REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION
ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF CONFORMITY TO THE
STANDARDS OF INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION OF ADDITIONAL
EDUCATION ORGANIZATIONS (CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL
DEVELOPMENT)
THE RSE ON THE REM RESEARCH AND PRODUCTION CENTER FOR
TRANSFUSIOLOGY OF THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH OF THE
REPUBLIC OF KAZAKHSTAN
1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 52 dated August 29, 2019, an External Expert Commission (EEC) was formed to conduct an institutional accreditation of the RSE on the REM Research and Production Center for Transfusiology MH RK, additional education organization (continuing professional development) with the following membership:

**External Expert Commission Chairman**

TURGUNOV ERMEK MEYRAMOVICH  
DMedSci, Professor, Head of the Department of Surgical Conditions of the Karaganda Medical University NJSC, President of the Surgical Association of the Karaganda Region Public Association, member of the International Surgery Society, member of the Association of Independent Experts of Astana, the Union of Independent Experts of the KSMU  
tel.: +7 7016119655, e-mail: turgunov@kgmu.kz

**Foreign expert**

TATYANA VASILYEVNA MOISEEVA  
Candidate of Medical Science, Associate Professor, Vice-Rector for Continuing Medical Education of the REAVIZ Medical University, Samara, Russian Federation, expert of the Medical league of Russia  
tel.: +79277176281 e-mail: fpdoreaviz@mail.ru

**National academic expert**

SAMAILOVA ALTYNAY NAGYZKHANOVNA,  
Candidate of Medical Science, Chief Manager of Department of Strategy and Business Development of the University Medical Center Corporate Fund of Nazarbayev University  
tel.: +77774167171, e-mail: Smailova71@mail.ru

**Expert-representative of employers**

MOLDABEKOV KUANYSH ZHAKSYLYKOVACH,  
Head of the express laboratory of the National Research Oncology Center LLP, Nur-Sultan  
tel.: + 77784469737  
e-mail: moldab.kuanish@mail.ru
The EEC report contains an assessment of the RSE on the REM Research and Production Center for Transfusiology MH RK for compliance with the Accreditation Standards, recommendations of the EEC on further improving the activities of the organization implementing the program of additional education in the field of healthcare.

The visit of the external expert commission to the RPCT was organized in accordance with the program approved by the ECAQA Director General Sarsenbaeva S.S. on September 2, 2019 and agreed with the chairman of the EEC Turgunov E.M. and the director of RPCT Abdrakhmanova S.A.

2. General part of the EEC final report

Introduction of the RSE on the REM Research and Production Center for Transfusiology MH RK

The republican state enterprise with the right of economic management “Research and Production Center for Transfusiology” (hereinafter RPCT) was established on the basis of the Astana city Blood Center in accordance with the Decree No. 111of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 10, 2011.

The reason for this was the presence of systemic problems in the domestic blood supply service, associated not only with poor material and technical equipment, but also with the lack of its own school of transfusiologists.

Today, RPCT is a leading blood service organization that banking and producing blood components for a certain region. In addition, the scope of activities includes improving the regulatory framework of the blood service, coordination of the development of contract fractionation, conducting research in the field of production and clinical transfusiology, as well as coordinating and monitoring the activity of the entire blood service in the Republic of Kazakhstan.
As part of the normative activity, 18 regulatory legal acts were developed and issued, including amendments to the Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan “On the health of the people and the healthcare system” in terms of donation and blood supply service, transplantation.

The center has the material and technical base for the implementation of the tasks. There is a private building with an area of 12553.1 sq.m., with laboratories and premises for production activities. Contracts with the SMMO on the REM Perinatal Center No. 1, the SMO on the REM Oncology Center of the Akimat of Astana; the SMO on the REM «City Hospital No. 1” of the Akimat of Astana, National Research Center for Maternal and Child Health, National Research Oncology Center JSC , Educational and Clinical Center Astana, the SMO on the REM, University Medical Center Corporate Fund, Medical University of Astana JSC have been concluded.

In seven medical organizations (4 RMOs - NRCMCH, NRCOT, NRCSC, SRITO and 3 GMOs (CH No. 1, CMFH No. 2, PC No. 2) the information system Info Blood is functioning, which allows the RPCT to maintain a unified database of recipients, as well as operatively monitor intrahospital reserves of blood components.

For the first time in Kazakhstan, a methodology for the long-term preservation of blood components has been introduced. The technology of erythrocyte cryopreservation for long-term storage was mastered, an archive of 600 cord blood samples was created, the technology for producing and cryopreserving peripheral blood stem cells for bone marrow transplantation as part of the treatment of hematologic diseases was introduced.

The technology of obtaining fibrin glue from plasma of donated blood, used in surgery to seal small vessels during operations on parenchymal organs, has been mastered and put into practice. A special selection of platelet donors according to the HLA system (the main histocompatibility complex) has been introduced. Work to create a Register of bone marrow donors, a waiting list for patients in need of an organ transplant is underway.

Since 2009, a tissue-typing laboratory, unique for Kazakhstan, has been operating on RPCT base. The laboratory was preliminarily evaluated by an inspector of the European Federation of Immunogenetics (EFI) for compliance with EFI requirements.

In 2012, on the basis of RPCT, a Republican reference laboratory was created to conduct an external assessment of the quality of laboratory tests in the blood service of the republic, as well as resolve controversial and complex diagnostic cases, and fully automated PCR diagnostics of blood-borne infections.

By the order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Blood Center was determined as the basis for the implementation of component B4 “Development of the blood supply service” of a joint project of the World Bank and the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan on institutional reform of health care and technology transfer.

Work is constantly being done to improve the quality of the services provided, in November 2017, the RPCT passed the National Accreditation for compliance with the standards of the blood supply service with the highest category (Order KOOZ MH RK No. 172 - OD dated 08.12.2017). In December 2017, the Department of Immunological Typing of Tissues (hereinafter - DITT) passed the National Accreditation according to the standard ST RK ISO 15189-2015 “Medical laboratories. Quality and competency requirements”. In December 2017, the External Quality Assessment Support Department passed the National Accreditation according to ISO 17043 Standard “Proficiency testing scheme provider”.

At present, the organization employs 417 employees, including 52 doctors, 70 nurses. 2 doctors of medical sciences, 5 candidates of medical sciences, 5 graduate students, 8 masters, 3 residents are involved in the educational process.

In 2012, Department of Management of Research and Educational Programs was established at the RSE on the REM RPCT. Since that, the RPCT has begun training on continuing education programs - continuing education and retraining courses for RPCT specialists, as well as for specialists from other medical organizations on transfusiology and laboratory diagnostics issues. In 2015, the department of educational programs was formed.
Training of students is carried out using the resources of RPCT laboratories. For the period from 2012-2018, about 1,500 medical workers were trained on 201 refresher courses and 13 retraining cycles, about 1,000 of which with higher education and more than 500 people with secondary medical education.

In July 2013, RPCT received a license for training in a residency in speciality “Transfusiology”, the first enrollment took place in 2016: 3 people were trained in a residency. In connection with amendments to regulatory legal acts (order of MH RK dd 28.08.2017 No. 660) from the List of residency clinical specialties approved by the order of the MH RK dated January 30, 2008 No. 27, the specialty “Transfusiology” is excluded, therefore, today training in residency is not carried out.

The department of educational programs RSE on REM RPCT implements educational services in additional education in the following specialties: Transfusiology; clinical laboratory diagnostics; laboratory diagnostics and nursing

Over the past 5 years, 959 blood service specialists from medical organizations of the Republic have been trained in retraining and advanced training courses.

In order to represent, protect and fulfill professional interests, in 2015 the Republican public association “Society of Transfusiologists” was created, which was registered in the Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan on February 17, 2015, with 12 branches in regional centers. Members of the Society are more than 200 doctors - transfusiologists of blood centers of the republic.

3. Analysis of the self-assessment report of the RSE on the REM Research and Production Center for Transfusiology MH RK

The report on the institutional self-assessment of the RSE on the REM Research and Production Center for Transfusiology MH RK (hereinafter - RPCT) for compliance with the standards of institutional accreditation of supplementary education organizations (continuous professional development) is presented on 84 pages, excluding applications, is characterized by the completeness of answers to standards, structuredness with taking into account the recommendations of the ECAQA Self-Assessment Manual, as well as the internal unity of information provided by the accredited organization. A cover letter signed by Director Abdrakhmanova S.A. is attached to the report, confirming the accuracy of the information and data contained in the report.

The report contains a list of members of the internal commission for self-assessment, indicating the responsibility of each member of the internal commission (17 people in total), information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the institutional self-assessment - Tleubaeva A.B., head of the HR development department. Tleubaeva Akmaral Bolzhanovna is also the chairman of the working group on preparation for institutional accreditation.

Institutional self-assessment of RPCT was carried out on the basis of order No. 12 n/k dd 04.01.2019 “On conducting national institutional accreditation” of the RSE on the REM Research and Production Center for Transfusiology MH RK.

A certain work was done by the working group on the preparation of the self-assessment report: the key areas of activity and tasks for the implementation of continuing education programs were analyzed, the necessary information was collected in accordance with the standards of institutional accreditation; a thorough analysis, updating and addition of methodological and educational materials was carried out, their contents are reflected in the report. The content of the Self-Assessment Report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA Institutional Accreditation Standards and includes a description of strong points and areas for improvement for each of the 9 standards.

The database, applications are presented on 110 pages, including appendices, in full, sequentially and there are links to them in the text of the report. The report is written skillfully,
the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, and the tables contain links in the text and have continuous numbering.

4. Analysis of compliance with the institutional accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the RPCT and a review of each standard strong points.

Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES
The experts were convinced that the mission, strategic goal and vision of the RPCT are focused on training health professionals who are in demand and competitive in the labor market, with the joint responsibility of the state and the Center, protecting the health of the country's population.

The involvement of the faculty and students in the process of developing, discussing and accepting the mission (order No. 465 dd 20/10/2017), the vision of the RPCT and subsequent activities to achieve it has been established. When interviewing students and teachers, it was found that the majority are informed about the content of the mission and where they can find it, but mainly administrative workers are included in the development of the organization’s development strategy. When talking with representatives of practical health care, the process of involvement in the development and formulation of the mission is not fully reflected. The content of the mission of the institute changes dynamically over time as necessary.

To distribute the mission, strategic goal and vision, the institute developed a set of measures for its promotion, bringing it to the teaching staff, students, the public, health organizations, applicants and other stakeholders.

The outcomes are defined in all programs and voiced in practical classes. During the interview with the students, the experts received evidence that the students are informed about the training outcomes, and the teachers provide them with electronic syllabuses.

Strong points:
1. A mission and vision, including direction 2. Improving human and scientific potential has been developed in the Strategic Plan.
2. Participation in the implementation of state and scientific programs, in international projects,
3. Specialists trained in leading foreign blood centers, study and implement the best practices for organizing blood services in developed countries
4. Methodological activities and coordination of the practical activities of the MO in the blood service of the Republic of Kazakhstan (order of the MMH RK Kazakhstan dated 30.12.2011 No.913)
5. Conducting postgraduate and further trainings.
6. Financing of educational activities through budget programs and own funds

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** fulfilled - 13, partially fulfilled - 0, not fulfilled - 0

**Standard 1: accomplished**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**
1. To supplement the Mission of the RPCT with the main goal in the field of the educational process.
2. To introduce key teachers in clinical disciplines into the Scientific Council of RPCT.

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS
The RSE on the REM Research and Production Center for Transfusiology MH RK implements 34 additional education programs (in 4 specialties in total) for doctors and nurses. The experts studied the educational and methodological documentation and came to the conclusion that educational programs are designed in accordance with the standard programs for advanced training and retraining of medical and pharmaceutical personnel, approved by the order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 14, 2017 No. 165., are consistent with the mission of the RPCT and the relevant applications, inquiries and
recommendations of employers. The structure of educational programs meets the needs of the region and the Republic. The planning and organization of educational activities are carried out on the basis of the Model Curricula and the contents of educational programs.

When interviewing students, management staff and teachers, it was determined that students and employers were consulted on training planning and the selection of topics for inclusion in the work program regarding the optional component. Thus, the content of educational programs is formed in accordance with the requests of students on the basis of the formation of their personal competencies and needs, depending on their professional activities within the available opportunities, due to optional disciplines in specialty. Within the priority programs of the MH RK, at the meetings of the Academic Council, disciplines of choice in the EMC in the specialties are discussed and approved, which is fixed by the minutes of the meeting of the Scientific Council. The choice of disciplines corresponds to the recommended topics (directions) of components of choice in the continuing education and retraining cycles established in standard programs (order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 14, 2017 No. 165).

For the effective implementation of training programs, the RPCT concluded agreements with 7 clinical bases, 2 of which the external expert commission visited and made sure that the practical part of the educational programs is carried out at the proper level. Students can practice skills in all implemented programs.

RPCT teachers use a variety of teaching methods, focusing on active methods and practice in simulated conditions, directly in the RPCT, as well as in hospitals.

At the acceptance of students, their wishes and applications of the employer sending the students to study are taken into account. Thus, continuous improvement of educational programs is carried out on the basis of applications from medical organizations and a plan for the independent development of health professionals.

**Strong points:**

1. The accredited organization has adapted training to the needs of students not only in content, but also in forms (including the use of distance technologies), as well as to the needs of the healthcare system, receiving applications from specific employers.

2. Organization programs include the integration of practical and theoretical components, monitoring the practice of assisting patients in the leading medical and preventive institutions of the MH RK, simulating all stages of the listener's labor function. Active and independent training is organized in conditions simulated to practical activities on the basis of their own divisions.

3. RPCT through the formation of programs ensures the implementation of training in accordance with the current policy of the state and the Republican public association “Society of Transfusiologists”.

4. The organization determined the content of educational programs developed on the basis of the principles of scientific methodology, evidence-based medicine and clinical experience with the regard to its own rule-making, scientific, applied and practical activities, as well as other medical and preventive organizations of the MH RK.

5. RPCT ensures the diversity and individuality of the content of educational programs, including after determining the initial level of competencies of students to facilitate their further development.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** fulfilled - 18, partially fulfilled - 1, not fulfilled - 0

**Standard 2: accomplished**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1. To indicate more clearly the forms and criteria for evaluating the independent students’ work (ISW) in work programs and syllabuses, as forms of ISW to provide for participation in the implementation of a scientific project as part of a continuing education cycle. To make wider use of active teaching methods (Team-based learning, Clinical based learning).

2. To consider the possibility of developing joint educational programs with medical universities, research centers.
3. To conclude an agreement with a medical university on providing students and teachers with access to international medical databases.

4. To stimulate the development of the scientific process in the RPCT with the involvement of teachers and students in scientific work. To attract teachers and students to scientific projects implemented in the organization, and to study at the master's and doctoral programs at universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan and foreign partner universities. To popularize the achievements of the organization through modern channels for disseminating information (social networks, etc.)

**Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF COMPETENCES AND CPD DOCUMENTATION**

In the process of studying the documentation, experts obtained evidence that the evaluation criteria are described in the EMC for each specialty.

Moreover, assessment methods are proposed for use depending on what competencies are formed / developed and the outcomes in a particular discipline.

The choice of the assessment method is based on acceptability and effectiveness in relation to the established training outcomes, is carried out by the teacher and is reflected in the EMC.

The quality assurance system for the design and implementation of educational programs functions as a continuous cycle of internal quality assessment and examination of CPD programs. Elements of the system are:

- an internal examination of the quality of CPD educational programs, carried out using special algorithms, including technical and substantive examination, "feedback" mechanisms of students, employers and teachers;
- monitoring and auditing of CPD educational programs in the process of their implementation;
- external expertise from the professional community and employers, by reviewing of programs
  - students’ questionnaire (feedback during the learning process and upon its completion).

The leading role in managing and ensuring the quality of education belongs to the administration of the institute. The direct providers of these educational processes are the highly professional teaching staff of the institute.

**Strong points:**

1. Formation and assessment of all key competencies of the trainee;
2. The variety of methods for assessing knowledge and skills;
3. Developed and implemented standardized forms for the development of teaching materials, which reflect the goals, objectives, training outcomes, teaching methods, assessment methods, current bibliography, date of consideration and approval;
4. Monitoring of students’ progress through feedback.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** fulfilled - 6, partially fulfilled - 1, not fulfilled - 0

Please amend as I do not have a completed profile.

**Standard 3: accomplished**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1. To include the Anti-Plagiarism system when developing a student assessment policy (ISW, projects)
2. To consider the possibility of using an objective structured clinical exam (OSCE) as a stage of final certification
3. To provide for a students’ self-assessment.

**Standard 4: HEALTHCARE PROFESSIONALS (PERSONAL PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT)**

The procedure for advanced training and retraining of personnel is regulated in the "Rules for the organization of training in continuing education programs." Retraining is carried out in
the specialty "Transfusiology" within the Nomenclature of medical and pharmaceutical specialties. Within the continuing education and retraining programs, scientific and informational exchange events, seminars, trainings (master classes), self-education, and practical training (internships at the workplace) are held.

When planning training, each healthcare professional personally bears the primary responsibility for his participation in the training. According to the results of a survey of students, experts were able to obtain evidence of a high level of satisfaction with training at the RPCT among the majority of respondents regarding modularity and flexibility of programs, professionalism of teachers, a large proportion of practical training, an individual approach to program planning, a convenient training schedule and a desire to recommend this organization to their colleagues.

Health care professionals can be trained at the RTCT both at their own choice (individual responsibility for participating in the educational program) or according the direction of the employer; at his own expense as an individual, under a service contract - paid by the employer, specialists of state medical organizations have the right to undergo training for free on a budget basis. Practical healthcare specialists are involved in the planning and implementation of CPD activities, questioning of students according to the results of training (allows making adjustments to the programs or developing popular and recommended CPD programs). Employees and teachers of RPCT are participants of various working groups of the MH RK in the development of issues in their specialty.

At the end of the training process, an assessment of the practical knowledge is made by the teacher and there is the possibility of carrying out (testing, honing) independent manipulations during training (including in the RPCT itself). The experts were convinced that leading health care professionals were contracted to the teaching activities.

**Strong points:**

1. The organization provides academic advice on the selection of educational programs not only for students, but also directly for employers, heads of medical institutions, before sending specialists for training.
2. The organization implements programs of continuous development, which are based on its own clinical data, as a leading institution of the blood service, as well as data of the leading medical institutions of the MH RK.
3. Distance learning technologies.
4. Students can choose the form and schedule of training.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** fulfilled - 15, partially fulfilled - 4, not fulfilled - 0

**Standard 4:** accomplished

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1. To introduce a representative from the students into the Academic Council to discuss issues related to educational activities.
2. To introduce a system of incentives and rewards for students.

**Standard 5: PROVISION OF SUPPLEMENTARY EDUCATION (CONTINUOUS PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT)**

The republican state enterprise under the right of economic management “Research and Production Center of Transfusiology” (hereinafter referred to as RPCT) was established on the basis of the Astana city blood center in accordance with Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 10, 2011 No. 111. RPCT activity is carried out in accordance with the Charter of the organization where the educational direction is one of the leading. The initiation of institutional accreditation is the fact that this organization recognizes the need to improve its activities and ensure the quality of continuous professional development. RPCT in educational activities is guided by the main LSI in the field of CPD in healthcare, observing the qualification requirements for additional education organizations in terms of
structure, personnel, WC, material and technical base and the process of monitoring the quality of education.

The department of educational programs of RPCT implements educational services for additional education in 4 specialties: "Transfusiology", "Clinical Laboratory Diagnostics", "Laboratory Diagnostics", "Nursing". Over the past 5 years, 959 blood service specialists from medical organizations of the Republic have been trained in retraining and advanced training courses.

The lack of full-time teaching staff is compensated by the RPCT policy regarding human resources through the active involvement of health care professionals and professors from medical universities, research institutes, and clinics. Giving that, it takes into account the qualifications, professionalism and academic experience of the teacher.

**Strong points:**
1. The highly qualified faculty, academic degree holders rate of 50%, doctors with the highest category of 100%.
2. Training of teachers in emergency care issues.
4. Cooperation with medical universities of the country, mainly MUA JSC, KSPH, KazMUNCE, etc.
5. Information coverage on the website www.spct.kz, on the Astana page, the donor of RPTC on social networks (Between 01.01.2018 and 12.31.2018, the number of visitors to the site was 26132 people).

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** fulfilled - 11, partially fulfilled - 1, not fulfilled - 0

**Standard 5: accomplished**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**
1. To supplement the Regulation on the organization of additional professional education with the procedure for reviewing and approving of educational programs, to put in separate chapters the rules for admission, the procedure for concluding contracts, the procedure for remunerating teachers, and to supplement the list of document templates used in the educational process in the form of annexes to the Regulation.
2. To add the columns “number” and “name of the issued document” to the journal of registration of students.

**Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

The Research and Production Center for Transfusiology has a stable material and technical base, including its own administrative, production and training facilities, as well as practice bases under contracts with 7 medical, scientific and educational organizations in Astana.

The provision of supplementary education programs with resources (to relevant professional literature, information technology, equipment for teaching clinical and practical skills, methodological support, human resources, etc.) is determined by available resources both on property rights and under agreements with practice bases. The organization supports policies to provide a safe learning environment.

In general, the strategic development of the educational process in the RPCT, the organizational structure of management (including the presence of a unit responsible for implementing educational programs) and the availability of resources allow the RPCT to implement CPD programs in 4 medical specialties with a stable annual number of students.

In accordance with the signed agreement on joint activities with MUA JSC, students have the opportunity to use the library (as evidenced by the results of a survey of students (77%)), in addition, they have access to electronic educational resources (100%). RPCT employees also have access to electronic information resources - PubMed.
When interviewing students, 100% are satisfied with the conditions and equipment of classrooms, 92% of students say that teachers provide them with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature for preparing for classes.

Practical training is carried out in the laboratories of the center and at the clinical bases of RPCT with training on real modern medical equipment.

Students are provided with a sufficient number of seats in classrooms; lecture halls are equipped with multimedia equipment and comply with sanitary standards.

The center has a website where general information about ongoing educational programs is posted; on the page on Instagram (Astanadonor) information is posted to popularize voluntary donations.

The RPCT organizes international and republican events and attracts the audience of the center to participate in them. RPCT is a subject of scientific activity and has a certificate of accreditation of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan. During the training, students have the opportunity to get acquainted with the results of scientific research conducted at the center, however, they are not involved in fragments of research.

Being the leading republican organization of the blood service, the center is involved in improving the regulatory framework, coordinating the activities of blood centers of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and conducting research work in the field of transfusiology. The above allows providing expert influence on practical and educational activities in this area.

**Strong points:**
1. The department of educational programs in the structure of the Center;
2. Modern high-tech equipment;
3. Collaboration with leading clinics and the potential of RPCT medical personnel, agreements with 7 clinics of the city
4. Classrooms equipped with office equipment and Internet access;
5. Simulation class, with equipment for emergency care and practical skills training in transfusion.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** fulfilled - 23, partially fulfilled - 1, not fulfilled - 0

**Standard 6: accomplished**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**
1. To buy consumables for research for students and simulation equipment;
2. To use information and communication technologies more effectively;
3. To encourage students to use social networks to communicate with colleagues, inform about educational and other activities in the blood service of the Republic of Kazakhstan;
4. To encourage students to use information and communication technologies (website, Instagram, etc.) to manage their practice (inform about new SOPs, improve regulatory legal acts, discusses problematic issues in the blood service, etc.);
5. To provide for the familiarization of students with the results of scientific research conducted at the center, as well as the participation of students in the implementation of scientific projects. To include the results of scientific research of the center in the CPD program.

**Standard 7: EVALUATION OF SUPPLIMENTARY EDUCATION PROGRAMS (CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT)**

In the RPCT, the assessment of the educational process is carried out with a focus on monitoring the availability of resources (clinical bases, educational literature, laboratories, equipment, the composition of faculty), analysis of the conformity of WC with the requirements of the Model curricula.

When conducting an external visit, the experts were able to verify that the leading mechanism for evaluating CPD programs in the center was questioning of students about the quality of the content of the programs and verbal feedback.

When forming training programs, the opinion of employers is taken into account by including a representative in the EMB, as well as during ongoing industry conferences,
conventions, etc. oral recommendations are taken into account to make certain additions and changes to the programs themes.

The employees of the Center are members of the Transfusiology Association, working closely with other blood service specialists.

**Strong points:**
1. Involvement of representatives of practical health care and students in the formation of educational programs;
2. Close collaboration of the teaching staff of the RPCT with blood service specialists and other stakeholders.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** fulfilled - 9, partially fulfilled - 2, not fulfilled - 0

**Standard 7: accomplished**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**
1. To improve training programs, maximally bring them near the needs of the employer;
2. To develop and implement in the center mechanisms for monitoring the effectiveness of continuing professional development programs. To consider the proposal of an external expert commission on involving the center’s quality management department in this function;
3. On an ongoing basis, to monitor the specialists trained at the center on the results of their professional activities and training needs;
4. To maintain constructive feedback with students, to analyze and take appropriate measures based on feedback;
5. To actively involve the main stakeholders in program of monitoring and evaluation of the educational process.

**Standard 8. ORGANIZATION**

The RPCT plans CPD programs on the basis of the stated mission - "the development of blood donation, medical technology, professional potential and applied research in the field of transfusion medicine to improve the quality of blood services to the population of the Republic of Kazakhstan." When planning programs, employees determine expected learning outcomes. RPCT has an organizational structure that meets the requirements for the organization of additional professional education. General management is carried out by the director, planning and control of all aspects of the educational process is the responsibility of the first deputy director. Also, the institute has 4 employees responsible for the implementation and effectiveness of educational programs in 4 specialties.

The advisory body, providing methodological support to further education, is the Educational Council, which includes teachers, administration, and a representative of employers. EMC meets regularly, has its own plan and reporting.

The regulation on educational activities in the RSE on the REM Research and Production Center for Transfusiology MH RK defines the process of monitoring and control over the educational process.

Management of CPD programs is transparent. The center demonstrates that the administrative units responsible for formalized continuing professional development programs contribute to quality assurance and improvement.

The academic freedom of the center’s students is expressed in the right to choose a program, the terms of their studies, the opportunity to participate in the formation of the content of their education and to receive knowledge according to their inclinations and needs. Certificates issued by the center are taken into account by the National Center for Independent Examination when students pass qualification exams for a specialist certificate.

RPCT cooperates with 7 international organizations (Spain, Poland, Austria, USA).

Budget allocation is carried out in accordance with the strategic plan of the RPCT for 2017-2021. Financial matters are the responsibility of the chief accountant. Financing for the implementation of CPD programs is carried out at the expense of the republican budget under
program 005 "Advanced training and retraining of personnel of state healthcare organizations", under agreements with medical organizations and students.

**Strong points:**
- RPCT is a leading scientific and methodological center in the Republic of Kazakhstan
- The structure (department of educational programs) providing coordination, monitoring and control of educational activities
- Sustainable financing of educational activities through budget programs, agreements with the MO.
- In the rating of scientific organizations and medical universities by indicators of scientific and innovative activity (RCHD data), RPCT takes 10th place among 20 research institutes and scientific centers of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** fulfilled - 9, partially fulfilled - 0, not fulfilled - 0

**Standard 8: accomplished**

**Recommendations for improvement:**
1. Further training of specialists in the department of educational programs in methodology and innovative teaching technologies.

**Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

Strategic plan for the development of RPCT for 2017-2021 provides for tasks and activities for the continuous improvement of all areas of activity, the implementation of which is analyzed and monitored by management. Thus, the institute pursues a policy of improving its activities with a focus on education and resources.

The experts established the commitment of the academic leadership and teachers to ensure the quality of education, which was confirmed by the questionnaire.

All teachers are fully or partially satisfied with the organization of the educational process in the center, 80% of the teachers surveyed are completely satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace. 90% speak of a satisfactory microclimate in the team, 90% speak of full compliance with ethics and subordination in relations between colleagues, teachers, and management. 90% of teachers are confident that they have the opportunity to fulfill themselves as professionals in their specialty, 60% fully agree that they have the opportunity for career growth and the development of teacher competencies. 90% - that they have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the research results. Thus, the desire of teachers to develop the center is supported.

At the same time, not all teachers are satisfied with salaries (10%), they are not satisfied with the work of the HR service (20%). 10% of teachers went through continuing education more than 5 years ago and 10% do not remember when they took courses in professional development. The above is the subject of analysis and the search for solutions for RPCT.

A similar picture of the desire of RPCT employees for continuous improvement was found during a survey of students, the overwhelming majority (90%) noted that teachers and program managers are aware of the students' problems related to training. More than 90% are satisfied with the organization of clinical training and teaching methods; they speak of maintaining feedback after the completion of classes.

These points in the interview indicate trust and interaction in the center, and also testify to the professional skill of teachers who keep up to date and possess relevant information and knowledge in the field of medicine.

Experts have received compelling evidence of compliance with this standard.

**Strong points:**
1. Timely elimination of documented inconsistencies in connection with a change in the RPTC structure, the release of new regulatory acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the field of education;
2. RPCT, together with the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, developed and adopted 18 orders of the MH RK, amended the Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan “On the Health of the People and the Health Care System” in terms of donation and blood service;

3. Annually content of work programs is reviewed and updated, taking into account innovations in the blood service, the need for training personnel.

*EEC conclusions on the criteria:* fulfilled - 5, partially fulfilled - 0, not fulfilled - 0

*Standard 9: accomplished*

*Recommendations for improvement*

*Additional recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: no.*
6. Recommendations for improving the RSE on the REM Research and Production Center for Transfusiology MH RK activities for confirming to institutional accreditation standards for organization of supplementary education (continuing professional development):

1. To supplement the wording of the Mission of the RPCT with the main goal in the field of the educational process.

2. To introduce key teachers in clinical disciplines and students into the Educational Council of RPCT to discuss issues related to educational activities.

3. To make wider use of active teaching methods (Team-based learning, Clinical based learning).

4. To consider the possibility of developing joint educational programs with medical universities, scientific centers in the field of health.

5. To conclude an Agreement with a medical university on providing students and teachers of the RPCT with access to international medical databases.

6. To stimulate the development of the scientific process and the popularization of the achievements of RPCT:

   A) To attract young teachers and students to scientific projects implemented in the RPCT, and to study at the master's and doctoral programs at universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan and foreign partner universities.

   B) To expand the representation of RPCT in social networks in order to popularize the achievements and results of scientific activities and the educational process of RPCT.

7. When developing a student assessment policy, to include the “Anti-plagiarism” system (ISW, projects) and to consider the possibility of using the OSCE as a stage of the final assessment, as well as provide for a student self-assessment procedure.

8. To introduce a system of incentives and rewards for students.

9. To improve the structure and content of a number of documents on additional education:

   A) In work programs and syllabuses to describe more clear the forms, criteria for evaluating the independent work of students, and as forms of the ISW to provide for participation in the implementation of a scientific project as part of a continuing education cycle.

   B) To supplement the “Regulation on the organization of continuing professional education” with the procedure for reviewing and approving educational programs, to put into separate chapters the rules for admission, the procedure for concluding contracts, the procedure for remunerating teachers, and to supplement the list of document templates used in the educational process in the form of annexes to the Regulation.

   C) To supplemented with columns "number" and "name of the issued document" the journal of registration of students.

   D) To renew the concluded Employment contracts with teachers working part-time (5 specialists), as well as Contracts with clinical and practice bases.

12. To provide for the possibility of creating conditions for food and relaxation of students.

13. On a regular basis to monitor educational programs; to include representatives of third-party organizations of education and science, healthcare to the composition of the commission for the final certification of students; to provide a system for receiving feedback from employers directing students to train.

So, all 9 accreditation standards have been met; no compliance with the criteria for each of the basic accreditation standards in the process of analyzing of the self-assessment report and an external visit to the accredited organization was found.
7. Recommendation to the Accreditation Council of ECAQA

Based on the results of an expert assessment of the conformity of all the activities of the RSE on the REM Research and Production Center for Transfusiology MH RK to the Standards of institutional accreditation of the organization of additional education (continuous professional development) developed by ECAQA, the members of the EEC reached common ground to recommend the Accreditation Council of ECAQA to accredit the **RSE on the REM Research and Production Center for Transfusiology MH RK** for a period of 5 years.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role</th>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>External Expert Commission Chairman</td>
<td>Turgunov Ernem Meyramovich</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign expert</td>
<td>Moiseeva Tatyana Vasilyevna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National academic expert</td>
<td>Smailova Altnay Nagyzkhanovna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expert – representative of employers</td>
<td>Moldabekov Kuanys Zhaksylykovich</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expert – representative of health care professionals (trainee)</td>
<td>Nurtazina Gulnara Karabulatovna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECAQA observer</td>
<td>Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
7. Рекомендация Аккредитационному совету ЕЦА

По итогам экспертной оценки соответствия всех направлений деятельности РГП на ПХВ «Научно-Производственный Центр Трансфузиологии» Министерства Здравоохранения Республики Казахстан Стандартам институциональной аккредитации организаций дополнительного образования (непрерывное профессиональное развитие), разработанным ЕЦА, члены ВЭК пришли к единогласному мнению рекомендовать Аккредитационному совету ЕЦА аккредитовать РГП на ПХВ «Научно-Производственный Центр Трансфузиологии» Министерства Здравоохранения Республики Казахстан на период 5 лет.

Председатель Внешней экспертной комиссии
Туранов Ермек Мейрамович

Зарубежный эксперт
Моисеева Татьяна Васильевна

Национальный академический эксперт
Смакова Алтынай Нагызхановна

Эксперт — представитель работодателей
Молдабеков Куаныш Жаксылыкович

Эксперт — представитель специалистов здравоохранения (слушателей)
Нурзатина Гульнара Карабулатовна

Наблюдатель от ЕЦА
Умарова Макпал Альдибековна
Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the RSE on the REM Research and Production Center for Transfusiology MH RK for conformity to the standards of institutional accreditation of the organization of additional education (continuous professional development)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Standard</th>
<th>Assessment criteria</th>
<th>Evaluation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Fulfilled</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Mission and outcomes</td>
<td></td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Educational program</td>
<td></td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Assessment of competencies and CPD documentation</td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Healthcare professionals (personal professional development)</td>
<td></td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Provision of supplementary education (continuous professional</td>
<td></td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>development)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Educational resources</td>
<td></td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Evaluation of supplementary education programs (continuous professional development)</td>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Organization</td>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Continuous renewal</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>109</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>