REPORT OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMITTEE ON RESULTS OF ASSESSMENT OF COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS FOR INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION IN POSTGRADUATE MEDICAL EDUCATION OF THE CORPORATE FUND "UNIVERSITY MEDICAL CENTER" OF NAZARBAYEV UNIVERSITY

(summary)

In the period from October 3 to October 4, 2018, the conformity assessment of the main activities of the CF "UMC" with the ECAQA Institutional Accreditation Standards was assessed. The EEC report contains an assessment by the CF "UMC" for compliance with the Standards for Institutional Accreditation in Postgraduate Medical Education and the EEC recommendations for further improvement.

Composition of the External Expert Committee

Chairperson – Almagul Kuzgibekova
MD, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor.
Honored Worker of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan
Owner of The Leibniz Medal (2012) and the Max von
Pettenkofer Medal (2014)
Certified by WFME
Karaganda State Medical University, The Department of
Children’s Diseases

Foreign expert - Geneviève Moineau
MD, FRCPC, President and CEO of the Association of
Faculties of Medicine of Canada (AFMC)
Senior Adviser to the World Federation for Medical
Education (WFME)
Professor of the Department of Paediatrics at the University of
Ottawa. Practices Pediatric Emergency Medicine at the
Children's Hospital of Eastern Ontario

National Expert – Rafail Rozenson
MD, Doctor of Medical Sciences , Professor, Corresponding
Member of the International Academy of
Otorhinolaryngology, Pediatrician of the highest
qualification, Pediatric Pulmonologist, Allergist
Astana Medical University, the Department of Children's
Diseases
**Employer Expert** - Tayrkhan Dautov  
Doctor of Medical Sciences, Chief external specialist in Radiation Diagnostics of the Ministry of Health and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan, member of the European Society of Cardiology, member of the Radiological Society of North America, Vice-President of the Radiological Society of Kazakhstan (since 2012). The Head of the European School of radiology Astana Tutorial.  
The Head of the Department of Radiology and Nuclear Medicine of the National Research Cardiac Surgery Center (Astana, the Republic of Kazakhstan)

**Resident Expert** - Zhandos Tuyginov  
Member of the "Kazakh Association of Neurosurgeons, "AIESEC"  
Resident 4 years of training in the specialty "Neurosurgery, including children" JSC "National Center of Neurosurgery" (Astana)

**ECAQA observer** - Saule Sarsenbayeva  
MD, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, MBA, Pediatrician, Pediatric Cardiologist, Member of the Union of Pediatricians of the Turkic World, Member of the Federation of Pediatricians of CIS Countries  
The Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care (ECAQA), Director-General
General part of the EEC Final Report

In September 2015, the Corporate Fund "University Medical Center" (hereinafter referred to as CF "UMC") was created by the decision of the Board of Trustees of Nazarbayev University (Minutes No. 20 dated September 20, 2015).

Since 2016, the transformation process of the School of Medicine "Nazarbayev University" and CF "UMC" into an academic medical center began.

The goal of CF "UMC" is to provide safe, effective and high-quality medical care, to develop, implement and distribute modern technologies in the field of medical science, education and practice.

CF "UMC" has united five leading medical centers, including National Research Center for Maternal and Child Health (hereinafter referred to as NRCMCH), National Children's Rehabilitation Center (hereinafter referred to as NCRC), Republican Diagnostic Center (hereinafter referred to as the RDC), National Scientific Center for Oncology and Transplantology (hereinafter - NNTSOT) and Kyzylorda branch of the Corporate Fund "University Medical Center" (NRCMCH, RDC, NCRC) passed the international accreditation of the Joint Commission International.

In accordance with the Charter of CF "UMC", one of the main activities of CF "UMC" is educational.

Training in residency in the CF "UMC" is carried out since 2016. The total number of students in the 2017-2018 school years was 202 residents.

In 2018, 58 people graduated.

Educational services of CF "UMC" at the level of additional professional education. In 2016-2018, teachers of CF "UMC" trained more than 4,500 students in advanced training and retraining cycles from the regions. Within the framework of the 005 republican budget program, 340 specialists of health organizations of Kazakhstan were trained.

The total number of teachers involved in the educational process of residency and additional vocational training is 206 people, including 27, candidate of medical sciences - 60.

Analysis of the self-evaluation report of CF "UMC" for compliance with the Standards for Institutional Accreditation in Postgraduate Medical Education

The report on the institutional self-evaluation of CF "UMC" is presented on 149 pages, excluding annexes, is characterized by the completeness, structuredness and internal unity of information provided by the accredited educational organization about its activities. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by medical director Sandro Vento, confirming the accuracy of the information and data contained in the report.

The institutional self-assessment of the CF "UMC" was carried out on the basis of the order No. 18-n/c dated May 15, 2018 "On the approval of the composition of the working group on preparation for institutional accreditation of the corporate fund of the "University Medical Center".
The level and quality of self-evaluation of CF "UMC" activities

Based on the analysis of the self-evaluation report by experts, it was found that the content of the self-assessment report is structured in accordance with the Standards for Institutional Accreditation in Postgraduate Medical Education.

The report on the institutional self-assessment of the corporate fund "University Medical Center" is presented on 149 pages and contains 27 annexes on the relevant standards.

2. Analysis for compliance with institutional accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of CF "UMC"

Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES

Strengths:
- Recognition of the brand of CF "UMC" and its centers in the structure of medical organizations of Kazakhstan.
- The activities of CF "UMC" as part of the integrated academic health system of Nazarbayev University.
- Adherence to international standards of quality and safety of medical care (the foundation’s scientific centers have successfully passed the accreditation of the Joint Commission International).
- The presence of a clear strategic planning and management of all processes.
- The presence of highly qualified specialists recognized in the medical society of the country, as well as in neighboring countries.
- Implementation of residency programs on the basis of JCI-accredited centers of CF "UMC".

Improvement of the educational process, including the development and implementation of effective innovative technologies in the educational process.

**Standard 1: Completed.**

**Recommendations for improvement:** To improve the awareness of students, teachers and other interested parties about the declared mission of CF "UMC".

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES

Strengths:
- the compliance of the content of the residency programs with the requirements of the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan and ensuring the breadth and depth of graduate training in accordance with the name of the program and specialty;
- availability of clinical bases accredited according to JCI international standards;
- CF "UMC" uses appropriate methods of teaching and learning, guarantees the integration of components in practice and theory, experience in assisting the patient, independent and active learning.
- CF "UMC" introduces scientific foundations and methodology of medical research, including clinical research and clinical epidemiology, into postgraduate
education programs, apply methods of critical evaluation of literature, articles and scientific data in teaching.

**Standard 2: Completed.**

**Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF TRAINEES**
Strengths:
- compliance of the final competencies of the residency programs of CF "UMC" with the requirements of state educational standards;
- the application of principles and assessment methods that promote integrated learning and involvement in practical clinical work, provide interprofessional training.

**Standard 3: Completed.**

**Standard 4: TRAINEES**
Strengths:
- transparency of the selection procedure and equality of access to postgraduate education:

**Standard 4: Completed.**

**Standard 5: TRAINERS**
Strengths:
- Relatively high potential of teaching staff (share of teaching staff with academic degrees, first and highest categories);
- Presence of the republican budget program, which provides an opportunity to improve the qualifications of teachers in foreign scientific and clinical centers, as well as the possibility of attracting foreign mentors to the base of clinics of CF "UMC".

**Standard 5: Completed.**

**Recommendations for improvement:** To continue work to improve the level of pedagogical skills of teachers involved in the training of residents.

**Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**
Strengths:
- CF "UMC" has modern innovation centers, scientific and clinical bases that contribute to the intensification of educational and clinical processes, and conduct scientific research.
- In CF "UMC" methods of active vocational practical training are used, aimed at stimulating cognitive activity and motivation, developing decision-making skills, critical thinking, teamwork in real professional activity. CF "UMC" has high scientific and academic potential.
- The share of the staffing level of the staffing capacity of the faculty is high.
- Wide access to international databases. Positive growth dynamics of all indicators of research.

**Standard 6: Completed.**
Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION

Strengths:
- monitoring and evaluation system of the educational program is carried out at all levels, using the competence-based approach and includes a system of evaluation forms (formative, summative, minimum practical skills), a 360-degree assessment methodology;

  **Standard 7: Completed.**

  **Recommendations for improvement:** More actively involve stakeholders in the development and improvement of residency education programs.

Standard 8. COVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION

  **Strengths:**
  - continuous organizational, coordination and administrative work aimed at achieving the mission and goals;
  - defined responsibilities and obligations regarding the management of the educational program;
  - stable financial condition of CF "UMC";

  **Standard 8: Completed.**

Standard 9. CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

  **Standard 9: Completed.**

  **Recommendations for improvement:** no.

3. **Recommendations for improving the activities of CF "UMC":**

   1) To improve the awareness of residents, higher-education teaching personnel and other interested parties about the declared mission of the CF "UMC".
   2) To continue work on improving the pedagogical skills of teachers involved in the training of residents.
   3) More broadly involve stakeholders in the development and improvement of residency educational programs.
4. **Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council**

The members of the EEC came to a unanimous opinion to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit the **Corporate Foundation of the University Medical Center of Nazarbayev University** for a period of 5 years.

Chairman of the EEC  
Kuzgibekova Almagul Bolatovna

Members of the EEC:

Foreign expert  
Geneviève Moineau

Expert  
Rosenson Rafail Iosiphovich

Expert-employer  
Dautov Tayrkhan Bekpolatovich

Resident-expert  
Tuyginov Zhandos Mukhtarovich

ECAQA observer  
Sarsenbayeva Saule Sergazievna
8. Рекомендация Аккредитационному совету ЕЦА

Члены ВЭК единогласно считают, что деятельность Корпоративного Фонда «University Medical Center» Назарбаев Университета соответствует Стандартам институциональной аккредитации Евразийского Центра Аккредитации и обеспечения качества образования (ЕЦА).

Члены ВЭК пришли к единогласному мнению рекомендовать Аккредитационному Совету ЕЦА аккредитовать Корпоративный Фонд University Medical Center Назарбаев Университета сроком на 5 лет.

Председатель ВЭК
Кузгебекова Болатовна

Алмагуль

Члены ВЭК:
Зарубежный эксперт
Женевьев Монэ

Розенсон Рафаил Иосифович

Национальный эксперт
Даутов Тайрахан Бекполатович

Рабочий-эксперт
Туйгынов Жандос Мухтарович

Резидент-эксперт
Сарсенбаева Саule Сергазиевна