REPORT OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMITTEE
ON RESULTS OF ASSESSMENT OF COMPLIANCE WITH
STANDARDS FOR INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION OF
ORGANISATIONS FOR CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL
DEVELOPMENT (CPD) FOR HEALTHCARE PROFESSIONALS

"INTERNATIONAL INSTITUTE OF POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION"
LLP
(Summary)

In accordance with the order of the ECAQA No.15 dated 26.12.2018 year formed
External Expert Committee (EEC) for the institutional accreditation of
"International Institute for Postgraduate Education" LLP composed of:

**Chairman** - ISENNOVA SAULE SHAYKENOVNA
Doctor of medical sciences, Excellent Worker of Public Health
of the Republic of Kazakhstan.
JSC "National Medical University", Head of the Department of
Obstetrics and Gynecology

**Foreign expert** - Lidiya Georgieva Katrova
Doctor of Medicine, Doctor of Sociology, Professor
Member ADEE (the Association for Dental Education in
Europe), awarded the medal of the European Association for
the dental education is included in the anthology "Luminaries
on Bulgarskata medicine"
Medical University of Sofia, Department of Public Health
Dentistry
National expert
KYZAEVA AIZHAN DYUSENBEKOVNA, PhD, Member ASPHER (Association of Schools of Public Health in the European Region), ORPHEUS (International Union for doctoral programs), APACPH (Asia-Pacific Academic Consortium for Public Health)
Kazakhstan Medical University "VSHOZ", Vice-Rector for International Relations

National expert
SHAMSUTDINOVA ALFIA GUMAROVNA, PhD, President of the NGO "Association of Bioethics and Medical Law", member of the World Association for Medical Law (WAML), the European Association of Pediatric and Adolescent Gynecology (EUROPAG)
JSC "Central Clinical Hospital" (Almaty), Head of the Center of innovation and education.

Expert - Representative of practical health
RAMAZANOVA SHOLPAN HAMZAEVNA, M.D. Candidate of Medical Sciences, Kazakh Corporation of Health and Medical Insurance "Interteach" allergist

Expert - Representative of the healthcare professionals
ABDRASULOV RASHID BOLATOVICH, M.D., Candidate of Medical Sciences, anesthesiologist-resuscitator of the National Scientific Center for Phthisiopulmonology of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan
In the period from 16 to 17 January 2019 evaluated compliance with the basic directions of activity of "International Institute for Postgraduate Education" to institutional accreditation the Standards for Institutional Accreditation of Organisations for Continuing Professional Development (CPD) for healthcare professionals.

The EEC report contains an assessment of "International Institute for Postgraduate Education" LLP on compliance improvement activities of the accredited organization.

Activities of additional education organizations (CPD) is not licensed.

So far, the institutional accreditation IIST was not carried out.

**General part of the final report of the EEC**

International Institute of Postgraduate Education (IIP) - an educational institution offering students a competitive additional medical education with the issuance of certificates of the established sample

Establishment of the International Institute of Postgraduate Education has its prehistory. In 2014, when the Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education was organized by the Department of subcontracting "Health, Environment and Health" under the guidance of Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor Tolemisova Aray Magauianovna. At the department conducted refresher training on various topics specialty "Hygiene and Epidemiology." Teaching was carried out by doctors and candidates of sciences, as well as experienced professionals of Scientific and practical center of sanitary epidemiological examination and monitoring having the highest qualification category and conducts training of specialists in all regions of the country. In 2012-2015, only in specialty "Hygiene and Epidemiology" were trained 862 cadets.

In January 2016 the department of "Hygiene, Environment and Health" was renamed the International Institute of Postgraduate Education (order №1 from 29.01.2016g.). In this context, expanded activities, including training, not only in specialty "Hygiene and Epidemiology "but also on surgical and therapeutic.

Educational and research activities implemented by 30 departments according to the list of structural divisions, while two specialties: obstetrics and gynecology, including Children and anesthesiology and resuscitation, including Children participate in specialized accreditation, which is planned to open in the future residency in these specialties.
For the purpose of the continuous development of the IIEP and ensuring its smooth functioning of the departments created educational-methodical work and strategic development department, quality management system, human resources and functional maintenance, scientific and clinical department, accounting department. Structural subordination provides a harmonious work of all the departments of the Institute, whose activities are also based on these internal regulations: IIEP Charter, internal regulations, quality manual, documented procedures and other rules and regulations, approved by the Academic Board of the IIEP. IIST awarded the title "Industry Leader 2016", has a certificate of conformity of the QMS and other IIEP recognition certificates identified the main goal:

Contracts for training sessions with the clinical bases of medical institutions: multidisciplinary clinic "Rakhat" with a network of hospitals and other organizations of Almaty city Health Department.

Actual direction of the activities of IIEP is currently the training of qualified health personnel by means of continuing professional education for specialists with integration into the international educational space, reflecting the Institute's mission. The Strategic Plan of IIEP particular importance is given to both postgraduate education specialists and programs of continuing professional development of medical personnel.

**Analysis of the self-assessment report of "International Institute for Postgraduate Education" LLP for compliance with institutional accreditation standards organizations of additional education (continuing professional development)**

Report on the institutional self-evaluation of educational organization / program (name) is presented on page 101, excluding attachments, characterized by structuring and internal unity of the information provided by the accredited institution of additional education about their activities. A cover letter signed by the Director Tolemisovoy A.M. is attached to the report confirming the accuracy of the information and data contained in the report.

Institutional self-assessment of "International Institute for Postgraduate Education" LLP was held on the basis of the order No.9 dated 04.08.2018, "On approval of the working group on preparation for accreditation."

**The level and quality of self-awareness activities of "International Institute for Postgraduate Education" LLP**

Based on the analysis of self-evaluation by experts, it was found that the content of the self-assessment report is structured in accordance with institutional standards accreditation of medical institutions additional education (CPD) ECAQA.

During the visit, and external evaluation of IIEP LLP, the EEC members carefully studied and evaluated the main indicators of the educational organization for compliance with institutional accreditation standards of additional (CPD) education ECAQA.
Analyzed the information provided by external experts during a visit to IIPE LLP in meetings with management, staff offices, the study of documents, with the survey of students and teachers, interviewing employers, graduates and compared with the data of the report on self-assessment that will ensure the credibility and validation provided in IIPE LLP report information.

Despite the fact that the report on the institutional self-assessment IIPE LLP described their best practices to meet the standards of institutional accreditation, during a visit by external experts, it has requested the necessary information on the self-assessment of individual units IIPE LLP (strategic plan, reports, a, syllabus, control and measuring means of feedback, the model certificates, working curriculum, minutes of meetings of the Academic Council, the agreement with the clinical database, library, financial data), which revealed compliance of the IIPE LLP to the standards institutional accreditation organization of additional education ECAQA.

Analysis for compliance institutional accreditation standards for the external evaluation of IIPE LLP and an overview of the strengths of each standard.

**Standard 1: Mission and outcomes**

**Strengths:**

– Developed mission education organization that actualized in 2018 and participated in the formulation of the mission stakeholders, the mission is communicated to all participants in the educational process is available on the website for informational and educational materials in the classroom;

– Integration into the international educational space, the introduction of joint and international training programs, cooperation with hospitals in Turkey, Korea, Azerbaijan, Belarus, etc.;

– There is an inverse relationship with stakeholders - survey of practical public health representatives, students with the aim of further improving the working curricula, programs, refresher courses and retraining and other measures;

– The presence of listeners updated database to monitor customer satisfaction and ways to improve the activities of IIPE;

– Academic autonomy of organization.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond to - 13 correspond partly - 0 do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 1: Completed**

**Recommendations for improvement:** no

**Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES**

**Strengths:**

– additional education programs are designed in accordance with the regulatory requirements and the needs of practical health care;

– In the preparation of listeners used the competence-based approach;
- In IIEP provided training in various clinical conditions, bases which have a profile clinics, various categories of patients, the level of care (primary care, specialized care, highly specialized care);

- Use as a tool to improve programs - exchange of experience and transfer of technology, the availability of exit cycles, program of visiting professors;

- Autonomy in the development of additional education programs;

- Annual meetings, joint meetings of chairs, round tables with employers and stakeholders in the development of new programs;

- The close relationship between IIEP and employers;

- OP agreed with the representatives of professional associations, practical public health, reviewed by specialists of the corresponding profile;

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond to - 16 correspond partly - 3 do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 2: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement:**
- Greater use of new information technologies and scientific approaches to provide the theoretical and practical skills;

- Activating the research work of teachers and implementation of the scientific component in the educational process (under the CDS, preparing systematic reviews of fragments, a coffee club);

- Introduction of remote learning technologies to listeners.

**Standard 3: Assessment and Documentation**

**Strengths:**
- Formation and evaluation of all key competences listener;

- Availability of appropriate assessment methods - in addition to traditional examinations / tests use self-assessment techniques;

- Monitoring the development of students learning outcomes through feedback.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond - 6 correspond partly - 1 do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 3: Completed**

**Recommendations for improvement:**
- Introduction of electronic document management, including documentation of evaluation of educational achievements of students;

- Feedback optimization through the implementation of electronic questionnaires;

- Develop document management procedure (SOP);

- Develop and implement a standardized form for the development of teaching materials (syllabus), which reflects the objectives, targets, modular learning system, learning outcomes, teaching methods, evaluation methods, relevant bibliography, review and approval date;
– Consider the possibility of introducing a system of confidential preservation of personal data of students, teachers, patients enrolled in the educational process.

**Standard 4: The Healthcare Professionals (Individual professional development)**

**Strengths:**

– High qualification of teaching staff of departments involved in the implementation of the CPD;
– At clinical sites created opportunities for the development of all necessary competences in accordance with the stages of medical expert assistance, including specialized;
– At specialized department provides students participation in all the medical activities of the clinical sites;
– The modular training system;

**WEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond to - 18 correspond partly - 1 do not correspond - 0.

**Recommendations for improvement:** no

**Standard 5: CPD PROVISION (Continuing Professional Development)**

**Strengths:**

– Academic degree holders rate of teachers are high, the presence of the highest qualification of medical category, large medical and pedagogical faculty work experience, participating in the preparation of students;
– Availability of human resources policies to encourage and reward teachers to develop their expertise in education;
– Employee development, support their learning, ensuring their further professional development;
– Monitoring of the educational process on the part of management and departments;
– Use of modern methods and technologies of training of doctors and nurses.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond to - 11 correspond partially - 1 do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 5: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement:**

– Encouraging scientific work of teachers;
– To improve control of professional development of teachers and teacher training.

**Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

**Strengths:**
– Sufficient and developing the material and technical base and clinical resources;

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond to - 23 correspond partly - 1 do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 6: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement:**
– Strengthening the participation of IIEP staff expertise in the field of education;
– Improving the provision of educational programs by own equipment where necessary.

**Standard 7: EVALUATION OF CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT**

**Strengths:**
– Monitoring and evaluation of the educational program;
– Using feedback analysis by stakeholders to improve the educational programs;

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond - 9 correspond partly - 2 do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 7: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement:**
– To improve monitoring of educational programs with subsequent amendments;
– To improve the educational achievements of students evaluation system.

**Standard 8. ORGANIZATION**

**Strengths:**
– Stable financial condition of IIPE;
– Extensive cooperation with partners in the health sector;
– Competent personnel policy;
– Flexibility and responsiveness of training programs to modern health care needs;
– Electronic data base of listeners.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond - 9 correspond partly - 0 do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 8: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement:**
– Effective use of information and communication technologies in the management system (electronic document);
– Expansion of Web site content (publishing job training programs, control and measuring devices, syllabus, etc.) With the introduction of registration of listeners through a restricted access system.
Standard 9. Continuous Renewal

Strengths:
- Processes for continual improvement of additional education programs include professional development of teaching staff every 5 years, including on pedagogical competences;
- Exchange of experience with colleagues in other institutions of education and science of Kazakhstan and foreign countries implementing additional education programs;
- Development of material resources, expansion of classroom fund

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond to - 5 correspond partially - 0 do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 9: Completed**

**Recommendations for improvement:**
- Improvement of self-listeners (computer room, electronic library, annotation bibliography in syllabus, access to tests for self-assessment) 4
- Enhance cooperation with professional and national organizations to review the educational programs of additional education.

3. **Recommendations for improving the activity of "International Institute for Postgraduate Education":**
   1) Introduction of electronic document management, including documentation of evaluation of educational achievements of students;
   2) To implement standardized forms and procedures for the management of the educational process, including feedback from all interested parties;
   3) To improve conditions for self-listeners, including simulation equipment;
   4) To enhance the interaction with professional national and international organizations, educational programs for review additional education;
   5) To develop joint educational programs with foreign partners, taking into account the practical needs of health of RoK.
7. Recommendations for Accreditation council of the ECAQA

The EEC members came to unanimous opinion to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit "International Institute for Postgraduate Education" LLP for 5 years.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role</th>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chairman</td>
<td>Isenova Saule Shaykenovna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign expert</td>
<td>Lidiya Georgieva Katrova</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National expert</td>
<td>Kyzaeva Aizhan Dyusenbekovna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National expert</td>
<td>Shamsutdinova Alfia Gumarovna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expert - representative of practical health</td>
<td>Ramazanova Sholpan Hamzaevna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expert- Representative of the healthcare professionals</td>
<td>Abdrasulov Rashid Bolatovich</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECAQA observer</td>
<td>Sarsenbayeva Saule Sergazievna</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
8. Рекомендация Аккредитационному совету ЕИА.
Члены ВЭК приняли к единогласному мнению рекомендовать Аккредитационному совету аккредитовать ТОО «Международный институт послеприемного образования» сроком на 5 (пять) лет.

Председатель ВЭК
Члены ВЭК:

Зарубежный эксперт
Лидия Георгиевна Капрова

Национальный академический эксперт
Шеметдинова Альфия Гумеровна

Национальный академический эксперт
Казеева Айжан Дюсенбековна

Эксперт-представитель практического здравоохранения
Гамазанова Шолпан Хамзаевна

Служитель-эксперт
Абдрахмов Рашит Бодасович

Наблюдатель от ЕИА
Сарсенбаева Сауле Сергазиевна
## Quality Profile And Criteria of Institutional Assessment

**IIPE (organization additional education (CPD))**  
(Generalized version)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of standards</th>
<th>Number of evaluation criteria</th>
<th>Assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Comply</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Mission and Outcomes</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Educational programme</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Assessment and Documentation</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The Healthcare Professionals (Individual professional development)</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. CPD PROVISION (Continuous Professional Development)</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Educational resources</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Evaluation of CPD Activities</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Organization</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Continuous Renewal</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>110</strong></td>
<td><strong>9</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>