentssupport365.

Further, a final discussion of the results of the external assessment, study of documents, results of interviews, interviews, questionnaires was held. Generalizations of the results of the external assessment are made. The members of the EEC began to design the final report of the EEC. The expert individually completed the “Quality profile and criteria for external assessment of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01127 -“Ophthalmology, including children’s”for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards.”

No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the postgraduate education sector in general and the department implementing the educational programme were discussed. A draft report with recommendations was prepared.

By the chairperson of the EEC prof. Morenko M.A., a final open vote was held on recommendations to improve the educational programme of residency 7R01127 - "Ophthalmology, including children's" and a final vote on the recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council - to accredit this programme for a period of 5 years. Then the chairperson of the EEC for the management and employees of the educational organization announced recommendations based on the results of an external assessment as part of the accreditation of educational programmes for residency specialties.

**Results of the survey.**

An observer from ECAQA on May 26, 2021 conducted an online survey of residents and teachers on the resource https://webanketa.com/...

The total number of responding residents is 200. Of these, 46.5% are residents of the 1st year of study, 33% are residents of the 2nd year of study, 15.5% are residents of the 3rd year of study and 5% are graduates of the KazNMU residency programme.

According to the results of the survey, 83% of respondents fully agree that they would recommend studying in this educational organization to their acquaintances, friends, relatives, partially agree - 15.5%, and completely disagree with this statement 1.5% (3 people). Fully agree with the statement that programme managers and teachers are aware of the problems of residents related to training, 83.5% of residents, 14% partially agree, 1% strongly disagree (2 people), 1.5% doubt the answer (3 people).

According to the survey results, 86.5% of respondents believe that programme managers and teachers constantly involve students in the work of advisory bodies (methodological council, academic council, committees of educational programmes), 4% answered that no, they do not involve, while
3.5% do not know about it, 3% doubt the answer, and 3% expressed the opinion that they are sometimes involved in this work.

78% of residents are fully satisfied with the conditions and equipment of classrooms, classrooms of this educational organization, partially - 14.5%, completely dissatisfied - 3.5%, partially dissatisfied - 3%.

81.5% of residents answered that they personally have access to equipment (educational and real) in order to master practical skills in their specialty, partially agree - 7%, 6.5% - partially disagree, while 2.5% doubt the answer and the same number of respondents completely disagree with this statement.

Fully 82.5% of residents were provided with the necessary educational literature, 13% answered that it was partially, while 2.5% believed that they were not provided with the necessary literature. 86% of respondents fully agree that teachers provided them with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, 10.5% - partially agree, 2% - completely disagree, 1.5% doubt the answer.

71.5% of residents confirmed that at this time they are engaged in scientific work under the guidance of their teacher or mentor, 13.5% have started planning the implementation of research, 11% have not yet decided on the topic of research, 2.5% have no desire to engage in research, 1.5% doubt the answer.

73.5% of residents are completely and 20.5% are partially satisfied with the library fund of KazNMU, while 2.5% did not give an answer, 2% are partially dissatisfied, 1.5% are completely dissatisfied. According to the results of the survey, 83.5% of the respondents are completely satisfied with the organization of teaching, 14.5% - in part, 1.5% - are not satisfied.

87% of residents believe that there is sufficient time for practical training, 8% - partially agree with this statement, 2% - completely disagree, 1.5% - partially agree, and the same number of people doubt the answer. The schedule of training sessions is fully satisfied with 85% of the respondents, 14% - partially. 91.5% of residents are completely satisfied with the methods of assessing knowledge and skills, and 7.5% - partially.

Of all the respondents, 84% answered that teachers regularly use active and interactive teaching methods in the classroom, 12% expressed the opinion that such teaching methods are used only occasionally, and 1.5% believe that they are rarely, and the remaining 2.5% answered, that they doubt or do not know what it is.

According to the survey results, 88% answered that after the end of the class, the teacher constantly conducts feedback with them, 8.5% believe that sometimes, 1.5% answered that it is rare, and the remaining 1.5% have never encountered this.

When asked about the number of seminars held during the month within the EP residency, 71.5% answered that the seminars are held once a week, 18.5% answered that two or three times a week, 5.5% - held daily, 2.5% believe that it is very rare.

94% of residents are sure that this educational organization allows them to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in their specialty, 3% are not sure about this, and 2% cannot yet answer this question. Of all the respondents, 76.5% give an excellent assessment of the organization of clinical training, 17.5% have a good impression, 3% cannot rate it yet, and 2% are not satisfied.

We completely agree that the teacher (mentor, curator) of this educational organization is an example for them as a professional doctor, a person, 91% of residents, 7.5% answered that not all teachers of this educational organization are an example, while 1% is completely do not agree.

89% of respondents are completely satisfied with the number of patients for supervision or assistance during operations, 8% - in part, 1.5% - completely dissatisfied.

The majority (86%) of respondents believe that the accreditation of an educational institution and educational programmes is an important and necessary mechanism for ensuring the quality of education in residency, 6% doubt the answer, 5.5% do not know what it is.

50% of residents believe that an interview with the university management is the most important tool for external expert evaluation, 46.5% chose the option “interview with teachers”, 39.5% consider interviews with residents as such, 38% answered that interviews with mentors of residents, 29% -
interviews with university graduates, 28.5% - an overview of the resource base for training residents, 25.5% - attending practical classes and seminars.

**Conclusions:** By their responses, residents generally expressed satisfaction with the organization of education in general, as well as with the conditions of training, access to equipment, time for practical training, the number of patients for supervision, and the organization of teaching.

**The results of the questionnaire survey of the teachers of the NJSC "Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University "(KazNMU)**

The ECAQA observer, as part of the external assessment programme, conducted an online survey on May 26, which included 23 questions, allowing to draw conclusions about the attitude of teachers to the organization of the educational process and identify existing problems.

The total number of teachers on the list is 64, including those with up to 5 years of experience - 7.81%, up to 10 years - 20.31%, over 10 years - 71.88%.

Of all the respondents, they teach in the educational programme of the therapeutic profile - 48.44%, the surgical profile - 29.69%, the pediatric direction (including pediatric infections and neonatology) - 4.69%, the diagnostic direction (functional diagnostics, radiation diagnostics) - 4.69%, oncology, radiology, radiation therapy - 6.25%, dental profile - 6.25%.

Of all the respondents, 84.38% are full-time teachers, 6.25% are part-time teachers, 6.25% are not involved in teaching residents, 1.56% are mentors, 1.56% are not related to residency programmes.

84.38% are completely satisfied with the organization of the educational process, partially - 15.63%. According to the survey, 84.38% of teachers fully agree that ethics and subordination are observed in KazNMU, the remaining 15.63% believe that it is partially. 75% of respondents are completely satisfied with the organization of work and workplace, 23.44% are partially, and 1.56% (1 person) are not completely satisfied. The organization has an opportunity for career growth and development of competence for teachers: 75% fully agree, 25% partially.

70.31% of respondents fully agree that in this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research, 28.13% - partially agree, and the remaining 1.56% (1 person) - completely disagree. According to the survey results, 46.88% of respondents are completely satisfied with the salary, 17.19% - More NO than YES, 15.63% - more YES than NO, 12.5% did not give an answer, 7.81% - completely dissatisfied.

70.31% confirmed that they personally participate in the development of teaching materials for the residency programme, 17.19% participate partially, 6.25% answered that they are provided with ready-made methodological developments, 4.69% doubt the answer.

64.06% of respondents studied at professional development courses from 1 to 5 years ago, 35.94% - during this year.

More than half of the respondents (51.56%) hold seminars with residents once a week, 15.63% - 2-3 times a week, 12.5% - daily, 7.81% - 1-2 times a month.

According to the survey results, 84.38% of teachers fully agree that they can be realized as professionals in their specialty in this educational organization, and 10.94% agree partially, 3.13% partially disagree.

76.56% of respondents fully agree that the organization has enough equipment and resources to conduct training for residents on accredited programmes, 20.31% - partially agree.

75% of respondents are fully satisfied with the work of the postgraduate education department, 20.31% are partially, the rest are not satisfied or have doubts about the answer. Regarding participation in conferences (international, republican), 29.69% did not contact the management on this matter, 26.56% did not give an answer, 18.75% answered that the organization supported their participation by paying for travel, travel expenses, registration fees, 7.81% answered that they no expenses are paid, 7.81% found sponsors, 6.25% are supported only by fare.

The majority of respondents (93.75%) fully agree that residents have free access to patients at clinical sites and all conditions for improving their practical skills, 6.25% - partially agree. The teachers answered that during the classes, they have a syllabus and a CDM (87.5%), control and measuring
instruments (78.13%), cases (65.63%), an educational journal (54.69%), monographs (35.94%), a registration journal mining (20.31%).

The level of previous training of residents upon admission to training programmes is fully satisfied by 40.63% of the respondents, partially - 51.56%, at the same time, 1.56% completely disagree with this, 6.25% did not give an answer.

57.81% know about the implementation of social programmes to support teachers, 29.69% do not know about it, 7.81% doubt the answer, 3.13% have already used it. Of all the respondents, 67.19% note that the organization's management systematically listens to the opinion of teachers in relation to issues on the educational process, research and development, clinical work, 26.56% believe that sometimes, 4.69% did not give an answer.

In the process of training residents, a variety of training methods are used, but more often the analysis of situational tasks (78.13%), the preparation and solution of cases (64.06%), work in small groups (64.06%), problem-oriented training (60.94%), interactive training (60.94 %), oral questioning of students (54.69%), oral analysis of the topic (50%), solution of tests (43.75%), practical training in clinical skills in a clinical training centre (42.19%).

70.31% of the respondents fully agree that this survey is useful for developing recommendations for improving the key areas of activity of this organization, 15.63% partially agree with this, 12.5% found it difficult to answer. Of all respondents, 67.19% believe that accreditation of educational programmes is an important and effective mechanism for ensuring the quality of postgraduate education, 28.13% did not understand what accreditation is, 23.44% expressed the opinion that it is, but in combination with other mechanisms (certification, audits, independent assessment of students’ knowledge).

**Conclusions:** The survey showed that the majority of the interviewed teachers are satisfied with the organization of the educational process, observance of ethics and subordination, the organization of labor and workplace, the opportunity for career growth, the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research.

The results of the questionnaire are presented in the Attachment and, in general, demonstrate satisfaction with the educational process, the resources of the clinical base, the competencies of teachers, and also indicate the presence of a centralized management of educational programmes.

**Conclusion on the basis of the external evaluation:**

Members of the EEC have carefully studied and evaluated the main indicators of the accredited educational programme. The information obtained by the expert during the study of the self-assessment report, during the preparation of a written review with recommendations for improvement, during the implementation of the activities of the visit programme was analyzed at KazNMU from 26 to 28 May 2021. All the information received was compared with the data of the self-assessment report, the information was validated for each criterion of the accreditation standards and the indicators of the Attachment to the self-assessment report were verified, which made it possible to ensure the reliability of the provided the university information and 23 documents confirming compliance with ECAQA Accreditation Standards.

Despite the fact that in the self-assessment report of the educational programme NCIE described his real educational practice in postgraduate education. Before visiting the organization by examining the attachments to the report provided by the postgraduate education department and access to googledisk https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1FjbOSq-JcHvquVn42DkJdp-VCFLmbb?usp=sharing, experts reviewed more than 30 documents, as well as during an external expert evaluation by members of the EEC studied the main documents (mission, strategic plan until 2021, teaching materials of disciplines, syllabuses, control and measuring instruments, checklists, portfolios of residents, individual plans of residents for the 2019-2020 academic year, publications of teachers, rules for admission to residency, personnel policy, internal programme quality assurance systems, resources for training were viewed directly at the clinical bases of departments (classrooms, office equipment
available for residents to work with literature, patient documentation, educational and methodological literature), resources on residency on the website https://kaznmu.kz/, which made it possible to identify the compliance of the educational organization with the basic accreditation standards.

During the external examination, it was found that the Rules for the training of medical personnel in residency were observed (order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated September 18, 2018 No. KR DSM-16). The volume of the study load and treatment and prophylactic work by sections of the educational programme is determined by the individual work plan of the resident (clause 14) for one year and is monitored by monthly reports of the resident in an arbitrary form. The accounting of completed tasks is drawn up in the form of a portfolio according to the recommendations in the syllabus.

In connection with the new edition of order No. 647 On the approval of state compulsory standards and standard professional training programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties dated July 31, 2015 (as amended by the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 02.21.No. KR DSM-12/2020 Chapter 2. Requirements for the content of residency educational programmes with a focus on learning outcomes), there have been changes and additions in the educational programme in relation to the development of the research competence of residents, which must participate in the work of the research team.

In accordance with Article 222 of the Residency of Clause 4 of the Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan on People's Health and the Health care System No. 360-VI ZRK dated July 7, 2020, external experts studied the activities and conducted conversations with mentors of residents, and it was established that each resident was provided with a mentor.

Accredited educational programme 7R01127 - "Ophthalmology, including children's" implemented according to the current state educational standard. All educational, methodological, personnel and resource bases were assessed for compliance with accreditation standards. Through interviews with teachers and interviews with students, it was possible to determine their direct participation in the development, evaluation of educational programmes, decision-making on a number of key issues in the choice of clinical sites, topics of electives, participation in the appeal commissions for the admission and assessment of residents, the development of the content of individual plans of residents and the selection of mentors.

Recommendations for improving activities in the field of implementation of the educational residency programme in the specialty 7R01127 - "Ophthalmology, including children's" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards, developed by the EEC based on the results of the expert assessment, were presented at a meeting with the management on May 28, 2021.

The programme of the 3-day visit (May 26-28, 2021) of the external expert assessment of the EEC has been completed in full. On the part of the university staff, the participation of all persons indicated in the programme is ensured.

Thus, the external assessment and the visit of the EEC members made it possible to verify and validate the data of the self-assessment report of the residency programme in full in accordance with the Regulation on the External Expert Commission, the Guidelines for the external assessment of the medical organization ECAQA education.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all necessary information and material resources of the accredited educational programme was organized. Experts note the high level of corporate culture and discipline of the employees of KazNMU responsible for the postgraduate education, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to members of the EEC.
4. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of the educational residency programme in the specialty 7R01127 - "Ophthalmology, including children's" and an overview of the strengths for each standard.

**Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES**

It was found that KazNMU defined its mission, which includes an educational component, namely: “Mission of the NJSC Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University (hereinafter referred to as the University) is aimed at serving society through the training of competitive specialists in the treatment, preservation and strengthening of people's health, improving health care through the integration of advanced educational, scientific and medical technologies "...

Mission of the educational programme (EP) in the specialty 7R01127 - "Ophthalmology, including children's" is aimed at realizing the mission of the University by training a qualified doctor in ophthalmology with a system of universal knowledge and professional competencies, capable and ready for independent professional activity in the treatment of ophthalmic diseases.

The University organizes targeted meetings with employers - when coordinating educational programmes, catalogs of elective disciplines (CED); representatives of employers are members of the Clinical Council of KazNMU, at whose meetings issues related to the implementation of the Mission are discussed. Training of residents in the specialty 7R19027 - "Ophthalmology, including children’s" is carried out in 4 scientific and medical centres of the city of Almaty. The Department of Ophthalmology has its own clinical base, where there is an advisory, diagnostic, inpatient department, a laser centre and an operating unit, as well as modern medical equipment for ophthalmological operations. Resident ophthalmologists have the opportunity to assist in all operations at clinical sites. Residency training is focused on practice, therefore theoretical training is 10%, clinical work 75%, independent work 15%. When working with residents, training is carried out using updated clinical minutes of the meetings, treatment recommendations, own and borrowed implementations in clinical practice. The EP, as a mandatory component, includes the work of residents in healthy lifestyle rooms, according to the noncommunicable disease management programme (DMP). Among the checklists of the resident's activities there is a checklist for assessing the conduct of health education work with patients. The staff of the Department of Ophthalmology, together with the residents, hold round tables for persons registered with dispensaries with diseases of the organ of vision. Residents give lectures on the topics: "Computer visual syndrome", "Dry eye syndrome", examine the children of orphanages.

KazNMU strictly follows the requirements of the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the provisions of the TUP when developing the mandatory part of the educational programme, therefore, it clearly formulates the competencies and skills that a resident will receive as a result of training.

Currently, 23 residents are studying in the residency specializing in ophthalmology, including children’s.

Thus, during a visit to KazNMU, experts established compliance with the basic criteria of the accreditation standard: the presence of a mission, strategic objectives of the programme, participation in the development of the mission of stakeholders (employees, teachers, residents’ assets), residents are informed about their final results from the first day of classes, provided with resources and a practice-oriented educational programme. The effectiveness of the educational programme is evidenced by 100% employment.

**Strengths:**

1. KazNMU has procedures for the development and adoption of legal acts and their management.
2. The medical organization contributes to the formation of professionalism among residents through the implementation of academic autonomy.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 17 standards conform: completely - 15, significantly 2, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 1: completed**
Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME

The educational and methodological complex for the educational programme of residency in the specialty "Ophthalmology, including children’s" meets the requirements for the structure and content of vocational education and the level of training of residency specialists. The academic policy of the educational programme has been developed, which determines the procedure for the development and approval of the programme, the rules for conducting all types of control, criteria for assessing the educational achievements of residents and others. For each resident, a working training curriculum is available for the entire period of study, there is an individual curriculum, which assumes the personal participation of the student of the residency in the provision of services to patients. Residents, while studying basic, major and elective disciplines, master the clinical competencies required for professional practice in ophthalmology. The University has Simulation Centre named after K. Kozhakanova, equipped with modern equipment. Clinical work of residents during training at clinical sites is carried out under the guidance of curators and mentors. Curators for residents are appointed from among the teaching staff of departments with a scientific degree, as well as the highest or first qualification category, who are actively involved in scientific and practical activities in this industry and carry out training in residency. The institute of mentoring has been developed (clause 2.6.1) since September 2019 on the basis of the Regulation on mentoring, approved by order of the rector No. 231 of September 16, 2019. The syllabuses indicate the place and time of the resident's training consultation. The list of acquired practical skills is reflected in the portfolio of the resident. The curator assesses the portfolio of residents, assesses knowledge, skills and abilities in each discipline based on the developed system of control and measuring instruments. The University has introduced a modular-credit technology of education, all documentation is drawn up taking into account the "Regulations on credit technology of education". The development and evaluation of educational programmes in the areas of training is carried out by the profile committee of educational programmes (CEP), which includes representatives of residents and practical health care (clause 2.5.2, Attachment "Regulations on the Committee of educational programmes"). The catalogs of elective disciplines are developed on the basis of the State Educational Standard, consumer proposals and regional specifics in accordance with the unified approach to the organization of the educational process adopted at the University and focus on the Mission of the University. Elective courses reflect current trends in the development of ophthalmology. The university has an ISO 9001: 2015 certificate valid until 06/18/2023. (Attachment "Certificate ISO 9001: 2015"). Offsite training for residents is carried out, which facilitates their employment, allows you to monitor the employment process, track the trajectory of the graduate and determine the needs of the employer and the quality of training.

The ability for constant professional growth of a resident is reflected in the "Portfolio", which is formed from the moment of admission to the residency by the students personally. Persons who have completed training in the EP of residency and have successfully passed the final certification are awarded the qualification "doctor ophthalmologist" and a certificate is graduated.

Training of residents is carried out at clinical sites with personal participation in the treatment and diagnostic process, both in classroom time and during independent work. All the rules are reflected in the Reference Guide. Equipping clinical bases allows you to effectively implement active teaching methods: seminars, webinars, conferences, analysis of clinical cases, problem-oriented training (PBL); Case-Based Learning (CBL), Team-Based Learning (TBL); training based on simulation technologies, analysis of clinical cases, medical records management, examination of the quality of medical care, case management, training in a clinic with the participation of a real patient, training in primary health care, attending medical conferences, consultations.

The resident training programme provides for the implementation of various forms of educational and research work, while some residents are involved in the implementation of scientific and technical projects carried out by teachers.

The Academic Policy for the 2020-2021 academic year, approved by the Board by the Protocol of 01/05/2021, stipulates the appointment of mentors. Mentors in residency are appointed annually by order. No more than 3-4 residents are assigned to each mentor.
Thus, during a visit to KazNMU, experts established compliance with the basic criteria of the accreditation standard: a developed and approved educational programme that meets the requirements of the State Educational Standard of Education 2019 and is implemented in a student-centered and patient-centered environment in the best clinics of the city. The educational programme is provided with appropriate methodological documentation and documents accompanying residents (guide, Code, Portfolio structure, EMCD, syllables). Teachers have introduced and effectively apply various teaching methods, mainly of a practical nature, and involve residents in research, which contributes to the formation and development of competencies in the specialty.

**Strengths:**
1. The University has developed educational programmes based on the competence-oriented model of the graduate of residency, which are characterized by flexibility and responsiveness in accordance with the needs of society and the labor market.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 30 standards correspond: completely 23, significantly - 7, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 2: completed**

**Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS**
The policy and methods for assessing residents are considered and approved at a meeting of the committee of educational programmes (CEP) internship and residency. The general policy, principles, methods of assessing residents are reflected in the necessary internal regulatory documents (Attachment "Regulations on the committee of educational programmes" p. "Regulations on the current monitoring of progress, intermediate and final attestation of students NJSC» of Asfendiyarov KazNMU ", " Academic policy ", SOP 301 of 11.11.2019. "Rules for monitoring student progress"," Rules for the organization of the educational process "). The assessment of the educational achievements of residents is carried out on the basis of indicators of the level of formation of competencies developed by departments / modules in various forms, based on the collaboration of several disciplines (Attachment "Rules for organizing the educational process", "Regulations on current monitoring of progress, intermediate and final certification of residents ... "Dated 11.11.2019 (with changes and additions)." Review of control and measuring instruments is carried out at several levels - inside the department, inside the university, external review (clause 3.1.4 of the report, Attachment "Rules for the organization of the educational process", SOP No. 301 of 11. + 11.2019 "Procedure for the development of tasks in test form", SOP No. 197 of 29.08.2019 "Development and approval of a system of educational achievements"). During the entire period of study, the resident forms a portfolio, the assessment of which makes it possible to assess the development of the resident's competencies in the form of personal interest, professional competence, communicative, personal qualities, scientific interest (Attachment "Rules for organizing the educational process", "Academic policy", "Regulations on control of progress, intermediate and final certification of residents ... "dated 11.11.2019 (with amendments and additions)"). All employees are familiar with the rules for ensuring the continuity of IT services (order No. 259 of 04/17/2018). The results of the residents' achievement are displayed in the electronic journals of the AIS "Sirius" system and are controlled by the office-registrar system (clause 3.1.1 of the report, Attachment “Rules for ensuring the continuity of IT servers”).

Thus, during a visit to KazNMU, experts established compliance with the basic criteria of the accreditation standard: the review of control and measuring instruments is carried out at several levels, the policy and methods for assessing residents are considered and approved at a meeting of the committee of educational programmes (CEP) internship and residency, general policy, the principles, methods of assessing residents are reflected in the necessary internal regulatory documents, the assessment of educational achievements of residents is carried out on the basis of indicators of the level of formation of competencies developed by departments / modules in various forms, based on the collaboration of several disciplines. The results of the residents' achievement are
displayed in the electronic journals of the AIS "Sirius" system and are monitored by the office-registrar system.

**Strengths:**

1. The system of monitoring the educational achievements of residents is complex and is aimed at assessing the final learning outcomes.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Conform from 11 standards: completely - 7, significantly - 4, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 3: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1) Regularly analyze and evaluate the quality of the methods used and the assessment format for the validity and reliability of the final learning outcomes (3.1.4).

**Standard 4: STUDENTS**

The conditions for admitting residents are described in detail in "Rules for admission to residency". "For the corresponding academic year, based on regulatory legal acts (clause 4.1.1 of the report). The university has a selection committee. The procedure for conducting exams is described in detail, during which an examination committee is formed, which includes the most experienced, qualified teachers of the university with an academic degree. Clause 4.1.2 of the report describes the annual formation of an application (proposal) for the required number of specialists, which is discussed at a meeting of the Academic Committee of the University Senate, and a protocol decision is made on sending the application to the DPHR. According to clause 4.1.3 of the report, the reception of residents with disabilities is regulated by the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated August 31, 2012 No. 1119 "On approval of the standards of public services provided by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, local executive bodies in the field of education and science". Citizens are enrolled in residency on a competitive basis, which is carried out separately among persons applying for targeted places. Regulatory documents of the Rules for admission to residency do not limit the rights of low-income families, national minorities and disabled people. Biomedical knowledge achieved at the undergraduate level is assessed during the entrance examinations on a 100-point assessment scale (paragraph 4.1.5 of the report, Attachment “Rules for admission to residency”). Upon admission, scientific achievements corresponding to the profile of the chosen specialty are taken into account (clause 4.1.6 of the report). When studying at the University, the implementation of the rights of residents, regulated by the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the "Law on Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan", etc. is guaranteed. Consulting residents (clause 4.3. 2 reports) during the academic year can be presented both in full-time and remote forms (on online platforms, in chats, etc.). For the personal growth and development of residents, in addition to sports sections and creative teams, the University has a sufficient resource base (Internet, 100% coverage of the University's WiFi, library, computer classes, reconstructed and improved areas of the main buildings) (p. 4.3.3). At the University, students are provided with an opportunity for anonymous feedback (p. 4.3.4 of the report). Support is provided to protect the health of residents. Social assistance is provided to those in need in accordance with the "Regulations on the provision of social assistance to students and teachers" (order No. 10 of 09.12.2019). Also provided (clause 4.3. 6 of the report) support for vocational guidance and career planning of residents, increasing the mobility, competitiveness of university graduates in the labor market, expanding the framework of social partnership and improving the "resident-university-employer" system. There is an Ethics Council at the University (for the Regulation see [http://kaznmu.kz/rus](http://kaznmu.kz/rus)), which serves as a public body responsible for ensuring the implementation of the Code of Integrity of a teacher and a resident of KazNMU. For residents, there is motivation in the form of awards, participation in republican and international conferences, master classes and trainings, publication of joint scientific works, participation in scientific research conducted at the department. Activity is encouraged when reviewing portfolio materials.
The amount of hours of study work is distributed by type of work in the following necessary ratio. Thus, during a visit to KazNMU, experts established compliance with the basic criteria of the accreditation standard: "Rules for admission to residency" includes both justification and selection methods, also include a description of the appeal mechanism. The admission policy is monitored annually to improve the selection criteria to reflect the ability of residents to be competent. Upon admission, scientific achievements corresponding to the profile of the chosen specialty are taken into account (clause 4.1.6 of the report). Regulatory documents of the Rules for admission to residency do not limit the rights of low-income families, national minorities and disabled people. There is an Ethics Council at the University (for the Regulation see http://kaznmu.kz/rus), which serves as a public body responsible for ensuring the implementation of the Code of Integrity of a teacher and a resident of KazNMU.

Strengths:

1. High commitment and continuity of residency students to this university.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 30 standards conform: fully 18, significantly - 12, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

Standard 4: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1. Expand the representation of residents in the process of developing a policy for the admission and selection of residents (4.1.8).
2. Expand opportunities for residents to participate in the youth policy department and other advisory bodies (4.3.8).

Standard 5: ACADEMIC STAFF / FACULTY

The personnel policy of KazNMU (clause 5.1.1 of the report) is guided by the following regulatory legal acts: “Personnel policy of KazNMU” (order No. 7 dated October 14, 2019); "Rules for the assessment of scientific and pedagogical personnel of KazNMU" (order No. 285 of 23.10.2019); "Qualification requirements for the positions of the teaching staff of KazNMU" (order of the Rector No. 281 of June 25, 2019). The number of teachers working with residents and having an academic degree and / or an academic title, the degree of degree is 83%, at the Department of Ophthalmology 50%. The recruitment of teachers for the implementation of the EP (clause 5.1.2 of the report) is carried out through a competition for filling vacant positions, ("Rules for the competitive replacement of vacant positions of the teaching staff and scientific workers of the NJSC “Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University "(Minutes No. 7 of the Resolution of the Board of Directors dated July 15, 2020). The volume of teaching load of the teaching staff is approved for the academic year by the Senate of the University annually, in accordance with the positions held (clause 5.2.1 of the report). The individual teacher's plan is the main document that regulates the activities of each teacher of the department and is drawn up on the basis of the annual work plan of the department. At the University level, every 5 years, a teaching staff competition for the position held is held. The requirements of personnel policy for the teaching staff and teachers who carry out training in residency comply with the Charter and the policy of providing human resources to KazNMU. "Rules for the search, selection of admission and adaptation of KazNMU employees" No. 10 dated 09.12.2019. The volume of teaching load of the teaching staff is approved for the academic year by the Senate of the University annually, in accordance with the positions held (clause 5.2.1 of the report). The individual teacher's plan is the main document that regulates the activities of each teacher of the department and is drawn up on the basis of the annual work plan of the department. At the University level, every 5 years, a teaching staff competition for the position held is held. The requirements of personnel policy for the teaching staff and teachers who carry out training in residency comply with the Charter and the policy of providing human resources to KazNMU, "Rules for the search, selection of admission and adaptation of KazNMU employees" No. 10 dated 09.12.2019. The volume of teaching load of the teaching staff is approved for the academic year by the Senate of the University annually, in accordance with the positions held
The individual teacher's plan is the main document that regulates the activities of each teacher of the department and is drawn up on the basis of the annual work plan of the department. At the University level, every 5 years, a teaching staff competition for the position held is held. The requirements of personnel policy for the teaching staff and teachers who carry out training in residency comply with the Charter and the policy of providing human resources to KazNMU, "Rules for the search, selection of admission and adaptation of KazNMU employees" No. 10 dated 09.12.2019. The individual teacher's plan is the main document that regulates the activities of each teacher of the department and is drawn up on the basis of the annual work plan of the department. At the University level, every 5 years, a teaching staff competition for the position held is held. The requirements of personnel policy for the teaching staff and teachers who carry out training in residency comply with the Charter and the policy of providing human resources to KazNMU, "Rules for the search, selection of admission and adaptation of KazNMU employees" No. 10 dated 09.12.2019.

Thus, during a visit to KazNMU, experts established compliance with the basic criteria of the accreditation standard: the individual teacher's plan is the main document that regulates the activities of each teacher of the department and is drawn up on the basis of the annual work plan of the department, a balance is observed between the load on clinical and teaching work. The requirements of the personnel policy for the teaching staff and teachers who carry out training in residency comply with the Charter and the policy of providing human resources of KazNMU. Periodic assessment of the activities of teachers and mentors is carried out due to feedback from residents through a questionnaire.

**Strengths:**
1. Highly qualified and reputable faculty implementing residency programmes and experts in practical health care and medical education

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 7 standards conform: completely - 6, significantly -1, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 5: completed**

**Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

All clinical bases (clause 6.1.1 of the report) have training rooms for 6-10 seats. The training rooms are fully equipped for seminars / workshops. KazNMU has a scientific library [https://lib.kaznmu.kz/, NS](https://lib.kaznmu.kz/), the area of which is 6386 м² (library premises - 5 396 м², book storage - 902 м²). The library consists of 5 sections. The general fund of the library has more than 1 439 376 copies of literature, of which 115 in the state Russian and foreign languages according to the EP residency "Ophthalmology, including children's". The electronic catalog of the library is available in all educational buildings, on the Internet - from the library website (http: // (lib.kaznmu.kz.). The collection of electronic literature is 11,958 copies: e-books - 9001, video lectures - 22, e-books in PDF format - 2744, EMCD - 191. (tables in Attachment 6.1.1.3 and 6.1.1.4). The scientific library is also available in the AIS "Sirius", in the module "Library." Since 2019, access to international electronic databases is open. practical skills (clause 6.2.1 report) is carried out at the Centre for Practical Skills of KazNMU, which covers an area of 3500 м². In total, the CA has 500 items of equipment. Information support for the work of residents (clause 6.3.1 of the report) in the specialty "Ophthalmology, including children’s - 7R01127" is carried out through: Mass media (Facebook, Telegram, etc.) the university website; electronic creeping line; television monitors in the foyer of educational buildings; boards of official information of the administration,
dean's offices; information boards in hostels and departments; radio broadcasting on the territory of the University. The University has three Internet centres equipped with 7 modern server stations. The distance learning system is based on the Moodle programme, Microsoft teams 365, Classroom, Zoom. In total, the CA has 500 items of equipment. Information support for the work of residents (clause 6.3.1 of the report) in the specialty "Ophthalmology, including children’s - 7R01127" is carried out through: Mass media (Facebook, Telegram, etc.) the university website; electronic creeping line; television monitors in the foyer of educational buildings; boards of official information of the administration, dean's offices; information boards in hostels and departments; radio broadcasting on the territory of the University. The University has three Internet centres equipped with 7 modern server stations. The distance learning system is based on the Moodle programme, Microsoft teams 365, Classroom, Zoom. In total, the CA has 500 items of equipment. Information support for the work of residents (clause 6.3.1 of the report) in the specialty "Ophthalmology, including children’s - 7R01127" is carried out through: Mass media (Facebook, Telegram, etc.) the university website; electronic creeping line; television monitors in the foyer of educational buildings; boards of official information of the administration, dean's offices; information boards in hostels and departments; radio broadcasting on the territory of the University. The University has three Internet centres equipped with 7 modern server stations. The distance learning system is based on the Moodle programme, Microsoft teams 365, Classroom, Zoom. University website; electronic creeping line; television monitors in the foyer of educational buildings; boards of official information of the administration, dean's offices; information boards in hostels and departments; radio broadcasting on the territory of the University. The University has three Internet centres equipped with 7 modern server stations. The distance learning system is based on the Moodle programme, Microsoft teams 365, Classroom, Zoom.) University website; electronic creeping line; television monitors in the foyer of educational buildings; boards of official information of the administration, dean's offices; information boards in hostels and departments; radio broadcasting on the territory of the University. The University has three Internet centres equipped with 7 modern server stations. The distance learning system is based on the Moodle programme, Microsoft teams 365, Classroom, Zoom. Residents in the specialty of ophthalmology are provided with the opportunity to carry out research work (clause 6.5.2 of the report), since at present the department has its own clinical base, which allows the collection of material. KazNMU has the opportunity to train residents in other medical organizations (clause 6.7.1 of the report) through agreements between the University and the Health Departments of 8 regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan and 16 agreements / memoranda with foreign universities and research centres in 27 countries of the world, through the programme "Academic mobility residents " and " Visiting professor of KazNMU ".

Thus, during a visit to KazNMU, experts established compliance with the basic criteria of the accreditation standard: clinical bases include clinics for the provision of primary, specialized and highly specialized care, as well as outpatient and polyclinic services, Centre for Practical Skills of KazNMU, which allow for clinical training of residents and ensure rotation in the main clinical disciplines. All clinical bases (clause 6.1.1 of the report) have training rooms, halls, rooms for teachers. The equipment of the University allows the use of educational and scientific laboratories, a library. Information technologies and means are widely used. Examination in the field of education with the inclusion of doctors with experience in the field of medical education, psychologists and sociologists of the educational system.

Strengths:
1. Availability of modern and equipped clinical bases that provide residents with the opportunity to master the necessary clinical skills and competencies.
2. The university has a sufficient material and technical base and provides a variety of ways to realize the personal growth of residents.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 21 standards conform: fully - 16, significantly - 5, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0
Standard 6: completed
Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:
1. Include in the educational programme of residency the elective discipline "Management of scientific research" (6.5.1.)
2. Expand opportunities for clinical training at all levels of care (6.7.1).

Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION
At the Monitoring and evaluation of EP (clause 7.1.1 of the report) uses a multilevel approach. In this case, it is carried out (clause 7.1.4 of the report) regular involvement of employers and practitioners in the development and discussion of educational programmes, including the expected learning outcomes; also as mentors. The results of the assessment are heard at meetings of the clinical council, faculty councils, MS and CA, published in the university newspaper and on the university website. The teaching staff studies at the institute (additional and professional education of KazNMU), participates in the competition for the title "The best teacher of KazNMU", "The best teacher of the university" of the Ministry of Education and Science. There are 3 branches of KazNMU training (clause 7.5.2 of the report) in multidisciplinary clinical hospitals (in the cities of Taldy-Kurgan, Taraz, Kyzyl-Orda). The results of the questionnaire survey (clause 7.4.2 of the report) of the teaching staff, residents, AUP, employers are placed in the Sirius programme and discussed at the meetings of the deans with the teaching staff and structural units, students. The analysis of the questionnaires is carried out by the Department of Academic Quality. The principle of equality in learning is respected. FSA is held with the participation of independent (external) examiners. The report of the FSA chairperson on the results of certification of residents is heard annually at the Council of the Dean's Office, the Academic Committee. Based on the results, an action plan is developed aimed at improving and eliminating the identified problems and shortcomings in the EP (Attachment "Report of the Chairperson of the SJSC on the results of the FSA resident graduates 2019-2020 academic year", "Academic policy").

Thus, during a visit to KazNMU, experts established compliance with the basic criteria of the accreditation standard: The monitoring and evaluation of the EP is used a multilevel approach, a collection of information to study the effectiveness and adequacy of EP based on monitoring data, feedback and the results of special studies in order to confirm the quality of education in relation to the mission and established learning outcomes. To evaluate the educational programme, external experts and external organizations, including education, are involved. Based on analysis For identified issues, a corrective action plan is drawn up to create a safe and supportive learning environment and feedback from faculty and residents.

Strengths:
1. The university has developed a multi-stage system for evaluating educational programmes.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 15 standards conform: fully - 7, significantly - 8, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

Standard 7: completed

Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION
Coordination of the implementation, control and monitoring of the implementation of residency programmes in all licensed specialties is carried out by the dean's office of the faculty of internship and residency under the supervision of the vice-rector for academic activities (Rector's Order No. 577 dated July 20, 2018) for the educational process and the provost for clinical activities. Students who have mastered the EP residency in the specialty "Ophthalmology, including children’s - 7R01127" and have successfully passed the state certification, are graduated a state-recognized document on the conferment of the qualifications of an ophthalmologist; including a nursery - 7R01127 ". Ensuring the quality of the educational process (clause 8.1.3 of the report) in residency is determined by the fulfillment of the mandatory requirements for the level of training of residents (SES 2017, 2020),
educational programmes and the creation of a system for monitoring the efficiency of the teaching staff and the implementation of the resident’s IEP. Monitoring of the quality of the educational process is carried out by educational departments, members of the committee of educational programmes, the dean’s office, independent experts. The transparency of EP management is carried out through the discussion (clause 8.1.4 of the report) of educational and methodological documentation for the residency programme at meetings of departments / modules, CEP, AC of KazNMU and, after receiving their positive opinion, is approved by the vice-rector for academic activities. Syllabuses, test tasks for the FSA programme are placed in the AIS “Sirius”. Since 2010, the Committees of Educational Programmes (CEPP) have been functioning in KazNMU. To handle financial issues in KazNMU, the position of the head of the DEF (clause 8.3.1 of the report) on economics and general issues was created, powers and responsibilities were determined. The university’s budget is formed from several sources: the republican budget (state order for the training of university and postgraduate education personnel, advanced training of medical workers, the development of scientific research, transfers); local budget; provision of paid educational and other services.

At the University, the determination of the main priorities for spending money (clause 8.3.2) is approved by the Supervisory Board. Accounting and preparation of financial statements is carried out in accordance with the National Financial Reporting Standard No. 2. In order to ensure the efficient use of financial resources (including distribution), a budget commission was created (clause 8.3.3 of the report), which considers the results of the formation and use of financial resources. Material assistance is provided to teachers (according to the trade union system), the teaching staff’s scientific activities are stimulated (payment for articles with a high impact factor, participation in scientific and technical progress, intra-university grants), which affects the introduction of innovations into the educational process in residency (Standard 5 “Teachers”, p. 5.2). Since 2005, the University has created and operates a quality management system (clause 8.4.2 of the report). In the same year, QMS department. Internal audit is implemented in self-certification processes within the framework of state certification, internal audit (QMS), self-assessment (accreditation), data collection for ranking the university and programme evaluation. The teaching staff of the University, together with the RCHD of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, is actively involved in the development and implementation of clinical minutes of the meetings for the diagnosis and treatment of various diseases, which are used in training experts. Residency training in the specialty "Ophthalmology, including children's - 7R01127" is carried out in a dual format.

Thus, during a visit to KazNMU, experts established compliance with the basic criteria of the accreditation standard: ensuring the quality of the educational process in residency is determined by the fulfillment of mandatory requirements for the level of training of residents, educational programmes and the creation of a system for monitoring the efficiency of the teaching staff and the implementation of the resident's IEP. Monitoring of the quality of the educational process is carried out by educational departments, members of the committee of educational programmes, the dean’s office, independent experts through discussion. The EMCD is located on the electronic databases of the University, is available, monitoring is regularly carried out also due to feedback from residents and teaching staff. Internal audit is implemented in self-certification processes within the framework of state certification, internal audit (QMS), self-assessment (accreditation),

**Strengths:**

1. Stable financial position of the University.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 15 standards conform: fully - 10, significantly - 5, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

**Standard 8: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1. To improve the mechanisms of motivation of teaching staff in the implementation of EP residency
Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

An important condition for the continuous improvement of the postgraduate educational process is the assessment of the quality of learning outcomes / competencies, assessment of knowledge and skills, the learning environment of the programme. The review procedure is carried out at 3 levels (clause 9.1 of the report) and is accompanied by a documentation procedure: administration and management of the university, internal audit (head of the department) and feedback from residents and teachers. To implement the model of medical education and to ensure the quality of the educational process, a new structure has been created - the department of academic work, there are committees of educational programmes in the areas of training. The CEP has experts assessing the quality of training sessions with residents, a group of testologists. Every year, the contingent of the group of experts and testers is updated by attracting specially trained young employees. The University created the Course of Pedagogical Excellence (formerly the Centre / School of Pedagogical Excellence named after Kh.S. Nasybullina) by the decision of the Academic Council (Minutes No. 7 dated March 29, 2011) and is currently defined in the structure of the Institute of Additional and Professional Education NJSC "Asfendiyarov KazNMU".

Strengths:
The University has a system of continuous improvement of the postgraduate educational process.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 4 standards conform: completely - 1, significantly - 3, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 9: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:
1. Expand the further development of academic mobility of teaching staff and residents (9.4).
2. Improve mechanisms of relationships with key stakeholders (9.4).

Thus, all 9 accreditation standards have been met, no inconsistencies in the fulfillment of the criteria of each of the basic accreditation standards in the process of analyzing the self-assessment report and carrying out the examination as part of the tasks of the external expert evaluation programme were found.

5. Recommendations for improving educational residency in the specialty 7R01127 - "Ophthalmology, including children’s»:

Standard 3. EVALUATION OF RESIDENTS
1. Regularly analyze and evaluate the quality of the methods used and the assessment format for the validity and reliability of the final learning outcomes (3.1.4).

Standard 4. RESIDENTS
1. Expand the representation of residents in the policy development process for the admission and selection of residents (4.1.8).
2. Expand opportunities for residents to participate in the youth policy department and other advisory bodies (4.3.8).

Standard 6. EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES
1. Include in the educational programme of residency the elective discipline "Management of scientific research" (6.5.1.)
2. Expand opportunities for clinical training at all levels of care (6.7.1).

Standard 8. MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION
1. Improve the mechanisms of motivating teaching staff in the implementation of the EP residency.

Standard 9. CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT
1. Expand the further development of academic mobility of teaching staff and residents (9.4).
2. Improve communication mechanisms with key stakeholders (9.4).
6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The members of the EEC came to a unanimous opinion to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit the educational residency program in the specialty 7R01127 - "Ophthalmology, including children's" Asfendiyarov KazNMU" for the period of 5 years.

Chairman of the EEC
Morenko Marina Alekseevna
Foreign expert
Ryzhkin Sergey Alexandrovich
Academic expert
Serik Zhakenovich Dzhandaev
Academic expert
Ligai Zoya Nikolaevna
Academic expert
Magyarov Valentin Manarbekovich
Academic expert
Zhanalina Bakhyt Sekerbekovna
Academic expert
Zhumalina Akmaral Kanashevna
Academic expert
Kudabaeva Khatimya Ilyasovna
Academic expert
Abdullina Venera Ravilevna
Academic expert
Igimbayeva Gauhar Tleubekkyzy
Academic expert
Kabildina Nailya Amirbekovna
Academic expert
Kusainova Faridat Azymovna
Academic expert
Bacheva Irina Viktorovna
Academic expert
Maukaeva Saule Boranbaevna
Academic expert
Ospanova Nargul Narimanovna
Expert - representative of employers
Sergeeva Elena Nikolaevna
Expert - representative of residents
Diana Abbasova
Expert - representative of residents
Ilyasov Eldar Rashitovich
ECAQA Observer
Sarsenbayeva Dariyabanu Bulatovna
Quality profile and external evaluation criteria (summary)
Of educational programme in the specialty
7R01127 - "Ophthalmology, including children's” of KazNMU

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Standard</th>
<th>Criteria for evaluation</th>
<th>Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number of standards = BS * / SI</td>
<td>TOTAL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. MISSION AND END OUTCOMES</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>9/6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>16/7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>3/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. STUDENTS</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>11/7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. ACADEMIC STAFF / FACULTY</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4/2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>8/8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. PROGRAMME EVALUATION</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>4/3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>7/3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. CONTINUOUS RENEWAL</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1/0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>total</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>63/4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## List of documents studied by EEC members within the framework of accreditation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Names of documents</th>
<th>Quantity</th>
<th>Date of approval (if applicable)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Academic Policy for 2020-2021</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>375 from 28.08.20 g</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Code of academic integrity of students of NJSC KazNMU</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>375 from 28.08.20 g</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Regulations on the committee of educational programmes</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>368 from 24.08.20 g</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Regulations on the current monitoring of progress, intermediate and final certification</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>13 from 20.10.20g</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>IT Service Provisioning Rules</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>259 from 04/17/2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>SOP: The order of registration of the academic identity of the student of the S.D. Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>389 from 01.09.20 g</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Code of honor of teaching staff and employees of KazNMU</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>191 dated 08/27/19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>The organizational structure of the university</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Report of the Chairperson of the SJSC on the results of the FSA</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>192 from 08/27/19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Quality policy and objectives</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5 from 25.08.2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Mentoring clause</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>231 dated 09/16/2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Regulations on the Faculty of Continuing Education</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>162 dated 12/14/2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>Regulations on academic mobility</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>9 from 11.11.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>Rules for admission to residency</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7 from 15.07.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>Inner order rules</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7 dated 10/14/2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>Rules for the assessment of scientific and pedagogical personnel</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>285 from 23.10.2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>Rules for the search, selection, admission and adaptation of employees of the NJSC</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>10 from 09.12.20 g</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.</td>
<td>On the approval of the candidacies of the chairpersons and the composition of the state examination and certification commission</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>356 dated 26.12.2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.</td>
<td>SOP name: Formation, discussion, approval of the academic calendar</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>600 from 02.08.2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20.</td>
<td>Strategic plan of NJSC KazNMU for 2017-2021</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3 from 05/30/2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21.</td>
<td>List of mentors for 2020-2021</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>10.10.2021 g</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22.</td>
<td>Residency educational programme for</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>366 from 08.24.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23.</td>
<td>Syllabus</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>